Transcript of Proceedings

Date:September 25, 2012

Case: APPLEWHITE, et al. vs. COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA



Phone:302.464.0880

Fax:302.261.7396

Email:Office@Miller-Verbano.com

```
1
          IN THE COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA
 2
 3
     VIVIETTE APPLEWHITE; WILOLA
                                                    CERTIFIED
     SHINHOLSTER LEE; GROVER FREELAND;
                                                   TRANSCRIPT
     GLORIA CUTTINO; NADINE MARSH; DOROTHY
 4
     BARKSDALE; BEA BOOKLER; JOYCE BLOCK;
     HENRIETTA KAY DICKERSON; DEVRA MIREL
 5
     ("ASHER") SCHOR; THE LEAGUE OF WOMEN
 6
     VOTERS OF PENNSYLVANIA; NATIONAL
     ASSOCIATION FOR THE ADVANCEMENT OF
 7
     COLORED PEOPLE, PENNSYLVANIA STATE
     CONFERENCE; HOMELESS ADVOCACY PROJECT,:
 8
          Petitioners,
                                             : C.A. No.
 9
                                             : 330 M.D. 2012
               vs.
10
     THE COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA;
     THOMAS W. CORBETT, in his capacity as :
     Governor; CAROLE AICHELE, in her
11
     capacity as Secretary of the
12
     Commonwealth,
13
          Respondents.
14
15
16
17
         Reporter's Transcript of Proceedings before
18
                 THE HONORABLE ROBERT SIMPSON
                   Harrisburg, Pennsylvania
19
20
                 Tuesday, September 25, 2012
21
22
     REPORTED BY:
23
     Gail L. Inghram Verbano, CSR, RDR, CRR
24
```

Page 2 1 APPEARANCES 2 On behalf of Petitioners: 3 DAVID P. GERSCH, ESQUIRE david.gersch@aporter.com MICHAEL A. RUBIN, ESQUIRE 4 michael.rubin@aporter.com 5 ARNOLD & PORTER, LLP 555 Twelfth Street NW 6 Washington DC 20004-1206 202.942.5000 7 MARIAN K. SCHNEIDER, ESQUIRE 8 marianesq@mac.com ADVANCEMENT PROJECT 9 295 East Swedesford Road, #348 Wayne, Pennsylvania 19027 10 610.644.1925 11 WITOLD WALCZAK, ESQUIRE 12 vwalczak@aclupa.org ACLU OF PENNSYLVANIA 13 313 Atwood Street Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15213 14 412.681.7864 15 16 JENNIFER R. CLARKE, ESQUIRE jclarke@pilcop.org PUBLIC INTEREST LAW CENTER OF PHILADELPHIA 17 1709 Benjamin Franklin Parkway, Second Flood 18 Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103 215.627.7100 19 20 On behalf of Respondent Commonwealth of Pennsylvania: 21 PATRICK S. CAWLEY, ESQUIRE Senior Deputy Attorney General 22 pcawley@attorneygeneral.gov PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE OF ATTORNEY GENERAL 23 16th Floor, Strawberry Square Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17120 717.787.3391 24



```
Page 3
     On behalf of Respondents THOMAS W. CORBETT, in his capacity
 1
     as Governor; CAROLE AICHELE, in her capacity as Secretary of
 2
     the Commonwealth:
           ALFRED W. PUTNAM, JR., ESQUIRE
           alfred.putnam@dbr.com
           ALICIA HICKOK, ESQUIRE
 4
           alicia.hickok@dbr.com
 5
               DRINKER, BIDDLE & REATH, LLP
                One Logan Square, Suite 2000
 6
                Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996
                215.988.2907
 7
 8
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
```



		raye i
1	CONTENTS	Page 4
2	WITNESS:	PAGE
3	KURT MYERS	
4	By Mr. Gersch (Direct)	22
5	By Mr. Cawley (Cross)	103
6	By Mr. Gersch (Redirect)	119
7	Shannon Royer	
8	By Mr. Gersch (Direct)	125
9	By Mr. Putnam (Cross)	156
10	By Mr. Gersch (Direct)	171
11	JONATHAN MARKS	
12	Ms. Hickok (Direct)	225
13	Mr. Gersch (Redirect)	241
14	By Ms. Hickok (Recross)	249
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		



			rage J
1	EXHIBITS		Page 5
2	Petitioners' 107	. 223	
3	Petitioners' 115	. 149	
4	Petitioners' 131	42	
5	Petitioners' 131	. 215	
6	Petitioners' 136	66	
7	Petitioners' 145	. 243	
8	Petitioners' 149	. 212	
9	Petitioners' 172	. 139	
10	Petitioners' 173	. 141	
11	Petitioners' 174	. 141	
12	Petitioners' 178	. 138	
13	Petitioners' 179	. 137	
14	Petitioners' 192	77	
15	Petitioners' 217	. 208	
16	Petitioners' 218	. 209	
17	Petitioners' 220	23	
18	Petitioners' 224	83	
19	Petitioners' 224	. 219	
20	Petitioners' 225	81	
21	Petitioners' 226	81	
22	Petitioners' 229	. 202	
23	Petitioners' 232	264	
24	(Petitioners' Exhibits Received	: PAGE 185)	



	Page 6		
1	EXHIBITS		
2	Respondents' 1 158		
3	Respondents' 2 159		
4	Respondents' 3 160		
5	Respondents' 4 161		
6	Respondents' 5 166		
7	Respondents' 6 166		
8	Respondents' 7 165		
9	Respondents' 8 226		
10	Respondents' 9 228		
11	Respondents' 10 233		
12	(Respondents' Exhibits Received: PAGE 265)		
13			
14			
15	Harrisburg, Pennsylvania		
16	Tuesday, September , 2012; 10:00 a.m.		
17			
18	THE COURT: Thank you, you may be seated.		
19	Welcome to Courtroom 331. We are here in		
20	Applewhite again. Nice to see you again. It is		
21	Tuesday, September 25th.		
22	And last Tuesday, September 18th, the		
23	Supreme Court returned this matter to us in this		
24	language: Thus, we returned the matter to the		
1			



- 1 Commonwealth Court to make a present assessment of
- 2 the actual availability of the alternate
- 3 identification cards on a developed record in light
- 4 of the experience since the time the cards became
- 5 available.
- In this regard, the Court is to consider
- 7 whether the procedures being used for deployment of
- 8 the cards comport with the requirement of liberal
- 9 access, which the general assembly attached to the
- 10 issuance of PennDOT identification cards.
- If they do not, where if the Commonwealth
- 12 Court is not still convinced in its predictive
- 13 judgment that there will be no voter
- 14 disenfranchisement arising out of the Commonwealth
- 15 implementation of a voter identification requirement
- 16 for purposes of the upcoming election, that Court is
- 17 obliged to enter a preliminary injunction."
- 18 And language a little bit later the
- 19 Supreme Court majority stated "The Commonwealth Court
- 20 is to file its supplemental opinion on or about
- 21 October 2nd, 2012." That would be a week from
- 22 today, next Tuesday.
- So I can tell you that I'm not of the
- 24 mind that I should wait until the very last minute to



- 1 file something. I think the sooner the better for
- 2 everybody involved.
- 3 So I'd like to focus everybody on meeting
- 4 the -- the Supreme Court's directive to make a record
- 5 on certain particular issues. That's where I hope to
- 6 keep us focused.
- 7 Let me just remind the gallery that the
- 8 one thing that happens that I find very disconcerting
- 9 is when I have people moving up and down, so I would
- 10 ask that you try to keep that to a minimum if you
- 11 will.
- We will probably go until about 12:30,
- 13 1:00. Take a lunch break and then go until about
- 14 5:00 today. We will reconvene if necessary on
- 15 Thursday morning at 10:00.
- 16 Are there any matters that I need to
- 17 address before we get started?
- MR. PUTNAM: Yes, Your Honor.
- 19 THE COURT: All right.
- MR. GERSCH: Your Honor, we'd like to
- 21 invoke the rule against witnesses. We'll be starting
- 22 with Deputy Secretary Myers of PennDOT; and the other
- 23 witnesses will be called later. Mr. Royer,
- 24 Mr. Marks, we'd like to have them excused.



- 1 MR. PUTNAM: Your Honor, if I may, we
- 2 would like to suggest that the most orderly way to do
- 3 this, in view of what the Supreme Court has asked
- 4 Your Honor to do, is those three witnesses are going
- 5 to be called. They're going to be called by us.
- 6 They have their story, in order to explain how the
- 7 DOS card is being administered, which is exactly what
- 8 Your Honor is supposed to hear.
- 9 We believe it makes no sense for us to
- 10 call them, for them to testify first and allow
- 11 Mr. Gersch to cross-examine them.
- We'll be putting those three witnesses
- on; and as to whether Your Honor wishes to have them
- 14 excused, that's entirely up to the Court.
- I don't know that it's necessary, but I
- 16 understood you did in the first hearing; so if you
- 17 do, you do.
- 18 The question we would like to raise is to
- 19 start the hearing with cross-examination, as opposed
- 20 to hearing from the witnesses as to what's going on
- 21 and then having cross-examination, seems to us to be
- 22 likely to take longer and to be much more efficient
- 23 if we put them in and then see what the cross is.
- 24 THE COURT: As I understand the problem,



- 1 Mr. Gersch has asked for sequestration. There's no
- 2 objection. The sequestration is ordered.
- 3 There's another suggestion is that we,
- 4 what, reschedule the witnesses or handle them in some
- 5 sort of different order?
- 6 MR. PUTNAM: The suggestion is that
- 7 inasmuch as they are Commonwealth witnesses and
- 8 inasmuch as they're being asked what is going on, it
- 9 makes most sense for them to tell their story first,
- 10 put forward what, in fact, has gone on, and to permit
- 11 Mr. Gersch at that point to cross-examine.
- 12 It's true that he's the Petitioner and
- 13 we're the Respondents. But I think that the
- 14 efficient taking of evidence in the case is such that
- 15 starting out with a series of cross-examination
- 16 questions before the witness, in fact, explained
- 17 things is likely to take much longer. That's all.
- 18 THE COURT: All right. Here's my
- 19 approach to advocacy. I try to stay out of the
- 20 lawyers' way. I'm going to let both counsel run
- 21 their cases the way they want to run their cases. I
- 22 understand that the Petitioners have the burden of
- 23 proof here. So I'm going to let them call these
- 24 witnesses in whatever order they think is most



- 1 appropriate.
- 2 The understanding is they still have to
- 3 explain things to me, and I'm confident that they
- 4 will tell me something that's useful.
- 5 So -- so if that's a request that there
- 6 be some sort of priority in presentation of the
- 7 witnesses, that's declined.
- If we have the witnesses here,
- 9 Mr. Royer...
- MR. GERSCH: Mr. Myers is who we would
- 11 call first.
- 12 THE COURT: You want Mr. Myers to come up
- 13 and the other witnesses that you named, which
- 14 were ...
- MR. GERSCH: Mr. Marks and Mr. Royer.
- 16 THE COURT: -- Mr. Marks and Mr. Royer
- 17 may step out.
- 18 And there's something else?
- MR. CAWLEY: Yes, Your Honor, on a
- 20 related note, and this goes to the efficient
- 21 presentation of witnesses, Respondents wanted to
- 22 address, under your court's order -- under this
- 23 Court's order for this hearing, the witness list that
- 24 we've received from the Petitioners attached to their



- 1 brief, Your Honor said that we were required to
- 2 follow Rule 212.2, which requires names and addresses
- 3 of witnesses.
- 4 We have a few issues with the witness
- 5 list. One, there are no addresses. And to compound
- 6 that problem, we've never seen most of these names
- 7 before.
- 8 And while we would like to accommodate
- 9 affidavits where people are unavailable, I think
- 10 that's generally something for a special or expedited
- 11 hearing. We're now four months into this case and
- 12 we've done extensive discovery and we've never seen
- 13 most of these names. We don't have addresses, and so
- 14 we can't defend against any testimony that they may
- 15 be offering. We can't be helpful to the Court in
- 16 that regard.
- 17 The only names that are familiar on here
- 18 are either Commonwealth employees or Mr. Wolosik, who
- 19 testified in person and is now listed as offering an
- 20 affidavit here. So he is both available, as
- 21 demonstrated by his testimony before, and he also
- 22 testified about matters unrelated to the department
- 23 of state voter ID, so that would put him outside the
- 24 scope.



- 1 And finally, Your Honor, we received just
- 2 this morning, obviously beyond the Court's deadline,
- 3 a supplemental list with an email that said that more
- 4 names may be forthcoming. Again, we don't recognize
- 5 these names except for one.
- 6 So we would ask that the Court strike
- 7 witnesses who have not been properly identified under
- 8 the Court's order.
- 9 THE COURT: Well, I didn't think that --
- 10 your list was rather expansive, and I did note that
- 11 there was no way to contact these people or even
- 12 locate them.
- 13 But would you like to be heard before I
- 14 try to sort this one out?
- 15 MR. GERSCH: Certainly, Your Honor.
- With respect to the addresses, Mr. Cawley
- 17 and I spoke at 5:30 last night, between 5:00 and
- 18 5:30. Had he expressed concern about the addresses,
- 19 we would have done everything we could to provide
- 20 them.
- 21 With respect to the fact that he doesn't
- 22 know these people, that's because these are people
- 23 who tried to get the DOS ID since it became
- 24 available. They would not have surfaced in the case



- 1 earlier.
- These are people that have surfaced, as
- 3 the Supreme Court anticipated, after the cards became
- 4 available. These are people that tried to get those
- 5 cards and are having a very hard time getting them.
- 6 There's no reason they should have seen these names
- 7 before.
- 8 With respect to the addresses, we'll
- 9 obviously try and get them the addresses.
- The Commonwealth had been opposed to
- 11 depositions of these people. So it wasn't clear to
- 12 me that they needed the addresses. Certainly we've
- 13 been in contact with them. And if that was an issue
- 14 for them, they could have provided --
- The reason we were speaking with counsel
- 16 for the other side last night was Page 21 of their
- 17 brief, they announced that they were changing their
- 18 procedures. We've seen no documents about that. I
- 19 called them up and said, "Where are the documents?"
- 20 He emailed them over right away.
- MR. CAWLEY: And, of course, depositions
- 22 in this case.
- 23 THE COURT: Hang on. Let me take one
- 24 problem at a time here. The problem we're talking



- 1 about now is the witness list.
- I don't think the witness list that you
- 3 provided complied with 212. You need to give them
- 4 more information. I'm really not looking for
- 5 cumulative evidence here. I don't have -- I know you
- 6 need to present some people, and I know you can
- 7 represent to me that you have these other people that
- 8 will say the same thing.
- 9 But given the time frame I have, my
- 10 tolerance for cumulative evidence will be less than
- 11 usual, if I can give you that broad hint.
- 12 Is there some way that you can work out
- this witness list and tell them who you're really
- 14 going to call?
- MR. GERSCH: Certainly, Your Honor, when
- 16 we take a break this morning, we can probably --
- 17 THE COURT: You can't possibly call all
- 18 those people and expect me to hear all that and
- 19 understand it and sort through it.
- MR. GERSCH: That's correct, Your Honor.
- 21 Part of it was first we had people approach us and
- 22 then we had to make a decision as to who we could
- 23 call, which is essentially what happened last time,
- 24 only this time we have much less time in which to do



- 1 it.
- In any event, we would expect to finish
- 3 on Thursday no matter what, and we're going to call
- 4 their witnesses in our case.
- 5 I think today in light of the
- 6 Commonwealth's concession today, we'll probably end
- 7 early. And on Thursday, we'll call those witnesses
- 8 that we can get on in the time available to Your
- 9 Honor. But we're not planning to go beyond Thursday,
- 10 absent some information that we don't know of today.
- 11 THE COURT: My understanding was the
- 12 entire thing was finished on Thursday, not just your
- 13 part of the case.
- MR. GERSCH: Yes, but we're going to call
- 15 their witnesses, so they only have three witnesses.
- 16 I'm going to call them all.
- 17 THE COURT: That's true. He listed three
- 18 witnesses.
- MR. PUTNAM: That was my point, Your
- 20 Honor.
- 21 THE COURT: All right. I am going to
- look forward to some report from you after we've
- 23 taken a break as to what prognosis you've made as to
- 24 identities of witnesses who will actually be called.



- 1 MR. GERSCH: Certainly, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: I'm sort of putting that on
- 3 hold for a little bit.
- 4 Is there some other issue I need to
- 5 address here?
- 6 MR. CAWLEY: Nothing from us, Your Honor.
- 7 THE COURT: I think, Mr. Putnam, you
- 8 indicated that because you would not be available on
- 9 Thursday that you wanted to make a closing today
- 10 or ...
- 11 MR. PUTNAM: I'd like to be heard at some
- 12 point today. I think it's probably better after the
- 13 testimony comes in since my witnesses are going to be
- 14 called today. If Your Honor would leave some time at
- 15 the end of the day, I'd just like to be able to make
- 16 my closing, if it is closing on that.
- 17 THE COURT: All right. And that's going
- 18 to be the only closing for the Commonwealth or what?
- MR. PUTNAM: Presumably, the issue as to
- 20 what it is Your Honor is actually hearing on Thursday
- 21 is something that I can't entirely tell from that
- 22 list. And so, obviously, although I will not be
- 23 here, either Mr. Cawley or Ms. Hickok, I'm sure will
- 24 ask at the same time to address whatever is left in



- 1 front of Your Honor, because the record could change
- 2 in terms of what they bring in on Thursday. I can't
- 3 predict that. That's their case.
- 4 MR. CAWLEY: And technically, Your Honor,
- 5 the Commonwealth and the other Respondents are
- 6 separately represented, but we are endeavoring to not
- 7 present cumulative defenses, and I will not go well
- 8 beyond what Mr. Putnam has to say if there's no need
- 9 for it.
- 10 THE COURT: Okay. Do you want to be
- 11 heard?
- MR. GERSCH: Your Honor, obviously, we --
- 13 I guess we object to the idea of there being two
- 14 separate closings. I think Your Honor may be
- 15 disposed to allow it under the circumstances. If it
- 16 is, we may seek to address the Court very briefly at
- 17 that time. But I think the better course is simply
- 18 that the closings be made at the end of the case in
- 19 normal fashion.
- THE COURT: That would be the better way,
- 21 that's for sure. But this has come back to us in
- 22 sort of an unusual posture, so I'm going to try to be
- 23 as flexible as I can with that, assuming we have the
- 24 time to make the record that needs to be made.



- 1 The closing is to help me, but it's not
- 2 to give the record that the Supreme Court can
- 3 ultimately view. So I don't want to spend a lot of
- 4 time with closings today, but I acknowledge that
- 5 there may be something else to occur on Thursday
- 6 which might require further comment from the
- 7 attorneys.
- 8 So whatever time you take today, you will
- 9 get an equal opportunity today to give me sort of a
- 10 roundup of the day's work.
- 11 Let me say something else to you. It
- 12 sounds like you're going to be submitting some
- 13 affidavits and other things. Sounds like there are a
- 14 lot of exhibits that are listed. Somewhere along the
- line, a summary or your view of the contents would be
- 16 helpful for me; because if you put on as much
- 17 evidence as you disclosed, I could be reading that
- 18 well beyond next Tuesday. As an effort to help me
- 19 focus on what you think the most important part is, I
- 20 will be inviting your take on the evidence, and your
- 21 take on the evidence.
- 22 As far as the affidavits go, have they
- 23 been changed? Has opposing counsel seen the
- 24 affidavits yet?



- 1 MR. WALCZAK: Your Honor, if I may.
- 2 hope Your Honor appreciates, we've had very limited
- 3 time to -- as per Your Honor's instructions and the
- 4 Pennsylvania Supreme Court's instructions, we've been
- 5 focused on people who have had problems since
- 6 August 27th. We have people who have had problems
- 7 on August 22nd. By Thursday, we may have people
- 8 who have problems tomorrow. It's has not been hard
- 9 to find individuals. We are in the process of
- 10 gathering declarations. I expect that by early this
- 11 afternoon, we will be able to submit to the Court and
- 12 to opposing counsel a dozen or maybe even a couple.
- 13 THE COURT: Don't submit them to me, but
- 14 give them a fair chance to read them first before I
- 15 see them. If there's some obvious problem there, you
- 16 have an opportunity to respond.
- 17 MR. WALCZAK: We will share them with the
- 18 Commonwealth before the end of the day. I do not
- 19 believe we will have all of them today, but we will
- 20 have a good chunk of those folks today.
- 21 As of right now, we are planning on
- 22 calling 13 witnesses on Thursday. We expect all of
- 23 those to be brief. Probably no more than 15,
- 24 20 minutes including cross-examination. And they



- 1 were a mix of voters who have had difficulties
- 2 getting or have been unable to get the Department of
- 3 State ID and people who have been helping individuals
- 4 to acquire ID who have sort of more of a global
- 5 perspective on what's been going on, who can testify
- 6 about the lines that people have been encountering,
- 7 about the types of excuses that people are getting
- 8 for being rejected for a DOS ID, things like that.
- 9 But we certainly appreciate that there's
- 10 limited time, and we will be as efficient as we can.
- 11 And I see no reason we're not going to be able to put
- 12 all that evidence on in a relatively short day on
- 13 Thursday.
- 14 THE COURT: Mr. Simpson will be happy to
- 15 hear that.
- 16 Is there anything else that I need to
- 17 address before we get going?
- 18 MR. GERSCH: Just one question with
- 19 respect to your earlier remarks. We appreciate the
- 20 opportunity to address the Court, as Mr. Putnam
- 21 addressed the Court today. I just wasn't sure, will
- 22 we be permitted to address the Court at the close of
- 23 the evidence?
- 24 THE COURT: Yes, absolutely. Because



- 1 there may be something that isn't addressed today
- 2 that comes into evidence on Thursday. So I
- 3 anticipate we're going to have two closings, two
- 4 rounds of closing.
- 5 MR. GERSCH: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 6 THE COURT: Is there anything else that
- 7 you need me to rule on before we -- or share thoughts
- 8 with you before we get going here?
- 9 MR. GERSCH: No.
- 10 THE COURT: Okay. Please call your first
- 11 witness.
- 12 MR. GERSCH: Your Honor, Petitioners call
- 13 Mr. Kurt Myers.
- 14 - -
- 15 KURT MYERS, having first been duly sworn
- 16 according to law, was examined and testified as
- 17 follows:
- 18 - -
- 19 EXAMINATION
- 20 - -
- 21 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 22 Q Sir, would you please state your name.
- 23 A Yes. It is Kurt Myers.
- Q And you are, I take it, still a Deputy



- 1 Secretary for PennDOT; is that right?
- 2 A That is correct.
- 4 THE COURT: Can I just ask you to pause
- 5 for a moment. I'm informed that we're having some
- 6 difficulty projecting this information upon the big
- 7 screen. Perhaps we're having some difficulty
- 8 projecting it to the overflow courtroom, although I'm
- 9 not sure there's anybody up there.
- I can see it. I think you can see it.
- 11 The witness can see it, but as far as the -- as far
- 12 as the big screen, I'm not entirely sure.
- 13 It will make for a very boring day for
- 14 those of you in the gallery, but we'll get our work
- 15 done.
- MR. GERSCH: If I could, Your Honor, we
- 17 proposed not to start exhibits again from 1 but to go
- on from where the exhibits were from the last hearing
- 19 so that there will be no confusion. And in most
- 20 cases, our exhibits --
- 21 THE COURT: But I don't know where that
- 22 was.
- MR. GERSCH: Well, we're going to start
- 24 with 100 --



- 1 THE COURT: Okay.
- 2 MR. GERSCH: -- but this exhibit is
- 3 actually -- we've premarked them in our -- to
- 4 correspond with the exhibit list we furnished the
- 5 other side. So we're just going to use the exhibit
- 6 numbers that were furnished to the other side. This
- 7 will be Exhibit 220. If I could hand that up.
- 8 (Petitioners' 220 was marked for
- 9 identification.)
- 10 MR. GERSCH: I'm handing a copy to the
- 11 witness.
- 12 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 13 Q Mr. Myers, I've shown you what's been
- 14 marked Exhibit 220. I call your attention to the
- 15 writing in the lower right-hand corner of the
- 16 exhibit, which says "DOS Initial ID Form 8/14/2012."
- 17 This is the application for the
- 18 Department of State ID card that you started using on
- 19 August 27th of this year; is that right?
- 20 A That is correct. It is the one that was
- 21 used until last night.
- 22 Q You've anticipated my next question.
- 23 Last night you came up with a new ID form; is that
- 24 right?



- 1 A The Department of State did, yes.
- 2 Q All right. And very briefly, and then
- 3 we'll come back to 220. Have you distributed the new
- 4 DOS ID that was come up with last night, have you
- 5 distributed that to all 71 centers at this point?
- A Just for clarification, it was finalized
- 7 yesterday. It was worked on before yesterday, but it
- 8 was finalized yesterday. And yes, we have
- 9 distributed it to all 71 locations.
- 10 Q And when did you do that?
- 11 A That would have been either late last
- 12 night or this morning.
- 13 Q How did you distribute the new DOS ID
- 14 application to the 71 centers?
- 15 A Electronically.
- 16 Q So you sent an email?
- 17 A It would have been an attachment to an
- 18 email.
- 19 Q Okay. Let's come back to that.
- 20 So Exhibit 220 is the form that was being
- 21 used from August 27th through yesterday; is that
- 22 right?
- 23 A That is correct.
- Q Now, that Exhibit 220, the application



- 1 you've been using until now for the DOS ID card,
- 2 that's what you call a card of last resort or a
- 3 safety net; is that right?
- 4 A Up until last night, yes.
- 5 Q Okay. And my questions are all going to
- 6 be directed through the end of business yesterday.
- 7 When we leave that temporal period, when we go
- 8 forward to the new cards, to the new procedures, I'll
- 9 make that clear in my question. So all these
- 10 questions are going to have to do with what happened
- 11 leading up to last night.
- 12 A Understood.
- O And then we'll move on.
- When a voter came in, up until last
- 15 night, and wanted an ID card to vote with, what your
- 16 people at PennDOT were supposed to do was to try and
- 17 give them a PennDOT ID card; right?
- 18 A When an individual came in to our
- 19 location and stated that they needed an ID for voting
- 20 purposes, they would first be run through the process
- 21 of attempting to give them a PennDOT ID.
- Now, obviously there are requirements for
- 23 a PennDOT ID, as we know from past discussions, such
- 24 as security card, a birth certificate with a raised



- 1 seal, as well as two forms of address verification.
- In those cases where an individual didn't
- 3 have a birth certificate, we would go through an
- 4 alternative process for the purposes of validating --
- 5 if that individual was born in Pennsylvania, that the
- 6 Department of Health --
- 7 Q Mr. Myers, my question was simpler. I
- 8 just wanted to know when a voter came in and asked
- 9 for a photo ID for voting, the first thing you would
- 10 try to do is qualify them for a PennDOT ID card?
- 11 A That is correct.
- 12 O And you would not move on to trying to
- 13 give them a Department of State ID card until you had
- 14 determined that you couldn't give them a PennDOT ID
- 15 card?
- 16 A That is correct.
- 17 Q All right. And the notion that the
- 18 PennDOT ID card -- withdrawn.
- 19 The notion of the DOS ID card was
- 20 supposed to be the card of last resort, and then you
- 21 would first exhaust the possibility of giving the
- 22 voter a PennDOT ID card, that's, in fact, reflected
- 23 in Exhibit 220, in the very first paragraph on the
- 24 top of that page; right?



- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q Right. Because that first sentence says,
- 3 "I am requesting a Pennsylvania Department of State
- 4 ID for voting purposes because I am unable to obtain
- 5 a nondriver's license photo identification card
- 6 issued by Pennsylvania Department of Transportation,
- 7 PennDOT" -- let me stop there.
- 8 So the first thing that a person who came
- 9 in for an ID card had to do if they wanted to get a
- 10 DOS ID, the first thing they had to do was say I'm
- 11 unable to get a PennDOT card; right?
- 12 A We would still take them through the
- 13 process. And once we took them through the process,
- if they weren't able to get a PennDOT ID, we would
- 15 then have to fill out this form.
- 16 Q Fair enough. Now, I want to walk through
- 17 that very first language at the top of the card. The
- 18 first thing that the person -- by the way, the
- 19 person -- the voter has to sign an affirmation? This
- 20 form is an affirmation; right?
- 21 A That is correct.
- 22 Q And it's made under criminal penalties of
- 23 if you don't tell the truth?
- 24 A I think it's unsworn testimony or



- 1 something of that nature. I think, but I'm not a
- 2 hundred percent sure.
- 3 Criminal penalties imposed by law for
- 4 violation of 18 Pa. C.S. 4904.
- 5 Q And the first thing that -- on this
- 6 paper, the first thing that someone is affirming is
- 7 that they are unable to obtain an identification card
- 8 issued by PennDOT; right? That's what the first
- 9 sentence says?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q And then the clause after that says,
- 12 "Because I do not possess all of the documentation
- 13 required to obtain a PennDOT card and cannot obtain
- 14 the needed documentation."
- 15 Let me just stop there. Do you see that
- 16 language?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q And what that means is I can't get the
- 19 PennDOT ID card because I don't have the
- 20 documentation for it and I can't get the
- 21 documentation for it; right? It's pretty
- 22 straightforward?
- 23 A That is correct.
- Q And then the next clause says, "Or cannot



- 1 obtain the documentation without payment of a fee;"
- 2 right?
- 3 A That's correct.
- 4 Q And that again, also pretty
- 5 straightforward, means either I couldn't get the
- 6 documentation -- either I can't get the documentation
- 7 for a PennDOT card or I would have to pay a fee in
- 8 order to get it?
- 9 A That is correct.
- 10 Q Okay. And that's what you're affirming
- 11 to when you sign this?
- 12 A That is correct, yes.
- 13 Q All right. And just a minute to refresh
- our recollections from our last hearing, the PennDOT
- 15 ID is what you call a secure ID; right?
- 16 A That is correct.
- 17 Q And that means as a general matter, as
- 18 you were saying before, you need either a raised
- 19 birth certificate or an alternate check of the
- 20 voter's birth date and birth record; you need a
- 21 Social Security card, and you need two proofs of
- 22 identity?
- 23 A That's correct.
- Q All right. One of the things that has



- 1 been happening since August 27, when the cards were
- 2 made available -- withdrawn.
- For the PennDOT ID -- let's move away
- 4 from the DOS ID for just a minute. For the PennDOT
- 5 ID, when a voter came in to get a PennDOT ID, if they
- 6 didn't have a birth certificate and they were born in
- 7 Pennsylvania, there was what you call an alimentative
- 8 procedure for determining whether or not they had a
- 9 Pennsylvania birth record; right?
- 10 A That is correct.
- 11 Q And that procedure was that you would
- 12 take the paperwork from the voter, and PennDOT would
- 13 make inquiry with the Department of Health to
- 14 determine whether they could find a voter record.
- In the interim, the voter would go home;
- 16 and if the Department of Health could find a birth
- 17 record, then the voter would receive a letter from
- 18 the Department of Health telling them that they'd
- 19 found the birth record and to come back in?
- 20 A That is the correct procedure through, I
- 21 believe, the 20th of September. It was changed
- 22 after the 20th. I believe it's the 20th.
- 23 Q I'm going to come to that in just a
- 24 minute. Just to finish the procedure so far.



- 1 Until September 20th, what that meant
- 2 was if you wanted a PennDOT ID and if you were using
- 3 a procedure where they had to check your birth
- 4 record, you had to come to PennDOT twice --
- 5 A That's correct.
- 6 0 -- is that correct?
- 7 Okay. Thank you.
- 8 And the interim between the two visits
- 9 would presumably be at least on the order of 7 to 10
- 10 days because that's how long it took the Department
- of Health to check your birth record?
- 12 A Our estimate was somewhere between 7 to
- 13 10 days.
- 14 Q And, by the way, if they couldn't find
- 15 your birth record, the voter would not be asked to
- 16 come back in to get a PennDOT ID?
- 17 A That's incorrect. If -- after the DOS ID
- 18 was available, we sent all of those individuals --
- 19 even before the DOS ID was available, we sent a
- 20 letter to individuals letting them know that the
- 21 Department of Health couldn't verify them.
- 22 After the DOS ID was introduced, we sent
- 23 them a letter saying the Department of Health
- 24 couldn't verify you. However, we do have a product



- 1 available for you, and that is the DOS ID, so please
- 2 come back.
- 3 Q Fair enough. And what you've just
- 4 described is what -- a process that would have been
- 5 in place starting August 27th?
- 6 A That is correct.
- 8 after August 27th, using this alternate method --
- 9 up until September 20th, using this alternate
- 10 method, the voter would come in, they'd make
- 11 application, they'd have to go home while there was a
- 12 check made with the Department of Health, and then
- 13 they would receive notification: Either come back
- in, you can get a PennDOT ID; or if it was after
- 15 August 27th, we can't find your birth record but
- 16 maybe you can get a Department of State ID, come back
- 17 in for that?
- 18 A Yes.
- 19 Q Let's turn to what you were just
- 20 describing, Mr. Myers, which is on September 20th,
- 21 you made another change, and that was to cut down the
- 22 time it took to check with the Department of Health
- 23 as to whether a Pennsylvania-born voter had a birth
- 24 record; right?



- 1 A Well, we've listened very closely to the
- 2 concerns of individuals and also groups who have
- 3 stated various concerns that they've had in the
- 4 process, and this was one that we reacted to by
- 5 making this change to reduce the timeline.
- 6 Q And what is the procedure as of
- 7 September 20th? A voter comes in, they don't have
- 8 a raised-seal birth certificate, the person at the
- 9 window -- let me stop for a second.
- 10 What's the title of the person at the
- 11 window at PennDOT who dispenses the ID? What are
- 12 they called?
- A Well, in general layman's terms, they're
- 14 customer service representatives. Their technical
- 15 title is a Driver License Examiner or a Driver
- 16 License Examiner Assistant. A DLEA or a DLE.
- 17 O What if we call them a customer service
- 18 representative?
- 19 A That's fine with me.
- 20 Q They might prefer that too.
- 21 A I'm sure they do.
- 22 Q All right. So the voter comes up --
- 23 let's talk about what's happening on
- 24 September 20th.



- 1 The voter comes up to the customer
- 2 service representative at PennDOT. The voter does
- 3 not have a raised-seal birth certificate. They are
- 4 born in Pennsylvania. And I take it the customer
- 5 service representative says, not to worry, I can
- 6 determine whether or not there's a birth record.
- 7 So far correct?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q And now, tell the Court what happens
- 10 after that. What will the PennDOT customer service
- 11 representative do then?
- 12 A The customer service representative will
- 13 contact the central office here at the Riverfront
- 14 Office Center. There are individuals that are
- 15 trained there to be able to access the Department of
- 16 Health records. They will either verify that the
- 17 record does exist, or if they can't find it, they'll
- 18 also let the customer service representative know
- 19 that.
- That process may take a few minutes, but
- 21 at that point in time, the customer simply stays
- 22 there, either at the counter or is asked to have a
- 23 seat while we're checking.
- As soon as we get verification back, that



- 1 individual then comes back up to the counter or if
- 2 they're still standing there, they're then told that
- 3 the record has been verified.
- 4 Q And the -- when you say the PennDOT
- 5 customer service representative calls over to the DOH
- 6 or contacts -- is it a phone call?
- 7 A No. I think they are checking the
- 8 electronic system.
- 9 Q I take it DOH is going to check the
- 10 electronic system; is that right?
- 11 A No. We have access to check the
- 12 electronic system.
- 13 O Okay.
- 14 A That's my understanding of it.
- 15 Q So your understanding is the customer
- 16 service representative at PennDOT, they are able, on
- 17 their own without going through DOH, to go into DOH's
- 18 records and determine whether or not the voter has a
- 19 Pennsylvania birth record?
- 20 A No. Point of clarification: The
- 21 customer service representative in the field contacts
- 22 a PennDOT employee here at the Riverfront Office
- 23 Center. That employee then contacts the Department
- 24 of Health, which I believe is through an electronic



- 1 process, if they're able to verify the record.
- 2 Q The last stage, when the PennDOT employee
- 3 here in Harrisburg contacts the Department of Health,
- 4 that's what you're saying is the electronic process?
- 5 A That's correct.
- 6 Q By the way, you say you believe it. Who
- 7 would know the answer to that question?
- 8 A Well, there are plenty of people who are
- 9 process-wise within our shop. Obviously, Scott
- 10 Shenk. There are others within the organization.
- I'm very, very confident that was, in
- 12 fact, the process; but I just don't want to make a
- 13 comment that it's 100 percent because I'm not into
- 14 the individual aspects of how that actually functions
- 15 from the standpoint of the contact information.
- 16 O All right.
- 17 A I'm very confident that it's electronic.
- 18 Q Understood. Let me just ask you about
- 19 the first part of that process. When the customer
- 20 service representative contacts the PennDOT facility
- 21 here in Harrisburg, is that a phone call, or is that
- 22 also an electronic contact?
- 23 A That's a phone call, I believe.
- Q A phone call?



- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q You said that process could take a couple
- 3 of minutes. Does it take longer? Does it ever take
- 4 longer?
- 5 A I can't state specifically how long it
- 6 takes on each individual case. I suspect that there
- 7 are some that take more than a few minutes. There
- 8 are some that take less, depending upon how quick
- 9 they're able to match up the records and verify.
- 10 Q You've not had any complaints from your
- 11 customer service representatives that they can make
- 12 that connection with -- through PennDOT here in
- 13 Harrisburg to DOH and get a prompt answer; that's not
- 14 happened?
- 15 A Not that I'm aware of.
- 16 Q Let me turn now to the process of getting
- 17 a DOS card, at least as it existed through last
- 18 night.
- 19 All right. So once it has been
- 20 determined that the voter can't get a PennDOT ID,
- 21 they'll be given that Exhibit 220 to fill out; is
- 22 that correct?
- 23 A That is correct.
- 24 Q And in addition to the affirmation, we



Page 39 discussed the things that the voter will have to

- 2 supply. Their name; correct?
- 3 A That is correct.
- 4 O Their date of birth?
- 5 A That is correct.
- 6 Q Their Social Security number, or they
- 7 will have to say they've never been issued a Social
- 8 Security number?
- 9 A That is correct.
- 10 Q They have to identify their gender?
- 11 A That is correct.
- 12 Q They have to give their address?
- 13 A That is also correct.
- 14 Q They'll have to give their phone number?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 O It also asks for their email address.
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q And when the voter -- well, let me ask
- 19 you this.
- 20 Typically, will the voter do this while
- 21 standing in front of the customer service
- 22 representative? Or will the customer service
- 23 representative give them the form and ask them to
- 24 move on so they can service another person?



