

Gallagher never communicated with Attorney Haverstick regarding the Notice of Removal prior to the filing of the same.

4. To the contrary, on Sunday, November 12, 2017 Attorney Gallagher was advised that Attorney Haverstick believed the action was subject to removal under 28 U.S.C. § 1443, which statute does not require the consent of all Defendants prior to removal.

5. Speaker Turzai was not interested in pursuing a removal action.

6. During the afternoon of November 13, 2017, Attorney Gallagher learned that Attorney Haverstick would file a removal solely on behalf of Senator Scarnati.

7. At all times, the only ground for removal ever discussed was under Section 1443.

8. Neither Attorney Gallagher nor Speaker Turzai had any knowledge of the intent to remove this action under 28 U.S.C. § 1441. It was not until the undersigned counsel received the filed copies of the Notice of Removal on Wednesday, November 15, 2017 via e-mail service from Attorney Joshua Voss and a request for written consent to the same that it was discovered that removal was sought under Section 1441.

9. Indeed, counsel for Speaker Turzai was not provided with the opportunity to review in advance the Notice of Removal prior to its filing.

10. In light of the false representation contained in the Notice of Removal, Attorney Gallagher sent an e-mail to Attorney Haverstick on November 16, 2017 at 12:40 p.m. indicating that “[r]emoval pursuant to Section 1441, however, was never discussed and no consent was given to you or anyone else.” *See Exhibit A*, attached hereto, E-mail dated 11/16/17 to Attorney Haverstick.

11. Accordingly, Attorney Gallagher requested that an amended notice of removal be filed to correct the false statement regarding consent. *See Exhibit A*.

12. Instead of filing an amended notice of removal, Senator Scarnati filed his Emergency Motion to Withdraw Notice of Removal in which, once again, it is improperly represented that counsel for Speaker Turzai “consented to removal” but “does not now consent to the Notice as filed,” implying that Speaker Turzai or his counsel previously consented to the removal as filed. (ECF No. 9).

13. Consequently, Speaker Turzai is left with no choice but to file the within Response in order to correct the record and the false representations made to this Court.

14. To this end, and to be clear, at no point in time did Speaker Turzai’s counsel or anyone else acting on Speaker Turzai’s behalf state to Attorney Haverstick, or anyone else acting on Senator Scarnati’s behalf, that Speaker Turzai consented to removal pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1441.

Dated: November 16, 2017

Respectfully submitted,

CIPRIANI & WERNER PC

/s/ Kathleen A. Gallagher

KATHLEEN GALLAGHER

CAROLYN BATZ MCGEE

650 Washington Road, Suite 700

Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15228

Phone: 412-563-4978

Email: KGallagher@c-wlaw.com

CMcgee@c-wlaw.com

*Attorneys for Defendant Michael C. Turzai,
in his official capacity as Speaker of the
Pennsylvania House of
Representatives*

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on November 16, 2017, I caused the foregoing Response to Defendant, Joseph B. Scarnati III's Emergency Motion to Withdraw Notice of Removal to be filed with the United States District Court for the Eastern District of Pennsylvania via the Court's CM/ECF system, which will provide electronic notice to all counsel and parties of record.

CIPRIANI & WERNER PC

/s/ Kathleen A. Gallagher
Kathleen A. Gallagher