- 1 A That would depend upon the situation at
- 2 the center and what the customer wanted to do. From
- 3 the standpoint if the customer wants to fill the form
- 4 out right then and there, the transaction is in
- 5 process. Then common sense would say let's, you
- 6 know, have the form filled out.
- 7 There's not a tremendous amount of
- 8 information that's needed on here, so this is
- 9 probably something that a person could fill out in a
- 10 minute or so.
- 11 Q All right. Now, one of the things that
- 12 the customer service representative is supposed to do
- 13 when they receive this form is then to initiate a
- 14 process of checking to see whether the voter is in
- 15 the SURE database?
- 16 A That is correct.
- 17 Q And the way the customer service
- 18 representative does that is to call the help desk at
- 19 the Department of State?
- 20 A That is correct.
- 21 Q All right. And there are, what, five
- 22 people on the help desk at the Department of State
- 23 who take these calls?
- 24 A I don't know the answer to that question.



- 1 Q All right. And the theory was that the
- 2 person -- the customer service representative was
- 3 supposed to be able to determine whether or not there
- 4 was -- the voter was listed in the SURE database,
- 5 that would take on the order of a couple of minutes?
- 6 A In general, yes.
- 7 Q But, in fact, it is taking, in many
- 8 cases, a lot longer than that.
- 9 A Well, there have been some people who
- 10 could not be found in the SURE database. So from
- 11 that standpoint, there certainly have been people who
- 12 have not been -- their records found.
- 13 Q But you've received complaints that in
- 14 some instances, it was taking 10 or 15 minutes for
- 15 the folks at PennDOT, the customer service
- 16 representatives, to wait -- they'd be put on hold for
- 17 10 or 15 minutes while they waited for the SURE help
- 18 desk to pick up?
- 19 A That is correct. We've been in
- 20 conversations with the Department of State since we
- 21 deployed the new program on August 27th. And I
- 22 know the Department of State has made changes in the
- 23 number of people they have staffing, things of that
- 24 nature.



- 1 In the early stages we did have some
- 2 issues where the line wasn't being picked up and/or
- 3 someone was not available when our individual called
- 4 in from the center.
- 5 Q So when the customer service
- 6 representative called up, sometimes they would just
- 7 get a busy signal from the SURE help desk; is that
- 8 right?
- 9 A I believe that that occurred.
- 10 Again, these were in the early stages of
- 11 deployment. And they're back. And as I said, the
- 12 Department of State is taking corrective action.
- 13 Q And sometimes the help desk would put
- 14 your customer service representatives on hold; right?
- 15 A That is correct.
- 16 Q And they could wait 10, 15 minutes before
- 17 they'd be picked up?
- 18 A There's a possibility of them waiting
- 19 while they're on hold. Specifically how long, I
- 20 don't know the specific answer to that. But
- 21 certainly people are put on hold.
- MR. GERSCH: Let me hand you what we'll
- 23 mark Exhibit 131.
- 24 (Petitioners' 131 was marked for



- identification.)
- 2 MR. GERSCH: Your Honor, I apologize,
- 3 this is the wrong exhibit. Let me hand up what's
- 4 been marked 130.
- 5 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 6 Q All right. Directing your attention to
- 7 Exhibit 130, that's an email from Scott Shenk; is
- 8 that right?
- 9 A That's correct.
- 10 Q He works for PennDOT?
- 11 A That's correct.
- 12 Q He is the director -- division manager
- 13 for driver's licensing?
- 14 A Yes, that's correct.
- 15 Q And he was emailing to several people,
- 16 Megan Sweeney, who is an assistant to the Secretary;
- 17 right?
- 18 A At the Department of State, yes.
- 19 O Mr. Marks; correct?
- 20 A Correct.
- Q And cc'ing you, among others?
- 22 A Right.
- 23 Q All right. And he is writing -- if you
- look at the second paragraph where he says, "I've



- 1 also gotten reports of callers being put on hold for
- 2 up to 10 to 15 minutes. I've also gotten reports of
- 3 getting busy signals when they contact the SURE help
- 4 desk."
- 5 Do you see that?
- A Yes, I do.
- 7 Q When Scott says, "I have also gotten
- 8 reports of callers," you understand what he means is
- 9 he's getting those reports from PennDOT's customer
- 10 service people?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 O Right. These are concerns being
- 13 expressed by your own people up the chain of command,
- 14 and then it's being reported over to the Department
- 15 of State?
- 16 A That's correct.
- O Okay. Now, in some instances when it is
- 18 that the customer service folks from PennDOT make
- 19 contact with the SURE help desk, in some instances
- 20 the SURE help desk will not be available to verify
- 21 that the voters are registered?
- 22 A That is correct. And that is certainly
- 23 some of the reason that people are put on hold while
- 24 the customer service folks at the Department of State



- 1 do the verification.
- 2 As you can see from this email that you
- 3 presented to me -- and again, this is August 30th,
- 4 so it's three days after deployment of the Department
- 5 of State new product, as I testified earlier -- the
- 6 fact of the matter is we did work through some
- 7 issues. This was one of them Scott was bringing to
- 8 the Department of State's attention to work through.
- 9 So there are certain cases, though, where people
- 10 can't be verified.
- 11 Q All right. You made two points that I
- 12 should follow up on.
- 13 The first is you said you worked through
- 14 some of these issues. I take it you would say
- inherent to going to any new process, there will be
- 16 bumps along the way, glitches, issues to be worked
- 17 out, and over time it's your hope that those can all
- 18 be remedied; is that fair?
- 19 A I think I've testified, not only in the
- 20 depositions but as well at the last trial, that by no
- 21 means is PennDOT perfect. We receive 2.4 million
- 22 customers face-to-face every year. And clearly,
- 23 there are going to be instances that need to be
- 24 addressed. But what I can assure you is that we



- 1 address them quickly and effectively once we're made
- 2 aware of a situation.
- 3 So there's no question about the fact,
- 4 when anybody deploys an operational program,
- 5 regardless of what it might be, there are always
- 6 going to be things you learned in deployment that
- 7 there was no way of anticipating leading up to that
- 8 deployment.
- 9 The key to it is that as you define them
- 10 and as you discover them, you address them.
- We have.
- 12 Q Thank you.
- Now, going back to the other thing you
- 14 said was that in some cases the SURE help desk is
- unable to verify the voter's registration status?
- 16 A That's correct.
- 17 O All right. Now, if the voter's
- 18 registration status is confirmed and if everything
- 19 else on the form has been filled out correctly, then
- 20 I take it the PennDOT customer service representative
- 21 ought to be able to issue a DOS ID?
- 22 A That's correct.
- 23 O All right. But in the instance in which
- 24 the SURE help desk says, "We can't verify that the



- 1 voter is, in fact, registered," then the voter does
- 2 not get a DOS ID?
- 3 A Up until last night, as we've said, yes,
- 4 that's correct.
- 5 Q And we're still talking up until last
- 6 night?
- 7 A Right.
- 8 O And in that instance, the matter is for
- 9 DOS to do follow-up on; is that right?
- 10 A That's correct.
- 11 Q Okay. And at that point it's essentially
- 12 out of your hands unless the person is asked to come
- 13 back in again.
- 14 A Correct; because DOS may, after doing
- 15 further research, may find the registration, may get
- 16 the individual registered, in which case they would
- 17 be sent back to receive the DOS ID.
- 18 Q All right. Another reason why a voter
- 19 would be turned down under this process that existed
- 20 until last night for a DOS ID card is if they didn't
- 21 have two proofs of residence?
- 22 A That's correct, although there were
- 23 alternative processes there for some individuals;
- 24 individuals, for example, who were homeless.



- 1 Q Sure. But if a person just came in and
- 2 they didn't know that this was a requirement and the
- 3 customer service representative says "You need two
- 4 proofs of address" and the person says "Well, I don't
- 5 have them or "I only have one," they'd be told to go
- 6 home and get the proofs of address and come back in?
- 7 A That is correct.
- 8 O Another thing that would require the
- 9 voter to go home is if they didn't know their Social
- 10 Security number?
- 11 A Yes, that is also correct.
- 12 O You wouldn't issue the ID at that point?
- 13 A If they said they had a Social Security
- 14 number but they didn't know it, yes, that's correct.
- 15 O And another problem that would result in
- 16 the voter not receiving a DOS ID is if you -- if the
- 17 voter gives their Social Security number but it links
- 18 to a different name, such as their maiden name or a
- 19 birth name if they were adopted, but a name different
- 20 than the name that is in the SURE database and
- 21 different than on the application?
- 22 A Or you're getting into an area that the
- 23 Department of State handles from the standpoint of
- 24 the verification, so I would defer to them to answer



- 1 that question.
- 2 Q Fair enough.
- In fact, just to be clear, in actuality
- 4 there are voters who come for ID who are not
- 5 qualified to get a PennDOT ID and are turned away
- 6 when they apply for a DOS ID; that, in fact, happens?
- 7 A To date, yes, I believe there were
- 8 approximately 55 individuals who are in an
- 9 alternative process from the standpoint of getting
- 10 verification and working with the Department of
- 11 State. And the Department of State, again, would be
- 12 in a better position to say where those individuals
- 13 are.
- And that's an estimate on my part; but
- 15 55, I think it's around that number. But again, they
- 16 could attest to that.
- 17 Q If I put it to you that initially over
- 18 100 voters have been turned away without an ID,
- 19 regardless of whether they later resolve it, does
- 20 that sound right to you?
- 21 A That number sounds high to me. But
- 22 again, it would be the Department of State that would
- 23 have the number.
- Q Very good. We'll ask them.



- 1 Up until last night, up until whenever it
- 2 was you decided to start the process that led to last
- 3 night, is there any reason why you didn't have a
- 4 simple system where a voter could come in, say I
- 5 don't have ID, I need ID to vote, make out an
- 6 affidavit to that effect and get an ID?
- 7 Did anyone ever tell you or did you ever
- 8 tell anyone, no, we can't do that for the following
- 9 reasons?
- 10 A Well, I think I've testified in the past
- 11 that this has been an evolutionary process from the
- 12 standpoint of the initial issuance going back to
- 13 March 15th. The fact of the matter is, we've
- learned as we've gone along and we've made changes,
- 15 the alternative processes that we put into place,
- 16 such as the birth certificate process.
- We've learned, and that was the reason
- 18 why we worked and developed the DOS ID. And
- 19 certainly, since the DOS ID has been put in place,
- 20 we've made some additional changes, with the most
- 21 recent ones being the changes that went in last
- 22 night.
- So we have learned through the process,
- 24 and we've learned ways to make it easier for



- 1 individuals to get?
- Is it something that I believe somebody
- 3 should have thought about before? Again, as I said
- 4 earlier, from an operational standpoint, as an
- 5 administrator, whenever I deploy a program, while as
- 6 much as I may want to think that I've thought about
- 7 everything that needs to happen within the process,
- 8 the reality is you do learn, through the deployment.
- 9 And we have, and we've made changes accordingly.
- 10 Q And I appreciate that answer. My
- 11 question is really a little bit different; which is,
- 12 before, say, the last week or so, had you ever
- 13 participated in a discussion where either you or
- 14 someone else who was a party to the discussion said,
- 15 Why can't we just have people -- voters sign a simple
- 16 affirmation saying something like, "I don't have the
- 17 ID I need to vote, and I need ID so that I can vote"?
- 18 Something like that. Were you ever in a discussion
- 19 like that before the last week, 10 days?
- 20 A I don't recall there being a conversation
- 21 like that. But I think the important part is that
- 22 PennDOT is the conduit for getting these IDs to
- 23 individuals. If there was a conversation of that
- 24 nature, it would have most likely been a conversation



- 1 amongst the folks at the Department of State.
- 2 Q Moving on to another topic.
- 3 Am I correct that if you want an ID to
- 4 vote, you're not supposed to have to pay for it?
- 5 It's supposed to be free?
- 6 A Could you repeat the question.
- 7 Q If a voter comes in and they want an ID
- 8 for voting, whether it's a PennDOT ID or DOS ID, it's
- 9 supposed to be free?
- 10 A If they sign an affirmation stating that
- 11 they have no other form of acceptable ID for voting
- 12 purposes.
- 13 Q Then it's supposed to be free?
- 14 A That is correct.
- 15 Q Let me ask you about the following
- 16 situation:
- 17 If the voter comes in -- withdrawn.
- In order to be valid for voting, the ID
- 19 has to have an expiration date on it, and it has to
- 20 be -- the expiration date has to not have run
- 21 already; correct?
- 22 A Has not what?
- 23 Q I didn't phrase that well. Let me start
- 24 over.



- In most cases -- this is not going to be
- 2 true of the PennDOT ID; but in most cases, your
- 3 understanding is that to have a valid ID for voting,
- 4 the ID has to have an expiration date and the
- 5 expiration has to have not have run already?
- 6 A That is correct, excluding the PennDOT
- 7 ID, driver's license or ID.
- 8 Q And the way the PennDOT ID works is you
- 9 can use that ID even if it's expired so long as it
- 10 hasn't been expired 12 months?
- 11 A Yes; as prescribed by the law.
- 12 Q And if the voter comes to you today --
- 13 not to you personally, Mr. Myers, but to PennDOT to
- 14 the customer service representative and they say:
- 15 "I'm in the system. I have a PennDOT ID, maybe I
- 16 even have it with me"; and says, "It will be
- 17 expired -- it will be 12 months' expired on October
- 18 1st and so I'm going to need an ID for voting; I'd
- 19 like to have that renewed" -- will that individual be
- 20 charged if they bring that in today?
- 21 A They would; because legally they would
- 22 not be allowed to sign the affirmation because the
- 23 affirmation says they have no form of voter ID that's
- 24 appropriate. So at that point, when they come in,



- 1 they do. So they would be violating the law by
- 2 signing the affirmation.
- 3 Q I hear you say that. And I've heard that
- 4 before. But help me with this part. They can't vote
- 5 today. They can't vote on September 25th. They
- 6 can't vote today. They've got to wait until November
- 7 to vote in any case, because there's no election
- 8 today.
- 9 Who is it who would determine that the
- 10 right way to read the law is that you can't give them
- 11 a free ID today, they have to wait until
- 12 October 1st?
- 13 A The Commonwealth's attorneys.
- 14 Q Is there a particular Commonwealth
- 15 attorney?
- 16 A Not one that specifically comes to mind.
- 17 I know the discussion was between the Department of
- 18 State and the PennDOT.
- 19 Q Were you a party to this discussion?
- 20 A I have been involved in discussions,
- 21 specifically the attorneys looking at it.
- In other words, much of those discussions
- 23 were early on back in March. So I don't recall
- 24 specifically who was involved.



- 1 But there was certainly discussion about
- 2 whether or not somebody could sign the oath before
- 3 the product had expired. And the determination was
- 4 made by the parties involved -- and again, there were
- 5 people from the Department of State as well as the
- 6 PennDOT, a chart went out that clearly defined the
- 7 fact that someone would have to pay if it was not a
- 8 product that had been expired for a year. I think
- 9 the law is fairly specific about that.
- 10 Q But in any case, you're not going to
- 11 testify about what the law requires; right?
- 12 A I'm not a lawyer.
- 13 O That's what we have these folks for.
- 14 Are there other instances since you last
- 15 testified in which -- putting aside this particular
- 16 fact set, in which folks who come in and want a
- 17 PennDOT or DOS ID for voting are charged when they
- 18 should receive the ID for free?
- 19 A I just looked at the records this morning
- 20 actually, because this subject matter came up at the
- 21 last trial, and I was asked how many refunds have
- 22 been issued.
- I want to preface this response by saying
- that when a refund is issued, it's not because



- 1 necessarily somebody made a mistake at the center.
- 2 It may simply have been that the customer didn't know
- 3 what their responsibilities were.
- 4 And again, I have stressed from day one
- 5 and in my testimony in the past that this is a shared
- 6 responsibility amongst our customers as well as our
- 7 customer service representatives. It's a shared
- 8 responsibility on the part of the customer to bring
- 9 information, the appropriate information in to the
- 10 centers when they come in.
- 11 But there are times, whether either by
- 12 misunderstanding on the part of the customer or where
- 13 an employee has made a mistake -- again, I've never
- 14 claimed that we're perfect -- that we have been made
- 15 aware of a situation where somebody says, you know, I
- 16 could have signed that affirmation. And when we are
- 17 made aware of that, that individual, when that
- 18 affirmation -- we ask the individual to sign the
- 19 affirmation. We then refund them.
- To date, since March, we have refunded 21
- 21 individuals.
- 22 Q Mr. Myers, in order to get a refund, the
- 23 person would have to first figure out that they could
- 24 have gotten the card for free; right?



- 1 A Well, again, it goes to the shared
- 2 responsibility that I spoke about earlier.
- 3 You say "figure out." There's plenty of
- 4 information on the Web. They're on the call center
- 5 and other areas for people to come to our centers
- 6 well-prepared -- including what times and hours we're
- 7 open.
- 8 Q Mr. Myers, I should have asked this
- 9 first.
- 10 You're not contending that just because
- 11 there are 21 refunds that that's the only -- that's
- 12 the number of people who have been charged for free
- 13 ID who were entitled to get it for free?
- 14 A Well, I think we have to look at facts
- 15 and data.
- To date, since March, we've issued
- 17 approximately 9500 voter, free voter IDs across the
- 18 entire Commonwealth. We've issued, since
- 19 August 27th, approximately 1300 DOS IDs.
- 20 So when you ask me are 22 people
- 21 potentially -- or 21 people potentially the ones who
- 22 should have gotten a free ID and didn't? I don't
- 23 know. That number seems pretty consistent with the
- 24 fact that we've issued less than 10,000 free IDs.



- 1 Q My question is simpler than that.
- 2 Are you testifying that because there are
- 3 21 records of refunds, that only 21 voters who
- 4 applied for PennDOT or DOS ID were charged when, in
- 5 fact, they should have or could have gotten it for
- 6 free?
- 7 A I am testifying that I believe that right
- 8 now there are 21 individuals who have asked for a
- 9 refund. Are there more? I would say probably yes,
- 10 there are probably some others who would qualify for
- 11 a refund.
- But based upon the total number of IDs
- 13 that we've issued free, the 9500 plus the 1300, logic
- 14 would dictate, based upon the facts in the data, that
- 15 while there may be more that are owed a free ID
- 16 because of some misunderstanding or some mistake on
- 17 the part of PennDOT, that number is certainly
- 18 probably not in the hundreds but is well below that
- 19 100 number. That's based upon the facts and the
- 20 data.
- 21 Q Mr. Myers, you said you had checked the
- 22 total number of refunds?
- 23 A That's correct.
- Q When did you do that?



- 1 A This morning.
- O When was the last refund?
- A = I'd have to turn my BlackBerry on.
- 4 MR. GERSCH: I have no objection if --
- 5 THE COURT: Any objection?
- Go ahead.
- 7 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 8 Q Go ahead.
- 9 A I have this by month. And there were
- 10 five refunds issued in September, but I don't know
- 11 the specific date. But in September, we issued five.
- Now, I think it's important to understand
- 13 that simply because the five refunds were done in
- 14 September doesn't mean that the original transaction
- 15 was done in September. It could be somebody as far
- 16 back as March who said I'm signing the affirmation
- 17 now.
- We don't put a time limit on it. If
- 19 somebody comes back and says, "Back in March I was
- 20 here and I paid for this and I shouldn't have, "we
- 21 would refund them.
- Q What's the process for getting the
- 23 refund?
- 24 A The process is, first, as you point out,



- 1 the customer would need to contact us. There is no
- 2 way for us to know. Contact us and say that they
- 3 believe they are owed a refund.
- 4 And that contact may come through a
- 5 legislator. We've had a number of ways the contacts
- 6 have come through to us where we researched it and
- 7 said, Fine, sign the affirmation, and we'll be happy
- 8 to send you a refund check.
- 9 Q How do you communicate with a customer
- 10 voter in that instance?
- 11 A It may be through email, may be through
- 12 telephone. It may be with the legislator being the
- 13 go-between. There's multiple ways that we would end
- 14 up communicating with the --
- 15 O How does the voter end up with the
- 16 affirmation in that situation? So the voter has
- 17 already paid. Somebody, an advocate, a legislator,
- 18 the voter has contacted you and said, Hey, I paid
- 19 when I shouldn't have paid. You do your research,
- 20 you determine, Hey, he's right, she's right. How
- 21 does the voter end up with the affirmation in their
- 22 hands?
- 23 A Well, the affirmation is on the Internet.
- 24 If it's a legislator, we would send them the copy.



- 1 Most likely we would say, Hey, it's on the Web, go
- 2 ahead and print it. Have the individual sign it and
- 3 send it in to us.
- 4 O Let's assume we have a voter who doesn't
- 5 have access to the Internet. How do they get it?
- 6 A In those cases we will mail them one if
- 7 they didn't have any other access to it. They're
- 8 also at our centers.
- 9 Q Do you ever ask them to come in and fill
- 10 out the form?
- 11 A I don't know the specifics of the 21
- 12 cases and specifically how we had them fill the form
- 13 out.
- 14 Q I want to get a sense of why it is that
- 15 these misunderstandings happen in the first place.
- So a voter has come. They say they need
- 17 ID to vote. I am trying to understand what the
- 18 confusion would be.
- 19 You have 71 licensing centers; correct?
- 20 A Driver's licensing centers.
- 21 Q How many customer service representatives
- 22 do you have that service people who want any kind of
- 23 ID for voting?
- 24 A Well, all the staff is trained on being



- 1 able to issue IDs.
- 2 Q Do you have people whose principal job is
- 3 to be a customer service representative?
- 4 A The DLEAs, which is the separation --
- 5 there's a difference between a DLE and a DLEA.
- 6 A DLE can give the actual driving test.
- 7 A DLEA can't. That's my separation between the two
- 8 job responsibilities. But all of them are trained to
- 9 be able to issue IDs.
- 10 Q So how many of those people are there?
- 11 A There's approximately 350 across the
- 12 state.
- Q Okay. And other than the DLEs and DLEAs,
- 14 is there anyone else involved in distributing voter
- 15 IDs to people who apply for them?
- 16 A The regional managers, the district
- 17 managers. Those are all individuals that may at some
- 18 point in time actually process something.
- 19 O So someone comes to the customer service
- 20 representative. They want an ID for voting. I take
- 21 it your customer representatives, all 350 of them,
- 22 and I take it the people more senior who might be
- 23 manning a window at any particular time, they all
- 24 know that if the customer wants an ID for voting,



- 1 they're entitled to it for free? And we're not
- 2 talking about in that situation we discussed earlier
- 3 about the person whose ID has been expired 12 months
- 4 yet. All your folks know this; correct?
- 5 A That's correct.
- 6 Q So how is it that people end up getting
- 7 charged? Do your folks not make clear that they're
- 8 entitled to it for free?
- 9 A It goes back to my comment earlier about
- 10 a shared responsibility. And when customers come in,
- if there are situations where the customer doesn't
- 12 inform us that they want a voter ID, some customers
- 13 come in and they don't tell us they're here for a
- 14 voter ID. They simply say they're here for an ID.
- So there are situations where, when the
- 16 customer comes in, that's where the potential is for
- 17 a mistake to be made; not intentionally, but simply
- 18 because of the fact that the customer didn't realize
- 19 that perhaps they could sign the affirmation.
- 20 My employees are instructed to let people
- 21 know, and it's part of their -- our expectation is
- 22 that they ask the customer if they're getting an ID
- 23 for voting purposes. And if they are, they certainly
- 24 go through the affirmation and what needs to happen



- 1 from the standpoint of them being able to sign the
- 2 affirmation.
- To the best of my knowledge, I believe
- 4 there have also been some cases where individuals
- 5 have believed that they were owed a free ID when in
- 6 point of fact they didn't qualify for one.
- 7 Q What would be a situation if you didn't
- 8 qualify for a free ID?
- 9 A They weren't able to sign the
- 10 affirmation. After reading it, they had other forms
- of ID that would be useable for voting purposes.
- 12 O I see.
- But the way you would want it to work is
- 14 the way you were describing. You want your folks,
- when a voter comes up to a person, you don't know why
- 16 they're there, you want them to say, why do you want
- 17 the ID? Do you want it for voting? And if the
- 18 person says yes, I want it for voting, you want your
- 19 folks to say, if you can sign this affirmation,
- 20 you'll get it for free?
- 21 A Absolutely. As I testified before, we're
- 22 in the business of issuing IDs, not denying people
- 23 IDs.
- Q If you or a voter who applied for PennDOT



- 1 ID before August 27th and were rejected, has
- 2 PennDOT send them any communication since then
- 3 saying, you know, I know we rejected you last time,
- 4 but we have a new procedure, a DOS card, and please
- 5 come back so we can give you the DOS card or so that
- 6 you can apply for a DOS card?
- 7 A My recollection is yes, we did. We sent
- 8 a letter out to those individuals who had previously
- 9 been denied.
- 10 Q When you say it's your recollection, who
- 11 would know?
- 12 A Scott Shenk.
- 13 Q Anyone else?
- 14 A I suspect that there would be other
- 15 people in the organization that would know, but I
- 16 believe that Scott had responsibility for that
- 17 communication.
- 18 Q And it would come from PennDOT, not from
- 19 DOS?
- 20 A That would come from PennDOT, yes.
- 21 Q Just to go over the numbers, we were
- 22 provided with information through September 19th.
- 23 A Yes.
- Q So maybe you have more recent data.



- 1 The data we received was that through
- 2 September 19th, since the law had been passed, only
- 3 8,795 PennDOT IDs for voting had been issued; is that
- 4 right?
- 5 A That number sounds right for last week,
- 6 yes.
- 7 Q Do you have a more current number for
- 8 this week?
- 9 A Yes, I had said earlier I believe that, I
- 10 think it's somewhere around 9500, 9300, somewhere in
- 11 that range.
- 12 Q All right. And the other information we
- 13 were given is that since August 27th, only 105
- 14 DOS -- I'm sorry -- only about 1,005 DOS cards had
- 15 been issued; is that right?
- 16 A That sounds approximate for last week.
- 17 As I said earlier, it's now somewhere around 1350
- 18 that have been issued.
- 19 Q Is that something you checked this
- 20 morning?
- 21 A Yes, it is.
- 22 Q All right. When we had our last hearing,
- 23 I had understood you to say that PennDOT issued on
- 24 the order of 45,000 initial identifications, driver's



- 1 license, nondriver's license, a month. Do you recall
- 2 that testimony?
- 3 A I do. But it also includes learner's
- 4 permits, which is a part of that whole process.
- 5 (Petitioners' 136 was marked for
- 6 identification.)
- 7 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 8 Q Let me show you what's been marked
- 9 Exhibit 136.
- 10 Are you familiar with Exhibit 136,
- 11 Mr. Myers?
- 12 A Yes, I am.
- 13 O What is that?
- 14 A This is the number of initial licenses
- 15 issued and initial photo IDs issued for 2011 and
- 16 2012, comparison of March through September.
- 17 Q So if I'm reading this right, it looks
- 18 like August is your busiest month?
- 19 A That is correct.
- 20 Q And in August, you issued on the order of
- 21 37,000 total initial licenses and photo IDs?
- 22 A That is correct.
- 23 O And that would be a little bit above what
- 24 you did last August?



- 1 A A little, yeah.
- 2 Q And on the low end, you have months,
- 3 looks like March was a particularly slow month where
- 4 you issued on the order of 18,000 IDs.
- 5 A That's correct. And again, these numbers
- 6 don't include learner's permits and what we discussed
- 7 at the last trial.
- Q And the learner's permits, I take it
- 9 those will also fluctuate, depending on the month?
- 10 A They certainly do. August is a big month
- 11 for learner's permits, as is the entire summer for
- 12 kids out of school.
- 13 Q Okay. But in any case, we're talking
- 14 somewhere in the neighborhood of 35-, 45,000 IDs a
- 15 month; right?
- 16 A That's correct.
- 17 O A busy month would be 45,000 IDs?
- 18 A That's a fair statement.
- 19 Q Most months, it looks like you'll be
- 20 below that, even with the learner's permits?
- 21 A That's correct.
- 22 Q I take it if 30,000 people came in in a
- 23 month, 30,000 new people came in in a month who
- 24 needed ID, that would be a substantial burden for



- 1 your department.
- 2 A If 30,000 additional people beyond what's
- 3 here came in --
- 4 O Yes.
- 5 A -- in that hypothetical, certainly that
- 6 would stretch our abilities.
- 7 THE COURT: I'm not sure I understood the
- 8 answer.
- 9 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 11 A It would stretch our ability to be able
- 12 to service them.
- 13 THE COURT: What I didn't understand is,
- 14 what number are we talking about that would stretch
- 15 your ability?
- 16 THE WITNESS: An additional 30,000
- 17 customers on top of the customers that we currently
- 18 have, which is somewhere around 35- to 40,000 a
- 19 month, so essentially doubling our business.
- 20 THE COURT: So we're talking if 60- to
- 21 70,000 people, 60- to 70,000 people came in for some
- 22 sort of initial license or initial photo license,
- 23 that would be pushing it?
- 24 THE WITNESS: That would be pushing it.



- 1 THE COURT: Got it.
- 2 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 3 Q And that's because it would be an
- 4 increase on the order of 100 percent?
- 5 A Yes.
- 6 O Right. Okay. And am I right that
- 7 there's no document, there's no actual analysis that
- 8 we could look at where the department has analyzed
- 9 how it would handle large additional numbers of
- 10 people seeking ID. When I say "large" for these
- 11 purposes, I'll use on the order of 30,000; but if
- 12 you've done it for 10,000, I'd like to know that; if
- 13 you've done it for 50,000.
- I take it there's no such analysis at
- 15 PennDOT.
- A Well, I believe in my deposition as well
- 17 as the previous trial, I had made it clear that there
- 18 was no analysis because the data and facts didn't
- 19 support doing an analysis. By your own words
- 20 earlier, you said there was a slight increase from
- 21 2012 for August in comparison to 2011. I would agree
- 22 with that statement. There is a slight increase.
- So we haven't seen huge, huge number of
- 24 increases. Again, that goes back to my testimony



- 1 earlier of 93-, 9500 free IDs issued in total and the
- 2 1300 DOS IDs that have been issued. The data just
- 3 doesn't support that there are hundreds and hundreds
- 4 of thousands of individuals out there that don't have
- 5 IDs.
- 6 Q That is your opinion, I take it?
- 7 A It is my personal opinion, based upon the
- 8 facts that I see.
- 9 Q When you say "based upon the facts," the
- 10 first question is, you've done no analysis of how
- 11 you'd handle a significant increase in the number
- 12 of --
- 13 A That's absolutely correct.
- 14 Q -- of applicants; correct?
- 15 A That is correct.
- 16 Q And the second thing -- and I don't want
- 17 to reiterate what we did last time -- but as long as
- 18 we're on this topic, since we were last here before
- 19 Your Honor, since we were last here, you've done no
- 20 work to estimate the number of people who don't have
- 21 ID and would need ID to vote?
- 22 A That is correct.
- 23 Q Did you happen to read the Supreme
- 24 Court's opinion in this case?



- 1 A I breezed through it. I will not say I
- 2 read it in detail, nor am I an attorney to understand
- 3 some of the things that are said.
- 4 Q Sure, sure. And this is not going to be
- 5 a legal question. If it is, I'm sure I'll draw an
- 6 objection.
- 7 Did you see the part of the opinion where
- 8 the Court expressed concern that this law might
- 9 impact what they call vulnerable groups, the elderly
- 10 and disabled, the financially disadvantaged? Do you
- 11 recall that part of the opinion?
- 12 A I do recall that comment. I don't
- 13 remember the exact words. Yes.
- 14 Q Okay. Have you done any work to
- 15 determine the number of the people in those groups
- 16 who don't have ID and need ID to vote?
- 17 A No.
- 18 Q Have you done any work to determine
- 19 whether those groups -- because of their age or
- 20 because of their disability, because of their
- 21 financial status, whether they need additional help
- 22 above and beyond what you're doing already in order
- 23 to get ID to vote with?
- 24 A Well, in general, our staff is instructed



- 1 to help all of our customers. That's nothing new
- 2 since the voter ID. And when people have individual
- 3 health issues or some other issue that may restrict
- 4 them, we do whatever we possibly can, based upon the
- 5 business environment, to help them.
- 6 We have a wonderful letter from an
- 7 individual, a woman who was turning 100 before her
- 8 election. She sent me a letter. Because our staff
- 9 person, when the individual drove up with her friend,
- 10 she was too frail to come into the center, our staff
- 11 person went out, got all of her paperwork, allowed
- 12 her to sit in the car, got her paperwork processed,
- 13 and then they wheeled her in, put her in line, and
- 14 had her picture taken and then got her back to her
- 15 car.
- Our staff has done yeoman's work when it
- 17 comes to working with various locations. I have one
- 18 employee who took his day on off on a Monday to go to
- 19 an assisted-living center to help gather paperwork,
- 20 bring it back, look at the paperwork, get it done and
- 21 take that work back to the center.
- So in answer to your question, "Have we
- 23 done anything specifically since the Supreme Court
- 24 ruling has come out?" and the answer to that is no.



- 1 I would answer that it has historically
- 2 been standard operating procedures for our folks to
- 3 take care of our customers to the best of their
- 4 ability.
- 6 that on many occasions PennDOT rises to the occasion,
- 7 goes above and beyond. But my particular concern is
- 8 with people here who may not even get to PennDOT;
- 9 have you done any kind of outreach to try and
- 10 identify the people who, say, are having difficulty
- 11 getting to PennDOT in the first place?
- 12 A We have certainly done outreach from the
- 13 standpoint of assisted-living centers, nursing homes,
- 14 things of that nature, where we've sent people to
- 15 visit those centers and help with paperwork and
- 16 things of that nature. We've done as much as we
- 17 possibly can to facilitate the process.
- 18 Certainly PennDOT has the Shared-Ride
- 19 program. A couple months ago, a letter went out to
- 20 all the Shared-Ride Program operators, making sure
- 21 that they understood that they were to allow people
- 22 to get on the Shared-Ride and Cross County lines if
- 23 they needed to, to get people to driver's licensing
- 24 centers.



- 1 And, of course, if you're disabled or
- 2 over the age of 65 -- it's not a program under my
- 3 responsibility -- but I believe there are significant
- 4 discounts for people in those categories to -- from
- 5 the standpoint of the cost associated with getting
- 6 those rides.
- 7 Q And I don't doubt that people are being
- 8 helped with those programs. But I take it, since you
- 9 don't know the size of the need, you can't actually
- 10 compare what you've accomplished against what the
- 11 size of the need is to determine whether you've met
- 12 all the need, part of the need or a smidgen of the
- 13 need?
- 14 A It's interesting you ask that question.
- 15 Because the fact of the matter is that, no, I can't
- 16 specifically quantify the need.
- But what I can tell you is that we've had
- 18 a number of situations. Just recently, about a week
- 19 ago, we had an individual who contacted us to come in
- 20 on a Saturday with a group of people who apparently
- 21 supposedly didn't have IDs. And as a point of fact,
- 22 I actually sent one of my employees from Harrisburg
- 23 down, because this group was a Latino group, and he
- 24 is fluent in Spanish. And we wanted to make sure



- 1 that he would be there to help facilitate from a
- 2 language standpoint, just in case there were any
- 3 language barriers.
- 4 He went from Harrisburg to Philadelphia,
- 5 got to the center at Columbus Boulevard, and
- 6 unfortunately no one showed up.
- 7 That has occurred on other occasions as
- 8 well where we've made arrangements for groups to come
- 9 and then no one comes.
- I can only assume -- and it's an
- 11 assumption on my part -- that the individual,
- 12 although good-intentioned to bring people in who
- 13 didn't have IDs, I could only assume they couldn't
- 14 find anybody who didn't have an ID, so there was no
- 15 one to bring.
- 16 Q You're not testifying, Mr. Myers, there's
- 17 no one out there, no disabled person, no elderly
- 18 person, no person who is financially disadvantaged,
- 19 who is having difficulty getting to PennDOT, are you?
- 20 A I'm not testifying to that at all, no.
- 21 Q You mentioned the Shared-Ride Program.
- Is it the case that you've got to show ID
- in order to be able to avail yourself of the
- 24 Shared-Ride Program?



- 1 A Again, as I stated earlier in my
- 2 testimony, that's not a program that's specifically
- 3 under my responsibility, and so I don't know the
- 4 answer to that question.
- 5 Q Have you heard that? Have you heard that
- 6 complaint, that when people want to use the
- 7 Shared-Ride Program so that they could come and get
- 8 ID, they, in fact, have to show ID in order to avail
- 9 themselves of it?
- 10 A I have not heard that complaint. And I
- 11 would ask only, what is the ID? Are you saying ID
- 12 and that it has to be a picture ID or are you saying
- 13 ID simply that someone has to show a bill or
- 14 something of that nature?
- 15 Again, I don't know the program, so I
- 16 don't know what ID is being required.
- 17 (Petitioners' 192 was marked for
- identification.)
- 19 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 20 Q Fair enough. Let me show you what's been
- 21 marked Exhibit 192, which is, I want to be clear,
- 22 does not show you being copied on. It's an email
- 23 exchange with Megan Sweeney, the assistant to the
- 24 Secretary. And if you've not seen this before, this



- 1 reflects someone's complaint about the situation I'm
- 2 talking about. If you've not seen this before, you
- 3 can put it aside. So let me know if you've --
- 4 A I'm sorry. What was the question again?
- 6 situation that's being documented on Exhibit --
- 7 A I need to read it real quick here.
- 8 MR. CAWLEY: Your Honor, objection. I
- 9 think the question was whether he's seen the document
- 10 before.
- 11 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 12 Q We can start with that. Have you seen
- 13 this document before?
- 14 A I don't recall ever seeing this document.
- 15 Q Regardless of whether you've seen
- 16 Exhibit 192 before, are you familiar with the
- 17 situation that is discussed there?
- 18 A No, I was not aware of the situation.
- 19 Q All right. You can put that aside.
- 20 One of the things you mentioned earlier
- 21 in your testimony was this process by which, when new
- 22 procedures are implemented, things come up; and over
- 23 time you work through them and try and address
- 24 issues.



- 1 One thing I want to reference is, this
- 2 new procedure whereby you've streamlined the process
- 3 by which PennDOT can verify someone's birth record, I
- 4 just want to ask you about that.
- The procedure that you've come up with
- 6 today, is there a reason that couldn't have been
- 7 implemented before?
- 8 A The answer to that is no. But, again, as
- 9 I said earlier, this has been an evolutionary
- 10 process, as we've learned. And this is something
- 11 that we listened to our customers. We listened to
- 12 the concerns that were being expressed, and we made
- 13 adjustments to our program accordingly.
- 14 O All right. Let's turn now to the events
- 15 of last night and the events that led up to it. And
- 16 the new DOS ID.
- 17 All right. So as of last night, I take
- 18 it, there's a new application for a DOS ID; is that
- 19 right?
- 20 A That is correct.
- 21 Q And some other new documents that pertain
- 22 to the new DOS ID?
- 23 A Yes. There are -- there are some updated
- 24 training documents, things of that nature, yes.



- 1 Q I'll show you some in a moment. My first
- 2 question, though, is, is there someone who is in
- 3 charge or the point person for implementing the new
- 4 DOS ID program, I'll call it?
- 5 A Us, certainly.
- 6 Q "Us" being PennDOT?
- 7 A Certainly from the standpoint -- were you
- 8 asking a specific person?
- 9 Q Yes, a person, a name.
- 10 A Specifically within PennDOT, that would
- 11 be Scott Shenk's responsibility.
- 12 Q Okay. And let me go back -- I should
- 13 have asked this question first. Is there -- who made
- 14 the decision that the process for getting a DOS ID
- 15 should be changed?
- 16 A The decision, I believe, was made by the
- 17 Department of State and the Office of General
- 18 Counsel.
- 19 Q How did you find out about the decision?
- 20 A I found out about it, I believe, early
- 21 last week, if not late the week before, where there
- 22 were conversations that we started talking about how
- 23 we might change it. And it was specifically based
- 24 upon the findings of the Supreme Court.



- 1 So it was information, then, to look at
- 2 that and say, Is there a way that we can modify our
- 3 program? So there were a number of discussions about
- 4 how the program may or may not change.
- 5 Q And who did you first hear this from?
- A I believe it was PennDOT's chief counsel,
- 7 to the best of my recollection.
- 8 0 Who is that?
- 9 A That would be Bill Cressler.
- 10 Q I'm sorry. Bill?
- 11 A Bill Cressler.
- 12 Q And did you have input into how this new
- 13 DOS program would be either designed, implemented,
- 14 anything like that?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q And are you the person that assigned
- 17 Scott Shenk to be the coordinator for PennDOT?
- 18 A Well, in his role and his position,
- 19 that's his responsibility. Any type of deployment
- 20 out to the field for driver licensing centers falls
- 21 under his responsibility.
- 22 (Petitioners' 226 was marked for
- identification.)
- 24 BY MR. GERSCH:



- 1 Q Let me show you what's been marked as
- 2 Exhibit 226.
- 3 What's that document?
- 4 A This is the form the Department of
- 5 State -- their form that we utilize at our centers.
- 6 And it's a change of name for a replacement of a lost
- 7 or stolen or mutilated Department of State card. So
- 8 this is not the initial application. This is the
- 9 replacement of a product that's been lost or stolen
- 10 or mutilated.
- 11 O It's not a seamless machine. I showed
- 12 you the wrong document.
- 13 (Petitioners' 225 was marked for
- identification.)
- 15 BY MR. GERSCH:
- Let me hand you Exhibit 225. Here you
- 17 go, Mr. Myers.
- 18 A Thank you.
- 19 Q If you take a look at Exhibit 225, and
- 20 after you've had a chance to review it, tell us what
- 21 this is.
- 22 A This is the form for the initial
- 23 issuance, the new form for the initial issuance for a
- 24 Department of State ID.



- 1 Q In the lower right-hand corner, what's
- 2 the date?
- 3 A 9/24/12.
- 4 O So this is a document that was at least
- 5 finalized last night; is that right?
- 6 A That would be correct.
- 7 Q Am I right this is the final version?
- 8 A It appears to be, yes.
- 9 Q Okay. And this is the version that you
- 10 say would have gone out either last night or sometime
- 11 this morning to your driver's license centers?
- 12 A That is correct.
- 13 Q Okay. Let me ask you a few questions
- 14 about this.
- So one thing that I see is missing is,
- 16 remember that paragraph we looked at at the very top
- 17 of the old form?
- 18 A Yes.
- 19 Q That paragraph is gone; right?
- 20 A That is correct.
- 21 Q So the exhaustion requirement contained
- in that paragraph, that's been eliminated?
- 23 A That is correct.
- Q Okay. And another thing that I don't see



- 1 anywhere on this form is -- and we'll look at another
- 2 document in a minute -- there's no requirement for
- 3 two proofs of residency; is that right?
- 4 A That is also correct.
- 6 A That is correct.
- 7 (Petitioners' 224 was marked for
- 8 identification.)
- 9 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 10 Q All right. Let me show you -- let me
- 11 show you what's been marked Exhibit 224.
- 12 Take a look at that document. And when
- 13 you've had a chance to review it, tell us what that
- 14 is.
- 15 A This was the identified process flow.
- 16 Q Okay. Does this describe the process for
- 17 issuing the new DOS card?
- 18 A I believe so, yes.
- 19 O And what's the date in the lower
- 20 right-hand corner?
- 21 A Again, 9/24/12.
- 22 O So this is another document from
- 23 yesterday?
- 24 A That's correct.



- 1 Q All right. And the caption says, Amended
- 2 Proposal for the DOS Voter ID Process.
- 3 Do you know why it's called "proposal"?
- 4 A I do not. This document was prepared by
- 5 the Department of State.
- 6 Q Do you understand that this is a final
- 7 document?
- 8 A I don't know that without specifically
- 9 comparing it against what documents I have that are
- 10 final. And there's two pages here of detail. I
- 11 don't know if there's any tweaks in here that
- 12 something got changed.
- 13 Q Certainly. Let me ask you this
- 14 question -- and it won't be a question about the
- document, although if it's helpful, feel free to look
- 16 at it.
- 17 The question I have is, okay, so the
- 18 exhaustion requirement has been eliminated. The two
- 19 proofs of residency have been eliminated. Are there
- 20 any other requirements for the DOS card that have
- 21 been eliminated as of last night?
- 22 A Yes; the gender question.
- 23 O Anything else besides the gender
- 24 question?



- 1 A I don't believe so, other than the
- 2 primary requirement, which was before it was a safety
- 3 net product; and now it can be issued the first
- 4 product when somebody comes in. So we're not going
- 5 through the process of trying to issue somebody a
- 6 PennDOT ID. We're now going immediately to the
- 7 DOS ID.
- 8 Q I'm curious, why was the gender
- 9 requirement --
- 10 A That was a Department of State request
- 11 that it be removed. And I believe -- here again, I
- 12 believe that it was a certain constituency group that
- 13 asked for this. But I don't know the specific
- 14 details of it, and the Department of State would
- 15 really be the best to answer that.
- 16 Q Certainly. We'll hold that question for
- 17 them.
- 18 All right. Any other requirements that
- 19 have been eliminated in the new DOS program?
- 20 A Again, as far as the process works, I
- 21 think what's important here, as I said earlier, is
- 22 that the product has now become the first product
- 23 that we would issue as far as free ID is concerned.
- 24 We will still be verifying registration,



- 1 as we've noted before. And I said it was somewhere
- 2 around 55; you had a number somewhere of 100.
- 3 Regardless of what that number is, there were some
- 4 people who were turned away, if you will.
- 5 I think the most significant aspect of
- 6 this new process is the fact that even if we can't
- 7 verify that somebody is a registered voter, what we
- 8 will do is still process their work; and we will take
- 9 their photo. We will produce a card. However, we
- 10 will hold that card and take the card along with a
- 11 voter registration form, filled out by the customer.
- 12 We will send that to the Department of State. The
- 13 Department of State will take the steps necessary to
- 14 get the individual registered with the County.
- 15 Again, I'm not an expert on that process.
- 16 Department of State would have to refer to that. And
- 17 at that point in time, once the individual is
- 18 registered, the card would be sent to the individual.
- 19 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 20 Q Okay. Let me just make sure we
- 21 understand.
- 22 Mostly I want to make sure I distinguish
- 23 between what PennDOT does and DOS does because we
- 24 want to save the DOS questions for DOS.



- 1 A I understand.
- 2 Q So on the PennDOT end, do you still --
- 3 will you still have your customer representative
- 4 phone over to the SURE help desk?
- 5 A Yes, we will.
- 6 Q Okay. And I take it what you're talking
- 7 about now is if the SURE help desk says to you, "We
- 8 can't verify that this is a registered voter, "then
- 9 instead of your old process, you will create a card
- 10 for that person; and you will forward the card and
- 11 the paperwork to the Department of State, and they'll
- 12 take it from there?
- 13 A Correct. And they'll have the
- 14 registration form. There's two reasons why somebody
- 15 might not get verified. One might be because they
- 16 were -- they signed up in the voter registration
- 17 drive and it hasn't gotten through the process.
- But there's also a possibility that
- 19 somebody may walk in and say, "I'm gonna register to
- 20 vote. I want to register to vote. But I haven't
- 21 done it yet." So we'll have the form; we do now.
- 22 Those forms, they've always been there. They can
- 23 fill the paper form out, get their picture taken.
- 24 We'll take the card. We'll take the form. We'll



- 1 send it to the Department of State and get them
- 2 processed.
- 3 Q When you say, We have those forms there,
- 4 are you talking about the "motor voter" registration
- 5 form?
- 6 A The application to register to vote, yes.
- 7 Q So, in other words, so if a person comes
- 8 in and they say, "I'm not registered, but I want to
- 9 register," you will now service them -- it will be a
- 10 one-stop shopping now?
- 11 A That is correct. And we will also ask
- 12 customers, even if they say that they've been at a
- 13 voter registration drive and filled out the paper,
- 14 we're still going to have them fill them out, just so
- 15 when we send them in to the Department of State --
- 16 I'm sorry -- just so when we fill them out to the
- 17 Department of State. They've gotten that
- 18 registration application along with the card.
- 19 So if by chance somehow or another that
- 20 paperwork doesn't get from the other mechanism that
- 21 that person filled out, we'll have that fallback of
- 22 them having the documentation from us.
- 23 Q At the point where you sent the
- 24 paperwork, whatever it is, and it's just the



- 1 application and the photo, maybe it's the
- 2 application, the photo and the registration, at
- 3 whatever point that you send it on to the Department
- 4 of State, is PennDOT now out of the picture?
- 5 A We would be out of the picture at that
- 6 point.
- 7 Q So if the card is going to be -- if the
- 8 Department of State makes the decision, okay, we have
- 9 now been able to determine what we could not before;
- 10 this person is registered; they should get an
- 11 identification under this new system -- it's up to
- 12 PennDOT to deal with the voter at that point?
- 13 A You mean the --
- 14 Q I'm sorry. It's up to the Department of
- 15 State to deal with the voter --
- 16 A Department of State, yes.
- 17 O I saw you double take. I realized I must
- 18 have asked that wrong.
- 19 Okay. Let me ask you a couple other
- 20 questions.
- 21 If -- what happens if the Social
- 22 Security -- withdrawn. Let me ask this question.
- Does PennDOT verify whether the voter who
- 24 is standing in front of the customer service



- 1 representative, whether their Social Security number
- 2 matches their name?
- 3 A For the issuance of a DOS ID?
- 4 O Yes.
- 5 A No. That's the Department of State.
- 6 O Okay. And is that something that is
- 7 supposed to be resolved in the phone call that you
- 8 place to the SURE help desk?
- 9 A That's part of the verification process;
- 10 but DOS or Department of State would be able to refer
- 11 better to that than I can.
- 12 Q But in any case, you could get a response
- 13 from the Department of State: We're not issuing this
- 14 because we can't verify the Social Security number?
- 15 A Well, now, under the new system we would
- 16 issue, because we would issue from the standpoint of
- 17 getting them through, getting their picture taken;
- 18 and then we would send all that information to the
- 19 Department of State.
- 20 So if they came back and said, "We can't
- 21 verify because the Social Security number doesn't
- 22 match, as an example of your scenario, we'd still
- 23 now go through the entire process, send that to them.
- 24 So it could be a data-entry error.



- 1 There's a whole bunch of things that potentially
- 2 could happen.
- 3 Q Sure.
- 4 A But they would work to get that
- 5 straightened out. Once they did, then they would
- 6 send the card to the individual.
- 7 Q Okay. Just so I make sure I understand,
- 8 if, for whatever reason, the Department of State,
- 9 when your folks call the Department of State, the
- 10 SURE help desk, for whatever the reason the
- 11 Department of State representative says, "We can't
- 12 give you the go-ahead to issue, " you will nonetheless
- 13 take the picture, assemble the paperwork and send it
- on to the Department of State; but in that instance,
- 15 you will not actually issue a card to the voter?
- 16 A That's correct. We'll produce a card but
- 17 not issue one.
- 18 O Okay. And the question of whether
- 19 certain things are disqualifying in that as a result
- 20 of the verification process, that's a question for
- 21 the Department of State?
- 22 A That is a Department of State process.
- 23 Again, we're the conduit.
- 24 THE COURT: You can't be yawning. You



- 1 can't be yawning.
- 2 MR. WALCZAK: I'm sorry. You want me to
- 3 not yawn. It's as interesting for me as it is for
- 4 you.
- 5 MR. GERSCH: We're coming to the end.
- 6 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 7 Q You made reference to training materials,
- 8 I think. Is there a -- is that right?
- 9 A Training --
- 10 Q Withdrawn.
- 11 Is there a training manual for PennDOT
- 12 for the new DOS program, the new DOS ID program?
- 13 A There was a training document that was
- 14 put together for the original deployment of the DOS
- 15 program; and then there was an updated training
- 16 program that I believe was either sent last night or
- 17 this morning. For our staff these changes are minor
- 18 from a standpoint of a deployment standpoint. There
- 19 isn't a lot of change for our staff.
- 20 So there was not a great deal that needed
- 21 to take place other than a general communication that
- 22 was this morning -- there was a conference call this
- 23 morning where all the regional and division managers
- 24 were brought up-to-date and informed the process of



- 1 the change and what we were doing.
- 2 Q Besides getting the new application form
- 3 for the DOS ID, what other materials should there be
- 4 there were circulated to your staff?
- 5 A Again, there was the update to our staff,
- 6 again was either sent last night or first thing this
- 7 morning.
- 8 And that update was the update to the
- 9 training document, that is, the original training
- 10 update that went out.
- 11 There was also a memo that went out to
- 12 PIBH. If you recall from previous testimony, the
- 13 last trial, PIBH is our contractor. They're the
- 14 individuals that actually take the photos at the
- 15 photo centers.
- 16 Q Okay. The first document you mentioned
- 17 was called the update?
- 18 A Correct.
- 19 Q And the update, how many pages would that
- 20 have been?
- 21 A The entire document, I believe, is around
- 22 12 pages. But those 12 pages are from the original
- 23 training. The parts that were actually updated --
- 24 for example, as I said, they're not required to



- 1 capture gender anymore. From the standpoint of male
- 2 or female, we now -- we put a code in there, and they
- 3 were given the instructions on what the new code is
- 4 to put in. So -- but other than that, that change,
- 5 also the fact that they don't have to collect or see
- 6 or image the documents that somebody uses for
- 7 verifying address.
- 8 So that's in there, but most of that is,
- 9 again, a couple sentences. It's not significant the
- 10 amount that had to be changed.
- 11 Q In any case, there was something sent out
- 12 either last night or this morning?
- 13 A I believe it was either late last night
- 14 or early this morning.
- 15 Q Is there a schedule by which the customer
- 16 service representatives are supposed to be trained in
- 17 these new procedures, new forms?
- 18 A Well, again, as I stated earlier, there's
- 19 not a lot to train somebody on on this.
- We're simply telling them that they are
- 21 no longer required to look at address verification
- 22 documents. The form itself, as we looked here
- 23 before, the Exhibit 225, asked for the customer's
- 24 address, so they're filling that out on this form.



- 1 Q You're not required to exhaust also --
- 2 you don't have to exhaust the PennDOT ID?
- 3 A That's correct. There are some people
- 4 who want the PennDOT ID because it can be used for
- 5 more things than just voting.
- 6 Q Let me go back to my question. Is there
- 7 a schedule by which their 350-odd people will be
- 8 trained with respect to the new DOS ID program?
- 9 A Well, training would suggest that there's
- 10 a complexity to this process change. That doesn't
- 11 exist. There is not a complexity to it. This is
- 12 really straightforward for our folks.
- 13 Q Are you not going to train them?
- 14 A What I said was that we informed them
- 15 this morning and our division manager as well as our
- 16 regional managers are working with our supervisors in
- 17 our locations first thing this morning to go out and
- 18 make them aware of the changes so that their staff is
- 19 made aware of the changes.
- But to suggest somehow someone needs to
- 21 sit in a room like we did for the training on the DOS
- 22 ID, we spent a number of overtime hours in both the
- 23 morning and in the afternoon bringing staff in where
- 24 we sat them down and said, here are all the aspects



- 1 of the new DOS ID, because that was more detail, more
- 2 in-depth.
- 3 These changes are really quite minor.
- 4 It's just really a matter of saying from here on out,
- 5 this is how we want you to handle these applications.
- 6 Q I hear you saying that, but you raise an
- 7 interesting point. So how did you train your staff
- 8 when the first iteration of the DOS ID program came
- 9 out? What did you do in that instance?
- 10 A Well, again, we sent a training document,
- 11 which we had. Here again, we updated that training
- 12 document for this most recent deployment. But in
- 13 that particular case, as I said, there was more to
- 14 that than what we're talking about here.
- So there, we brought people in, we did --
- 16 I believe we did a Webinar with folks at the centers
- 17 after hours where we sat them down, and I believe the
- 18 training sessions were like an hour, hour and a half,
- 19 something of that nature.
- Q When you say you brought them in, are you
- 21 referring to customer service representatives coming
- 22 in to their own location?
- 23 A To their own location.
- O Not coming here to Harrisburg?



- 1 A Oh, no, no.
- 2 Q How about the training for the
- 3 supervisory personnel? I take it they were trained
- 4 first before the line people?
- 5 A If I recall correctly, I believe that
- 6 there was -- that there was a process by which we did
- 7 a Webinar with the regional and the division
- 8 managers, and then we did it with the supervisors.
- I don't recall the specifics of exactly
- 10 how it was put together.
- 11 Q And how are you training the managerial
- 12 folks in this round?
- 13 A Well, again, because this is not nearly
- 14 as detailed as it was on the initial deployment of
- 15 the product, this is really just nothing more than
- 16 the ability to reach out and talk to them, see if
- 17 they have any questions.
- 18 This is pretty standard stuff for our
- 19 folks. So training is conference call; training is
- 20 the updated document they can read over if they have
- 21 any questions. And then training is the outreach to
- 22 our employees to talk to them this morning to let
- 23 them know what needs to be deployed.
- O When is the conference call?



- 1 A It already occurred. It occurred at
- 2 quarter of 8:00 this morning.
- 3 Q And who ran the call for PennDOT?
- 4 A Scott Shenk.
- And then do I understand that they'll
- 7 be -- you're not going to bring in the customer
- 8 service representatives the way you did last time;
- 9 right?
- 10 A No, again, because there's no need to do
- 11 that.
- 12 Q I keep hearing you say there's no need.
- 13 Did anyone say, you know, it would be a good idea if
- 14 we did something like we did last time where we
- 15 brought them all in and sat them down and explained
- 16 to them this is really important about getting folks'
- 17 ID for voting and we want to make sure we get it
- 18 right? Did anyone say that?
- 19 A No, no one specifically said that.
- 20 Operationally, my employees understand the importance
- 21 of making sure that every individual has an ID.
- 22 Q Just a couple more questions. When you
- 23 usually process motor voter registrations, is it the
- 24 case that those are transmitted electronically?



- 1 A I'm sorry. Could you rephrase or ask the
- 2 next question again?
- 3 Q Sure.
- 4 A I'm sorry.
- 5 Q You could -- without reference to the DOS
- 6 ID card program, if someone came in in January of
- 7 this year and said I want a driver's license and I
- 8 want to register to vote, you would process them for
- 9 both of those things?
- 10 A Absolutely, yes.
- 11 Q And am I right that in those instances,
- 12 you would transmit the voter registrations
- 13 electronically?
- 14 A That's correct. We take application as
- 15 part of the process of issuing the photo
- 16 identification.
- 17 Q With reference to the new DOS program,
- 18 are you transmitting the registrations
- 19 electronically?
- 20 A No. In those cases where an individual
- 21 has not been found to be registered and/or is someone
- 22 who says I'm registered but it's not showing up on
- 23 the system, it will be in paper form that they'll
- 24 fill out, and the paper form and the ID will be sent



- 1 to the Department of State.
- 2 Q Why is it done on paper in that instance
- 3 as opposed to electronically, the way you would in
- 4 the normal course?
- 5 A Because it's not built into the system
- 6 for the DOS ID.
- 7 Q When you say it's not built into the
- 8 system, could you explain that.
- 9 A Well, it's not built into the technology
- 10 for that process for it to be done when somebody is
- 11 getting their picture taken. So it's not -- the DOS
- 12 ID and the way that it is designed is separate from,
- obviously, the PennDOT ID. So although some of the
- 14 processes may seem similar, like getting your picture
- 15 taken, the screens that somebody sees -- that
- 16 somebody has to build all that, and that wasn't built
- into that part of the process. So that's why it's
- 18 paper.
- 19 Q It's something that could be done
- 20 electronically at some point if someone writes the
- 21 program for it?
- 22 A That's correct.
- 23 Q It just hasn't been written yet?
- 24 A Absolutely, yes.



- 1 MR. GERSCH: Your Honor, I have no
- 2 questions at this time. I'd like to make a request
- 3 for the document that was described by Mr. Myers, the
- 4 updated training document. I don't think we've
- 5 received it.
- 6 Alternately, if counsel believes that it
- 7 was provided, I'd like to know that it was provided
- 8 in the handful of documents we got last night. But
- 9 subject to that, I have no other questions at this
- 10 time. I wonder if we could have that handled through
- 11 a representation, Counsel, just so we --
- 12 THE COURT: It sounds like a reasonable
- 13 request. I'm not sure who's going to respond to it.
- MR. CAWLEY: It is a reasonable request.
- 15 And to answer the second question, which resolves the
- 16 first, I don't believe it has been produced because I
- 17 don't believe that I've seen it. So I will certainly
- 18 obtain that document and provide it to counsel.
- 19 THE COURT: Let's talk about when.
- 20 MR. CAWLEY: I see no reason why it
- 21 couldn't happen today.
- MR. GERSCH: Your Honor, we have no
- 23 further questions at this time. I should say that I
- 24 doubt we would need to recall the witness even once



- 1 we see it, but we have to reserve on that just
- 2 because we haven't seen the document.
- 3 THE COURT: Which means you are going to
- 4 question the witness now; right?
- 5 MR. CAWLEY: Yes, Your Honor.
- 6 Does Your Honor have a preference as to
- 7 where I sit or stand to ask questions?
- 8 THE COURT: No. I try to stay out of
- 9 your way. I would prefer that you stand.
- MR. CAWLEY: I will do that.
- 11 THE COURT: I don't care where you do it.
- MR. CAWLEY: I might as well just come
- 13 over here.
- 14 - -
- 15 CROSS EXAMINATION
- 16 - -
- 17 BY MR. CAWLEY:
- 18 Q Mr. Myers, how many years have you been
- 19 with PennDOT?
- 20 A A little over 14 years.
- 21 Q And how many of those years have you been
- 22 Deputy Secretary of the department?
- 23 A Since January of 2007, acting and
- 24 appointed in June of 2007.



- 1 Q During that time frame, have new programs
- 2 or products come into effect at PennDOT?
- A Absolutely.
- 4 Q Have you provided training in the course
- 5 of the implementation of new programs or new products
- 6 in that time frame?
- 7 A Based upon what's needed, yes.
- 8 Q Have you yourself been trained along the
- 9 line on new programs and products?
- 10 A In some cases, yes.
- 11 Q So what role does your experience with
- 12 the implementation of new programs or products at
- 13 PennDOT play in how you have decided to train the
- 14 employees in the driver's license centers as voter ID
- 15 has been implemented?
- 16 A It has an extensive amount, based upon
- 17 the professional opinion of myself and others who
- 18 have been with the department for many years, knowing
- 19 what works and what's effective in the field from the
- 20 standpoint of training, not only in the field but
- 21 also here at the central office.
- 22 Q Switching gears a bit, you were asked
- 23 some questions about Exhibit 136, which has the two
- 24 charts showing how many driver's licenses and photo



- 1 IDs were issued in a number of months over the course
- 2 of two years.
- 3 A Yes.
- 4 Q Do you have that exhibit in front of you?
- 5 A Yes, I do.
- Q As you can see, August and September are
- 7 the last two months listed; and the number drops off
- 8 by about 50 percent from August to September.
- 9 Since October is not shown, can you
- 10 explain for the Court, how busy a month is October in
- 11 comparison to August and September?
- 12 A Well, there's certainly -- the fact of
- 13 the matter is that historically, August has been a
- 14 very busy month for us.
- 15 That's primarily due to a number of
- 16 different factors, especially in the Philadelphia
- 17 region, because we have so many colleges and
- 18 universities. We have a lot of foreign exchange
- 19 students coming in; and in those cases, those
- 20 individuals, one of the things they want is an ID,
- 21 and, of course, they go through the same process,
- 22 although obviously they're demonstrating legal
- 23 presence here in the United States as opposed to
- 24 being a U.S. citizen. So that puts demands on us in



- 1 the Philadelphia region in particular, but we also
- 2 see it in Pittsburgh.
- 3 Again, as I noted earlier, we have a lot
- 4 of kids off in the summertime looking for driver's
- 5 licenses and getting their learner's permits and
- 6 things of that nature. Their parents want to do it
- 7 then because they're not in school, so they have an
- 8 easier time of it.
- 9 As we go into the fall, historically
- 10 speaking, the fall begins to drop off. December is
- 11 normally one of our slower months, but as we go into
- 12 the fall, the amount of volume that we have in our
- 13 locations has historically dropped off.
- 14 O So as the volume of initial issuances for
- 15 these two products drops off, what effect does that
- 16 have on PennDOT's ability to handle the hypothetical
- wave of 30,000 voters that Mr. Gersch asked you
- 18 about?
- 19 A Well, it makes it easier. It does not --
- 20 and I think this is important to understand. And I'm
- 21 not sure that it's ever been stated before.
- 22 But from the standpoint of our locations,
- 23 if you're in our location when it closes, we don't
- 24 kick people out. We service all the individuals that



- 1 are in that location at the time of closing.
- 2 The fact of the matter is, volume is
- 3 simply a function of whether or not someone is there
- 4 for 15 minutes or 30 minutes. Obviously in the
- 5 example that was given, if you're going to go a
- 6 hundred percent increase in the number of people
- 7 coming in, that would have a significant impact on
- 8 how fast we would be able to service customers.
- 9 Again, the data, in my opinion, and this
- is simply my opinion, doesn't show that that 30,000
- 11 is going to walk through the door anytime soon.
- 12 This data, this historical data, factual
- 13 data, suggests that these numbers are running a
- 14 little higher than what we've seen in the past but
- 15 not significant from the standpoint of us being able
- 16 to help customers.
- 17 Has it impacted some wait times?
- 18 Absolutely. There's no question about we've seen
- 19 some areas, in Philadelphia as an example, where
- 20 we've had wait times that have increased. That's
- 21 precisely the reason why now, in the five
- 22 Philadelphia centers, we've extended our hours on
- 23 Thursday all the way to the Thursday after elections
- 24 to ensure that people do have the availability of



- 1 additional hours to be able to come in and to get
- 2 IDs. We've been responsive. We will continue to be
- 3 responsive.
- 4 And I think it's clear, when I was here
- 5 in July, I testified that we were working on a new
- 6 ID. And while I was very confident that it would
- 7 deploy on August 27th, the fact of the matter is
- 8 that the Department of State and Department of
- 9 Transportation delivered on that promise. That
- 10 product was available on the 27th to all
- 11 individuals.
- 12 Q You discussed keeping the driver's
- 13 license centers, especially in Philadelphia where
- 14 your department is very busy, open later hours. What
- 15 other support have you been giving to the driver's
- 16 license centers to ensure that any increased volume
- 17 will be handled efficiently?
- 18 A Well, when we originally deployed the DOS
- 19 ID and we had sent individuals to the centers for a
- 20 couple days just to oversight from central office,
- 21 that probably goes back to the training question I
- 22 was asked earlier. That was something that we made
- 23 sure that people were in our centers from central
- 24 office so if there were questions, they could be



- 1 asked.
- We've done that again today actually.
- 3 There are a couple people in some of our key
- 4 locations who are also from central office or from
- 5 the management team, if you will, to be able to help
- 6 do this.
- 7 I noted earlier that we've done a lot of
- 8 outreach. We've also dealt with individual concerns.
- 9 I suspect that -- and clearly, people have seen
- 10 things in the newspaper, and you probably will -- you
- 11 know, have heard there will be testimony at some
- 12 point in time that somebody didn't get an ID and
- 13 PennDOT asked for some type of information that --
- 14 and denied them an ID.
- 15 You know, I've had a lot of those to
- 16 research with individuals, because we see them in the
- 17 newspaper. We see them from legislators. Had one
- 18 legislator last week, he sent an email through our
- 19 legislative office and said that one of our centers
- 20 didn't know what they were doing because they were
- 21 requiring a birth certificate.
- Well, obviously I'm going to look at
- 23 that. And we immediately jumped on it and I said,
- 24 well, that doesn't sound right.



- 1 And when we actually talked to the
- 2 customer, in this case, it was one of my staff talked
- 3 to the customer there, and we said, we understand
- 4 that you were denied a birth certificate -- or denied
- 5 an ID because you didn't have a birth certificate,
- 6 and he said, yeah, I was, and that's not right.
- 7 And my staff person said, well, when did
- 8 this happen?
- 9 He said, well, it was two years ago.
- 10 So we get a lot of that. And the
- 11 question isn't -- it's good-intentioned people. I
- 12 don't question that for a second. There are a lot of
- 13 folks out there doing their utmost to make sure that
- 14 everybody gets an ID, and one-on-one, we're doing
- 15 exactly the same thing.
- But a lot of times people don't know all
- 17 the questions to ask. And as you drill down into
- 18 these cases, what you find is that the real facts
- 19 behind the particular case are far different than
- 20 what the perception is of the individual.
- 21 And in most cases we're able to work
- 22 through with the customer for them to be able to get
- 23 an ID. But the fact is that it's important that you
- 24 ask the probing questions as to why something is



- 1 occurring, getting all the details behind it.
- I had another case in that same situation
- 3 where an individual wanted a DOS ID, came in for a
- 4 DOS ID, and what happened was the legislator wrote me
- 5 a letter or an email to one of my staff and said that
- 6 this person couldn't get an ID because they didn't
- 7 have a birth certificate.
- 8 Well, the real facts behind it when we
- 9 talked to the customer was that the individual went
- in, said he wanted the DOS ID, but when he found out
- 11 that he could only use it for voting purposes, he
- 12 said, well, I really want this for more than that.
- 13 So I'll go to my representative's office and get my
- 14 birth certificate.
- So it wasn't a question of us denying
- 16 them a DOS ID, but the representative felt that it
- 17 was because of the limited amount of information they
- 18 get. We see that over and over again.
- 19 All that means nothing to us at the end
- 20 of the day. What's important to us is to ensure that
- 21 we work with that individual customer to make sure
- 22 that they get the ID.
- One other point.
- 24 THE COURT: Hang on. You have to wait



- 1 for a question.
- 2 BY MR. CAWLEY:
- 3 Q Let me just ask a follow-up question on
- 4 that. You talked about being contacted by
- 5 legislators on behalf of constituents.
- 6 Does PennDOT pay any attention to media
- 7 reports in particular that indicate that PennDOT
- 8 centers may be making mistakes?
- 9 A Absolutely. In fact, we even follow
- 10 Twitter.
- 11 And there's -- although one individual
- 12 who had sent a tweet about his dad, a fairly famous
- individual, or at least for some may be considered
- 14 famous, and we were able to solve his problem by
- 15 reading Twitter and being out -- and going out and
- 16 answering his questions and getting his dad an ID.
- 17 So there are other steps that we're
- 18 taking. In fact, we just announced this morning,
- 19 separately from the other change, that we plan to
- 20 keep approximately 40-some of our driver licensing
- 21 centers -- we're going to open them on the Monday
- 22 before Election Day, here again, making sure that
- 23 every opportunity is afforded individuals to be able
- 24 to get their IDs before they go in to vote.



- 1 And we'll note too, as well, in
- 2 Philadelphia on the Thursday following the Election
- 3 Day, which is part of the provisional window, we'll
- 4 be staying open late on that day, as well, until
- 5 7 o'clock.
- 6 Q Mr. Gersch asked you some questions about
- 7 outreach in general and about the problem of people
- 8 who may have difficulty in getting to a driver's
- 9 license center.
- 10 Were mobile units that go out into the
- 11 community ever considered by PennDOT?
- 12 A At one time we a mobile unit. So the
- 13 answer is yes, we did. We had a mobile unit I
- 14 believe in the late '90s all the way up to, I
- 15 believe, 2008.
- 16 And in 2008 we made the decision that it
- 17 was not economically feasible, nor did it have the
- 18 value to it from the standpoint of the cost
- 19 associated. We would send it out in the field, and
- 20 it would do three or four transactions in a day, in
- 21 some cases. Then perhaps we would have four people
- 22 committed to that site, quote/unquote, for that
- 23 period of time.
- 24 From a cost benefit analysis, it just



- 1 made absolutely no sense to the taxpayers of the
- 2 Commonwealth that we'd be spending that kind of money
- 3 to maintain the system for so few transactions. So
- 4 it was determined in the last administration that we
- 5 would discontinue the unit.
- 6 Q So the mobile unit went away during the
- 7 Rendell administration?
- 8 A That's correct.
- 9 Q Were there any security concerns that you
- 10 had along with the cost benefit analysis that you
- 11 just mentioned?
- 12 A There were always security concerns in
- 13 reference to the mobile unit, and it was one in which
- 14 because we not only had product on it, we also had
- 15 all of our computer systems on it.
- 16 Obviously when you're going out on an
- overnight event where there's an event on two days,
- 18 you've got to park it somewhere. Usually when you go
- on those things, you're out in more rural areas,
- 20 although it can sometimes be in the city.
- 21 So there's always a risk of someone
- 22 breaking into the unit. Obviously from the
- 23 standpoint of the security aspect of not only our
- 24 computers but the products and customer confidential



- 1 information, that offers a huge risk when you have a
- 2 mobile unit.
- 3 Q I'd like to talk about some of the other
- 4 outreach that PennDOT has done. Has PennDOT taken
- 5 steps to translate forms necessary for photo IDs into
- 6 other languages?
- 7 A Yes, we have. And, in fact, this is a --
- 8 we have always had many of our key forms in Spanish,
- 9 of course. But we've translated all of the voter ID
- 10 forms into now 10 different languages. I don't have
- 11 the list in front of me, but it is extensive,
- 12 everything from Chinese, Arabic; and the list goes on
- 13 through the list of languages that it's been
- 14 translated into.
- 15 O Are those forms or is the translation
- 16 also available on your Web site?
- 17 A Yes, they are.
- 18 Q Has PennDOT made translation services
- 19 available to groups of voters out in the community?
- 20 A Well, as I talked about earlier in the
- 21 case, just a week and a half ago, where we had a
- 22 situation there, we sent an individual down who was
- 23 fluent in Spanish to help facilitate the process.
- 24 Q I'd like to talk about another form of



- 1 outreach. Has PennDOT offered to any groups in the
- 2 community something called prescreening for purposes
- 3 of photo IDs for voting?
- 4 A Yes, we have.
- 6 prescreening would entail?
- 7 A Well, essentially it just avoids the
- 8 individual having to come to the center and have the
- 9 documents reviewed. It allows our folks to review
- 10 the documents, make sure that the people have
- 11 everything that they need so that when they do come
- 12 to the center, it's a process which is shorter
- 13 because now we know that the documents are good, the
- 14 birth certificate, the Social Security card, whatever
- 15 it might be.
- 16 Q And what groups have been involved with
- 17 these offers of prescreening?
- 18 A I think they've primarily been involved
- 19 with nursing homes and assisted living centers, those
- 20 types of environments.
- 21 Q Did PennDOT have any conversations with
- 22 the League of Women Voters about offering
- 23 prescreening?
- 24 A We did actually. The League of Women



- 1 Voters in Philadelphia asked us to be able to set up
- 2 a table in our center and be able to work with
- 3 customers that are coming in.
- 4 And what we said to them and what we
- 5 would say to any group and what we've said to the
- 6 media, for that matter, is that we have a job to do
- 7 in our driver licensing centers regardless of which
- 8 one it is.
- 9 Obviously Arch Street in particular is
- 10 particularly busy, and we have a responsibility to
- 11 our customers to ensure that whether they're taking a
- 12 knowledge test or whether they're there with
- 13 confidential documents, that they have a right and
- 14 expectation that the environment be kept as
- 15 reasonable as possible.
- 16 What we said to the League of Women
- 17 Voters is that we didn't think that having a table in
- 18 our operations would work; but because of those
- 19 concerns, however, we offered to work with them from
- 20 the standpoint of prescreening and going out and
- 21 talking to groups.
- We've been out -- our staff, in fact --
- 23 we had staff out last night, we'll have staff out
- 24 again tonight talking to groups across the state



- 1 about what they need to do from the standpoint of
- 2 PennDOT IDs. Normally we do those meetings with the
- 3 Department of State.
- 4 So it's rather extensive a list of
- 5 meetings where we've held over the last couple months
- 6 and continue to have planned, I'm sure, all the way
- 7 through the election.
- 8 Q I'd like to switch to a different topic.
- 9 Mr. Gersch asked you a series of questions about this
- 10 new process, that some of the paperwork came out
- 11 yesterday --
- 12 A Yes.
- 13 Q -- for issuing the Department of State
- 14 voter ID.
- 15 Is that process being implemented across
- 16 Pennsylvania today?
- 17 A It was implemented today across
- 18 Pennsylvania.
- 19 Q And will that process that you described
- 20 during the direct examination be implemented through
- 21 at least mid November?
- 22 A That is correct, yes.
- 24 you know of to discontinue that process in the



- 1 foreseeable future?
- 2 A None, no.
- 3 Q You were asked some questions about the
- 4 delay in getting that current process going and why
- 5 didn't you start that process before.
- 6 Can you explain for the Court whether
- 7 there was any sort of interface with the Department
- 8 of State, whether from a technological standpoint or
- 9 otherwise, that had to be established before this
- 10 process could be up and running?
- 11 A Well, the primary change here for the new
- 12 process that went into effect here was primarily
- 13 related to forms change, communications that we
- 14 talked about.
- So certainly from the issuance of the DOS
- 16 ID, there was definitely technology changes that had
- 17 to be made there.
- Moving forward with this change, this was
- 19 primarily communications as well as forms that had to
- 20 be updated.
- 21 MR. CAWLEY: Those are all the questions
- 22 I have.
- MR. GERSCH: Your Honor, very brief
- 24 reexamination.



- 1 - -
- 2 REDIRECT EXAMINATION
- 3 - -
- 4 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 5 Q You mentioned -- there was mention, it
- 6 may have been counsel who referenced busy periods at
- 7 the Philadelphia driver's license centers; is that
- 8 right?
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q Am I right that there are waits of
- 11 several hours at those centers to get DOS IDs and
- 12 PennDOT IDs?
- 13 A Well, I think I've said before that the
- 14 Philadelphia region is our busiest region. We have
- 15 five locations there, more than any other county in
- 16 the state.
- 17 The fact of the matter is that there are
- 18 busy times. There are specifically -- the specific
- 19 wait times of one individual, I don't know whether or
- 20 not it's one hour, two hours.
- 21 What I do know is that our goal is to
- 22 service our customers in 30 minutes or less. During
- 23 the month of October, I believe that somewhere around
- 24 25 percent of the customers in that location were



- 1 serviced in that time frame. Which would mean some
- 2 people were serviced over 30 minutes.
- As to the specifics, I've not looked at
- 4 those numbers to say two hours is a reasonable
- 5 statement.
- I don't know.
- 7 Q If someone were to say that, say at Arch
- 8 Street, they had to wait several hours to be served,
- 9 would you have a way of verifying that?
- 10 A It would -- I don't know the specific
- 11 answer to your question. We have at Arch Street, as
- 12 an example, we utilize a queuing system which is
- 13 electronic, there's technology behind it.
- I don't know well enough to be able to
- 15 say can I pick out one individual customer from
- 16 sometime in the past and tell you whether or not --
- 17 how long -- from the time they got their ticket until
- 18 the time that they got served, I don't know the
- 19 answer to that.
- 20 Q Sure. Have you heard, regardless of
- 21 whether it's one individual or many individuals, have
- 22 you heard that at Arch Street and other Philadelphia
- 23 locations there are -- people are having to wait
- 24 several hours to be serviced?



- 1 A I certainly read that in the newspaper.
- 2 Again, I would encourage everybody to remember,
- 3 though, that you always need to drill down into the
- 4 facts to find out what the total story is behind
- 5 individual statements.
- 6 Q Shifting topics, you were asked some
- 7 questions about the mobile unit. Do you recall that?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q And you said the mobile unit was
- 10 discontinued in 2008?
- 11 A I believe it was November 30th, 2008.
- 12 Q Okay. And you said it was underutilized,
- 13 I believe?
- 14 A That is correct, yes.
- O But back in 2008, there was no
- 16 requirement that voters obtain ID in order to vote;
- 17 right?
- 18 A That's absolutely correct, yes.
- 19 Q And we didn't have the situation then, as
- 20 we do now, where you're bringing on a new product a
- 21 month or two before the election.
- 22 A That is correct, but that does not negate
- 23 the security concerns that we had for the unit.
- Q Well, regardless of whether there are



- 1 security concerns, the fact is you were able to do
- 2 this in 2008, right?
- 3 A We did, up until November 30th, I
- 4 believe, yes.
- 6 heard, such as Georgia, they also manage to have
- 7 mobile units for their Department of Motor Vehicles;
- 8 is that right?
- 9 A There are clearly some other
- 10 jurisdictions that do have mobile units, yes.
- 11 Q So whatever the security concerns are --
- 12 and I don't mean to minimize them -- those can be
- 13 worked around?
- 14 A Some have chosen to take that risk.
- 15 Q Well, my question stands: Those can be
- 16 worked around, do you agree?
- 17 A I'm sorry?
- 18 Q Do you agree that the security concerns
- 19 can be worked around, as you apparently did in 2008
- 20 and earlier?
- 21 A I agree that there is a certain level of
- 22 risk that some are willing to accept that others are
- 23 not.
- 24 MR. GERSCH: I have no further questions



- 1 of this witness at this time, Your Honor.
- MR. CAWLEY: No questions, Your Honor.
- 3 THE COURT: You may step down, and I
- 4 gather you may be subject to recall, so don't leave
- 5 the state.
- 6 MR. GERSCH: And, Your Honor, we'll be in
- 7 touch with counsel as soon as we get that document.
- 8 We can look at it, make an assessment, and release
- 9 the witness if need be.
- 10 THE COURT: Okay. This would seem to be
- 11 a good time for a break. Do you want a little bit
- 12 longer than an hour? Do you want a lunch break
- 13 that's a little longer than an hour so counsel can
- 14 confer about the witnesses who are likely to be
- 15 called?
- 16 I'm asking if you want a longer lunch
- 17 break is what I'm asking.
- 18 MR. GERSCH: I think that would be
- 19 useful.
- Mr. Myers, I think, will be our longest
- 21 witness. So I don't anticipate that the other
- 22 witnesses will take as long. So I think we can do
- 23 with an hour and a quarter or something like that.
- 24 THE COURT: Well, it's about 20 after



```
Page 125
     12:00 now. We'll be in recess and we'll reconvene at
 1
 2
     1:30.
                               Thank you, Your Honor.
                 MR. GERSCH:
                  (Luncheon recess from 12:15 p.m.
                 to 1:30 p.m.)
 6
                 THE CLERK: Ladies and gentlemen,
     Commonwealth Court is now in session.
 7
                 You may be seated.
 8
 9
                 THE COURT: All right. Please call your
     next witness.
10
11
                               Thank you, Your Honor.
                 MR. GERSCH:
12
                 Petitioners now call Shannon Royer.
13
                 SHANNON ROYER, having first been duly
14
     sworn according to law, was examined and testified as
15
16
     follows:
17
18
                          EXAMINATION
     BY MR. GERSCH:
19
20
                 Good afternoon. Please state your name.
             0
21
                 Shannon Royer.
             Α
22
                 Mr. Royer, you and I have met before?
             0
                 Yes.
23
             Α
24
                 Most recently, I think, at the Supreme
             0
```



- 1 Court.
- 2 A Yes.
- 3 O What I want to talk to you about, first,
- 4 is there was testimony this morning regarding new
- 5 procedures for the Department of State ID that were
- 6 adopted or at least finalized last night.
- 7 Are you familiar with those?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q There's been testimony regarding what
- 10 those procedures are. I'm not going to take you
- 11 through that again.
- 12 The question I want to ask you,
- 13 Mr. Royer, is, where did this idea come from, the
- idea for these new Department of State procedures?
- 15 A After the Supreme Court issued their
- 16 decision on this matter, we started discussions
- immediately with PennDOT, along with our attorneys
- 18 and other folks.
- 19 O And who made the decision that the old
- 20 procedures should be changed and the new procedures
- 21 adopted? Whose decision was that?
- 22 A Well, it's the Department of State's ID
- 23 card, so it is ultimately the Department of State.
- Q Was there a person at the Department of



- 1 State who made that decision?
- 2 A Ultimately the Secretary of the
- 3 Commonwealth.
- 4 Q Was there a meeting where this happened?
- 5 A There were several discussions and
- 6 conference calls where we talked about this, yes.
- 7 Q When was the decision made: Let's not
- 8 use the old procedures; let's have new procedures?
- 9 When was that decision made?
- 10 A We decided, right after the Supreme Court
- 11 issued their decision, to make changes. The process
- 12 and the changes incorporated in that followed
- 13 afterward.
- 14 O Okay. I just want to focus on the
- 15 decision, which I understand would be in the earlier
- 16 part of this time period; right?
- 17 A I'm sorry?
- 18 O The decision was made in the earlier part
- 19 of the time period between the Supreme Court's
- 20 decision and today; right?
- 21 A Correct.
- Q Were you in the room when that decision
- 23 was made?
- 24 A I was involved in meetings where it was



- 1 discussed.
- 2 Q Okay. Who else was in the room when
- 3 these discussions took place?
- 4 A It would have been our members of our
- 5 BCEL staff, Bureau of Commissions, Elections and
- 6 Legislation; Commissioner; Deputy Commissioner;
- 7 myself; Department of State counsel. And I reported
- 8 to the Secretary of the Commonwealth after that.
- 9 So I think that pretty much covered it on
- 10 our end.
- 11 Q And so the Secretary is not actually in
- 12 the room?
- 13 A When it was first discussed?
- O When the decision was made, was she in
- 15 the room?
- 16 A She makes the decision.
- 17 Q Okay. You've just testified about a
- 18 meeting with several persons.
- 19 A Yes.
- 20 Q Correct me if I'm wrong. The Secretary
- 21 was not in the room for that discussion?
- 22 A She was involved in discussions about the
- 23 new process. She wasn't involved in all the
- 24 discussions about the new process. And I reported to



- 1 her.
- 2 Q I understand. The discussion that you
- 3 had just testified maybe three answers ago where you
- 4 said you were in the room with the BCEL staff, you
- 5 said the commissioner, the deputy commissioner,
- 6 mentioned some other people, I think counsel; was the
- 7 Secretary in the room for that discussion?
- 8 A She participated in discussions about
- 9 this new process. I'm not sure if she was in the
- 10 exact one where, that you're referring to.
- 11 Ultimately, I reported to her and she made the
- 12 decision.
- 13 Q And now I want to come to this next part.
- 14 So when the decision was made, was that a one-on-one
- 15 conversation between you and the Secretary?
- 16 A Yes -- well, one-on-one with counsel --
- 17 her and counsel and myself.
- 18 Q Are there documents reflecting this
- 19 decision, or was this all done orally?
- 20 A There are documents which laid out in
- 21 varying degrees the process that we were changing for
- 22 the new DOS ID cards. Which I think offers you a
- 23 snapshot at any particular time as to the changes we
- 24 were making.



- 1 0 Is there an actual document evidencing
- 2 the decision to make the change?
- 3 A It was a meeting that took place with the
- 4 Secretary, myself and counsel. I don't know that we
- 5 had documents in front of us other than an
- 6 explanation of the process, the new process that we
- 7 had discussed.
- 8 O Tell me what was discussed in that
- 9 meeting with the Secretary where the decision was
- 10 made.
- 11 A We reviewed the new process.
- MR. PUTNAM: I just want to record an
- 13 objection insofar as it requests advice of counsel.
- 14 THE COURT: I don't know that the
- 15 question -- yeah, maybe it does.
- 16 Would you rephrase your question, please.
- 17 MR. PUTNAM: Let me also, if I may,
- 18 interpose a general objection.
- 19 I'm not -- I understand the significance
- and relevance of the change, and I don't mind any
- 21 objections about the change. I'm not sure I
- 22 understand why we have to have extensive questioning
- 23 about each meeting in the course of the change. It
- doesn't seem to me to be germane.



- 1 THE COURT: I think he's trying to do
- 2 some of the discovery that he didn't do yesterday.
- 3 So I understand what's going on. I think he's
- 4 looking for documents or something that may have been
- 5 generated in meetings that might be available.
- 6 That's what I understood you to do. But
- 7 I would ask you to rephrase your question in light of
- 8 the objection to not seek anything that might have
- 9 been said to or by counsel in the course of giving
- 10 advice on a matter in litigation, I guess.
- 11 MR. GERSCH: Understood, Your Honor. And
- 12 this may be a short question.
- 13 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 14 Q Mr. Royer, can you tell me anything about
- 15 this meeting at which the decision was made which
- 16 does not involve advice given by counsel or a request
- 17 for legal advice from the Secretary, yourself or some
- 18 other member of the department?
- 19 A I'm not sure I understand the question.
- The meetings all took place with our
- 21 attorneys where we talked about the process, and with
- the Secretary.
- Q Right. So I'm not interested in any
- 24 legal advice the attorneys give.



- 1 A Okay.
- 2 Q And I'm not interested in any testimony
- 3 if you asked the lawyers, Could you give me some
- 4 legal advice, or the Secretary asked for legal
- 5 advice. I'm more interested in the policy side of
- 6 this, if you will.
- 7 Was there a discussion about policy that
- 8 you can tell me about that doesn't reveal either the
- 9 advice from counsel or a request for advice from
- 10 counsel?
- 11 A Well, the policy changes that were made
- 12 for the DOS ID card was guided by our attorneys to
- 13 keep in the spirit of the Supreme Court decision.
- 14 So everything that was done was done with
- 15 our guidance and suggestions and support.
- MR. PUTNAM: To which I'll stipulate.
- 17 MR. GERSCH: I don't think I'm going to
- 18 be able to go further down this line of questioning.
- 19 THE COURT: Probably not.
- 20 MR. GERSCH: And I'm not going to attempt
- 21 it.
- THE COURT: Thank you.
- 23 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 24 Q Before the Supreme Court decision --



- 1 let's go back before then -- were you ever party to a
- 2 discussion in which there was consideration given to
- 3 creating some form of identification in which a voter
- 4 could obtain identification for voting from the
- 5 Department of State or PennDOT simply by filling out
- 6 an affidavit that said, "I don't have photo ID
- 7 acceptable for voting, and I want photo ID so that I
- 8 can vote, " or some similar simple form? Was that
- 9 ever considered before the Supreme Court's decision?
- 10 A Yes. I remember at some point over the
- 11 summer having discussions about modifications.
- 12 You're talking about the Department of
- 13 State card?
- 14 Q Sir, it could be with respect to -- yes,
- 15 I would be interested if it was about the Department
- 16 of State.
- 17 A Yes. We had sometimes talked about that,
- 18 yes, after the Department of State cards were a
- 19 reality.
- 20 O And what were those discussions?
- 21 A Looking, always looking for ways to
- 22 improve the process. Anything that could be done to
- 23 make sure that every eligible voter gets the card, if
- 24 needed.



- 1 Q With whom did you have these discussions?
- 2 A Probably at our -- we have biweekly
- 3 meetings on voter ID. We have many meetings on
- 4 voter ID in the Department with different folks --
- 5 our press office, policy office, leg. affairs office,
- 6 Bureau of Commissions, Elections and Legislation.
- 7 I'm sure it popped up a couple of times.
- 8 I vaguely remember discussing it.
- 9 Q Again, focusing only on the period before
- 10 the Supreme Court's decision, was there any
- 11 discussion of why not? Why not just give people a
- 12 simple affidavit of the kind I asked you about
- 13 before? Why not give people a simple affidavit that
- 14 says, "I don't have the ID I need to vote. I need to
- 15 get the ID I need to vote"?
- 16 A Well, we tried to model the Department of
- 17 State ID card somewhat after the legislation for the
- 18 nondriver's license photo IDs which are specified in
- 19 Act 18, which require a number of documents: birth
- 20 certificates, Social Security card, proofs of
- 21 residence.
- We wanted to come up with a modified
- 23 process to make it easier for individual voters to
- 24 obtain Department of State IDs cards if they didn't



- 1 have all the documentation they would need, such as a
- 2 birth certificate.
- 3 So during all the discussions about the
- 4 Department of State ID card, there were different
- 5 things that were suggested. And what we ended up
- 6 initially with was bringing two proofs of residence,
- 7 which was the old process.
- 8 Q Did anyone advocate just the simple
- 9 affidavit process?
- 10 A You mean giving a Department of State ID
- 11 card without any documentation?
- 12 O Yes.
- 13 A It was suggested by advocates,
- 14 particularly the Committee of Seventy was interested
- 15 in that. That may have been actually the first time
- 16 someone mentioned it to me. We had discussions about
- 17 it.
- 18 Q How about within the Department; did
- 19 anyone say, "This is the right course"?
- 20 A My recollection is everyone was satisfied
- 21 initially with the process of simply using two proofs
- 22 of residence, which is a watered-down version of what
- 23 PennDOT requires for their nondriver's license
- 24 photo IDs.



- 1 Q All right. Let's shift topics. I
- 2 appreciate that information and your testimony on
- 3 that subject.
- 4 I want to switch to a different topic,
- 5 which is educating the public. And I take it you'd
- 6 agree that it's important to educate the public with
- 7 respect to what the requirements of Act 18 are and
- 8 how members of the public can satisfy those
- 9 requirements.
- 10 A Act 18 requires the Department of State
- 11 to conduct a voter education campaign; and I do agree
- 12 it's important.
- 13 Q Let's take a look at -- I'm going to move
- 14 back to this, Mike, just so I can grab some exhibits.
- 15 When we were at the hearing last time,
- 16 you testified about having a \$5 million budget for
- 17 education; is that right?
- 18 A That is correct.
- 19 Q And that was going to cover things like
- 20 radio, TV, robocalls, various forms of print
- 21 advertising; is that right?
- 22 A That is correct.
- Q And who is it who did the TV ads?
- 24 A Red House Communications.



- 1 O Red House Communications.
- 2 And is it the case that non-TV ads
- 3 mention the DOS card?
- 4 A The advertising that we are doing,
- 5 television included, specifically says you must bring
- 6 an acceptable photo ID for voting purposes, to vote,
- 7 and encourages the voters to call or go to our Web
- 8 site to get additional information.
- 9 A 30-second TV spot does not allow you to
- 10 mention all of the different kinds of IDs that you
- 11 can use.
- 12 Q And, in fact, the TV spots that you've
- 13 been describing don't mention the DOS ID?
- 14 A They do not. And they may not mention
- 15 other IDs either.
- 16 (Petitioners' 179 was marked for
- 17 identification.)
- 18 MR. GERSCH: Let me hand up Exhibit 179.
- 19 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 20 Q I'm showing you what's been marked as
- 21 Exhibit 179. That's typical of the TV spots that
- 22 have been designed for the educational campaign that
- 23 the Department of State is running; correct?
- 24 A Yes. And there's also a Spanish version.



Page 138

1 Q As you referenced earlier, this would be
2 a 30-second spot?

 A That's correct.

4 Q And it's designed by Red House

5 Communications?

6 A Correct.

7 Q And the part where you say they encourage

8 you to contact DOS, where is that on here?

9 A At the bottom where it says "super,"

10 which means superimposed onto the screen, in large

11 letters at the end of the ad, it directs voters to

12 1-877-votesPA and votesPA.com for more information.

2 So what you mean by encourage, they'll

just be someplace on the ad while the people are

15 speaking that has the phone number for votesPA?

16 A And the Web site, which has detailed

information, that is correct.

18 Q Who answers the phone at votesPA?

19 A It is our election office.

Q And who is that?

21 A Well, we have 30 people now answering

22 phones. And as of next week, it will be boosted to

23 48 folks at our election office.

Q Who runs that office?



- 1 A John Marks.
- 2 Q Directly, or is there someone between him
- 3 and those people?
- 4 A John Marks is the commissioner. Ann
- 5 Harlow is the deputy commissioner.
- 6 Q Thank you. You can put that one aside.
- Now, there are also radio ads that have
- 8 been designed by Red House; correct?
- 9 A That is correct.
- 10 Q And those also don't mention anything
- 11 about the DOS card?
- 12 A Specifically about the DOS card, no.
- 13 (Petitioners' 178 was marked for
- 14 identification.)
- MR. GERSCH: Let me show you what's been
- 16 marked 178. I'll hand that up.
- 17 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 18 Q 178 is typical of the radio ads designed
- 19 by Red House; correct?
- 20 A Yes, and there's also a Spanish version.
- 21 Q I said typical. Is this, in fact, the
- 22 only radio ad? And I include within that the Spanish
- 23 counterpart.
- 24 A There are two television spots and two



- 1 radio spots. You showed the text for both, and
- 2 there's also an identical Spanish version.
- 3 Q Okay. Again, with respect to encouraging
- 4 people to check in with PA vote, that would be the
- 5 second-to-the-last line, the document; right?
- A Yes. It says to learn more, call
- 7 1-877-votesPA or visit votesPA.com.
- 8 Q All right. You've also got ads on the
- 9 buses and mass transit?
- 10 A Correct.
- 11 (Petitioners' 172 was marked for
- identification.)
- MR. GERSCH: All right. Let me hand up
- 14 what's been marked Exhibit 172.
- 15 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 16 Q Mr. Royer, you're copied on this email --
- 17 I'm sorry, it's addressed to you?
- 18 A That is correct.
- 19 Q And this is an email in which the folks
- 20 at Red House are sending you the ads that they want
- 21 to use on mass transit; is that right?
- 22 A Yes.
- 23 O And these are in fact the ads for mass
- 24 transit?



- 1 A Yes, they are.
- Q Okay. And they say, "If you want to
- 3 vote, Show It."
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q Is that, in fact, the name of the
- 6 campaign, "Show It"?
- 7 A It is.
- 8 Q And they're English and Spanish versions;
- 9 right?
- 10 A Correct.
- 11 Q And they make no mention of the DOS ID?
- 12 A No. They direct people to the
- 13 votesPA.com Web site and the phone number for more
- 14 information.
- 15 (Petitioners' 174 was marked for
- identification.)
- MR. GERSCH: Let me hand up Exhibit 174.
- 18 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 19 Q Mr. Royer, I'm showing you what's been
- 20 marked as Exhibit 174. This, too, is an email from
- 21 Red House to you; is that right?
- 22 A That is correct.
- 23 Q And this has very similar ads for mass
- 24 transit?



- 1 A That is correct.
- 2 Q And these ads also do not make any
- 3 mention of the DOS ID card?
- 4 A Right. They do reference our Web site
- 5 and phone number for detailed information.
- 6 O Department of State has also mentioned
- 7 billboard ads; is that right?
- 8 A That is correct.
- 9 (Petitioners' 173 was marked for
- identification.)
- 11 MR. GERSCH: Let me hand up Exhibit 173.
- 12 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- 13 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 14 Q All right. There's a cover email again
- 15 to you. Am I right?
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 O And these are the billboard
- 18 advertisements for the "Show It" campaign that the
- 19 Department of State is going to be running; is that
- 20 right?
- 21 A The ones are toward the bottom, not the
- 22 first two. Those are sample IDs that were used.
- 23 Q So Pages 1 and 2 of Exhibit 173, those
- 24 are not billboard ads?



- 1 A Correct.
- 3 pages?
- 4 A That's correct.
- 5 O And they do not mention the DOS card?
- 6 A No. But, again, they direct people to
- 7 votesPA.com and the toll free number where people
- 8 have been calling and logging on for detailed
- 9 information.
- 10 Q The \$5 million allocated for this
- 11 campaign, that money has been spent?
- 12 A Almost all of it, yes.
- 13 O How much is left?
- 14 A I don't know exactly. Hardly any. You
- 15 buy television ads ahead of time, radio spots ahead
- 16 of time. We did a mailing to almost 6 million
- 17 households which has been delivered, which does
- 18 mention the DOS ID card specifically. Every
- 19 household in the state with a voter. That money is
- 20 basically gone.
- 21 Q The \$5 million, that was federal HAVA
- 22 funding, wasn't it?
- 23 A Correct.
- 24 Q And so in 2008, you received a similar



- 1 \$5 million?
- 2 A No. The way it worked is that in --
- 3 Pennsylvania had, I think it was \$120 million
- 4 originally, perhaps more than that, beginning many
- 5 years ago, in HAVA money and you're able to draw that
- 6 down and spend it during federal years only, during
- 7 even-numbered years.
- 8 Q And is there a limit on how much you can
- 9 spend a year of that 120 million?
- 10 A For a voter education effort? Not that
- 11 I'm aware of.
- 12 Q Thank you for that clarification.
- But in any case, in 2008, there was a
- 14 different kind of campaign called the "Ready, Set,
- 15 Vote"?
- 16 A I have been told that and have seen some
- 17 samples of it, but I was not working at the
- 18 Department of State at the time.
- 19 Q That was a campaign that was aimed at
- 20 encouraging voter turnout; right?
- 21 A That's my understanding.
- 22 Q All right. And in this election cycle,
- 23 the department chose to use the funds to educate
- 24 people about Act 18?



- 1 A Well, it's a dual meaning. We're
- 2 encouraging people to vote and reminding them that if
- 3 they want to vote, they need to show it. So if you
- 4 want to vote, show it. So we're hoping it encourages
- 5 people to vote and very clearly reminds people now
- 6 that they must show photo ID before they vote.
- 7 Q Have you looked at any metrics to see --
- 8 withdrawn.
- 9 Are there any metrics showing whether
- 10 this campaign is effective and, if so, how effective
- 11 it is?
- 12 A Metrics in terms of polling on our part
- 13 or anything like that?
- 14 Q Could be polling or metrics that
- 15 advertising agencies use.
- 16 A Well, there is metrics regarding how many
- 17 times our votesPA site has been hit, for example. I
- 18 know that from August 1st until September 20th,
- 19 just like we had approximately 210,000 unique
- 20 viewers.
- 21 So the advertising campaign is drawing
- 22 traffic to our Web site, which is where all the
- 23 detailed information is about Act 18.
- I also think somewhere in the documents



- 1 you were provided, there was information about
- 2 click-through rates, viewers on the 175 Web sites,
- 3 that sort of thing. But above and beyond that, I'm
- 4 not aware of anything else.
- 6 is reaching the groups the Supreme Court mentioned in
- 7 its opinion, the elderly, the disabled, the
- 8 financially disadvantaged? Do you have any metrics
- 9 on that?
- 10 A Well, Harmelin Media designed the media
- 11 campaign and made recommendations specifically with
- 12 the charge to reach young voters, minority voters,
- 13 and senior voters. And the entire media effort is
- 14 geared toward that among all the other voters, but
- 15 with a specific emphasis on those groups.
- 16 They described it as a very aggressive
- 17 campaign and will reach 12 million Pennsylvanians.
- 18 That's the way they described it to us.
- 19 Based on the phone calls and emails that
- 20 we're getting, it does seem to be working.
- 21 Q It wouldn't be surprising if the people
- 22 who designed your ads would say that they've got a
- 23 bang-up campaign and it's going to work really well.
- 24 That doesn't shock you?



- 1 A I trust the judgment of the professionals
- 2 that we hired to do this job, who know a lot about
- 3 it.
- 4 Q But, Mr. Royer, every product that is
- 5 advertised in the world, they've got an ad agency and
- 6 the ad agency tells the people who make the product,
- 7 We got a great ad campaign, and we're going to reach
- 8 all the people you need to reach, and give us some
- 9 money and we're going to get it done, and here is our
- 10 stuff and it's going to be terrific.
- 11 Do you imagine that happens in virtually
- 12 every case?
- 13 A I have no idea if that happens in every
- 14 case. I can tell you that based on what Harmelin
- 15 designed for us and Red House designed for us, the
- 16 creative team, it does appear to be reaching voters
- just based on the feedback we're getting.
- 18 Q But the mere fact that the ad agency for
- 19 the entity that is designing the ads and getting paid
- 20 to run the ads, the mere fact that they say this is
- 21 going to work, that alone doesn't really tell you a
- 22 whole lot, does it?
- 23 A If you're insinuating that they would be
- 24 lying to us, I think in putting their reputations at



- 1 risk, I doubt that.
- 2 Q Not at all. I'm not insinuating
- 3 anything. I'm really getting at the point that
- 4 everyone who wants to market and goes to an outside
- 5 firm, the outside firm, when they've done their work
- 6 is going to say, we've done a good job and this is
- 7 going to accomplish what you're paying us to do.
- 8 That's what you would expect would
- 9 typically happen, whether you're advertising a Bic
- 10 pen or a lite beer or -- I know DOS licenses
- 11 wrestling. I think it markets martial arts. If
- 12 you're marketing anything like that, once you hire
- 13 the ad agency, the ad agency is going to say, We've
- 14 done a bang-up job for you and this is going to get
- 15 the job done. Isn't that what you would expect?
- 16 A I would expect them to certainly be proud
- of the effort that they're doing.
- 18 Q And in some cases, they'll succeed; and
- in some cases, they won't succeed.
- 20 A Well, they're certainly succeeding in
- 21 this effort.
- 22 Q Would you agree with me that not all ad
- 23 campaigns succeed?
- 24 A Sure.



- 1 Q When you say "they're succeeding in this
- 2 effort," you're saying that based simply on the fact
- 3 that you guys are getting phone calls?
- 4 A People are seeing our television ads.
- 5 Six million households received information -- every
- 6 household with a voter in the state -- about Act 18
- 7 and all of the IDs that people need to bring Election
- 8 Day, including the Department of State ID. It is
- 9 abundantly apparent that this ad campaign is
- 10 effective.
- 11 Q Well, with all due respect, sir, when you
- 12 say it's effective, the mere fact that some people
- 13 are seeing your ads, do you say that is the sign that
- 14 it's effective? Some people are seeing your ads? Is
- 15 that how we should measure effectiveness?
- 16 A From August 27th until November 6th,
- there will be over 8,000 ads running across
- 18 Pennsylvania in every media market, with the
- 19 exception of three counties. That is described by
- 20 the professionals as an intense, encompassing media
- 21 effort. We think it is reaching voters without any
- 22 question.
- 23 BY MR. GERSCH:
- Q I'm sure we can all stipulate it will



- 1 reach some voters.
- 2 Since we were last here for the last
- 3 hearing has the Department of State or any
- 4 Commonwealth agency to your knowledge done any
- 5 additional work to determine how many voters lack the
- 6 ID they need to vote in November?
- 7 A Not to my knowledge.
- 8 (Petitioners' 115 was marked for
- 9 identification.)
- 10 MR. GERSCH: I'm going to show you what's
- 11 been marked as Exhibit 115.
- 12 BY MR. GERSCH:
- O You're familiar with this document; is
- 14 that right?
- 15 A Yes, I am.
- 16 Q This is a blown-up version of the
- 17 postcard that was sent to the 5.9 million households;
- 18 correct?
- 19 A Correct.
- Q The actual postcard is smaller?
- 21 A It is a little bit smaller, yes.
- 22 Q And the only mention of the Department of
- 23 State ID in this document is three bullets from the
- 24 bottom; is that right?



- 1 A Correct.
- 2 Q And this would have been sent in --
- 3 what? -- in late July/early August?
- 4 A This mailer started -- was mailed in
- 5 waves and started, I believe, the 13th of
- 6 September -- 12th and 13th of September. The
- 7 last wave of these mailings occurred on Friday, this
- 8 past Friday. It was sent to every household in the
- 9 state with a registered voter.
- 10 MR. GERSCH: Your Honor, I don't know
- 11 that we need to mark this, but for the benefit of the
- 12 Court.
- 13 THE COURT: I have my own.
- 14 MR. GERSCH: Then Your Honor knows what
- 15 the actual size looks like.
- 16 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 17 Q Mr. Royer, the record won't reflect this,
- 18 she'll reflect me speaking, but this is what the
- 19 actual card looks like.
- 20 A That appears to be it, yes.
- Q Thank you.
- There was not a Spanish version of this
- 23 postcard, was there?
- 24 A There was not.



- 1 Q Why was that?
- 2 A I'm sorry?
- 3 Q Why was there no Spanish version of the
- 4 Show It postcard that went to 5.9 million households?
- 5 A Because we don't know exactly which
- 6 households are speaking English or Spanish.
- 7 Again, like everything we're doing, the
- 8 detailed information is on our Web site, and if you
- 9 go to votesPA.com, there's -- the entire Web site has
- 10 a Spanish version to it.
- 11 Q Just a few more questions, Mr. Royer.
- 12 Following up on my question about whether there had
- 13 been more work done to estimate the number of people
- 14 who need ID.
- I take it there's no written document,
- 16 there's no written plan where Department of State
- 17 sets out: Here are the number of people who don't
- 18 have ID; this is how we're going to get it to them;
- 19 these are the number of elderly; these are the number
- 20 of financially disadvantaged; these are the number of
- 21 disabled; here's how we're going to get it done.
- 22 There's no document like that?
- 23 A Well, the documents that you're talking
- 24 about will be encompassed in the advertising campaign



- 1 documents.
- Our goal was to reach all voters.
- 3 Certainly this is probably the only law that I know,
- 4 of any state law, where every single voter receives
- 5 notification of it in the mail -- television, radio,
- 6 web advertising, robocalls -- I know of no other
- 7 state law that has received this much attention or
- 8 has been the subject of such a multimedia campaign
- 9 over the course of a year.
- 10 So to answer your question, are we
- 11 targeting individual voters, no. There is an
- 12 emphasis on seniors, minorities and young people, and
- 13 we wanted to make sure they were included in
- 14 everything that we're doing, along with the general
- 15 voting population.
- 16 Everyone needs to be reminded to bring an
- 17 ID. And as you can see from this postcard that's
- 18 still on the screen, we told every single voting
- 19 household in the state the kinds of IDs that they
- 20 need to bring on Election Day.
- 21 Q My question is a little different. Is
- 22 there any written plan in which you have analyzed the
- 23 size of the need, that is, these are the numbers of
- 24 people we've got to get it to, including the numbers



- 1 of people who are in the vulnerable sectors, the
- 2 aged, disabled, financially disadvantaged; and you
- 3 have a plan for how you're going to make sure that
- 4 all of those people get the ID they need to vote?
- 5 There's no such document, is there?
- 6 A Well, again the advertising campaign, if
- 7 you look at the section on radio advertising, the
- 8 large percentage of that is targeted for
- 9 African-American radio stations, Hispanic radio
- 10 stations and some others, as well.
- 11 The newspaper advertising focuses almost
- 12 exclusively on African-American, Latino, Vietnamese,
- 13 Chinese, Japanese, different newspapers in different
- 14 languages. We are advertising in those newspapers
- 15 but not the general population.
- 16 We are advertising in every college
- 17 newspaper in the state. Every college or university
- 18 that has a newspaper, we have a full-page ad that's
- 19 appearing in October about the voter ID campaign,
- 20 listing all the IDs that voters can bring to the
- 21 polls on Election Day.
- 22 So there are many various components of
- 23 our advertising campaign that target the populations
- 24 that you're talking about.



- In addition, we have done, I think, close
- 2 to 200 events. The Department of State and with one
- 3 of our vendors personally appearing at events with
- 4 minority populations, elderly populations, speaking
- 5 at these events, tabling these events, reaching out
- 6 to groups as best we can to make sure that they
- 7 understand the law and to be available to answer any
- 8 questions they might have.
- 9 So we're very proud of the grass-roots
- 10 effort, as well.
- 11 Q Okay. But if we can focus, say, first on
- 12 the ads that you mention. Those ads are the kind of
- 13 ads I've been showing you; right?
- 14 A I don't know that you showed the
- 15 newspaper ads in the Latino or African-American
- 16 newspapers or specifically the college newspapers. I
- 17 think I saw that in what you showed me.
- 18 Q But you'd expect them to be similar to
- 19 this?
- 20 A Yes. But a full-page newspaper ad,
- 21 though, does allow you to have more space than the
- 22 postcards where you actually list all the IDs that
- 23 can be used.
- Q All right. But what you have is you have



- 1 a plan for where you're going to place advertisement.
- 2 You don't have any document which says these are the
- 3 number of people we've got to get ID into the hands
- 4 of?
- 5 A We know the populations that we need to
- 6 target, and we are targeting with our media effort.
- 7 Q Is there any metric that shows how
- 8 successful you've been in actually giving them ID?
- 9 I'm not talking about whether you put an ad in a
- 10 place where someone says, they'll see it here. I'm
- 11 asking whether you've been successful in putting the
- 12 ID in their hands. Any metric for that?
- 13 A No. And I would imagine that that kind
- 14 of determination would be made at the end of a
- 15 campaign, not during a campaign. We still have six
- 16 weeks to go until Election Day.
- 17 O Mr. Royer, to date, since the law --
- 18 since Act 18 was passed on March 14th, at least as
- 19 of September 19th, you'd issued a grand total of
- 20 about 8900 PennDOT IDs; isn't that right?
- 21 A I think the number is slightly more than
- 22 that by now. But roughly that, yes.
- 23 Q And again through September 19th,
- 24 you've issued only about a thousand DOS IDs; isn't



- 1 that right?
- 2 A I think it's closer to 1300 by now.
- MR. GERSCH: I have no further questions
- 4 at this time, Your Honor.
- 5 – –
- 6 CROSS EXAMINATION
- 7 - -
- 8 BY MR. PUTNAM:
- 9 Q Mr. Royer, when was the DOS ID program
- 10 implemented?
- 11 A It's been in existence for approximately
- 12 four weeks.
- 13 Q And how was it implemented? How was it
- 14 rolled out?
- 15 A It was rolled out with an announcement,
- 16 press release announcement; and PennDOT started
- 17 issuing the cards immediately.
- 18 Q What is the -- do you have a hotline?
- 19 A We do.
- 20 Q Could you explain what the hotline is for
- 21 and when it -- how it was implemented?
- 22 A The 1-877-VotesPA number is -- was an
- 23 existing number which has been transformed into our
- 24 voter ID hotline. We receive about 4,000 phone calls



- 1 a week at that number, almost exclusively on voter ID
- 2 issues.
- We are expanding that hotline. And as of
- 4 next week, we'll have 48 individuals answering phone
- 5 calls on that hotline to provide the public and any
- 6 county elections official with information about
- 7 voter ID. That will enable us to have three times as
- 8 many calls than we currently have and can process
- 9 about 100 calls at any given time.
- 10 Q And what is the BCEL call center?
- 11 A Well, BCEL is the Bureau of Commissions,
- 12 Elections and Legislation, and we have implemented a
- 13 voter ID call center. That's what I just described
- 14 to you.
- 16 is going?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q And how do you get those reports?
- 19 A I get reports from our commissioner, our
- 20 election commissioner, John Marks. And I also get
- 21 updates on a weekly, sometimes a biweekly basis from
- 22 Megan Sweeney, who is our special assistant to the
- 23 Secretary.
- 24 (Respondents' 1 was marked for



- identification.)
- 2 MR. PUTNAM: Let me show you a document
- 3 we've marked R-1. Since we're Respondents, we're
- 4 using that set of numbers.
- 5 BY MR. PUTNAM:
- 6 Q Could you tell me what that is.
- 7 A This is a memo update from Megan Sweeney,
- 8 who is our special assistant to the secretary, to me.
- 9 It is our weekly voter ID report for the dates
- 10 August 13th through August 17th.
- 11 Q And it provides information about how
- 12 many IDs have been issued and any changes in
- 13 staffing?
- 14 A Yes, correct. This report is issued
- 15 weekly or biweekly. And typically the numbers are
- 16 updated, if need be, on IDs that are issued, staff
- 17 that are added, new policies that are implemented
- 18 regarding the ways in which we are administering the
- 19 voter ID law.
- 20 Q So the Department of State is generating
- 21 this document in the ordinary course of business in
- 22 order to keep track of what's going on in the field?
- 23 A Correct.
- 24 (Respondents' 2 was marked for



- identification.)
- 2 BY MR. PUTNAM:
- 3 Q So this one covers August 13 through 17.
- 4 Let me show you one that's been marked R-2, which
- 5 covers August 20 to 24.
- 6 Can you identify that document.
- 7 A Yes. This one is dated August 27th.
- 8 It is similar to the previous document from our
- 9 special assistant, Megan Sweeney, to me, covering the
- 10 period August 20th through the 24th.
- 11 O And there would be a similar document for
- 12 a later date, which might be marked hypothetically
- 13 R-3? If I can show that.
- 14 (Respondents' 3 was marked for
- identification.)
- 16 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- 17 BY MR. PUTNAM:
- 18 Q I'll ask you to identify R-3. Could you
- 19 tell us what that is?
- 20 A It is the voter ID update from
- 21 Ms. Sweeney to me from August 27th through the
- 22 31st covering that period. It's dated
- 23 September 14th.
- Q Now, on the R-3, August 27 through



- 1 31st, there's a reference to increasing Bravo's
- 2 contract to help out 8th and Arch PennDOT. Could
- 3 you tell me what that is?
- 4 A What page is that on?
- 5 Q I think it's on Page 2 at the bottom.
- 6 A Yes, I see it.
- 7 PennDOT has told us that Philadelphia is
- 8 the epicenter of the voter IDs that are being issued.
- 9 I believe they said it's 40 percent of the IDs
- 10 statewide are being issued in the City of
- 11 Philadelphia for voting purposes.
- 12 The Arch Street office is by far the
- 13 largest and busiest office in the state, and fully
- 14 20 percent of all IDs for voting purposes are issued
- 15 at the Arch Street office.
- 16 They asked us for assistance in having a
- 17 presence, as people are coming into their Arch Street
- 18 building, to make sure people were aware of the voter
- 19 ID law requirements, the kinds of IDs that can be
- 20 used, having the proper forms, and any other
- 21 information they might need before they get in line
- 22 to help voters through the process of getting an ID
- 23 at this particularly busy office.
- Q Do you -- Mr. Royer, do you receive



- 1 information on a regular basis about voters who were
- 2 rejected on efforts to get IDs?
- 3 A No, not on a regular basis, no.
- 4 (Respondents' 4 was marked for
- 5 identification.)
- 6 MR. PUTNAM: Let me give you R-4, which
- 7 is the August 31 to September 14th.
- 8 BY MR. PUTNAM:
- 9 O And I guess I'll ask you to identify that
- 10 document, if I could.
- 11 A It's the same thing, it's a voter ID
- 12 update for August 31st through September 14th.
- 13 Q Let me draw your attention on the first
- 14 page to under BCEL Update, it says, "As of
- 15 September 13, 145,353 letters sent to possible voters
- 16 who did not have PennDOT ID numbers were returned by
- 17 the post office." What's that a reference to?
- 18 A Over the summer we sent a letter in the
- 19 month of July to 760,000, approximately, registered
- 20 voters whom we were not able to match with
- 21 100-percent certainty between the voter database and
- 22 the PennDOT database. Out of those roughly 760,000
- 23 letters, 145,353 were returned as undeliverable by
- 24 the post office.



- 1 Q If I can change the subject, what is your
- 2 understanding of the change that's been effected in
- 3 the -- with the new -- yesterday or over the last
- 4 week in response to the Supreme Court? What is the
- 5 effect of that change?
- 6 A Well, the effect of that change is
- 7 keeping with the spirit of the Supreme Court in
- 8 allowing liberal access for these IDs. Before, the
- 9 process included a voter saying their name, date of
- 10 birth, telling the PennDOT customer service
- 11 representative their Social Security number and
- 12 providing two proofs of residence.
- We no longer require two proofs of
- 14 residence, so the voter need not bring any
- 15 documentation to get a DOS ID for voting purposes.
- 16 The process has also changed in that
- 17 everyone will be able to have a card made that day
- 18 and either walk out of PennDOT with a card; or if
- 19 their voter registration, for example, wasn't
- 20 confirmed, they weren't yet registered to vote and
- 21 weren't yet in the statewide database, which the
- 22 counties put the voters -- the counties are the ones
- 23 that put the voters in that database -- that card
- 24 would then be sent to the Department of State. And



- 1 then we would then send it to the voters once they
- 2 were registered, so it would no longer require a
- 3 second trip by the voter to pick up a -- an ID for
- 4 voting purposes.
- 6 were asked with respect to whether there was
- 7 discussion to just have a simple affidavit without
- 8 any other requirements, give an affidavit saying I
- 9 can't get an ID to vote.
- 10 You continue to require, as I understand
- 11 your testimony, that you verify that the applicant is
- 12 a registered voter; is that right?
- 13 A That is correct.
- 14 Q And why do you do that?
- 15 A Well, that is keeping with the spirit of
- 16 Act 18. Act 18 specifically mentions PennDOT issuing
- 17 cards to registered voters and registered voters
- 18 being entitled to IDs, if they have no other form of
- 19 acceptable ID, for free.
- 20 So we're trying to balance what the act
- 21 requires and the direction the Supreme Court has led
- 22 us in and finding a compromise to provide these IDs;
- 23 so you need not bring any documentation, but we still
- 24 check to make sure that you're registered to vote, as



- 1 we would for the nondriver's license photo ID. You
- 2 need to attest that you are -- affirm that you are
- 3 registered to vote for the nondriver's license ID as
- 4 well.
- 5 MR. PUTNAM: One moment.
- 6 BY MR. PUTNAM:
- 7 Q You had some testimony about the media
- 8 campaign. Could you tell me again who Red House is.
- 9 A Red House Communications is the creative
- 10 vendor. They're located in Pittsburgh. They're the
- 11 company that creates the radio spots, the TV spots,
- 12 the billboards, the WECK ads, the 15-second Web
- 13 advertising, as well as static banner ads; the
- 14 transportation ads. Everything that is done -- the
- 15 postcard. Everything that is done has been created
- 16 by them.
- 17 O Tell me who Harmelin Media is again.
- 18 A Harmelin Media is a Philadelphia company
- 19 that is the vendor for purchasing advertising.
- 20 (Respondents' 7 was marked for
- 21 identification.)
- MR. PUTNAM: This is marked R-7, show you
- 23 a document.
- 24 BY MR. PUTNAM:



- 1 Q You testified earlier about specific buys
- 2 on an African-American and Hispanic radio. What's
- 3 this document, R-7?
- 4 A It is the information provided by
- 5 Harmelin Media which lays out in great detail all of
- 6 the -- in all of the markets, all of the
- 7 African-American and Latino radio stations on which
- 8 we are advertising.
- 9 Q And you received in the regular course of
- 10 business copies of the efforts that the media are
- 11 making to reports on the efforts the media are
- 12 making?
- 13 A Absolutely.
- MR. PUTNAM: I'll give you R-6.
- 15 (Respondents' 6 was marked for
- identification.)
- 17 BY MR. PUTNAM:
- 18 Q Could you identify that document.
- 19 A This is a summary from Red House of all
- 20 of the creative projects they have provided the
- 21 Department of State and also listed at the end some
- 22 of the ones that are currently in progress.
- They list television, radio, online
- 24 banners, magazine advertising, newspaper advertising,



- 1 our nearly 6 million postcards, transportation,
- 2 college newspapers, ethnic newspapers and mobile
- 3 advertising, which is large banners -- large
- 4 billboards on wheels for Pittsburgh and Philadelphia
- 5 in the two weeks before the election.
- 6 MR. PUTNAM: I'm going to have another
- 7 document marked R-5.
- 8 (Respondents' 5 was marked for
- 9 identification.)
- 10 BY MR. PUTNAM:
- 11 Q Again, I'll ask you to identify that
- 12 document.
- 13 A This was a recent update from Harmelin
- 14 Media summarizing at a very high level, not in detail
- 15 but at a high level, the complete advertising
- 16 campaign, identifying the objectives, the media
- 17 target, specifically talking about ethnic voters,
- 18 voters who are college students, senior voters. All
- 19 of the television advertising, mentions over a
- 20 thousand television spots.
- 21 All the different print advertising, how
- 22 we're targeting different radio stations based on
- 23 ethnicity, out-of-home advertising, radio, TV,
- 24 online. The list goes on and on and on. This is a



- 1 high-level overview of all of the ways we are getting
- 2 the message out about voter ID.
- 3 Q Mr. Royer, how confident are you that
- 4 registered voters, registered electors, can get
- 5 photo ID before the election?
- 6 MR. GERSCH: Objection.
- 7 MR. PUTNAM: Grounds?
- 8 THE COURT: I'll take it from here.
- 9 Why?
- 10 MR. GERSCH: I think his confidence is
- 11 irrelevant. He's not an expert. There is no
- 12 foundation for it. I'll stipulate that he's
- 13 confident. I don't think it has anything to do with
- 14 this case. It's not admissible.
- 15 THE COURT: I certainly can't rely on his
- 16 confidence going forward. I got that message.
- But did you have a response?
- 18 MR. PUTNAM: I think that is an
- 19 appropriate first question to ask him, why he
- 20 believes he's done what needs to be done in order to
- 21 reach the electors. The other side asked a whole
- 22 series of questions, actually somewhat argumentative
- 23 questions, about whether or not he had any idea
- 24 whether he could reach the electors, so I'm asking



- 1 the flip side of that.
- 2 THE COURT: Objection overruled. But
- 3 ultimately I can't go with this. I can't make a
- 4 decision on this basis.
- 5 MR. PUTNAM: I understand.
- 6 THE COURT: Okay.
- 7 MR. PUTNAM: Okay. I'll rephrase the
- 8 question, then.
- 9 BY MR. PUTNAM:
- 11 have done what you need to do to reach electors so
- 12 that they will be able to obtain ID prior to the
- 13 election?
- MR. GERSCH: Objection; same grounds,
- 15 Your Honor. I think it's the exact same question,
- 16 just asked in different words.
- 17 MR. PUTNAM: I think it was overruled.
- 18 THE COURT: Probably true.
- But you may answer the question.
- THE WITNESS: Could you, please, restate
- 21 that.
- 22 THE COURT: I knew that was going to
- happen.
- 24 BY MR. PUTNAM:



- 1 Q Do you think you've done everything you
- 2 can do in order to make sure that electors,
- 3 registered electors, will have an opportunity to get
- 4 a photo ID prior to the election?
- 5 A Absolutely. And I mentioned earlier that
- 6 I know of no other state law that has received this
- 7 much publicity, that has been the subject of such a
- 8 grassroots effort to get the word out about how it
- 9 affects the people of this state or has been the
- 10 subject of such an extensive, encompassing and
- 11 intense multimedia effort. Every voter will know
- 12 about this law by Election Day.
- 13 Q Let me focus in particular on the
- 14 requirement that in order to get an ID, the applicant
- 15 must be a registered elector.
- 16 When does registration close in
- 17 Pennsylvania?
- 18 A The close of registration is
- 19 October 9th.
- 21 a voter has been registered should presumably be
- 22 resolved after -- at least some of them -- after
- 23 October 9th?
- MR. GERSCH: Objection; form.



- 1 THE WITNESS: Absolutely. The close of
- 2 registration is October 9th. Sometimes it takes,
- 3 during that final rush, seven or so days for some
- 4 counties to make sure that these newly registered
- 5 voters are in the system. It can take up to a week
- 6 afterward. And some instances -- which has happened
- 7 before -- but everyone will be in the system, voter
- 8 registration database, shortly thereafter.
- 9 MR. PUTNAM: I have nothing else. Thank
- 10 you, Your Honor.
- 11 MR. GERSCH: Thank you, Your Honor, just
- 12 a brief reexamination.
- 13 - -
- 14 DIRECT EXAMINATION
- 15 - -
- 16 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 17 Q You were asked about the 145,000 or so
- 18 returned letters; is that right?
- 19 A Correct.
- 20 Q That was out of 760,000 letters that were
- 21 sent out?
- 22 A Slightly less than that. But basically,
- 23 yes.
- 24 Q So there would be somewhere north of



- 1 600,000 letters that weren't returned?
- 2 A Correct.
- 3 Q You were shown various forms of a report,
- 4 a sample of which is R-3. Do you have R-3?
- 5 A Yes.
- 6 O And if you take a look at the second
- 7 bullet -- I'm sorry. The first bullet.
- 8 It says [reading]: As of
- 9 September 13th, PennDOT has issued 7,980 PennDOT
- 10 photo IDs.
- 11 Do you see that?
- 12 A I do.
- 13 Q And each of the reports has a statement
- 14 like that in it; do you recall that?
- 15 A Yes, I do.
- 16 Q Okay. And just to be clear, that's an
- 17 aggregate number starting with March 14th; right?
- 18 A Yes, that is correct.
- 19 Q You wouldn't total up the 7,000
- 20 referenced here with however many thousand were in an
- 21 earlier report. The 7,000 is the total?
- 22 A That is correct. This is the total since
- 23 March 14th.
- Q All right. You were shown R-7, if you



- 1 could take a look at that. That's the email
- 2 September 19th -- 19th from Melissa Rutz to you
- 3 and others.
- 4 Do you have that?
- 5 A Yes, Melissa Rutz.
- 6 Q And very quickly, the kind of information
- 7 that's in this summary is essentially how much is
- 8 spent at a particular station. And does it also show
- 9 you how much is spent -- withdrawn. I'll ask you.
- 10 If you look at the second page -- I'm
- 11 sorry -- the third page of the document, STNGRCPP.
- Do you see that at the top?
- 13 A Yes, I do.
- 14 0 What is that?
- 15 A That's the gross that is being spent on a
- 16 particular radio station in that particular market.
- 17 O Okay. And there are various forms of
- 18 that figure throughout this report?
- 19 A Yes.
- 20 Q Okay. And there are figures for how much
- 21 you're spending at which stations; right?
- 22 A That is correct.
- Q But nothing in this report tells you how
- 24 many registered voters are listening to those



- 1 stations or whether this is an effective means of
- 2 reaching those effective -- of those registered
- 3 voters; right? There's nothing in R-7 that tells you
- 4 that?
- 5 A There's nothing in here that states how
- 6 many registered voters this is reaching; correct.
- 7 Q Okay. And if you take a look at R-5,
- 8 that is the document that begins with something from
- 9 Mr. Ronald Ruman. If you need help, I can see if I
- 10 can find that.
- 11 Do you have R-5 in front of you?
- 12 A I do.
- 13 Q This, again, is a communication -- well,
- 14 there's a communication from you, but it attaches
- 15 communication to you from -- I hope I'm not
- 16 mispronouncing it -- Ms. Rutz? Melissa Rutz?
- 17 A Yes; Melissa Rutz from Harmelin Media.
- 18 Q And ultimately there's a memo from her
- 19 about three or four pages in.
- Do you see that?
- 21 A I do.
- 22 Q There's a lot of specific information in
- 23 her memo; right?
- 24 A Yes, there is.



- 1 Q But none of that information tells you
- 2 how many registered voters you're reaching in any of
- 3 those media outlets; right?
- 4 A No, it does not mention specifically how
- 5 many registered voters you are hitting with each of
- 6 these programs. It does mention, though, at the
- 7 beginning, 12 million households.
- 8 Q Right. But that doesn't tell you who is
- 9 doing the reading; right? That doesn't tell you
- 10 whether the person who is being reached ultimately is
- 11 a voter or someone who is underage or a citizen of
- 12 another country? You can't get any of that out of
- 13 this information; correct?
- 14 A Only to say that in the television/cable
- 15 section, the bullet point in here from Ms. Rutz says
- 16 [reading]: While utilizing this medium, we will
- 17 reach 12,696,379 PA households.
- 18 I'm assuming that the vast majority of
- 19 registered voters are included in that count.
- 20 Q All right. But, again, this is a TV ad
- 21 they're talking about; right?
- 22 A That is referencing our television buy;
- 23 correct.
- Q And so if you're watching television,



- 1 you're watching your show and the ads come on and you
- 2 decide, all right, this is a perfect time for me to
- 3 microwave the popcorn, or whatever it is that you
- 4 might do during that break, there's nothing in this
- 5 data that tells you whether that's happening or
- 6 whether -- this is the moment where everyone is
- 7 getting up to leave or whether people are sitting and
- 8 watching your ad; right? You can't get that out of
- 9 this information?
- 10 A I will agree with you that Ms. Rutz'
- 11 analysis of this does not tell us when people are
- 12 microwaving their popcorn.
- 13 Q Counsel -- and you'd agree with it that
- 14 you can't get beyond the basic information that you
- 15 recited, that it's shown in a medium and somehow or
- 16 other they calculate that there will be 12 million
- 17 households that are watching during the period that
- 18 it's shown? That's how you understand it; right?
- 19 A I'm not sure I understand your question.
- Q Withdrawn. When they say they're going
- 21 to reach 12 million, they don't mean that 12 million
- 22 households are watching your ad. They mean they're
- 23 showing the ad at a time during which they have
- 24 estimated that 12 million people happen to watch



- 1 television?
- 2 A The ad is -- the ad buy is created so
- 3 that up to 12 million households will be able to see
- 4 this advertising campaign on TV.
- 5 Q Well, let me just drill down a little bit
- 6 further. When you say "up to 12 million," the ad is
- 7 shown during a period when 12 million viewers are
- 8 watching those kinds of outlets, the outlets that
- 9 she's talking about; is that fair?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q Okay. But going back to my earlier
- 12 question about the popcorn, what it doesn't measure,
- 13 it doesn't measure whether people are still sitting
- on the couch watching when the ad comes on. There's
- 15 nothing like that in there?
- 16 A No, and I don't even know how that would
- 17 be possible.
- 18 Q You've never seen any data or market
- 19 research information where people actually try and
- 20 figure out whether persons are watching the ad?
- 21 You've never seen a survey where they actually try to
- 22 figure out how effective the ad is, see whether
- 23 people actually stick around to watch it?
- 24 A The ads are placed around television



- 1 shows and on cable networks in order to reach our
- 2 targeted populations. Then up to 12 million
- 3 households, which is what Melissa Rutz refers to in
- 4 her memo.
- 5 Q Mr. Royer, my question is a little
- 6 different.
- 7 My question is, don't you understand that
- 8 there is research that's done out there where they
- 9 try and measure how effective ads are, where they try
- 10 and measure whether people actually watch the ads or
- 11 whether they get up and leave?
- 12 A There may very well be research out
- 13 there.
- Q But you don't know if there is or isn't?
- 15 A I do not.
- 16 Q Certainly, you haven't seen any of that
- 17 research done on your ads?
- 18 A No.
- 19 Q Okay. Shifting topics again, you had a
- 20 question from counsel. I tried to take it down. I'm
- 21 not sure I got it entirely. But it was something
- 22 like, have you done everything you could to make
- 23 sure -- and I'm not sure whether it was to get
- 24 everyone an ID or make sure everyone could vote.



- 1 Do you remember your testimony?
- 2 A Yes.
- 3 Q Okay. So it's your position that you've
- 4 done everything you could, either to get the IDs in
- 5 people's hands or to make sure they can vote? Is
- 6 that how I understand your testimony?
- 7 A To make sure people can vote?
- 8 O Yes.
- 9 A Any eligible voter is able to vote.
- 10 Q They're only eligible -- they can only
- 11 vote if they've got the ID; right?
- 12 A If they don't have an ID, they can vote
- 13 by provisional ballot.
- 14 Q Not everyone can vote by provisional
- 15 ballot, can they?
- 16 A Anyone can vote by provisional ballot if
- 17 they ask the judge of elections.
- 18 Q So they've got to go to a judge; is that
- 19 your testimony?
- 20 A The judge of elections works in the
- 21 polling place.
- 22 Q They've got to go to the judge of
- 23 elections and ask them if they can vote?
- 24 A If a voter shows up on Election Day and



- 1 they are registered in a different precinct or if
- 2 they may not have their photo ID -- they left it at
- 3 home, for example, in the rush to get to the polling
- 4 place before 8 o'clock -- they are able to use a
- 5 provisional ballot to vote.
- 6 Q Is the -- when you made reference to you
- 7 doing everything you could do, is going to the judge
- 8 of elections, does that fall in that category of you
- 9 doing everything you could do?
- 10 A In the instances where someone may forget
- 11 their ID on Election Day, you are able to vote at
- 12 your polling place by provisional ballot. A judge of
- 13 elections is the polling place worker who works right
- 14 there in the precinct, who is elected by the voters
- 15 in their precinct. And a judge of elections will
- 16 give that voter a provisional ballot to vote.
- 17 Q By the way, when you were asked the
- 18 question, "Have you done everything?" I assume that
- 19 you interpreted that as meaning that the Department
- 20 of State and not Shannon Royer individually all on
- 21 his own; is that fair?
- 22 A That is fair.
- Q Okay. So in terms of whether the
- 24 Department of State has done everything to make sure



- 1 that people have the ID they need to vote, there is
- 2 something else that could have been done that you
- 3 haven't done; isn't that right?
- 4 A We are active in every single area that I
- 5 could think of to get the word out about this voting
- 6 requirement, at the grassroots level, at the
- 7 multimedia level, at the intermediate level.
- 8 We are engaging voters every way possible
- 9 on this legislation. So I don't know what other
- 10 mediums we can tap into to notify voters about this
- 11 law.
- 12 Q Mr. Royer, couldn't you have been
- 13 making -- the liberal access that the Supreme Court
- 14 says should have been offered to IDs, you could have
- 15 been offering that since March 14th of 2012,
- 16 instead of waiting until last night? You could have
- done that; isn't that right?
- 18 A That change could have been made earlier,
- 19 sure.
- THE COURT: Are you sure you want to ask
- 21 this next question?
- MR. GERSCH: I'm thinking, Your Honor.
- 23 I once had a case with a counsel from
- 24 New York, and in this setting she would have said,



- 1 I'm "toining" it over in my "moind."
- I have no further questions, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: I've been there. I get it.
- 4 MR. PUTNAM: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 5 THE COURT: Anything else for this
- 6 witness?
- 7 MR. PUTNAM: No, Your Honor. Thank you.
- 8 THE COURT: Are you finished with this
- 9 witness now? May I excuse him?
- MR. GERSCH: Yes, we are. Yes, Your
- Honor.
- 12 THE COURT: All right. You may step
- down. You're free to go. There's been a point that
- 14 I probably didn't discuss with anybody yet, which is
- 15 how you would like to handle the exhibits. So don't
- 16 take any exhibits with you. Just leave all the
- 17 exhibits there.
- 18 MR. GERSCH: Your Honor, before we go
- 19 further, if I could just make an announcement for the
- 20 benefit of Mr. Steve Turner, who I understand has
- 21 been in contact with the Secretary, who is on our
- 22 witness list, and advised him that they will not need
- 23 the Secretary.
- 24 THE COURT: Thank you. Mr. Turner, thank



- 1 you.
- What we did at the last hearing was that
- 3 I kept the exhibits, just because the -- I don't
- 4 really know the court reporter. We don't have an
- 5 ongoing relationship with the court reporter. It's
- 6 not a Commonwealth Court court reporter.
- 7 So I don't know what happened with the
- 8 exhibits that were identified during the morning. I
- 9 don't know whether the -- I have a copy of all the
- 10 exhibits here on the bench. It would be my intention
- 11 that my copies would be entered into the original
- 12 record.
- So I just want to make sure that the
- 14 court reporter knows that, unlike most trials I've
- 15 been involved with, the Court will take
- 16 responsibility for the exhibits. And I would like to
- 17 deal with that right now before I start losing track
- 18 of these exhibits, if you don't mind.
- 19 I'm assuming that Petitioners are moving
- 20 all the exhibits that you have identified with the
- 21 exception of one that was not -- I guess the witness
- 22 has never seen it before and didn't know anything
- 23 about it.
- 24 MR. GERSCH: Correct, Your Honor. And I



- 1 have a list if that would be helpful.
- THE COURT: I have the list.
- Were there -- are there any objections to
- 4 the exhibits? Let me read them off as they were
- 5 identified.
- 6 (Petitioners' 115, 130, 136, 172,
- 7 173, 174, 178, 179, 220, 224, 225
- 8 and 226 were received into
- 9 evidence.)
- 10 THE COURT: 179 is received. 178 is
- 11 received. 172 is received. 174 is received. 173 is
- 12 received. 115 is received. 136 is received. 225 is
- 13 received. 226 is received. 224 is received. 220 is
- 14 received. 130 is received.
- Respondent, when we get to your side of
- 16 the case, we'll deal with your exhibits, but right
- 17 now I have Exhibits R-1 through -7.
- MR. PUTNAM: Correct.
- 19 THE COURT: So I have all those exhibits
- 20 up here.
- 21 Mr. Mazin, they will be your
- 22 responsibility. Guard them with your life.
- 23 All right. Do you have another witness
- 24 for today?



- 1 MR. GERSCH: We do. It's Mr. Jonathan
- 2 Marks. We can go ahead, Your Honor, if possible, to
- 3 take a very short break. I think I can condense his
- 4 examination in light of everything we've heard. But
- 5 if Your Honor prefers, I can get started now.
- 6 THE COURT: How much time do you want?
- 7 MR. GERSCH: 10 minutes.
- 8 THE COURT: We'll take a 10-minute
- 9 recess.
- 10 THE CLERK: Commonwealth Court is now in
- 11 recess.
- 12 (Recess taken.)
- 13 THE CLERK: Come to order. Court is now
- 14 in session. Be seated.
- MR. GERSCH: Your Honor, Petitioners call
- 16 Mr. Jonathan Marks.
- 17 - -
- JONATHAN MARKS, having first been duly
- 19 sworn according to law, was examined and testified as
- 20 follows:
- 21 - -
- 22 EXAMINATION
- 23 BY MR. GERSCH:
- Q Sir, please state your name.



- 1 A Jonathan Marks.
- 2 Q And, Mr. Marks, are you still the
- 3 commissioner of the Bureau of Elections?
- 4 A I am.
- 5 Q Mr. Marks, I'm going to apologize in
- 6 advance. The questioning will be a little
- 7 disjointed, but it's to your advantage. Almost all
- 8 the questions have been answered by the preceding
- 9 witnesses, so you'll derive the benefit of that.
- There has been testimony about a change
- 11 to the Department of State ID program that went into
- 12 effect either last night and/or this morning.
- I take it you're familiar with those
- 14 changes?
- 15 A I am, yes.
- 16 Q Okay. And we heard testimony this
- 17 morning from Mr. Myers about how that change has
- 18 affected the folks at PennDOT in terms of what they
- 19 have to do.
- I'm not going to run through those
- 21 questions with you. I want to focus on how those
- 22 changes are going to affect the Department of State
- 23 on its end when it receives a call from the folks at
- 24 PennDOT and they want to verify that they can issue a



- 1 PennDOT -- I'm sorry -- a DOS ID to the voter.
- 2 Are you with me so far?
- 3 A I am.
- 4 Q All right. So, as we understand it, and
- 5 we've seen the new application form that gets filled
- 6 out by the voter and presented to PennDOT, is --
- 7 assuming PennDOT is able to get all the information
- 8 that's required on the form, we understand that at
- 9 some point in the process the customer representative
- 10 at PennDOT is going to call the SURE help desk; is
- 11 that right?
- 12 A That is correct, yes.
- 13 Q All right. What happens at that point
- 14 from PennDOT's -- I'm sorry, from the Department of
- 15 State's point of view?
- 16 A From that point, when a call is received,
- it comes in to the help desk, which I'll call Tier 1.
- 18 Tier 1 is the initial point of contact. The help
- 19 desk, we use the name, date of birth, Social Security
- 20 number information provided by the PennDOT customer
- 21 service representative to do a search. And there's a
- 22 specific application designed to do that search.
- 23 First, verify that the individual is registered to
- 24 vote and do the SSN verification.



- 1 If the help desk is unable to find a
- 2 match in the voter registration record or the SSN
- 3 does not match, that will be -- the call will then be
- 4 transferred to Bureau of Commissions, Elections, and
- 5 Legislation staff, which I'll call Tier 2.
- 6 We have a little more discretion. We can
- 7 search the database on items, such as just street
- 8 address, for example, to find out if maybe the
- 9 individual is in there under a slightly different
- 10 name.
- 11 So we have a little more capability that
- 12 the help desk doesn't have. We also have the luxury
- of a little more time that the help desk doesn't
- 14 have.
- So that call was immediately transferred
- 16 up to Tier 2. If we're able to resolve the issue,
- 17 find a match, then we would provide the PennDOT
- 18 customer service representative with the voter ID
- 19 number, the verification number, and the client will
- 20 be able to get their identification.
- 21 Q Let me stop you there and ask this
- 22 question: What is it that you need to find in order
- 23 for you to tell PennDOT: Go ahead and issue the ID
- 24 card. You need to find -- stop me if I'm wrong. You



- 1 need to find the voter in the SURE database; is that
- 2 right?
- 3 A That's correct, yes.
- 4 Q If you find the voter in the SURE
- 5 database, is that the end, or do you have to do
- 6 something else?
- 7 A In the overwhelming majority of cases,
- 8 that's the end. What we've found in our earlier
- 9 experience with this, that the majority of issues are
- 10 due to data entry errors, for example, or slight
- 11 differences in the name.
- To give an example, I spoke to an
- individual on Saturday who most likely the county
- 14 tacked their middle name on to their last name,
- 15 believing that it was a hyphenated name. So once I
- 16 was able to go in and do an additional search, we
- 17 made that determination.
- 18 We've also had an issue where the -- a
- 19 digit in the date of birth was entered incorrectly or
- 20 two digits were transposed. The Tier 1 help desk
- 21 process is not going to catch that. We are at
- 22 Tier 2.
- 23 Q And when you say -- withdrawn.
- Let me ask a couple questions. First of



- 1 all, you said you did this on Saturday.
- 2 So that's before this new process went
- 3 into effect; correct?
- 4 A That's correct, yes.
- 5 Q So the part in which -- the part of the
- 6 process in which PennDOT calls the SURE help desk,
- 7 the SURE help desk attempts to locate the voter in
- 8 the SURE database, that's the same both in the old
- 9 system and in the new system; right?
- 10 A Correct. That process will continue.
- 11 The only thing that will be different is whether the
- 12 individual walks out the door with the card or
- 13 whether that card is turned over to the Department of
- 14 State for safekeeping until we can determine that the
- 15 individual is, in fact, qualified and registered to
- 16 vote. That's the difference.
- 17 Q Okay.
- 18 A In a nutshell.
- 19 Q And I may have questions on that too.
- 20 I'm not up to that part yet.
- 21 A Sorry, didn't mean to get ahead of you.
- 22 Q That's all right.
- The part where the voter is not verified
- 24 at Tier 1, that is, the SURE help desk can't verify



- 1 and then they kick that over to the Bureau of
- 2 Elections line, what you call Tier 2?
- 3 A Correct.
- 4 Q That's been going on before, and it will
- 5 continue to go on; is that right?
- 6 A That is correct, yes.
- 7 Q And did I understand you to say that one
- 8 of the reasons that the people at the SURE help desk
- 9 might not be able to find the voter is because they
- 10 don't have access to all the tools for searching the
- 11 SURE database that the Tier 2 folks will have?
- 12 A Right. It's partly access and also
- 13 partly time.
- 14 Tier 1 help desk is fielding calls as
- 15 they come in. They're going to take the majority of
- 16 calls. The majority of those calls are going to
- 17 check out fine.
- 18 So they have an interest in keeping the
- 19 calls moving so that people do not sit on hold.
- 20 There are 71 centers, I believe, throughout the
- 21 Commonwealth that our help desk is serving, so it's
- 22 in their interest to keep the calls moving. So they
- 23 are looking under a very narrow set of criteria. And
- they're essentially looking for exact match on name,



- 1 date of birth, et cetera.
- 2 If discretion needs to be added, if
- 3 they're unable to find it, that's what Tier 2 is for.
- 4 As I said, we have the luxury of time. We can use
- 5 the additional tools, and we have the time to do
- 6 that.
- 7 Q And when you made reference to data entry
- 8 problems, so -- so the Tier 1 folks might not be able
- 9 to find the registration because of data entry
- 10 problems?
- 11 A Correct, yes.
- 12 O So are these -- is this a problem in the
- 13 sense of someone who entered the information into the
- 14 SURE database has made a typo; is that what we're
- 15 talking about?
- 16 A Correct, yes.
- 17 Q All right. And that would mean that the
- 18 Tier 1 folks can't find it for an exact match?
- 19 A Right, yeah. If there's a superfluous
- 20 space in the middle of the name, for example, or the
- 21 county accidently added a special character in the
- 22 name, Tier 1 is not going to find that. They're
- 23 going to type in the name as it's given to them over
- the phone.



- 1 We can use additional tools such as
- 2 searching just on the address to find a list of
- 3 voters who reside at that address and sort through
- 4 them to determine if we -- if we see a similar name
- 5 in the database. And that's how we find these
- 6 anomalies.
- 7 Q How many people do you have on the SURE
- 8 help desk?
- 9 A On the SURE help desk we have four
- 10 people, I believe, now committed to voter ID. We
- 11 also have the ability to add three more. Essentially
- 12 our division of SURE office is kind of the overflow
- 13 for that traffic.
- 14 Q Have you had complaints that the SURE
- 15 desk is not getting to calls fast enough and that the
- 16 PennDOT people have been on hold for as long as 10
- 17 and 15 minutes, or sometimes they just get busy
- 18 signals?
- 19 A We have had complaints. As I recollect,
- 20 initially within the first week and a half to two
- 21 weeks, the majority of those complaints came in. We
- 22 had one complaint from one facility this past
- 23 Saturday regarding a lengthy wait time. We have had
- 24 periodic issues with the phone system. They're



- 1 usually temporary, resolved within minutes.
- 2 As I recall, an overwhelming majority of
- 3 the complaints -- which weren't that many to begin
- 4 with, but those came within the first couple weeks.
- 5 O The card has only been available since
- 6 August 27th; is that right?
- 7 A Right.
- 8 O So the first couple weeks would be most
- 9 of the time the card has been available?
- 10 A Yes. And as I recall, those were
- 11 Saturdays, the first couple of Saturdays. I don't
- 12 recall complaints coming in during the week. They
- 13 now have three people committed to being there on
- 14 Saturdays at the Tier 1 help desk.
- 15 Q All right. Sticking with the new
- 16 process, so -- withdrawn. Let me put it differently.
- 17 If you're unable to find the voter in the
- 18 database at Tier 2, then what happens? What happens
- 19 today?
- 20 A Well, we determine that the individual --
- 21 does not appear that the individual is registered,
- 22 what we'll do is follow up whatever finding based on
- the calls; and not always is the PennDOT
- 24 representative there with the client; but in many



- 1 cases they are.
- We're finding out that individuals are
- 3 registering to vote via a voter registration drive,
- 4 for example. They hand over their forms to a
- 5 volunteer and then a couple of days later show up to
- 6 the PennDOT center to obtain their ID.
- 7 In that circumstance, it's unlikely that
- 8 within those two days the county will have received
- 9 the form and had the opportunity to process it.
- 10 So that's going to require us to do
- 11 follow-up, check the voter registration rolls
- 12 frequently. As these people -- as we determine that
- 13 these people are registered, then they'll receive an
- 14 exceptions letter which is essentially a letter
- 15 informing them that they may obtain the ID.
- We'll also follow up via phone if a phone
- 17 number was provided.
- 18 Q All right. And here I want to make a
- 19 distinction between the way the program used to work
- 20 and the way the program will work going forward.
- In terms of the way the program worked up
- 22 through last night, if it was the case that the
- 23 Department of State could not verify that the voter
- 24 was registered while the voter was standing there at



- 1 the PennDOT desk with a customer representative, at
- 2 that point the voter was sent home; is that right?
- A That's correct, yes.
- 4 Q Okay. And will that be different under
- 5 the new system?
- 6 A It will. What will happen under the new
- 7 system, the -- PennDOT will take the photo of the
- 8 voter, generate the card, and provide the card to us.
- 9 They will also offer the individual a voter
- 10 registration application form. It's kind of a safety
- 11 net.
- 12 If the individual isn't sure whether
- they're registered or can't remember whether they're
- 14 registered, or even if the individual did register
- 15 through a voter registration drive but now wonders if
- 16 that form is -- it's been several weeks, if that form
- is ever going to make it to the county, they'll be
- 18 offered the voter registration form as well.
- 19 We will either receive from PennDOT via
- 20 UPS a card for that individual and the voter
- 21 registration application form that we can send to the
- 22 county, or we will receive just a card if they refuse
- 23 to fill out the voter registration form.
- 24 That's how the process has changed.



- 1 As I understand it, PennDOT is also going
- 2 to be scanning, as part of the exceptions packet, a
- 3 copy of the voter registration application that's
- 4 been completed so that we have a soft copy of the
- 5 paperwork, as well.
- 6 Q So you're going to be receiving from
- 7 PennDOT in hard copy -- I'm sorry, did you say
- 8 through UPS?
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q Through UPS you're going to get a card,
- 11 you may be getting a voter registration application?
- 12 A That's correct.
- 13 Q And you're going to get -- by some means
- 14 you're going to get the exceptions document?
- 15 A That's correct.
- 16 Q And how are you going to get that?
- 17 A That will still be delivered through the
- 18 shared drive.
- 19 Q Electronically?
- 20 A Electronically, yes. There's a secure
- 21 drive onto which those documents are loaded.
- Q Who gets those materials on your end?
- 23 A Who gets them? We have three people that
- 24 have access to that folder. It's basically our three



- 1 points of contact for voter ID. They're kind of the
- 2 coordinators for this entire project.
- 3 Q And are they the same people who also get
- 4 the card and the registration form?
- 5 A No. We're actually going to have another
- 6 point of contact, a single person that's going to
- 7 coordinate the receipt, organization and distribution
- 8 of the cards.
- 9 Q Okay. And when you say "we're going to,"
- 10 you say that because this program is just being
- 11 rolled out now?
- 12 A Yes, it's fairly new. And at last check,
- 13 I believe that person will be ready to go next week.
- 14 Q And when you say "that person will be
- 15 ready to go, " do you mean the person who is going to
- 16 receive the cards --
- 17 A Right, I --
- 18 Q Let me just finish my question --
- 19 A Right.
- 21 The person who will be ready to go next
- 22 week will be the person who is on the receiving end
- of the card and the registration coming from PennDOT?
- 24 A That's correct. Yes.



- 1 Q And how about the people -- the three
- 2 people who are going to be receiving electronically
- 3 the exceptions document from PennDOT? When are those
- 4 people going to be ready to go?
- 5 A The three people, they're already ready
- 6 to go. They've been doing it.
- 7 Q And when we say "exceptions document," I
- 8 think we talked about this at the last hearing, what
- 9 you mean is a document which describes why PennDOT is
- 10 unable to issue them -- issue the voter a card while
- 11 they're standing there?
- 12 A That's correct.
- 13 Q Okay. All right. If it is the case
- 14 that -- withdrawn.
- 15 All right. Let's go back to the
- 16 situation where you haven't found someone's
- 17 registration. That's someone's job at the Bureau of
- 18 Elections to follow up on; right?
- 19 A That's correct, yes.
- 20 Q And if you can't find it in any of the
- 21 databases, then what's going to happen?
- 22 A Well, we'll continue to look for it.
- 23 We're in the process now of trying to find a more
- 24 systematic, programmatic way to search the database



- 1 automatically. But for now it's manual. We continue
- 2 to search the database until that individual is
- 3 registered.
- 4 Q How many people perform that function?
- A The same three people primarily. We do
- 6 have additional staff, temp staff that have been
- 7 trained on doing voter lookups. We're shifting the
- 8 office furniture around as necessary.
- 9 Q And am I right that what's going on now
- 10 is that -- am I right that what's going on now is the
- 11 way you do this is you wait until -- the
- 12 presumption -- withdrawn. I'm not saying this well.
- 13 Let me try it this way. From your
- 14 description, I'm getting the impression that the
- 15 presumption is that the person has registered
- 16 recently, and you're waiting until it shows up in the
- 17 SURE database; is that right?
- 18 A That's correct. The presumption is this
- 19 person is qualified and that they'd done the steps
- 20 necessary to register. We just can't confirm it at
- 21 that point.
- 22 Q But I also take it that the presumption
- 23 is that what is going on is a delay occasioned by a
- 24 recent registration, and then eventually they'll work



- 1 their way into the system.
- 2 A Correct.
- 3 Q I want to focus on the issue of whether
- 4 the person is already in the system and you just
- 5 haven't found them. What's supposed to happen in
- 6 that case?
- 7 A If they're already in the system and we
- 8 haven't found them, I'm not aware of a circumstance
- 9 where that's occurred, and I'm not aware of a
- 10 circumstance where anyone has actually alleged that
- 11 that's occurred.
- 12 As I said, we can look at the address an
- individual has provided. If they are registered to
- 14 vote under a different name and a different address
- on a different date of birth, there's probably no
- 16 circumstance under which we will find them.
- 17 But our search capabilities at Tier 2 are
- 18 pretty broad. So I don't expect that it would
- 19 happen.
- If an individual provides us with some
- 21 proof positive that they are registered -- for
- 22 example, a recent voter registration card, one that
- 23 would have been sent by the county recently -- we
- 24 could contact the county at that point to verify



- 1 whether there's a voter registration record, if they
- 2 have a paper record of the registration.
- 3 So there are -- and this is where the
- 4 case-by-case discretionary actions come into play
- 5 under a unique circumstance like that. But again,
- 6 I'm not aware of a situation under which that's
- 7 occurred.
- 8 THE COURT: May I ask a question.
- 9 MR. GERSCH: Of course.
- 10 THE COURT: The Level 2 searching, would
- 11 that be equivalent to what occurs here when we're
- 12 given a line challenge?
- 13 THE WITNESS: It's equivalent -- you're
- 14 looking at a slightly different view. It doesn't
- 15 have the Changes tab, for example, some other things
- 16 with personally identifying information on it. We
- 17 have a more direct view of it. But it is similar in
- 18 that respect.
- I know the Court has used that capability
- 20 for looking by address, et cetera.
- 21 THE COURT: All right. Thank you. That
- 22 just sort of focuses it for me because that's what we
- 23 do around -- in the spring. We do it in the spring.
- 24 We have some people doing it right now too.



- 1 THE WITNESS: It's like baseball. It's
- 2 an annual rite of spring.
- 3 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 4 Q I want to walk you through a case of
- 5 someone who was initially rejected for ID and ask if
- 6 you can explain how -- what happened there. Okay?
- 7 A Okay.
- 8 0
- 9 MR. GERSCH: I'm going to hand up
- 10 Exhibit 229, 229.
- 11 (Petitioners' Exhibit 229 was
- marked for identification.)
- 13 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 14 Q Mr. Marks, I've handed you Exhibit 229,
- 15 which is a several-page document. I want you to take
- 16 your time with it. This is a document produced to us
- 17 by counsel for Respondents. And it starts on the
- 18 first page, it says Eric Carney, not verified,
- 19 August 29, 2012. Take a look at and let me know when
- 20 you're ready.
- 21 A You want me to review the entire
- 22 document?
- Q Well, we can go page by page in a sense.
- 24 Let me ask you this. The first page where it says



- 1 "Eric Carney, not verified, August 29, 2012," does
- 2 that mean that that's the date he presented at
- 3 PennDOT and that's the date that Department of State
- 4 was unable to say he was a registered voter?
- 5 A That is correct, yes.
- 6 Q And then the second page in is his
- 7 application. And this, of course, is under the
- 8 original Department of State system. It's not under
- 9 the new one that's going into effect tomorrow?
- 10 A Excuse me. It actually -- it appears
- 11 that he was added on the 28th. The document may
- 12 not have been loaded until the 29th.
- 13 Q And let me just say for the record, we
- 14 have blotted out the Social Security number for the
- 15 benefit of the voter.
- 16 But if you had the -- there was an
- 17 unredacted copy that the Department of State has.
- 18 And if you go in, the page after the
- 19 application, what's that document?
- 20 A The page after the application?
- 21 Q Yes.
- 22 A Appears to be a voter registration card
- issued by the City of Philadelphia in 2003.
- O Right. So this is a fellow who came in



- 1 to PennDOT; and among the documents he brought to
- 2 identify himself, he brought a voter registration
- 3 card. He also brought his probation and parole
- 4 paperwork; is that right?
- 5 A Yes, that appears to be the case.
- 6 O Okay. Given that this fellow brought his
- 7 voter registration card from 2003 -- see it says
- 8 "enrollment date"?
- 9 A That's when he was enrolled.
- 10 Q Right. So that's when he would have
- 11 registered to vote?
- 12 A That's when he initially registered. It
- 13 appears the card was issued in 2012, valid 10 days
- 14 after if you look below the signature area.
- 15 O I see.
- 16 A I noticed he hasn't signed this.
- 17 O How does that work that he's initially
- 18 enrolled in 2003, and then it says valid 10 days
- 19 after June 7th, 2012?
- 20 A It would be the -- valid 10 days after is
- 21 when the County issues the card. This may have been
- 22 a transfer, for example. If he moved from another
- 23 county, the enrollment date would stay the same. He
- 24 may receive a new card from the new County.



- 1 Or this County may have issued a
- 2 duplicate voter registration card. Like any other
- 3 document, you can request a duplicate if you've lost
- 4 your card.
- 5 Q Okay. But does this mean he was
- 6 originally registered in 2003?
- 7 A Yes. The enrollment date indicates that
- 8 he was registered to vote initially in 2003.
- 9 Q So here we have a guy who was originally
- 10 enrolled, originally registered in 2003; and through
- 11 moving or through getting a duplicate card, he gets
- 12 another card that's valid by June 17th, 2012.
- 13 Am I right so far?
- 14 A Correct, yes.
- Q Okay. Are you able to tell why this guy
- 16 wasn't given a voter ID?
- 17 A I'm not able to tell the exact reason.
- 18 The exception page, the exception worksheet page is
- 19 not attached. But it appears, based on what was
- 20 written here by the PennDOT technician, they were
- 21 unable to verify with our SURE help desk.
- Q Okay.
- 23 A Either the individual's voter
- 24 registration or Social Security number.



- 1 O Okay. Let's talk about the Social
- 2 Security number for a moment.
- When you say -- how do you verify the
- 4 Social Security number?
- 5 A Without getting too far down in the
- 6 weeds, technically, the process involves essentially
- 7 bouncing the last four digits of the Social Security
- 8 number, the first name, last name, date of birth
- 9 against the Social Security Administration's
- 10 database. That happens within a matter of seconds.
- 11 So basically it will return a result, a
- 12 single match or a single match deceased or multiple
- 13 match, for example. If you have -- if you have, for
- 14 whatever reason, the last four, same name, same date
- 15 of birth --
- 16 Q And that's done by the SURE help desk?
- 17 A It's done by the SURE. It's actually
- 18 programmatic. It's built in. They just enter the
- 19 information, and it happens automatically.
- 20 O All right. Let me move to a different --
- 21 related but different topic, which is the number of
- 22 persons for whom PennDOT -- I'm sorry -- Department
- 23 of State has not at least initially been able to
- 24 verify their voter registration status.



- 1 So it's our understanding that, at least
- 2 through the discovery we got, there were 113 initial
- 3 rejections on which the Department of State rejected
- 4 someone for the Department of State ID because they
- 5 couldn't find them in the SURE database.
- 6 Does that sound right to you?
- 7 A There were 113 exceptions. I don't know
- 8 that I said they're rejected until I've made a final
- 9 determination.
- 10 Q That's where I was going to go next.
- And our understanding is, and we received
- 12 this information from counsel, that in 70 of those
- 13 cases -- in 43 of those cases, Department of State
- 14 was able to resolve the initial exception.
- 15 A Right.
- 16 Q Does that sound like the right number to
- 17 you?
- 18 A That does, yes.
- MR. GERSCH: Your Honor, I'm going to
- 20 hand up a binder given to us from materials received
- 21 from counsel of the 43 cases resolved by the
- 22 Department of State. And that's marked Exhibit 217.
- 23 (Petitioners' Exhibit 217 was
- 24 marked for identification.)



- 1 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 2 Q I showed these to counsel before, during
- 3 the break. And I don't expect you to verify the
- 4 contents of each one. But could you take a look --
- 5 A That's all you have?
- 7 appear to you to be the files of the persons whose
- 8 exceptions the Department of State was able to
- 9 resolve.
- 10 A It does. I won't concede that every one
- is correct, but it does appear to be.
- 12 O And we're doing this based on the
- 13 representation of counsel.
- 14 MR. GERSCH: And for the benefit of the
- 15 Court, we'll be talking further with counsel. If
- 16 they have any concerns, I'm sure they'll raise it
- 17 with us.
- 18 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 19 Q The next exhibit that I'm going to hand
- 20 up are what I understand to be the 70 cases that the
- 21 Department of State hasn't been able to resolve. And
- 22 these are Exhibit 218.
- 23 (Petitioners' 218 was marked for
- identification.)



- 1 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 2 Q Mr. Marks, again, just as a confirmation,
- 3 do those appear to you to be the files of the
- 4 persons, the applicants whose exceptions have not
- 5 been resolved?
- 6 A Yes, this appears to be representative of
- 7 that.
- 8 Q And there should be 70 files in there.
- 9 And my question to you is, does that sound like about
- 10 the right number to you?
- 11 A It does. The number's a little bit fluid
- 12 as each day goes by, so --
- 13 Q I'll represent that the oldest
- 14 application in that binder that is not resolved is an
- 15 application dated August 29th, 2012, which would be
- 16 two days after the original DOS ID became available.
- We're now, I think, September 24 --
- 18 25th. We're now September 25th, and I guess the
- 19 question I have for you is, if someone hasn't
- 20 received any -- withdrawn.
- 21 Do you consider that file under active
- 22 investigations? Or have you decided that for some
- 23 portion of these proceedings --
- 24 A It's active investigation. If we, as we



- 1 search the database, we reach a point within the
- 2 next, I would say about 10 days before the close of
- 3 registration, so one of the next few days, where they
- 4 have not shown up in the system yet.
- 5 I'm not aware of too many voter
- 6 registration drives that are that irresponsible that
- 7 they hang onto a voter registration application for a
- 8 month, but I guess anything is possible.
- 9 If necessary, we would have the
- 10 individual fill out another voter registration
- 11 application if the issue is simply having them get
- 12 registered to vote. So it is under active
- 13 investigation, yeah.
- Q When you say, if necessary, you'll have
- 15 them fill out another registration application, how
- 16 are you going to do that physically?
- 17 A We mail them a voter registration
- 18 application.
- 19 Q And how long does it take the mail to go
- 20 through this time of year?
- 21 A For them to receive it?
- 22 O Yes.
- 23 A Usually takes a few days.
- Q And then I presume it would have to take



- 1 a few days to get back to you?
- 2 A Well, they can mail it directly to the
- 3 County Board of Elections. Or they could mail it to
- 4 us. As long as it's postmarked before the
- 5 October 9th deadline to register to vote, it will
- 6 be accepted.
- 7 Q What's the last date on which you'll send
- 8 these people applications?
- 9 A The last date on which we will send
- 10 people applications?
- 11 O Yes.
- 12 A We'll send them applications up to the
- 13 point that we need to. For example, if somebody two
- 14 days before the voter registration deadline comes in
- 15 and we can't verify that they're registered, under
- this new process, they will be given the opportunity
- 17 to fill out a voter registration application on the
- 18 spot. That's the improvement about this process.
- 19 That safety net will be in place on the
- 20 front end. We won't have to address it on the back
- 21 end.
- 22 Q Sure. I guess I'm thinking of this
- 23 fellow from August 29th whose file still hasn't
- 24 been resolved. At what point will you send that



- 1 person an application to register?
- A As I said, within the next few days. I
- 3 want to make sure that we get it out there so that it
- 4 arrives several days before the close of
- 5 registration.
- And, again, if we have phone numbers for
- 7 individuals, we'll contact them by phone and explain
- 8 to them that we have not been able to verify their
- 9 record as of yet and they may wish to register again
- 10 or complete another registration application.
- 11 MR. GERSCH: Shifting topics, I'm going
- 12 to show you another exhibit marked 149.
- 13 (Petitioners' 149 was marked for
- identification.)
- 15 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 16 Q This one will be a little shorter.
- 17 A They're usually not this succinct,
- 18 though. I'll tell you that.
- 19 Q This is, I take it, some kind of either
- 20 calendar entry or invite to a meeting hosted by you?
- 21 A That's correct, yes.
- Q Would you have caused this to be created?
- 23 A I was, yes. I did.
- 24 O And the first line of the substantive



- 1 text says [reading]: Though it appears that the
- 2 majority of applicants are obtaining their IDs
- 3 without issue, 75 percent...
- 4 And then you go on to discuss options for
- 5 streamlining the process.
- 6 Do you see that?
- 7 A I do, yes.
- 8 Q All right. When you say that the
- 9 majority of applicants are obtaining their IDs
- 10 without issue, 75 percent, do I read that correctly
- 11 to mean that 25 percent of the applicants are not
- 12 obtaining their IDs without issue?
- 13 A At this point in time, on the 4th, I was
- 14 probably ballparking it. So it could have been
- 15 anywhere between 70 and 80 percent.
- 16 So that's -- if that's what I put in
- 17 there, that's probably what I saw based on the
- 18 experience at that moment in time.
- 19 Q Sure. And I'm asking you less about the
- 20 exact precision of the number and more in terms of,
- 21 so does this mean that 25 percent of the applicants
- 22 are having issues obtaining their ID?
- 23 A Roughly.
- 24 Q Are those all issues about registration,



- 1 or are there different kinds of issues?
- 2 A Those were primarily issues about the
- 3 search process and the Tier 1 help desk. This is
- 4 dated 9/4, which was Tuesday after -- about a week
- 5 after this process went into place. And what we were
- 6 finding at that point in time is that we had an
- 7 inordinate amount of exceptions that would be
- 8 generated because of narrow research criteria being
- 9 used by the SURE help desk.
- 10 So we discussed options to streamline
- 11 that. Our goal was to either address more of these
- 12 at the Tier 1 help desk or come up with a better
- 13 process to address them, at least while the
- 14 individual was at the PennDOT driver's license
- 15 center.
- 16 O Sure. And I take it this is sort of the
- 17 normal process of you roll out something new and you
- implement it; and as you implement it, you learn
- 19 about adjustments you need to make?
- 20 A Yes, and you always learn lessons.
- 21 (Petitioners' 131 was marked for
- identification.)
- 23 BY MR. GERSCH:
- Q Let's take a look at Exhibit 131.



- 1 All right. You have Exhibit 131 in front
- 2 of you. At least the first email is from a Courtney
- 3 Wolpert to you and a number of other people; is that
- 4 right?
- 5 A That is right, yes.
- 6 Q And I'm going to be focusing principally
- 7 on that first email.
- 8 Courtney Wolpert, I take it, is with the
- 9 SURE help desk?
- 10 A She is. She's basically the supervisor
- 11 of the SURE help desk.
- 12 Q And she's -- does she report to you?
- 13 A She's does not report directly to me.
- 14 She reports to our division chief, the division of
- 15 SURE, who reports to my deputy, who reports to me.
- 16 Q Okay. And she says -- well, withdrawn.
- 17 Let's go one item down to, you have an
- 18 email to her that's immediately before that. Do you
- 19 see that?
- 20 A The one that begins "for now"?
- 21 Q No. The one that's on the first page.
- 22 "Yes, I notified BCEL" --
- 23 A Yes.
- Q All right. So if you look at that email,



- 1 it says -- this is your email.
- 2 [Reading]: I notified BCEL staff this
- 3 morning that if they receive a call from the
- 4 SURE help desk regarding the DOS ID, they should
- 5 track down any one of the BCEL staff members.
- 6 Do you see that?
- 7 A Yes. Any one of five BCEL staff members.
- 8 Q I'm sorry. You're right.
- 9 And then she responds by saying,
- 10 essentially -- and tell me if I've got this right --
- 11 that they're just going to transfer the calls to
- 12 BCEL; they don't have time to get on the phone with
- 13 you because of the call volume that they're getting.
- 14 A That's correct. And that was rectified
- 15 that same day.
- 16 Q This is August 28th; right?
- 17 A That's correct, yes.
- 18 Q So this is right after you rolled out the
- 19 DOS program?
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 Q And this would be another example of
- 22 something, I take it, where I guess you would say:
- 23 We rolled out a new program; we learned some things;
- 24 we made some changes?



- 1 A Right.
- 2 Q Let me go back to the situation where
- 3 we're talking about the exceptions process that will
- 4 work on the new DOS card going forward. Okay?
- 5 So when there's an exception or problem
- 6 at the PennDOT desk and they send it along to the
- 7 Department of State, that's going to go
- 8 electronically to the three people that you discussed
- 9 before?
- 10 A Right.
- 11 Q And what's their job? How will they
- 12 investigate the process?
- 13 A Their job initially is to check -- and
- 14 they'll do the broader search to the extent that it
- 15 hasn't already been done.
- 16 Again, these three individuals are kind
- of the professionals, I guess, for lack of a better
- 18 term. And that's why they've been assigned to this
- 19 task. So they'll verify that the person is, in fact,
- 20 not registered and that we cannot find them, that the
- 21 initial determination was accurate.
- 22 And I expect that they will find in every
- 23 case that that is true. The card and the voter
- 24 registration application will come to a specific



- 1 PO box that we've set up, a specific address that
- 2 we've set up, specific account.
- And the individual who is coordinating
- 4 that effort will receive the card, the ID card, the
- 5 voter registration application. That person
- 6 coordinating the process will work with the other
- 7 three to determine the eligibility of the individuals
- 8 who are in the exceptions file.
- 9 As I mentioned earlier, we're going to
- 10 try to deal with this programmatically moving
- 11 forward. But in the short term, it's going to
- 12 require those three people or other staff that they
- 13 assigned looking up frequently the names, addresses,
- 14 dates of birth to determine if individuals are
- 15 registered.
- 16 Q I want to pursue the exceptions process
- 17 more, but I wanted to do that in the context of a
- 18 document. I want to show you what's already been
- 19 marked Exhibit 224.
- 20 (Petitioners' 224 was marked for
- identification.)
- 22 BY MR. GERSCH:
- Q All right. Exhibit 224 says "Amended
- 24 Proposal for the DOS Voter ID Process."



- 1 Are you familiar with this document?
- 2 A I am, yes.
- 3 Q And is this a Department of State
- 4 document?
- 5 A It is. This appears to be a version of
- 6 the -- essentially our synopsized version of our
- 7 exception process.
- 8 Q It's dated revised September 24th,
- 9 2012. Do you see that in the lower right?
- 10 A I do, yes.
- 11 Q That would have been yesterday?
- 12 A That's correct, yes.
- 13 Q It says "Amended Proposal for the DOS
- 14 Voter ID Process." Is this a final document? Is it
- 15 a proposal? What is it?
- 16 A This is a description of the process.
- 17 The process is final. This discussion -- I'm not
- 18 sure why the word "amended" is tacked on there. I
- 19 wasn't the author of the document. I did see the
- 20 document, though -- counsel actually prepared the
- 21 document.
- 22 Q Just to be clear, you did see the
- 23 document?
- 24 A I did, yes.



- 1 Q Okay. If you can turn to the second page
- 2 of the document, there are a number of -- there's a
- 3 discussion of a number of issues that may arise where
- 4 the voter -- I don't know if you call it exceptions,
- 5 but where the voter fills out the form in such a way
- 6 and it generates something -- what I'll call "other
- 7 than a standard process."
- If you take a look at the first bullet on
- 9 the second page, it says that "The applicant's record
- 10 with the DOS does not contain the last four digits of
- 11 the Social Security number, then the Department of
- 12 State verifies the applicant's information through
- 13 the American Association of Motor Vehicle
- 14 Administrators' online Social Security verification
- 15 system.
- 16 What happens if you don't succeed in
- 17 making that verification?
- 18 A If we don't succeed in making that, the
- 19 Social Security number verification -- I don't
- 20 believe it's happened. If that occurred, it would
- 21 come over as an exception to us. Everyone is treated
- 22 the same, and you'll be given the opportunity to
- 23 register to vote if they're not already registered to
- 24 vote.



- 1 We would use other pieces of information
- 2 to make a determination.
- For example, we know there is an error
- 4 rate in Social Security Administration. Miniscule as
- 5 it may be, there is an error rate so that the
- 6 possibility exists that an error could have been made
- 7 at the Social Security Administration.
- 8 If they have their Social Security card
- 9 with them and probably have that as evidence that
- 10 their Social Security number is, in fact, what
- 11 they've represented it on the form.
- 12 And if they've presented that and we have
- 13 a copy of that, we would use that information.
- If they have a Medicare card, for
- 15 example, that has a Social Security number printed on
- 16 it, if they have obtained a Medicare card, or some
- 17 other document like that.
- 18 Ultimately we're going to use our
- 19 discrepancy, as the counties do, in determining
- 20 whether someone is registered to vote. If the
- 21 counties have made a determination that an individual
- 22 is qualified to be registered, post the Help America
- 23 Vote Act, they've made a determination on the Social
- 24 Security number verification or the driver's license



- 1 verification, as the case may be.
- 2 Q In this situation we're describing where
- 3 you get some other form of identification, like the
- 4 health insurance card, how are you going to get that
- 5 and when are you going to get that from the voter?
- 6 A We would get that in any way possible.
- 7 The voter could fax a copy to us, the voter could
- 8 email a copy to us, mail a copy to us. Pretty much
- 9 your traditional methods.
- If it's necessary for us to work with the
- 11 County Board of Elections and the voter concurrently,
- 12 we'd do that. I would expect that we will not see
- 13 any of these at all, so it will happen so
- infrequently that we'll be able to dedicate the
- 15 necessary time to get that done.
- 16 MR. GERSCH: If I could just have a
- 17 moment, Your Honor.
- I'm going to hand him Exhibit 107.
- 19 (Petitioners' P-107 was marked for
- 20 identification.)
- 21 BY MR. GERSCH:
- Q Mr. Marks, I'm showing you what's been
- 23 marked as Exhibit 107. Are you familiar with this
- 24 document?



- 1 A I am, yes.
- 2 Q What is it?
- 3 A This is basically our training document,
- 4 for lack of a better term. This is provided by our
- 5 three -- I'm sorry. This is PennDOT's training
- 6 document. I imagine this is a binder similar to
- 7 ours.
- 8 Q And this is a document used to train
- 9 people for the -- what I'll call the old DOS ID
- 10 system, the one before last night and this morning?
- 11 A It appears to be, yes.
- 12 O Okay. And you have a similar document
- 13 for the Department of State?
- 14 A Yes. We have training materials, which
- 15 basically include those documents that are posted on
- 16 our Web site, in a binder.
- 17 Q Have you generated the training materials
- 18 for the new DOS program, the one from last night and
- 19 this morning?
- 20 A We're in the process of doing that. I
- 21 don't know that we have the actual training document.
- 22 Part of it is the document that we just reviewed and
- 23 the updated exceptions process.
- 24 There's also frequently asked questions



- 1 that are being updated. Those will -- the old ones
- 2 will be taken out and the new ones will be inserted
- 3 and replaced in the training binder.
- 4 Q And when do you expect to complete that
- 5 process?
- 6 A It may already be complete. I've been
- 7 here today. I don't know if it's complete or not.
- 8 Q Is there any additional training that
- 9 you're going to do for the Department of State people
- 10 on the new DOS procedures?
- 11 A Yes. In fact, we had training just this
- 12 morning, but we didn't have updated training
- 13 materials. We did cover that process. That training
- 14 was done with our three new temporary staff.
- 15 Our other staff will go through a
- 16 refresher training as well. That will occur I
- 17 believe either Thursday or Friday, and then we will
- 18 have additional staff being trained on Monday.
- MR. GERSCH: No further questions at this
- 20 time.
- 21 - -
- 22 DIRECT EXAMINATION
- 23 - -
- 24 BY MS. HICKOK:



- 1 Q Good afternoon, Mr. Marks.
- 2 A Good afternoon.
- 3 Q I want to follow up on a few points that
- 4 were made with you.
- 5 First of all, this Exhibit 229 that was
- 6 given to you, is that exhibit also a part of the
- 7 binders that you have? Is it actually an excerpt
- 8 from those binders?
- 9 A 229?
- 10 Q It's the one about Eric Carney.
- 11 A You're asking if it's part of the
- 12 training materials?
- 13 Q No. The two binders that they gave you,
- 14 that are the resolved and unresolved cases, is this
- 15 actually an excerpt from that larger collection of
- 16 documents?
- 17 A I would have to check.
- 18 THE COURT: I'm going assume counsel put
- 19 these in alphabetical order.
- 20 MR. GERSCH: Can I make a representation
- 21 that -- that's an excerpt from the binders that were
- 22 ultimately resolved.
- 23 THE WITNESS: All right. I will take his
- 24 word for it.



- 1 BY MS. HICKOK:
- 2 Q In those same files, do you also keep a
- 3 collection of letters that you have sent out to
- 4 people when you have resolved their matters?
- 5 A We do, yes.
- 6 (Respondents' Exhibit 8 was marked
- 7 for identification.)
- 8 MS. HICKOK: I would like to offer R-8.
- 9 And I actually did make it in alphabetical order.
- 10 BY MS. HICKOK:
- 11 O Is that a collection of the letters that
- 12 you maintained with these documents, the resolved and
- 13 unresolved cases?
- 14 A It is, yes.
- 15 Q And is there a letter from Mr. Carney?
- 16 A There is a letter to Mr. Carney, yes.
- 17 O When was that letter sent?
- 18 A It's dated September 4th, 2012, there.
- 19 Q And does that letter say that he is free
- 20 to get his DOS ID?
- 21 A It does, and it provides the ID
- 22 authorization number that he would present to the
- 23 PennDOT technician.
- 24 Q And with that authorization number, how



- 1 long would you expect it to take? Is it more than
- 2 just getting a picture taken?
- 3 A It's not much more than getting a picture
- 4 taken. But with this authorization letter,
- 5 essentially this is proof positive that PennDOT
- 6 already has access to the initial form that was
- 7 filled out, so you would expect the process would not
- 8 take very long.
- 9 Q Okay. And are each of the letters that
- 10 you have in that collection also people who have been
- 11 given authorization numbers because the matters have
- 12 been resolved?
- 13 A That is correct, yes.
- 14 Q And in that same set of documents, I'm
- 15 going to offer you what's R-9.
- 16 (Respondents' 9 was marked for
- identification.)
- 18 BY MS. HICKOK:
- 19 Q Do you recognize this document?
- 20 A I do, yes.
- 21 Q And is it a document that's maintained
- 22 within your department in the ordinary course of
- 23 business?
- 24 A It is, yes.



- 1 Q Is it generated with your participation?
- 2 A It is, yes.
- 3 Q And can you tell the Court what this
- 4 document explains?
- 5 A This document is essentially a tracking
- 6 document for the exceptions letters that are sent
- 7 out. As we research and resolve these exceptions,
- 8 they are tracked in this spreadsheet.
- 9 Q Why would you go to the trouble of
- 10 tracking exceptions?
- 11 A Well, aside from my proclivity to be
- 12 anal-retentive and track everything, we do it because
- 13 we want to keep an accurate accounting of who has
- 14 been verified, who has -- who we provided a letter to
- 15 so they can get their ID and we have it. It's really
- 16 just our way of -- I think the word that was used,
- 17 "active investigations," this is how we track our
- 18 progress.
- 19 Q To restate that, is that a way of
- 20 ensuring that nobody falls through the crack?
- 21 A Yes. That's the more succinct way of
- 22 saying it, yes, Counsel.
- 23 Q Is Mr. Carney on that spreadsheet?
- 24 A Yes, sir.



- 1 Q What does it say about when he was
- 2 resolved?
- 3 A The date completed, 9/4 of 2012, and
- 4 indicates his voter ID number and the date that the
- 5 letter was mailed, which is also 9/4/2012.
- 6 Q And the Exhibit 229 that you have, what
- 7 date did it show that he made the original
- 8 application?
- 9 A His date of signing was August 28th.
- 10 Q But it was entered August 29th, I think
- 11 you said?
- 12 A It appears that it may have been uploaded
- 13 to the shared folder on August 29th, yes.
- 14 Q So you were able to resolve and get him a
- 15 letter within less than a week?
- 16 A That's correct, yes.
- 17 O And how close to the beginning of the
- 18 issuance of the ID cards was that, of the DOS ID
- 19 cards?
- 20 A That was within, roughly, a week of the
- 21 beginning of the issuance.
- 22 Q And did you find that there was a
- 23 difference in the number of problems that you were
- 24 seeing at the beginning of the process and as the



- 1 process went on?
- 2 A Yes, the numbers seemed to decrease
- 3 overall, and that's partly -- I believe we reviewed
- 4 some email threads here earlier about the initial
- 5 days of this process.
- 6 And some of the bumps in the road,
- 7 improvements were made, progress was made even within
- 8 that first week. The Tier 1/Tier 2 process was
- 9 streamlined so that we can ensure that when the help
- 10 desk called up, they would get somebody on the phone.
- 11 Q Now, was there a Tier 2 process the very
- 12 first day?
- 13 A There wasn't a formal Tier 2 process on
- 14 the first day. It was an ad hoc process of
- 15 transferring phone calls.
- Q When did the Tier 2 process become
- 17 formalized?
- 18 A I believe it became formalized on the
- 19 following Monday, which would have been either the
- 20 3rd or the 4th.
- 21 O And does that correlate to the times when
- 22 you saw the dropoff in --
- 23 A It does seem to correlate to that. What
- 24 we were able to do with that streamlined process is



- 1 reduce the number of people who had to be turned
- 2 away, asked to come back.
- 3 Our goal from the very beginning was to
- 4 get IDs in the hands of clients as quickly and
- 5 efficiently as possible.
- 6 Our early experiences showed us -- and I
- 7 believe we reviewed an email where I called a meeting
- 8 on the topic. And one of the things that came out of
- 9 that was this formal Tier 2 process, and we created a
- 10 phone queue and dedicated staff to that phone queue
- 11 to ensure that the calls were getting through.
- 12 Q Now, you said something just a moment
- 13 ago. You said that you're trying to make sure that
- 14 people are not getting turned away.
- 15 You had said earlier that you were
- 16 spending more time than Tier 1 could spend.
- 17 Is the time that you're spending still
- 18 while the person is at PennDOT so they get it that
- 19 day?
- 20 A Yes. When I'm saying "more time," I'm
- 21 saying a few minutes. The Tier 1 help desk is
- 22 obviously trying to process calls as quickly as
- 23 possible; that coupled with the fact that they are
- 24 searching a very narrow set of criteria and they're a



- 1 help desk.
- 2 That's not to diminish their role.
- 3 They're obviously a critical part of this, but they
- 4 can't exercise discretion that our trained staff
- 5 can -- our trained and experienced staff can.
- 6 But that is all done with one telephone
- 7 call, the experiences that -- PennDOT technician
- 8 calls the Tier 1 help desk. If they can't verify the
- 9 individual that calls, it's automatically transferred
- 10 up to Tier 2.
- 11 The PennDOT technician then is talking to
- 12 somebody in the bureau's staff -- on the bureau's
- 13 staff, and we're spending a little bit of additional
- 14 time, the three or four or five minutes, whatever it
- 15 may take, to exhaust our search capabilities.
- 16 Q Now, did you make a judgment at some
- 17 point whether it would be better to send them away
- 18 and research on your own or to keep them there so
- 19 that they can get the product that day?
- 20 A Absolutely. We determined that keeping
- 21 them there so that they could get the product that
- 22 day was a much better resolution.
- 23 Q Thank you. I'm going to hand you what's
- 24 been marked as R-10.



- 1 (Respondents' 10 was marked for
- identification.)
- 3 BY MS. HICKOK:
- 4 Q Are you familiar with this document?
- $ar{b}$ A I am, yes.
- 6 O And can you tell me what it is?
- 7 A This is a schedule of basically the
- 8 after-hours Tier 2 help desk schedule, and it's
- 9 essentially managers who are assigned to be manning
- 10 the phones or coordinating the manning of the phones
- 11 specific dates and specific times.
- 12 O Now, are you on this list?
- 13 A I am, yes.
- 14 Q And why -- aren't you the supervisor?
- 15 Couldn't you get out of that duty?
- 16 A Well, I work late -- I could, I guess.
- 17 I'm actually -- I'm hands on. And one of
- 18 the ways I learn a lesson is to actually get involved
- 19 in the process so I can understand the process. So I
- 20 essentially told my deputy to assign me to this task.
- 21 So...
- 22 Q Okay. And are you intending to continue
- 23 working these overtime hours through the election?
- 24 A I am, yes.



- 1 Q Thank you.
- 2 You were asked about the number of people
- 3 that were initially rejected that have created those
- 4 binders. Have you made any assessment as to what
- 5 proportion of those were done within the first couple
- 6 of days?
- 7 A I believe, as I recall, over half of them
- 8 were actually done the first couple of days. I
- 9 believe the number was over 50 within that first
- 10 week.
- 11 Q Okay. You also had talked about people
- 12 who had voter registration -- had not gotten voter
- 13 registration cards and, therefore, they can't verify
- 14 that they are registered in the system.
- 15 Have you also encountered anything on the
- 16 other end where maybe pre-HAVA somebody had had a
- 17 voter registration card that had been purged from the
- 18 rolls but they still had the card?
- 19 A I believe -- I cannot recall a specific
- 20 voter, but I believe we have seen, on a couple
- 21 occasions, canceled records; and that's another that
- 22 I may have failed to mention.
- There's a flag that we can check -- when
- 24 we're searching, we can check both active and



- 1 inactive; or valid records and we can also check
- 2 nonvalid records, which would be canceled records.
- 3 So we would know if an individual was
- 4 registered 10 years ago and has been canceled since
- 5 then as a result of a list maintenance program. We'd
- 6 be able to find that canceled record.
- 8 and believe that they were eligible to vote but
- 9 actually not be a registered voter?
- 10 A That's correct. We have at least one
- 11 voter who right now has been mailed a notice called
- 12 the Five-Year Notice because they haven't appeared to
- 13 vote in the last five years. They're still valid and
- 14 they can still vote, but they were on the path to
- 15 being canceled as a result of that as maintenance.
- 16 Q Thank you.
- Now, you were asked questions about the
- 18 implementation, and much of those questions went to
- 19 the seamlessness of the process and how things are
- 20 going. When you undertook the process of the initial
- 21 implementation and then the steps that you've taken
- 22 since then, did you look at the experience of other
- 23 jurisdictions at all?
- 24 A We did look at the experience of other



- 1 jurisdictions. We reviewed several states. Our
- 2 policy office put together a packet of information
- 3 that I reviewed, as well as other individuals in the
- 4 department reviewed, to kind of get an idea of what
- 5 we could expect in terms of the number of IDs that we
- 6 would need to generate, et cetera.
- 7 Q And have those predictions been borne
- 8 out, or have they been -- did you find that they were
- 9 way off base?
- 10 A For the most part, the predictions have
- 11 been borne out. There are obviously slight
- 12 differences between the different jurisdictions, even
- 13 between the laws. But those states that are most
- 14 similar to us, the experience overall has been
- 15 similar.
- 16 Q And from the experiences that those
- 17 states have had, would you expect to see like a --
- 18 something that would be a spike in numbers that would
- 19 come right before the election that could not be
- 20 dealt with?
- 21 MR. GERSCH: Objection, foundation.
- 22 Calls for expert testimony. I don't think he's
- 23 competent to testify to this.
- MR. CAWLEY: Well, it's his prediction.



- 1 It's what he's acting on. It's the research that he
- 2 did before, or that the Department did.
- 3 THE COURT: I didn't quite get that was
- 4 his research. My recollection was that it is a
- 5 different witness that talked about this last time.
- 6 Maybe it was this witness.
- 7 MS. HICKOK: Maybe I can lay some
- 8 foundation.
- 9 THE COURT: Foundation would be good.
- 10 BY MS. HICKOK:
- 11 Q Did you participate in the evaluation of
- 12 what other states did?
- 13 A I reviewed and participated in the
- 14 discussions and the evaluation, yes. I believe our
- 15 policy office actually put the information together,
- 16 did the initial research, but I reviewed it.
- 17 Q And are your predictions about how many
- 18 people are going to be needing IDs between now and
- 19 the election related to your review of that search?
- 20 A It is partly related to that. It's also
- 21 related to the research we've done at PennDOT's
- 22 database and our database. A lot of things play a
- 23 role in my prediction of what I believe is going to
- happen.



- 1 And I guess maybe the best way I can
- 2 answer it is I'm not alarmed. I don't expect to be
- 3 inundated --
- 4 MR. GERSCH: Your Honor, I object, and I
- 5 move to strike. I think this -- this is the
- 6 prediction. And for the reasons we talked about
- 7 earlier, which is I don't think we're supposed to be
- 8 basing the record on predictions. And I don't think
- 9 his review of someone else's research is a foundation
- 10 for him offering that opinion. And he's not been
- 11 offered as an expert.
- 12 THE COURT: Motion to strike is
- 13 overruled. This is the type of retrospective
- 14 evaluation that seems to be different than what the
- 15 Supreme Court raised concerns about.
- 16 Please proceed.
- MS. HICKOK: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 18 BY MS. HICKOK:
- 19 Q Had you finished your answer? I think he
- 20 interrupted you in the middle.
- 21 A I did.
- 22 THE COURT: You should ask him the
- 23 question.
- 24 BY MS. HICKOK:



- 1 Q Okay. From what you can recall -- and if
- 2 you can't recall, please tell us.
- But from what you can recall, what had
- 4 other states seen between the months, that would be
- 5 like August and September, which we're now almost
- 6 through September, and then what happened in October
- 7 and the first days of November? Did you see a
- 8 pattern that you would -- did you see a pattern in
- 9 the other states?
- 10 A As I recall it, there was a spike. It
- 11 was not an unmanageable spike. But for the most
- 12 part, it was pretty static, as I recall, in the
- 13 numbers.
- 14 The one number that sticks out to me is
- 15 Georgia. I believe they issued 30 some thousand in
- 16 six years, free IDs. So I don't -- there's not an
- 17 overwhelming experience in other states, seems to be
- 18 there's not an overwhelming number that occurred all
- 19 at one time, if that answers your questions
- 20 accurately.
- MS. HICKOK: It does, thank you.
- MR. GERSCH: I renew my objection. Move
- 23 to strike and have a continuing objection on this
- 24 line of questioning. I think Your Honor is prepared



- 1 to overrule me.
- THE COURT: I am going to overrule you.
- 3 I already received this evidence in the first
- 4 hearing. I've heard this already. I'm not sure I
- 5 heard the exact same word, but I've already heard
- 6 this without objection. So I think it's a
- 7 clarification of information that was previously
- 8 covered.
- 9 MR. GERSCH: I'm not trying to debate
- 10 with the Court at this point. I just wondered if I
- 11 could have a continuing objection on this line of
- 12 questioning. I understand Your Honor is --
- 13 THE COURT: I think she's finished.
- MS. HICKOK: I am, Your Honor.
- 15 And actually, I think I'm finished.
- 16 Thank you.
- 17 - -
- 18 REDIRECT EXAMINATION
- 19 – –
- MR. GERSCH: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 21 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 22 Q Mr. Marks, you were just asked some
- 23 questions about experiences of other states that you
- 24 had reviewed. Do you have that testimony in mind?



- 1 A I do, yes.
- 2 Q And that the single state you mentioned,
- 3 specific state you mentioned was Georgia. Is that
- 4 right?
- 5 A I did, yes.
- 6 Q Georgia is very different than
- 7 Pennsylvania in that in Georgia, every voter can vote
- 8 absentee; isn't that right?
- 9 A I believe Georgia may be a vote-by-mail
- 10 state or no-excuse absentee balloting, whatever you
- 11 want to refer to it as.
- 12 Q And what that means is that you can vote
- 13 absentee at will. You don't need to make an
- 14 affirmation that you're missing from the polling
- 15 place or that you're disabled or that you're going to
- 16 be out of town. You can just vote absentee anytime
- 17 you want; right?
- 18 A That's correct.
- 19 Q So if a person doesn't have the photo ID
- 20 they need to vote, in Georgia they can just vote
- 21 absentee?
- 22 A I believe their law is similar in that
- 23 you have to provide identifying information -- I
- 24 believe, as I recall, I could be wrong about this,



- 1 their law may be similar in that you have to provide
- 2 identifying information to qualify for an absentee
- 3 ballot. I could be wrong.
- 4 Q But you don't have to provide a photo ID
- 5 to vote --
- 6 A No.
- 7 Q -- in Georgia?
- 8 You do not?
- 9 A That's correct.
- 10 Q All right. So I'm right that there's a
- 11 difference in the sense that in Georgia, if you never
- 12 get ID to vote, you can always vote absentee?
- 13 A Right. Without an excuse, yes.
- 14 Q All right. And you were also asked some
- 15 questions about sort of the flow of people and the
- 16 flow of exceptions. Do you recall those questions?
- 17 A I do, yes.
- 18 Q Mr. Marks, isn't it true that the big
- 19 dollars that are going to be spent by the Department
- 20 of State on the media buy, that those television,
- 21 radio spots, they are being shown now going forward.
- 22 They weren't being shown when the DOS ID was rolled
- 23 out on August 29th?
- 24 A I don't recall when the first TV ads -- I



- 1 believe in some markets they may have already -- the
- 2 TV ads may have already appeared at the end of
- 3 August. I know it's been a couple weeks. But the
- 4 majority of that push is occurring now and will occur
- 5 into the future; that's correct.
- MS. HICKOK: Let me show you what's been
- 7 marked Exhibit 145. I'll hand that up first.
- 8 (Petitioners' 145 was marked for
- 9 identification.)
- 10 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 11 O Take a look at Exhibit 145. Doesn't that
- 12 indicate that the television -- TV and cable ads
- 13 started the week of September 10th?
- 14 A I believe this -- I don't know if this is
- 15 an actual -- I don't know if this actually tracks
- 16 when the TV ads occurred.
- MS. HICKOK: Your Honor --
- 18 MR. GERSCH: It may have been part of the
- 19 initial proposal.
- MS. HICKOK: Your Honor, I'm not sure
- 21 that he is familiar with this document. That hasn't
- 22 been established. And I think that it's beyond the
- 23 scope of what the examination earlier was.
- 24 THE COURT: Well, you raise two



- 1 objections. One is to foundation, and the other is
- 2 beyond the scope.
- 3 MS. HICKOK: Yes, Your Honor.
- 4 THE COURT: I can cure beyond the scope
- 5 by having him come back some other day and answer the
- 6 question later. I'm not sure that's really what
- 7 anybody wants.
- 8 MS. HICKOK: But if he hasn't seen the
- 9 document, then he wouldn't -- I mean, he wouldn't
- 10 need to get there because there would be no
- 11 foundation for -- in court.
- 12 THE COURT: So that's why I'm not sure
- 13 I'm going to sustain the beyond the scope objection.
- Will you set a foundation.
- 15 MR. GERSCH: Certainly, Your Honor.
- 16 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 17 O Is this a document you've seen before?
- 18 A I don't know if it is. This is similar
- 19 to a document that was submitted as part of one of
- 20 the proposals, a general timeline. Whether this was
- 21 indicative of the actual timeline, I can't confirm.
- 22 Q Notwithstanding that you don't know
- 23 whether you've seen this document, and irrespective
- of the document, am I right that what I understand



- 1 you to say is that the TV ads may have started
- 2 already but that in any event, the bulk of those ads
- 3 are going to be running between now and the election?
- 4 MS. HICKOK: Your Honor, to the extent
- 5 that he knows.
- 6 THE COURT: Counsel, would you stand when
- 7 you speak.
- 8 MS. HICKOK: I'm sorry, Your Honor.
- 9 THE COURT: Thank you. What's your
- 10 objection?
- 11 MS. HICKOK: I'm only saying that he has
- 12 not asked him whether he has personal knowledge of
- 13 when the ads are running or whether that's within his
- 14 scope --
- 15 THE COURT: That is a foundation
- 16 objection again.
- 17 MS. HICKOK: Yes, it is, Your Honor.
- 18 THE COURT: The objection is overruled.
- 19 Please continue.
- 20 BY MR. GERSCH:
- 21 Q Thank you. I think I got my answer.
- 22 And with respect to the radio ads, those
- 23 ads are also going to be running predominantly
- 24 between now and the time of the election; right?



- 1 A That's correct, yes.
- 2 Q If there were any radio ads running
- 3 before now, they would be in the minority of the ad
- 4 buy?
- 5 A Yes, I believe the majority of the ad buy
- 6 is occurring -- is ramping up now and will continue
- 7 over the next several weeks.
- 8 Q And that's entirely intentional on the
- 9 part of the Department of State; right?
- 10 A Right.
- 11 Q You want the heaviest efforts put forth
- 12 as you get closer to the election?
- 13 A That's correct, yes.
- Q One other question that you got was about
- 15 when a person who is initially rejected for ID gets a
- 16 letter saying they're now confirmed for ID, I think
- 17 you had a question about whether or not that was
- 18 simply a matter of getting a picture taken; do you
- 19 recall that?
- 20 A Right. Taking a copy of a letter and
- 21 getting a picture taken.
- 22 Q Okay. But before you could have your
- 23 picture taken, before you show up at PennDOT, first
- 24 you've got to get to PennDOT; right?



- 1 A That's correct, yes.
- 2 Q Now, if you happen to be in a place of
- 3 mass transit, that may not be difficult; right?
- 4 A That's correct, yes.
- 5 Q Although you may have to take off from
- 6 work or make other arrangements?
- 7 A I know PennDOTs, in many locations, is
- 8 open Saturday. But it's possible you might have to
- 9 take some time off work.
- 10 Q There's a cost involved in getting to
- 11 PennDOT?
- 12 A I don't know whether there always is, but
- if you're taking mass transit, I suppose that would
- 14 be the case. Or if you're taking a cab, it would
- 15 certainly cost you.
- 16 Q If you're a voter in a county that has no
- 17 PennDOT locations, that could be a more severe
- 18 burden?
- 19 A You may have to drive several miles or --
- 20 and I can't recall the numbers of PennDOTs. They're
- 21 the experts on that, but in some locations you may
- 22 have to drive to get to PennDOT.
- 23 Q And you're not going to drive yourself
- 24 because by definition, you don't hold a license?



Page 249 1 Α Correct, yes. 2 You're going to have to get someone else 0 to drive? 3 Use the Shared-Ride Program, or a 5 neighbor or someone else would have to drive you, 6 yes. If you're in a county where the driver's license center is open only one day a week, as of 8 9 next week there will only be five days left that you can get to PennDOT before the election; right? 10 11 If that's the case, if there's a location Α 12 where the PennDOT exam center is only open one day a 13 week, then that would be true, yes. 14 And if you're a disabled or elderly 0 15 person, you may face other difficulties getting to 16 PennDOT; is that right? 17 Α That's correct, yes. 18 MR. GERSCH: Nothing further, Your Honor. Your Honor, just two quick 19 MS. HICKOK: 20 points of clarification. 21 2.2 RECROSS-EXAMINATION 23 24 RECROSS EXAMINATION



- 1 BY MS. HICKOK:
- 2 O You were just asked about the
- 3 difficulties of getting back to PennDOT a second
- 4 time. Given the new procedures that are in place,
- 5 that second trip could only apply to those 50 some
- 6 people who are still outstanding; is that correct?
- 7 A That is correct, yes.
- 8 One other point of clarification. He
- 9 asked you about Georgia and whether there might be
- 10 some differences in the laws. Was Georgia the only
- 11 state that you looked at?
- 12 A No. I believe I looked at Indiana. And
- 13 I don't recall this long after the fact all the
- 14 specifics, but we looked at several states. And
- 15 there's nothing about our experience to date that
- 16 makes me feel nervous or alarmed that we're going to
- 17 have a wildly different experience here in
- 18 Pennsylvania.
- MS. HICKOK: Thank you very much.
- 20 THE COURT: Anything else for this
- 21 witness?
- MR. GERSCH: No, Your Honor.
- 23 THE COURT: Do you need him back?
- MR. GERSCH: I don't believe so, Your



- 1 Honor.
- 2 THE COURT: All right. Thank you. You
- 3 may step down. You're free to go.
- 4 THE WITNESS: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 5 THE COURT: Is that it for the evidence
- 6 today?
- 7 MR. GERSCH: Your Honor, we'd like to
- 8 read the affidavit of Nadine Marsh. It's four or
- 9 five pages. She's the Petitioner that couldn't
- 10 appear in person. That should take a few minutes.
- 11 THE COURT: Please proceed.
- MR. CAWLEY: May I consult briefly that
- 13 they consulted me at the break about this, this
- 14 affidavit, to see if we could come to an agreement
- 15 about it.
- 16 THE COURT: All right.
- 17 (Discussion off the record.)
- 18 MR. CAWLEY: Thank you, Your Honor.
- MR. WALCZAK: Your Honor, we will --
- 20 THE COURT: By the way, I saw another
- 21 Petitioners' counsel stifling a yawn back there.
- MR. WALCZAK: Your Honor, I'm going to
- 23 read the declaration of Petitioner Nadine Marsh, and
- 24 we will submit -- we have a batch of 24 declarations,



- 1 which includes Ms. Marsh's, which we will submit to
- 2 the Court probably tomorrow morning. We've shared
- 3 those with counsel this afternoon.
- 4 THE COURT: Thursday morning?
- 5 MR. WALCZAK: Thursday morning. Or we
- 6 could make them -- I don't know if Your Honor wants
- 7 to use tomorrow to familiarize yourself with some of
- 8 these declarations. These are not individuals that
- 9 we will be putting on the stand on Thursday. We can
- 10 deliver them to your chambers.
- 11 THE COURT: I wasn't sure that we will be
- 12 in session tomorrow.
- MR. WALCZAK: I guess we could file them.
- 14 THE COURT: I'll be in the office, but I
- 15 expect to be in the office in Nazareth and not in
- 16 Harrisburg.
- MR. WALCZAK: We could fax them up or we
- 18 could send them by .pdf. We have unusual
- 19 circumstances here. And to facilitate the
- 20 decision-making process -- whatever Your Honor's
- 21 pleasure; we can introduce them on Thursday morning.
- 22 THE COURT: If you file them, they are
- 23 scanned rather quickly; and then they're available to
- 24 me very quickly.



- 1 So -- but I would ask you not to file
- 2 them until opposing counsel has read them.
- 3 MR. WALCZAK: Yes.
- 4 THE COURT: If you know what I'm saying.
- 5 MR. WALCZAK: Yes. Opposing counsel has
- 6 told us they'd get back to us tonight with objections
- 7 to those. And if there's objections, we won't file
- 8 any to which there are objections. And then we'll
- 9 just resolve those on Thursday. So we'll file any
- 10 that there aren't objections to.
- 11 THE COURT: Once they're filed, I'll see
- 12 them probably within the hour. I'll have access to
- 13 them within the hour.
- MR. WALCZAK: Okay.
- 15 THE COURT: So do we have tomorrow's
- 16 procedure understood?
- 17 MR. CAWLEY: I believe so, yes. We will
- 18 get in touch with counsel about the declarations as
- 19 soon as possible and hash out any agreements or
- 20 disagreements.
- 21 THE COURT: To put this affidavit in
- 22 perspective, Ms. Marsh -- she's a Petitioner?
- 23 MR. WALCZAK: She is a Petitioner.
- 24 Your Honor may recall she testified by video -- the



- 1 screen was on this side. It's very confusing,
- 2 changing courtrooms here. She's the woman from
- 3 Beaver County, gray hair. That doesn't really narrow
- 4 it down.
- 5 THE COURT: I went back and looked at my
- 6 notes, so I'm oriented to her testimony.
- 7 MR. WALCZAK: I have actually included
- 8 the trial transcript pages in the declaration here,
- 9 so it's all there.
- 10 THE COURT: Actually thought she was a
- 11 credible witness when I saw her the first time. I
- 12 saw that back in my notes.
- 13 So -- and the reason she can't be here is
- 14 a health reason.
- MR. WALCZAK: She's 84. She actually
- 16 just -- and she does not travel this far ever. So
- 17 she's well over 100 miles. She's in Beaver. So
- 18 she's out past the Pittsburgh International Airport.
- 19 So you're looking at a four-plus-hour drive to get
- 20 here. She does not go that far.
- 21 And beyond that, she's just coming off an
- 22 illness where she was down and out for a couple
- 23 weeks. So she didn't come the first time. She
- 24 couldn't come this time, which is not possible, which



- 1 is why we had suggested the video.
- THE COURT: There was a suggestion that a
- 3 videotaped deposition be taken to preserve her
- 4 testimony. The problem was the scheduling and
- 5 requiring of Respondents' counsel to travel on short
- 6 notice. So this other procedure was suggested as a
- 7 way to sort of move through this.
- 8 MR. WALCZAK: Right. We now know counsel
- 9 was busy with something else yesterday and Sunday.
- 10 All right. Declaration of Petitioner
- 11 Nadine Marsh. I, Nadine Marsh, hereby declare as
- 12 follows:
- I am over the age of 18 and otherwise
- 14 competent to testify.
- 15 2: I am registered to vote in
- 16 Pennsylvania and otherwise meet the qualifications
- 17 for voting; namely, I am over the age of 18, a U.S.
- 18 citizen and have lived in Pennsylvania for more than
- 19 30 days.
- 3: I am a petitioner in this action, and
- 21 I testified via videotape deposition on the first day
- of the trial, trial transcript July 25, 2012, at 179
- 23 to 198.
- 4: I was born on March 8th, 1928, in



- 1 Sewickley, which in Allegheny County, Pennsylvania.
- 2 5: I have no photo ID that will allow me
- 3 to vote on November 6.
- 4 6: I have never driven or had a PennDOT
- 5 photo ID, so I needed a raised, sealed birth
- 6 certificate, Social Security card and two proofs of
- 7 residence to get a nondriver PennDOT ID in order to
- 8 vote.
- 9 7: I have been unable to obtain a
- 10 PennDOT ID because I do not have a birth certificate.
- 11 And the Department of Health notified me in May by a
- 12 document dated May 16th, 2012, that they have no
- 13 record of my birth. Exhibit 12, Page 3, from the
- 14 first trial.
- 15 8: I want to vote, so I have continued
- 16 to try to get an ID that will allow me to do so in
- 17 November.
- 18 9: In August, I learned that the
- 19 Commonwealth would be issuing a new form of ID known
- 20 as the Department of State, DOS, voter ID and that I
- 21 could get it without a birth certificate.
- 22 10: My granddaughter, Suzanne Smith,
- 23 knows how to use the Internet, and she researched
- 24 what documents I needed to get the DOS ID.



- 1 11: Based on her research, she learned
- 2 that I would need to present two -- need to present
- 3 acceptable proofs of residency.
- 4 12: Since I live with my daughter, Barb
- 5 Smith, I do not get any bills that show my address.
- 6 13: Neither Suzanne nor I could tell if
- 7 I had the necessary documents to get a DOS ID. So on
- 8 August 25th, Suzanne sent an email to the
- 9 Department of State help line.
- 10 And we have the Internet address for
- 11 that.
- 12 A copy of the August 25 email is attached
- 13 as Exhibit 1.
- 14 And I'm just going to characterize here
- 15 Exhibit 1. It's an email to the help desk where she
- 16 says that the Web site says that you are asked to
- 17 present two proofs of residence, such as a utility
- 18 bill, along with their date of birth and Social
- 19 Security number. And the question is being asked:
- 20 What do you mean by "such as"? What is a full list
- 21 of the kinds of proof of residence documents that we
- 22 can present? I don't know what "such as" is. That's
- 23 too vague.
- 24 And then our DMV is over 20 miles from



- 1 home, and making numerous trips due to lack of
- 2 clarity about acceptable proof is burdensome, to say
- 3 the least.
- 4 So this is dated August 25.
- 5 14: Suzanne stated in the email that she
- 6 could not find a complete list of acceptable proofs
- 7 of residency. The closest thing she found was the
- 8 following: When requesting these IDs, voters will
- 9 need to affirm that they do not posses any other
- 10 approved identification for voting purposes. They
- 11 will be asked to provide two proofs of residence,
- 12 such as a utility bill, along with their date of
- 13 birth and Social Security number if the customer has
- 14 an assigned number.
- 15 PennDOT will validate the voter
- 16 registration status with the Department of State
- 17 while the voter is in the PennDOT office. Upon
- 18 confirmation of this information, the voter will be
- 19 issued a voter card before leaving the PennDOT
- 20 facility.
- 21 She then asked for a, quote, full list of
- 22 acceptable types of proof of residency, because
- 23 the -- "such as" in the above-referenced paragraph
- 24 was "too vague."



- 1 15: After three days, Suzanne still had
- 2 not received a reply from DOS. On August 28th,
- 3 Suzanne sent a second email asking DOS to respond and
- 4 adding a question about whether I would have to take
- 5 two trips to DMV. A copy of the August 28th email
- 6 is attached as Exhibit 2.
- 7 Two more days passed, and Suzanne still
- 8 had not gotten a response from DOS. On
- 9 August 30th, Suzanne sent a third email, forwarding
- 10 her earlier ones asking for a response. A copy of
- 11 the August 30 email is attached as Exhibit 3.
- 12 Later that day on August 30, Suzanne
- 13 received a response saying that I can fulfill the
- 14 requirements if I bring a, quote, verification of
- 15 residence affirmation, end quote, form which was
- 16 attached, filled out by someone who can say where I
- 17 live, along with a bank statement.
- 18 A copy of the August 30 DOS response is
- 19 attached as Exhibit 4.
- 20 I got very sick right after Suzanne
- 21 received the response, and I was unable to leave the
- 22 house for a couple of weeks.
- I felt better -- I'm sorry.
- 24 21. I felt better by the weekend of



- 1 September 15th, so I decided it was time to try
- 2 again to get my ID.
- 3 22: The closest licensing bureau is in
- 4 Rochester, which is more than 20 miles away from my
- 5 home and takes about 40 minutes to drive there.
- 6 See Exhibit 5, MapQuest printout of
- 7 directions.
- 8 23: Because such a trip is difficult for
- 9 me, we wanted to be sure we went to the bureau on a
- 10 day that I could get my ID. My granddaughter
- 11 searched the PennDOT Web site and found that the
- 12 Rochester office is opened from 8:15 to 4:30 on
- 13 Mondays. See Exhibit 6, which is a Web site printout
- 14 of East Rochester PennDOT driver license center.
- 15 24: Based on the information, on Monday,
- 16 September 17th, my daughter Barb, who had a day off
- 17 from work, drove me the 40 minutes to the
- 18 East Rochester licensing center. I had all the
- 19 papers I thought I would need to get the ID.
- 20 25: Even though the PennDOT office was
- 21 open, they told me that the licensing desk is not
- 22 open on Mondays, so I was unable to obtain a DOS ID.
- 23 We made the 40-minute drive home without getting an
- 24 ID.



- 1 26: Since Barb was again off from work
- 2 the next day, Tuesday, September 20th, she and I
- 3 made a second trip, yet again driving the 40 minutes
- 4 to the Rochester DMV.
- 5 27: After waiting in line for about
- 6 20 minutes, Barb and I worked with a PennDOT clerk,
- 7 who did not seem to understand about the DOS ID and
- 8 who had to ask her supervisor many questions.
- 9 28: Even though I had the two proof of
- 10 residency forms the DOS help desk had told Suzanne I
- 11 needed in their August 30 email, the completed
- 12 verification of residence affirmation form and my
- 13 bank statement with the home address on it, PennDOT
- 14 refused to issue me a DOS ID.
- 15 29: I was told that PennDOT needed to,
- 16 quote, process the application and that I should go
- 17 home and "Harrisburg" would notify me when I could
- 18 come back to get my DOS ID. I was not given a
- 19 receipt or any other document verifying my
- 20 application.
- In addition to the 20-minute wait, I
- 22 spent an hour working with this lady, and I still did
- 23 not get a voter ID.
- 24 The clerk could not tell me what document



- 1 I would be getting in the mail from Harrisburg or
- 2 when I would receive it. When I expressed concern
- 3 about how long it would take, the clerk alerted me to
- 4 the fact that I needed to return with the document
- 5 before October 9, which she said was the deadline to
- 6 get voter ID.
- 7 32: The drive home took another
- 8 40 minutes.
- 9 33: As of this date, September 23, I
- 10 still have not heard anything from either PennDOT or
- 11 DOS about getting my ID. As of this date, I have no
- 12 ID to vote, despite taking two trips to a DMV, and
- have no idea how or if I will be able to get an ID to
- 14 vote in November.
- 15 34: I declare that the facts set forth
- 16 above are true and correct to the best of my
- 17 knowledge, information and belief and are made
- 18 subject to the penalties of 18 PS, Section 4904,
- 19 relating to unsworn falsification to authorities
- 20 dated September 23rd, 2012. Nadine M. Marsh.
- 21 That's the end of the declaration. I
- 22 will note that Mr. Cawley asked me to include in the
- 23 packet we have here what he showed me and represented
- 24 was a letter dated yesterday to Ms. Marsh from Janet



- 1 Dolan, and apparently indicating that she can now
- 2 come and pick up her ID card.
- 3 But since I have not identified that
- 4 Ms. Marsh has, in fact, received that letter, we
- 5 could not stipulate to that.
- 6 So that's it.
- 7 MR. CAWLEY: Your Honor, on that point, I
- 8 would just ask that when we on Thursday discuss these
- 9 declarations, that perhaps counsel by that time will
- 10 be able to confirm with their client that this letter
- 11 was received and perhaps we can discuss a stipulation
- 12 at that time.
- MR. WALCZAK: If she gets it, we'll
- 14 stipulate to the day that she received that letter,
- 15 of course.
- 16 THE COURT: All right.
- 17 MR. GERSCH: Your Honor, could we move
- 18 the exhibits that we introduced.
- 19 THE COURT: Yes. After the break you
- 20 offered 229 -- are there any objections to the
- 21 Petitioners' exhibits?
- MS. HICKOK: Your Honor, only to the
- 23 exhibit that the witness did not recognize.
- 24 THE COURT: 145, and that objection would



- 1 be sustained.
- MS. HICKOK: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 3 THE COURT: 229 is received. 217 is
- 4 received. 218 is received. 149 is received. 131 is
- 5 received.
- Is the Marsh affidavit going to be marked
- 7 as an exhibit?
- 8 MR. GERSCH: Would Your Honor like them
- 9 as exhibits, or we'll we want it in the record.
- 10 THE COURT: It's in the record. It may
- 11 just be easier to have it written up already. But
- 12 you have it in the record now.
- MR. WALCZAK: Your Honor, I think the
- 14 only reason we would like to at least introduce it,
- 15 if not file it, is because there are the --
- 16 THE COURT: The attachments.
- 17 MR. WALCZAK: -- exhibits. Right, the
- 18 attachments.
- 19 THE COURT: So --
- MR. GERSCH: You should mark it.
- 21 It will be 232, Your Honor.
- 22 (Petitioners' 232 was marked for
- identification.)
- 24 THE COURT: 232 is received.



- 1 Is there any objection to my dealing with
- 2 the Respondents' exhibits? Normally when we get on
- 3 the Respondents' side of the case, but it sounds like
- 4 we have the Respondents' side of the case to a
- 5 certain extent.
- 6 MR. GERSCH: I just wanted to make sure
- 7 that Your Honor admitted Exhibit 107, which was the
- 8 training material.
- 9 THE COURT: I'm sorry. You're right.
- 10 Petitioners' 107.
- 11 MR. GERSCH: We have no objection to
- 12 Respondents' exhibits.
- THE COURT: Respondents' Exhibits 1, 2,
- 14 3, 4, 7, 6, 5, 8, 9, and 10 are received.
- 15 (Respondents' 1, 2, 3, 4, 7, 6, 5,
- 16 8, 9, and 10 were received into
- 17 evidence.)
- 18 THE COURT: I think those are all the
- 19 exhibits that have been offered by anybody today.
- Now, there was a request for some brief
- 21 argument at this point?
- MR. PUTNAM: To be very brief, Your
- 23 Honor, if I could. I thought it made sense to do it
- 24 at the end of the day, but it could almost have



- 1 easily have been an opening. So you could treat it
- 2 any way you want. I just wanted an opportunity to
- 3 address the Court.
- 4 We spent a lot of time today listening to
- 5 different kinds of questions about different kind of
- 6 issues. And all I wanted to do is to point to what I
- 7 think the Supreme Court has asked this Court to do.
- 8 I think Your Honor already understands
- 9 that, but there was plainly a lot of testimony today
- 10 that may or may not be interesting but really isn't
- 11 going to be germane to any judgment Your Honor makes.
- 12 For instance, if you live in a county
- 13 that doesn't have a DMV in it, if that is
- 14 unconstitutional, if that were a problem, there's no
- 15 reason to have had a remand on this case. There are
- 16 people living in such counties: They were before the
- 17 last hearing; there will be people after the last
- 18 hearing. That's not what the Supreme Court focused
- 19 on.
- 20 So I want to suggest that what the right
- 21 thing to do is to say, what did the Supreme Court
- 22 say?
- Now, one of the facts that's evidence in
- 24 this case is that the Department of State has changed



- 1 the method, the rules, done that along with PennDOT
- 2 as to what you need to do in order to get a DOS
- 3 identification. Plainly made that change, plainly
- 4 made it, as they said from the stand, in response to
- 5 the holding of the Supreme Court on that subject.
- 6 And that's -- it seems to me -- we might
- 7 for a moment pretend that we were all lawyers --
- 8 maybe we all are -- and say, what do you do when the
- 9 Supreme Court comes down and they said -- I don't
- 10 know that it was anticipated in the briefs. It
- 11 wasn't something that was argued at least in those
- 12 terms here before. Wasn't argued to the Supreme
- 13 Court.
- 14 But they said that Section 206(b) had a
- 15 liberal access requirement. And they said in the
- 16 liberal access requirement that, in fact, any effort
- 17 to set up, first, to go through the PennDOT
- 18 procedures and then to fall back on the DOS procedure
- if you couldn't go through the PennDOT procedure,
- 20 that whether or not that was a good or a bad thing,
- 21 whether or not the interpretation as to what it meant
- 22 to make -- be an applicant and have to go through an
- 23 application first to get to PennDOT, because it was
- 24 supposed to be PennDOT ID, we could argue all we



- 1 wanted to argue about whether or not that was a good
- 2 rule to start with.
- 3 But we read the Supreme Court's opinion
- 4 and I believe Your Honor probably read the Supreme
- 5 Court's opinion as saying actually that doesn't align
- 6 with what we think the General Assembly intended when
- 7 it passed the statute.
- Now, if that's right, we presumably could
- 9 have come here, we could have said whatever we wanted
- 10 to say with respect to why they think that the
- 11 Supreme Court's conclusion on that was perhaps --
- 12 could be interpreted differently. Doesn't matter.
- 13 Supreme Court's already said what the Supreme Court
- 14 already said.
- And Your Honor might well have concluded
- 16 that, oh, well, I really have to issue an injunction;
- 17 they just told me that I have to issue an injunction.
- 18 And we'd be arguing about what that injunction should
- 19 say.
- 20 And what our argument would have been
- 21 under those circumstances is, well, if you think that
- 22 the system we're using, the procedure we're using
- 23 isn't liberal enough in its access, then you tailor
- 24 your injunction to make sure that we no longer do



- 1 that and we do something else that is more liberal
- 2 and allows a better access so it's not just a
- 3 fail-safe system but rather that it's a more robust
- 4 system you can go to directly.
- 5 Such an injunction Your Honor could have
- 6 issued. We would have, obviously, complied with the
- 7 injunction, but we read the Supreme Court's opinion
- 8 too.
- 9 Having read the Supreme Court's opinion,
- 10 there's simply no point in not immediately going and
- 11 complying with the way we read it, which is to say we
- 12 better do that.
- Now, what did the Supreme Court not say?
- 14 The Supreme Court did not say, oh, and,
- 15 by the way, it doesn't matter whether or not the
- 16 applicant is registered. The Supreme Court did not
- 17 say you shouldn't worry about that, you should issue
- it even if you haven't proven that they're
- 19 registered.
- 20 And I think there's a reason the Supreme
- 21 Court didn't say that. Because the very section of
- 22 the statute that they've cited is very clearly that
- 23 it applies to registered electors.
- So DOS, Department of State, still takes



- 1 the position that it has to go and confirm
- 2 registration. Your Honor heard testimony about what
- 3 they do and how they tried to speed that up and how
- 4 they tried to ease registration, all those kinds of
- 5 things, but they're not supposed to issue one of
- 6 these cards to somebody who is not registered. They
- 7 have to check that. That's what the statute says.
- 8 So inasmuch as you had -- may have had
- 9 people who had difficulty getting cards because it
- 10 was hard to go through the Department of
- 11 Transportation procedures and then come back and only
- 12 get the DOS procedure if you couldn't get a
- 13 Department of Transportation procedure, the Supreme
- 14 Court said, "Too tight." So we're done with that.
- 15 And that's been loosened. The Supreme Court hasn't
- 16 said "ignore registration." And I don't think they
- 17 could, using the terms of that statute.
- Now, last point: A lot of the argument
- 19 in this case -- and I mean the argument in the case
- 20 even before I came into it -- argument to the Supreme
- 21 Court, even the argument today -- well, actually, not
- 22 so much the argument today -- focuses on this word
- 23 "disenfranchised." When did you get
- 24 "disenfranchised"?



- 1 And what I wish to suggest to the Court
- 2 is that the Supreme Court did not say, indeed, I
- 3 think they were careful not to say that you don't get
- 4 disenfranchised just because you are not able, for
- 5 one reason or another, to demonstrate who you are
- 6 and/or to vote. And I'll get to that in a minute.
- 7 That's not disenfranchisement. It is
- 8 long settled in Pennsylvania that asking someone for
- 9 identification in order to permit the person to vote
- 10 is not disenfranchisement.
- We do that now. We've done it for years.
- 12 You have to do it when you register, but we do it
- 13 now, since 2002, if you come from one town to
- 14 another -- if you move from Bethlehem to Nazareth is
- 15 an example I always like to use -- if you move from
- 16 Bethlehem to Nazareth, you're not only on the rolls
- 17 in Bethlehem. That's how it was under Augustus.
- 18 It's different now. You move, but you
- 19 have to show new -- as a new resident, in order to
- 20 get established, you have to go present on the first
- 21 time you vote there. Otherwise you've got to go back
- 22 to your old one and you're only allowed to go back
- 23 once. That's the existing law, which it is not
- 24 disenfranchisement, to ask someone to demonstrate, to



- 1 prove who they are.
- The only question is, what is it you're
- 3 allowed to do, what degree you're allowed to do? You
- 4 can challenge someone when they come to vote if you
- 5 don't like the way they signed it. Judges of
- 6 election do this all the time.
- 7 So the proposition that someone who finds
- 8 himself or herself unable to vote for some reason, or
- 9 challenged in the vote for some reason, and if the
- 10 reason is based on not being able to prove
- 11 identification, going back for years, that is not
- 12 disenfranchisement and, indeed, in the Supreme Court,
- 13 I believe all the justices agreed there's nothing
- 14 facially per se unconstitutional under Pennsylvania
- 15 law to go to a photo ID.
- 16 The question they raised was, is it too
- 17 hard to get? And as to that, I believe the testimony
- 18 that we've submitted today is that it's not too hard
- 19 to get.
- 20 There is a difference of agreement --
- 21 difference of opinion, I should say, about fact in
- 22 this case. Mr. Justice Baer raised this; there's a
- 23 question about fact. My colleagues on the other side
- 24 believe that there are either 1.4 million or 700,000,



- 1 or whatever there is, massive numbers of people who
- 2 don't have photo ID and will not be able to vote.
- 3 That is not the experience the people have had in
- 4 other states and it's not that we think the truth to
- 5 be.
- 6 In point of fact, to the extent that
- 7 there are a lot of people on the registration rolls
- 8 that allegedly don't have photo ID, one of the
- 9 reasons is that those rolls have been beefed up over
- 10 time because they don't purge them anymore.
- 11 My daughter is on the registration in
- 12 Lower Merion Township, but she's lives in Washington,
- 13 D.C. She doesn't -- she hasn't been purged off those
- 14 rolls. She's not supposed to vote in Lower Merion
- 15 with her photo ID from -- but she'd be listed as one
- of those people who hasn't voted in a number of years
- 17 because she doesn't come off the rolls.
- 18 The actual number of people who need to
- 19 get a photo ID who plan to vote, who could vote, we
- 20 believe is relatively small. And we think that the
- 21 numbers that Your Honor is seeing show that they're
- 22 relatively small, and that they're having success in
- 23 getting them, and that we're being able to resolve.
- 24 As things come up, we can look at them,



- 1 resolve them, got to prove they're registered, and we
- 2 get that done and these things are issued. And there
- 3 are not a significant number of people. There is an
- 4 access problem.
- 5 Last point. Access to the card.
- Is it possible that someone will not be
- 7 able to vote come Election Day because they don't
- 8 have a card? And the answer to that, of course it is
- 9 possible. That may well happen. Because a voter --
- 10 we had testimony today, or questions today, about
- 11 "We're doing everything we can to advertise. We're
- 12 doing everything we can to alert people to this
- 13 situation, but maybe someone went out for popcorn."
- Now, that's not a constitutional
- 15 question. If a voter doesn't do what he or she needs
- 16 to do to comply with the law, they're not
- 17 disenfranchised in the sense that this is a
- 18 constitutional, legal thing to do, to ask them. They
- 19 must participate, too, in the process. That's what
- 20 registration is.
- You have to register. You have to have
- 22 an ID card. So if, in fact, someone is out of the
- loop and doesn't do it, that is not a
- 24 disenfranchisement that is worked by this law.



- 1 The only way that would work is in point
- 2 of fact if you're not able to get the requisite card
- 3 in the way that the general assembly contemplated.
- 4 That's what the Supreme Court asks, Your Honor, to
- 5 look at.
- 6 And our belief is, insofar as they told
- 7 us how we had erred, in their view, we corrected
- 8 that. If Your Honor wants to issue an order to make
- 9 sure that we've corrected that, Your Honor is
- 10 certainly welcome to do that, but we have corrected
- 11 that.
- 12 And I think the people that testified to
- 13 Your Honor today are all saying essentially the same
- 14 thing, which is, for each and every individual who is
- 15 trying to get a card who has a right to get a card
- 16 who is a registered elector, yes, we're going to try
- 17 to make sure that they get a card. And we think they
- 18 will be able to get a card in time.
- There are not 700,000 people out there.
- 20 We are not about to be overwhelmed. This has been
- 21 done in other states and it can be done here. And
- 22 there's no -- the predictions -- the prediction that
- 23 Your Honor made in your last opinion when you
- 24 looked -- that prediction is still true.



- 1 It was right then. It's right now. The
- 2 correction that was necessary that the Supreme Court
- 3 pointed out had to do with a reading of the intention
- 4 of the general assembly and whether or not we were
- 5 making DOS cards. We've corrected that.
- 6 Getting the card, the fact that people
- 7 will still be able to vote and to vote by all the
- 8 protections that are in there is still true.
- 9 And we believe Your Honor, upon hearing
- 10 the record, should be able to come to the same
- 11 conclusion of prediction that Your Honor came to last
- 12 time.
- 13 Thank you for hearing me.
- 14 THE COURT: You wish to be heard?
- MR. GERSCH: Very briefly, Your Honor.
- 16 We'll be putting on evidence from persons who will
- 17 describe their difficulty in getting ID on Thursday;
- 18 and most of our comments are going -- and our
- 19 traditional closing will be at that time.
- I really want to respond to the reading
- 21 of the Supreme Court's opinion because it's almost as
- 22 though they're reading a different opinion than we
- 23 are.
- 24 The Supreme Court identified what I



- 1 think -- in itself identified sort of a difficult
- 2 tension in terms of a facial challenge with respect
- 3 to a short-term problem.
- 4 But they didn't find that an obstacle to
- 5 the lawsuit, and I think the fair characterization of
- 6 what Supreme Court found is a facial problem -- that
- 7 is, the law on its face requires that you get photo
- 8 ID to vote, but there's a problem in the law.
- 9 The law was intended to allow liberal
- 10 access so people could get that ID so they wouldn't
- 11 be disenfranchised. But it turns out kind of like
- 12 contracts, you have a probably with impossibility.
- 13 The legislature's chosen method of making that work
- 14 doesn't work.
- 15 And what happened at argument -- there's
- 16 no official transcript. It's on video. I've
- 17 transcribed it for the Court if the Court would find
- 18 it useful. Justice Saylor asked counsel for the
- 19 Commonwealth, "Are you ever going to be able to make
- 20 PennDOT ID available to everyone?"
- 21 And Mr. Knorr for the Commonwealth said,
- 22 "No, it's not possible. We're not going to be able
- 23 to do it."
- I should add that Justice Saylor also put



- 1 forth his interpretation of the statute, the same one
- 2 that the Court finds in the Supreme Court's opinion;
- 3 and neither the Commonwealth's attorney nor the
- 4 governor's attorney took any issue with the
- 5 interpretation of the statute offered by Justice
- 6 Saylor.
- 7 So the Court identified a facial problem.
- 8 The problem is that there's now a requirement that
- 9 you show ID; and if you don't show the ID, you'll be
- 10 disenfranchised. And there is no method on the face
- 11 of the statute where a citizen is guaranteed the
- 12 right to get ID.
- 13 Against that background, what did the
- 14 Supreme Court do? It did what was entirely logical.
- 15 They said come back here and let's understand --
- 16 because, of course, the record was made at a time
- 17 before the DOS ID -- they said let's find out two
- 18 things.
- 19 First, let's find out, has the
- 20 Commonwealth figured out a way to deploy ID in a
- 21 manner consistent with the liberal access
- 22 requirements that were contemplated by the general
- 23 assembly?
- And the answer to that, we now know it



- 1 hasn't. It may start tomorrow, but in the time that
- 2 the Supreme Court asked the Court to do its
- 3 examination, which is from the time the cards are
- 4 available, basis of actual experience, it's
- 5 undisputed that the Commonwealth was doing exactly
- 6 what the Supreme Court has already concluded was
- 7 improper.
- 8 So that issue is solved. But even if
- 9 they could overcome that hurdle, they said something
- 10 else, which also makes a lot of sense: The Supreme
- 11 Court is saying, we don't just want to know whether
- 12 there is a card in theory that comports with liberal
- 13 access, given that we are now roughly 6 1/2 months
- 14 down the road from when this act was passed; and the
- 15 Commonwealth has not been complying with the act for
- 16 the -- since March 14th, given that they missed out
- on the chance to sign all these people up in that
- long period of time, as the Legislature intended; is
- 19 it really the case that no one will be
- 20 disenfranchised. And they say no disenfranchisement.
- They don't use those softer words that
- 22 are in their brief. They say "No disenfranchisement
- 23 elsewhere." They talk about the possibility of
- 24 forestalling the possibility of disenfranchisement.



- 1 These are very strong words. And what the Supreme
- 2 Court did makes absolute sense, given their reading
- 3 of the statute and given the Court's finding, that
- 4 there's this facial problem.
- 5 So they have an enormous hurdle. They
- 6 have a problem on both prongs. First, it's clearly
- 7 the case, they've already admitted it, that they have
- 8 been running their DOS ID program in a manner that
- 9 the Supreme Court says is affirmed; and the Supreme
- 10 Court, as we've commented, Your Honor, also says we
- 11 don't want to rely on their going-forward
- 12 predictions. We don't want any part of that. We
- 13 want to know based on actual experience. We know the
- 14 actual experience.
- 15 And the second problem is, how are we
- 16 going to find out that, in fact, no one will be
- 17 disenfranchised? And notwithstanding the vigorous
- 18 investigation, it's quite clear that people will be
- 19 disenfranchised. There will be people who don't even
- 20 know about this law. There will be people that can't
- 21 get to PennDOT. And I can't stress enough, this was
- 22 not the general assembly's will. We're not talking
- 23 about deferring to the general assembly anymore.
- 24 The general assembly wanted this in place



- 1 for seven and a half months.
- 2 And I call Your Honor's attention in that
- 3 regard to the amicus brief filed for them by the
- 4 Republicans, in that they say that one of the great
- 5 features of the act was that it was supposed to be in
- 6 effect for -- there's supposed to be a 237-day period
- 7 when people could get ID before the election.
- 8 That's been frustrated. And I don't say
- 9 that the Commonwealth intended to frustrate it;
- 10 that's the way it worked out. It's not about good
- 11 intentions, bad intentions. It didn't work out that
- 12 way.
- Here we are, as of next week will be five
- 14 weeks before the election. The general assembly
- 15 never intended that that be the period for getting
- 16 ID; and there's no contemplation that the general
- 17 assembly thought constitutionally that would be a
- 18 short enough -- that would be a long enough period of
- 19 time to allow everyone to, A, become educated, B,
- 20 actually get the ID.
- 21 And we'll present tomorrow, Your Honor --
- 22 I'm sorry, Thursday, Your Honor, evidence of the kind
- 23 of real-world problems that people are having.
- 24 THE COURT: Well, ultimately, and I'm



- 1 really making this comment to both sides now --
- 2 ultimately, there's a possibility that I'm going to
- 3 enter an injunction. And I'm going to ask both
- 4 sides, when we speak on Thursday, what should the
- 5 injunction look like?
- 6 I kind of think I know what you're --
- 7 what you're going to say. But I do have a
- 8 responsibility to consider tailoring an injunction to
- 9 what is the offending conduct.
- 10 And I think there was an argument to this
- 11 effect in Respondents' pre-hearing brief.
- 12 So this will be part of my back and
- 13 forth. I'm giving you a heads-up so that you can
- 14 think about it today, be ready to think about it a
- 15 little bit more out loud on Thursday.
- 16 But I think it's possible that there
- 17 could be an injunction entered here, and I need input
- 18 from people who apparently have thought about this
- 19 longer than I have. You've obviously put months into
- 20 this. And I'll need some reasoned argument on that.
- 21 All right? Is there anything else that
- 22 you want me to look at today?
- MR. GERSCH: No, thank you.
- 24 THE COURT: All right. Then we are --



```
Page 283
     in -- we're adjourned until Thursday morning at
 1
 2
     10:00 a.m.
 3
                  THE CLERK: Commonwealth Court is now
     adjourned.
 4
                  (Proceedings adjourned: 5:03 p.m.)
 5
 6
 7
 8
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
```



1	CERTIFICATE OF SHORTHAND REPORTER	Page	284
2			
3	I, Gail Inghram Verbano, Registered		
4	Diplomate Reporter, Certified Realtime Reporter,		
5	Certified Shorthand Reporter (CA), and Notary Public,		
6	the officer before whom the foregoing proceedings		
7	were taken, do hereby certify that the foregoing		
8	transcript is a true and correct record of the		
9	proceedings; that said proceedings were taken by me		
10	stenographically and thereafter reduced to		
11	typewriting under my supervision; and that I am		
12	neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any		
13	of the parties to this case and have no interest,		
14	financial or otherwise, in its outcome.		
15			
16			
17	Sait Ingham Verbano		
18	Gail Inghram Verbano, RDR, CRR, CSR		
19	CA-CSR No. 8635		
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			

Index: \$120..226

12:00 125:1 198 255:23 \$ **19th** 65:22 66:2 156:19,23 173:2 **12:15** 125:4 **12th** 151:6 **1:30** 125:2,5 **\$120** 144:3 **13** 20:22 160:3 162:15 257:6 1st 53:18 54:12 145:18 **\$5** 136:16 143:10,21 144:1 **130** 43:4,7 184:6,14 2 **1300** 57:19 58:13 157:2 **131** 42:23,24 215:21,24 216:1 264:4 **2** 142:23 159:24 188:5,16 189:22 **-7** 184:17 191:2,11 192:3 194:18 201:17 202:10 **1350** 66:17 231:8,11,13,16 232:9 233:10 234:8 1 **136** 67:5,9,10 104:23 184:6,12 255:15 259:6 265:13,15 **13th** 151:5,6 159:10 172:9 **2.4** 45:21 **1** 23:17 142:23 158:24 187:17,18 **14** 103:20 258:5 189:20 190:24 191:14 192:8,18,22 **20** 124:24 160:5 161:14 257:24 260:4 194:14 215:3,12 232:16,21 233:8 261:6 **145** 244:7,8,11 263:24 257:13,15 265:13,15 **20-minute** 261:21 **145.000** 171:17 **1,005** 66:14 **200** 155:2 **145,353** 162:15,23 1-877-votespa 138:12 140:7 157:22 2002 271:13 **149** 213:12,13 264:4 1.4 272:24 **2003** 204:23 205:7,18 206:6,8,10 **14th** 156:18 160:23 162:7,12 172:17, **1/2** 279:13 23 181:15 279:16 **2007** 103:23,24 1/tier 231:8 **15** 20:23 41:14.17 42:16 44:2 107:4 **2008** 113:15,16 122:10,11,15 123:2, 193:17 259:1 **10** 32:9,13 41:14,17 42:16 44:2 51:19 19 143:24 144:13 115:10 185:7 193:16 205:13,18,20 **15-second** 165:12 **2011** 67:15 70:21 211:2 234:1 236:4 256:22 265:14,16 **15th** 50:13 260:1 **2012** 67:16 70:21 181:15 203:19 **10,000** 57:24 70:12 204:1 205:13,19 206:12 210:15 220:9 16th 256:12 10-minute 185:8 227:18 230:3 255:22 256:12 262:20 **17** 160:3 **100** 23:24 37:13 49:18 58:19 70:4 **206(b)** 267:14 73:7 87:2 158:9 254:17 **172** 140:11,14 184:6,11 **20th** 31:21,22 32:1 33:9,20 34:7,24 100-percent 162:21 **173** 142:9,11,23 184:7,11 145:18 160:10 261:2 **105** 66:13 **174** 141:15,17,20 184:7,11 21 56:20 57:11,21 58:3,8 61:11 259:24 **107** 223:18,23 265:7,10 **175** 146:2 210,000 145:19 **10th** 244:13 **178** 139:13,16,18 184:7,10

217 208:22,23 264:3

218 209:22,23 264:4

22 57:20 260:3

220 24:7,8,14 25:3,20,24 27:23 38:21 184:7,13

224 84:7,11 184:7,13 219:19,20,23

225 82:13,16,19 95:23 184:7,12

226 81:22 82:2 184:8,13



11 257:1

257:4

120 144:9

113 208:2,7

115 150:8,11 184:6,12

12,696,379 175:17

12 53:10,17 63:3 94:22 146:17 175:7

176:16,21,24 177:3,6,7 178:2 256:13

179 137:16,18,21 184:7,10 255:22

18 29:4 134:19 136:7,10 144:24 145:23 149:6 156:18 164:16 255:13,

17th 159:10 206:12 260:16

17 262:18

18,000 68:4

1928 255:24

192 77:17,21 78:16

Index: 229..9th

350-odd 96:7 229 203:10,11,14 226:5,9 230:6 15 263:20 264:3 **37,000** 67:21 **7,000** 172:19,21 **22nd** 20:7 3rd 231:20 7,980 172:9 23 260:8 262:9 70 208:12 209:20 210:8 214:15 232 264:21,22,24 4 70,000 69:21 23rd 262:20 **700,000** 272:24 275:19 **4** 162:4 255:24 259:19 265:14.15 **24** 160:5 210:17 251:24 260:15 **71** 25:5,9,14 61:19 191:20 4,000 157:24 24th 160:10 220:8 **75** 214:3,10 **40** 161:9 260:5,17 261:3 262:8 **25** 120:24 214:11,21 255:22 257:12 760,000 162:19,22 171:20 **40,000** 69:18 258:4 260:20 7th 205:19 40-minute 260:23 25th 54:5 210:18 257:8 **40-some** 112:20 **26** 261:1 8 **43** 208:13,21 **27** 31:1 160:24 261:5 **45,000** 66:24 68:14,17 **8** 180:4 227:6 256:15 265:14,16 **27th** 20:6 24:19 25:21 33:5,7,8,15 41:21 57:19 65:1 66:13 108:7,10 48 138:23 158:4 **8,000** 149:17 149:16 160:7,21 194:6 **4904** 29:4 262:18 8,795 66:3 28 261:9 **4:30** 260:12 8/14/2012 24:16 28th 204:11 217:16 230:9 259:2,5 **4th** 214:13 227:18 231:20 **80** 214:15 29 203:19 204:1 261:15 **84** 254:15 **29th** 204:12 210:15 212:23 230:10,13 5 8900 156:20 243:23 **8:00** 99:2 **5** 167:8 256:2 260:6 265:14,15 3 **8:15** 260:12 **5.9** 150:17 152:4 8th 161:2 255:24 **50** 105:8 235:9 250:5 **3** 160:14 255:20 256:13 259:11 265:14.15 **50,000** 70:13 9 **30** 107:4 120:22 121:2 138:21 240:15 **55** 49:8,15 87:2 255:19 259:11,12,18 261:11 **9** 228:16 256:18 262:5 265:14.16 30,000 68:22,23 69:2,16 70:11 6 9/24/12 83:3 84:21 106:17 107:10 9/4 215:4 230:3 **30-second** 137:9 138:2 **6** 143:16 166:15 167:1 256:3,4 260:13 265:14,15 279:13 9/4/2012 230:5 30th 45:3 122:11 123:3 259:9 **60-** 69:20,21 90s 113:14 **31** 162:7 600,000 172:1 **93-** 71:1 **31st** 160:22 161:1 162:12 **65** 75:2 9300 66:10 **32** 262:7 6th 149:16 **9500** 57:17 58:13 66:10 71:1 **33** 262:9 9th 170:19,23 171:2 212:5 **34** 262:15 **35-** 68:14 69:18 **7** 32:9,12 113:5 165:20 256:9 265:14, **350** 62:11,21

Α

abilities 69:6,10

ability 69:11,15 74:4 106:16 193:11

above-referenced 258:23

absentee 242:8,10,13,16,21 243:2,

12

absolutely 21:24 64:21 71:13 100:10 101:24 104:3 107:18 112:9 114:1 122:18 166:13 170:5 171:1 233:20

abundantly 149:9

accept 123:22

acceptable 52:11 133:7 137:6 164:19 257:3 258:2,6,22

accepted 212:6

access 35:15 36:11 61:5,7 163:8 181:13 191:10,12 197:24 228:6 253:12 267:15,16 268:23 269:2 274:4.5 277:10 278:21 279:13

accidently 192:21

accomplish 148:7

accomplished 75:10

account 219:2

accounting 229:13

accurate 218:21 229:13

accurately 240:20

acknowledge 19:4

acquire 21:4

act 134:19 136:7,10 144:24 145:23 149:6 156:18 164:16,20 222:23 279:14,15

acting 103:23 238:1

action 42:12 255:20

actions 202:4

active 181:4 210:21,24 211:12 229:17 235:24

actual 62:6 70:7 130:1 150:20 151:15,19 224:21 244:15 245:21 273:18 279:4

actuality 49:3

ad 138:11,14 139:22 147:5,6,7,18 148:13,22 149:9 154:18 155:20 156:9 175:20 176:8,22,23 177:2,6,14,20,22 231:14 247:3,5

add 193:11 277:24

added 159:17 192:2,21 204:11

adding 259:4

addition 38:24 155:1 261:21

additional 50:20 69:2,16 70:9 72:21 108:1 137:8 150:5 189:16 192:5 193:1 200:6 225:8,18 233:13

address 18:16 21:17,20,22 27:1 39:12,16 46:1,10 48:4,6 78:23 95:7, 21,24 188:8 193:2,3 201:12,14 212:20 215:11,13 219:1 257:5,10 261:13 266:3

addressed 21:21 22:1 45:24 140:17

addresses 219:13

adjustments 79:13 215:19

administering 159:18

administration 114:4,7 222:4,7

Administration's 207:9

administrator 51:5

Administrators' 221:14

admissible 168:14

admitted 265:7

adopted 48:19 126:6,21

ads 136:23 137:2 139:7,18 140:8,20, 141:23 142:2,7,24 143:2,15 146:22 147:19,20 149:4,13,14,17 155:12,13, 15 165:12,13,14 176:1 177:24 178:9, 10,17 243:24 244:2,12,16 246:1,2,13, 22,23 247:2

advance 186:6

advantage 186:7

advertise 274:11

advertised 147:5

advertisement 156:1

advertisements 142:18

advertising 136:21 137:4 145:15,21 148:9 152:24 154:6,7,11,14,16,23 165:13,19 166:8,24 167:3,15,19,21, 23 177:4

advice 130:13 131:10,16,17,24 132:4,5,9

advised 182:22

advocate 60:17 135:8

advocates 135:13

affairs 134:5

affect 186:22

affected 186:18

affects 170:9

affidavit 133:6 134:12,13 135:9 164:7, 251:8,14 253:21 264:6

affidavits 19:13,22,24

affirm 165:2 258:9

affirmation 28:19,20 38:24 51:16 52:10 53:22,23 54:2 56:16,18,19 59:16 60:7,16,21,23 63:19,24 64:2, 10,19 242:14 259:15 261:12

affirming 29:6 30:10

afforded 112:23

African-american 154:9,12 155:15 166:2,7

after-hours 234:8

afternoon 20:11 96:23 125:20 226:1, 2 252:3

afterward 127:13 171:6

age 72:19 75:2 255:13,17

aged 154:2

agencies 145:15

agency 147:5,6,18 148:13 150:4

aggregate 172:17

aggressive 146:16

agree 70:21 123:16,18,21 136:6,11 148:22 176:10,13

agreed 272:13

agreement 251:14 272:20



agreements 253:19

ahead 59:6,8 61:2 143:15 185:2

188:23 190:21

aimed 144:19

Airport 254:18

alarmed 239:2 250:16

alert 274:12 **alerted** 262:3

align 268:5

alimentative 31:7

alleged 201:10

allegedly 273:8

Allegheny 256:1

allocated 143:10

allowed 53:22 73:11 271:22 272:3

allowing 163:8

alphabetical 226:19 227:9

alternate 30:19 33:8,9

Alternately 102:6

alternative 27:4 47:23 49:9 50:15

amended 85:1 219:23 220:13.18

America 222:22 American 221:13

amount 40:7 95:10 104:16 106:12

111:17 215:7

anal-retentive 229:12

analysis 70:7,14,18,19 71:10 113:24

114:10 176:11

analyzed 70:8 153:22

and/or 42:2 100:21 186:12 271:6

Ann 139:4

announced 112:18

announcement 157:15,16 182:19

annual 203:2

anomalies 193:6

answering 112:16 138:21 158:4

answers 129:3 138:18 240:19

anticipate 22:3 124:21

anticipated 24:22 267:10

anticipating 46:7

anymore 95:1 273:10

anytime 107:11 242:16

apologize 43:2 186:5

apparent 149:9

apparently 75:20 123:19 263:1

appeared 236:12 244:2

appearing 154:19 155:3

appears 83:8 151:20 204:10,22 205:5.13 206:19 210:6 214:1 220:5

224:11 230:12

applicant 164:11 170:14 267:22

269:16

applicant's 221:9,12

applicants 71:14 210:4 214:2,9,11,

21

application 24:17 25:14,24 33:11 48:21 79:18 82:8 89:6,18 90:1, 94:2

100:14 187:5,22 196:10,21 197:3,11 204:7,19,20 210:14,15 211:7,11,15, 18 212:17 213:1.10 218:24 219:5

230:8 261:16,20 267:23

applications 97:5 212:8,10,12

applied 58:4 64:24

applies 269:23

apply 49:6 62:15 65:6 250:5

appointed 103:24

appreciates 20:2

approved 258:10

approximate 66:16

approximately 49:8 57:17,19 62:11

112:20 145:19 157:11 162:19

Arabic 115:12

Arch 117:9 121:7,11,22 161:2,12,15,

17

area 48:22 181:4 205:14

areas 57:5 114:19

argue 267:24 268:1

argued 267:11,12

arguing 268:18

argument 265:21 268:20 270:18,19,

20,21,22 277:15

argumentative 168:22

arise 221:3

arrangements 76:8 248:6

arrives 213:4

arts 148:11

asks 39:16 275:4

aspect 87:5 114:23

aspects 37:14 96:24

assemble 92:13

assembly 268:6 275:3 276:4 278:23

assessment 124:8 235:4

assign 234:20

assigned 81:16 218:18 219:13 234:9

258:14

assistance 161:16

assistant 43:16 77:23 158:22 159:8

160:9

assisted 116:19

assisted-living 73:19 74:13

Association 221:13

assume 61:4 76:10,13 226:18

assuming 18:23 175:18 183:19

187:7

assumption 76:11

assure 45:24

attached 206:19 257:12 259:6,11,16,

19

attaches 174:14

attachment 25:17

attachments 264:16,18

attempt 132:20



Index: attempting..breezed

attempting 26:21

attempts 190:7

attention 24:14 43:6 45:8 112:6

153:7 162:13

attest 49:16 165:2

attorney 54:15 72:2 278:3,4

attorneys 19:7 54:13,21 126:17

131:21,24 132:12

August 20:6,7 24:19 25:21 31:1 33:5, 7,8,15 41:21 45:3 57:19 65:1 66:13 67:18,20,24 68:10 70:21 105:6,8,11, 13 108:7 145:18 149:16 151:3 159:10 160:3,5,7,10,21,24 162:7,12 194:6 203:19 204:1 210:15 212:23 217:16 230:9,10,13 240:5 243:23 244:3 256:18 257:8,12 258:4 259:2,5,9,11, 12,18 261:11

Augustus 271:17

author 220:19

authorities 262:19

authorization 227:22,24 228:4,11

automatically 200:1 207:19 233:9

avail 76:23 77:8

availability 107:24

avoids 116:7

aware 38:15 46:2 56:15,17 78:5, 96:18,19 144:11 146:4 161:18 201:8,

9 202:6 211:5

В

back 18:21 25:3, 31:19 32:16 33:2,13, 16 35:24 36:1 42:11 47:13,17 48:6 50:12 54:23 59:16,19 63:9 65:5 70:24 73:14,20,21 80:12 91:20 96:6 108:21 122:15 133:1 136:14 177:11 199:15 212:1,20 232:2 245:5 250:3,23 251:21 253:6 254:5,12 267:18 270:11 271:21,22 272:11 278:15

background 278:13

bad 267:20

Baer 272:22

balance 164:20

ballot 179:13,15,16 180:5,12,16

243:3

balloting 242:10

ballparking 214:14

bang-up 146:23 148:14

bank 259:17 261:13

banner 165:13

banners 166:24 167:3

Barb 257:4 260:16 261:1,6

barriers 76:3

base 237:9

baseball 203:1

based 58:12,14,19 71:7,9 73:4 80:23 104:7,16 146:19 147:14,17 149:2 194:22 206:19 209:12 214:17 257:1

260:15 272:10

basic 176:14

basically 143:20 171:22 197:24 207:11 216:10 224:3,15 234:7

basing 239:8

basis 158:21 162:1,3 279:4

batch 251:24

BCEL 128:5 129:4 158:10,11 162:14

216:22 217:2,5,7,12

Beaver 254:3,17

beefed 273:9

beer 148:10

begin 194:3

beginning 144:4 175:7 230:17,21,24

232:3

begins 106:10 174:8 216:20

behalf 112:5

belief 262:17 275:6

believed 64:5

believes 102:6 168:20

believing 189:15

bench 183:10

benefit 113:24 114:10 151:11 182:20

186:9 204:15 209:14

Bethlehem 271:14,16,17

Bic 148:9

big 23:6,12 68:10 243:18

bill 77:13 81:9,10,11 257:18 258:12

billboard 142:7.17.24 143:2

billboards 165:12 167:4

bills 257:5

binder 208:20 210:14 224:6,16 225:3

binders 226:7,8,13,21 235:4

birth 26:24 27:3 30:19,20 31:6,9,16, 19 32:3,11, 33:15,23 34:8 35:3,6 36:19 39:4 48:19 50:16 79:3 109:21 110:4,5 111:7, 116:14 134:19 135:2 163:10 189:19 192:1 201:15 207:8,15 219:14 256:5,10,13,21 257:18 258:13

bit 51:11 67:23 104:22 124:11 150:21

177:5 210:11 233:13

biweekly 134:2 158:21 159:15

Blackberry 59:3

blotted 204:14

blown-up 150:16

Board 212:3 223:11

boosted 138:22

boring 23:13

born 27:5 31:6 35:4 255:24

borne 237:7,11

bottom 138:9 142:21 150:24 161:5

Boulevard 76:5

bouncing 207:7

box 219:1

Bravo's 161:1

break 124:11,12,17 176:4 209:3

251:13 263:19

breaking 114:22

breezed 72:1



Index: briefly..certificates

briefly 18:16 25:2 251:12 276:15

briefs 267:10

bring 18:2 53:20 56:8 73:20 76:12,15 99:7 137:5 149:7 153:16, 154:20

163:14 164:23 259:14

bringing 45:7 96:23 122:20 135:6

broad 201:18 **broader** 218:14

 $\pmb{brought} \ \ 93:24\ 97:15,20\ 99:15\ 205:1,$

2,3,6

budget 136:16

build 101:16

building 161:18

built 101:5,7,9,16 207:18

bulk 246:2

bullet 172:7 175:15 221:8

bullets 150:23

bumps 45:16 231:6

bunch 92:1

burden 68:24 248:18

burdensome 258:2

bureau 128:5 134:6 158:11 186:3

188:4 191:1 199:17 260:3,9

bureau's 233:12

buses 140:9

busiest 67:18 120:14 161:13

business 26:6 64:22 69:19 73:5

159:21 166:10 228:23

busy 42:7 44:3 68:17 105:10, 108:14 117:10 120:6,18 161:23 193:17 255:9

buy 143:15 175:22 177:2 243:20

247:4,5

buys 166:1

C

C.S. 29:4

cab 248:14

cable 178:1 244:12

calculate 176:16

calendar 213:20

call 22:10,12 24:14 26:2 30:15 31:7 34:17 36:6 37:21,23,24 40:18 57:4 72:9 80:4 91:7 92:9 93:22 98:19,24 99:3 125:9,12 137:7 140:6 158:10,13 185:15 186:23 187:10,16,17 188:3,5, 15 191:2 217:3,13 221:4,6 224:9 233:7

called 34:12 42:3,6 85:3 94:17 116:2 124:15 144:14 231:10 232:7 236:11

callers 44:1,8

calling 20:22 143:8

calls 36:5 40:23 127:6 146:19 149:3 157:24 158:5,8,9 190:6 191:14,16,19, 22 193:15 194:23 217:11 231:15 232:11,22 233:8,9 237:22

campaign 136:11 137:22 141:6 142:18 143:11 144:14,19 145:10,21 146:11,17,23 147:7 149:9 152:24 153:8 154:6,19,23 156:15 165:8 167:16 177:4

campaigns 148:23

canceled 235:21 236:2,4,6,15

capabilities 201:17 233:15

capability 188:11 202:19

caption 85:1

capture 95:1

car 73:12,15

card 24:18 26:1,2,15,17,24 27:10,13, 15,18,19,20,22 28:5,9,11,17 29:7,13, 19 30:7,21 38:17 47:20 56:24 65:4,5, 6 82:7 84:17 85:20 87:9,10,18 88:9, 10,24 89:18 90:7 92:6,15,16 100:6 116:14 126:23 132:12 133:13,23 134:17,20 135:4,11 137:3 139:11,12 142:3 143:5,18 151:19 163:17,18,23 188:24 190:12,13 194:5,9 196:8,20, 22 197:10 198:4,23 199:10 204:22 205:3,7,13,21,24 206:2,4,11,12 218:4,23 219:4 222:8,14,16 223:4 235:17,18 236:7 256:6 258:19 263:2 274:5,8,22 275:2,15,17,18 276:6 279:12

cards 26:8 31:1 66:14 129:22 133:18 134:24 164:17 198:8,16 230:18,19 235:13 270:6,9 276:5 279:3

care 74:3 103:11

careful 271:3

Carney 203:18 204:1 226:10 227:15, 16 229:23

case 18:3,18 38:6 47:16 54:7 55:10 68:13 71:24 76:2,22 91:12 95:11 97:13 99:24 110:2,19 111:2 115:21 137:2 144:13 147:12, 168:14 181:23 184:16 195:22 199:13 201:6 203:4 205:5 218:23 223:1 248:14 249:11 265:3,4 266:15,24 270:19 272:22 279:19

case-by-case 202:4

cases 23:20 27:2 41:8 45:9 46:14 53:1,2 61:6,12 64:4 100:20 104:10 105:19 110:18, 113:21 148:18,19 189:7 195:1 208:13,21 209:20 226:14 227:13

catch 189:21

categories 75:4

category 180:8

caused 213:22

Cawley 18:4 78:8 102:14,20 103:5, 10,12,17 112:2 119:21 124:2 237:24 251:12,18 253:17 262:22 263:7

cc'ing 43:21

center 35:14 36:23 40:2 42:4 56:1 57:4 73:10,19,21 76:5 113:9 116:8,12 117:2 158:10,13 195:6 215:15 249:8, 12 260:14,18

centers 25:5,14 56:10 57:5 61:8,19, 20 74:13,15,24 81:20 82:5 83:11 94:15 97:16 104:14 107:22 108:13, 16,19,23 109:19 112:8,21 116:19 120:7,11 191:20

central 35:13 104:21 108:20,23 109:4

certainty 162:21

certificate 26:24 27:3 30:19 31:6 34:8 35:3 50:16 109:21 110:4,5 111:7, 116:14 135:2 256:6,10,21

certificates 134:20



Index: cetera..concerns

cetera 192:1 202:20 237:6

chain 44:13

challenge 202:12 272:4 277:2

challenged 272:9 chambers 252:10

chance 20:14 82:20 84:13 89:19

279:17

change 18:1 33:21 34:5 80:23 81:4 82:6 93:19 94:1 95:4 96:10 112:19 119:11,13,18 130:2,20,21,23 163:1,2, 5,6 181:18 186:10,17 267:3

changed 19:23 31:21 80:15 85:12 95:10 126:20 163:16 266:24

changing 129:21 254:2

character 192:21

characterization 277:5

characterize 257:14

charge 80:3 146:12

charged 53:20 55:17 57:12 58:4 63:7

chart 55:6 **charts** 104:24

check 30:19 32:3,11 33:12,22 36:9, 11 60:8 140:4 164:24 191:17 195:11 198:12 218:13 226:17 235:23,24

236:1 270:7

checked 58:21 66:19

checking 35:23 36:7 40:14

chief 81:6 216:14

Chinese 115:12 154:13

chose 144:23

chosen 123:14 277:13

chunk 20:20

circulated 94:4

circumstance 195:7 201:8,10,16

202:5

circumstances 18:15 252:19 268:21

cited 269:22

citizen 105:24 175:11 255:18 278:11

city 114:20 161:10 204:23

claimed 56:14

clarification 25:6 36:20 144:12

241:7 249:20 250:8

clarity 258:2

clause 29:11,24

clear 26:9 49:3 63:7 70:17 74:5 77:21

108:4 172:16 198:20 220:22

clerk 125:6 185:10,13 261:6,24 262:3

click-through 146:2

client 188:19 194:24 263:10

clients 232:4

close 21:22 155:1 170:16,18 171:1

211:2 213:4 230:17

closely 34:1

closer 157:2 247:12

closes 106:23

closest 258:7 260:3

closing 19:1 22:4 107:1 276:19

closings 18:14,18 19:4 22:3

code 95:2,3

colleagues 272:23

collect 95:5

collection 226:15 227:3,11 228:10

college 154:16,17 155:16 167:2,18

colleges 105:17

Columbus 76:5

command 44:13

comment 19:6 37:13 63:9 72:12

comments 276:18

commissioner 128:6 129:5 139:4,5

158:19,20 186:3

Commissions 128:5 134:6 158:11

188:4

committed 113:22 193:10 194:13

Committee 135:14

common 40:5

Commonwealth 18:5 20:18 54:14 57:18 114:2 125:7 127:3 128:8 150:4 183:6 185:10 191:21 277:19,21 278:20 279:5,15

Commonwealth's 54:13 278:3

communicate 60:9

communicating 60:14

communication 65:2,17 93:21

174:13,14,15

communications 119:13,19 136:24

137:1 138:5 165:9

community 113:11 115:19 116:2

company 165:11,18

compare 75:10

comparing 85:9

comparison 67:16 70:21 105:11

competent 237:23 255:14

complaint 77:6,10 78:1 193:22

complaints 38:10 41:13 193:14,19,

21 194:3,12

complete 167:15 213:10 225:4,6,7

258:6

completed 197:4 230:3 261:11

complexity 96:10,11

complied 269:6

comply 274:16

complying 269:11 279:15

components 154:22

comports 279:12

compromise 164:22

computer 114:15

computers 114:24

concede 209:10

conceivably 236:7

concern 72:8 74:7 262:2

concerned 86:23

concerns 34:2,3 79:12 109:8 114:9, 12 117:19 122:23 123:1,11,18 209:16



239:15

concluded 268:15 279:6

conclusion 276:11

concurrently 223:11

condense 185:3

conduct 136:11

conduit 51:22 92:23

confer 124:14

conference 93:22 98:19.24 127:6

confidence 168:10,16

confident 37:11,17 108:6 168:3,13

confidential 114:24 117:13

confirm 200:20 245:21 263:10 270:1

confirmation 210:2 258:18

confirmed 46:18 163:20 247:16

confusing 254:1

confusion 23:19 61:18

connection 38:12

consideration 133:2

considered 112:13 113:11 133:9

consistent 57:23 278:21

constituency 86:12

constituents 112:5

constitutional 274:14,18

consult 251:12

consulted 251:13

contact 35:13 37:15,22 44:3,19 60:1, 2,4 138:8 182:21 187:18 198:1,6

201:24 213:7

contacted 60:18 75:19 112:4

contacts 36:6,21,23 37:3,20 60:5

contained 83:21

contemplated 275:3 278:22

contending 57:10

contents 19:15 209:4

context 219:17

continue 108:2 118:6 190:10 191:5 199:22 200:1 234:22 246:19 247:6

continued 256:15

continuing 240:23 241:11

contract 161:2

contractor 94:13

contracts 277:12

conversation 51:20,23,24 129:15

conversations 41:20 80:22 116:21

coordinate 198:7

coordinating 219:3,6 234:10

coordinator 81:17

coordinators 198:2

copied 77:22 140:16

copies 166:10 183:11

copy 24:10 60:24 183:9 197:3,4,7 204:17 222:13 223:7,8 247:20 257:12

259:5,10,18

corner 24:15 83:1 84:20

correct 23:2 24:20 25:23 27:11.16 28:21 29:23 30:3,9,12,16,23 31:10,20 32:5, 33:6 35:7 37:5 38:22,23 39:2,3, 5,9,11,13 40:16,20 41:19 42:15 43:9, 11,14,19,20 44:16,22 46:16,22 47:4, 10,14,22 48:7,11,14 52:3,14,21 53:6 58:23 61:19 63:4,5 67:19,22 68:5,16, 21 71:13,14,15,22 79:20 83:6,12,20, 23 84:4,6,24 88:13 89:11 92:16 94:18 96:3 100:14 101:22 114:8 118:22 122:14,18,22 127:21 128:20 136:18, 22 137:23 138:3,6,17 139:8,9,19 140:10,18 141:10,22 142:1,8 143:1,4, 23 150:18,19 151:1 159:14,23 164:13 171:19 172:2,18, 173:22 174:6 175:13,23 183:24 184:18 187:12 190:3,4,10 191:3,6 192:11,16 196:3 197:12,15 198:24 199:12,19 200:18 201:2 204:5 206:14 209:11 213:21 217:14,17 220:12 228:13 230:16 236:10 242:18 243:9 244:5 247:1,13

corrected 275:7,9,10 276:5

248:1,4 249:1,17 250:6,7 262:16

correction 276:2

corrective 42:12

correctly 46:19 98:5 214:10

correlate 231:21,23

correspond 24:4

cost 75:5 113:18,24 248:10,15

couch 177:14

counsel 19:23 20:12 80:18 102:6,11, 18 120:6 124:7,13 128:7 129:6,16,17 130:4,13 131:9,16 132:9,10 176:13 178:20 181:23 203:17 208:12,21 209:2,13,15 220:20 226:18 229:22 246:6 251:21 252:3 253:2,5,18 255:5, 8 263:9 277:18

count 175:19

counter 35:22 36:1

counterpart 139:23

counties 149:19 163:22 171:4

222:19,21 266:16

country 175:12

county 74:22 87:14 120:15 158:6 189:13 192:21 195:8 196:17,22 201:23,24 205:21,23,24 206:1 212:3 223:11 248:16 249:7 254:3 256:1 266:12

couple 20:12 38:2 41:5 90:19 95:9 99:22 108:20 109:3 118:5 134:7 164:5 189:24 194:4,8,11 235:5,8,20 244:3 259:22

coupled 232:23

court 18:10,16,20 19:2 20:11,13 21:14,20,21,22,24 22:6,10 23:4,21 24:1 35:9 59:5 69:7,13,20 70:1 72:8 73:23 92:24 102:12,19 103:3,8,11 105:10 111:24 116:5 119:6 124:3,10, 24 125:7,9 126:1,15 127:10 130:14 131:1 132:13,19,22,24 146:6 151:12, 13 163:4,7 164:21 168:8,15 169:2,6, 18,22 181:13,20 182:3,5,8,12,24 183:4,5,6,14,15 184:2,10,19 185:6,8, 10,13 202:8,10,19,21 209:15 226:18 238:3,9 239:12,15,22 241:2,10,13 244:24 245:4,11,12 246:6,9,15,18 250:20,23 251:2,5,11,16,20 252:2,4, 11,14,22 253:4,11,15,21 254:5,10 255:2 263:16,19,24 264:3,10,16,19,



Index: Court's..demonstrate

24 265:9,13,18 266:3,7,18,21 267:5, 9, 269:13,14,16,21 270:14,15,21 271:1,2 272:12 275:4 276:2,14,24 277:6,17 278:2,7,14 279:2,6,11

Court's 20:4 71:24 127:19 133:9 134:10 268:3,5,11,13 269:7,9 276:21 278:2

Courtney 216:2,8 courtroom 23:8

courtrooms 254:2

cover 136:19 142:14 225:13

covering 128:9 241:8 **covering** 160:9,22

covers 160:3,5 **crack** 229:20

create 88:9

created 165:15 177:2 213:22 232:9 235:3

creates 165:11 creating 133:3

creative 147:16 165:9 166:20

Cressler 81:9,11 **criminal** 28:22 29:3

criteria 191:23 215:8 232:24

critical 233:3

Cross 74:22 103:15 157:6 **cross-examination** 20:24

cumulative 18:7

cure 245:4 **curious** 86:8

current 66:7 119:4

customer 34:14,17 35:1,4,10,12,18, 21 36:5,15,21 37:19 38:11 39:21,22 40:2,3,12,17 41:2,15 42:5,14 44:9,18, 24 46:20 48:3 53:14 56:2,7,8,12 60:1, 9 61:21 62:3,19,21,24 63:11,16,18,22 87:11 88:3 90:24 95:15 97:21 99:7 110:2,3,22 111:9,21 114:24 121:15 163:10 187:9,20 188:18 196:1 258:13

customer's 95:23

customers 45:22 56:6 63:10,12 69:17 73:1 74:3 79:11 89:12 107:8,16 117:3,11 120:22,24

cut 33:21 **cycle** 144:22

D

D.C. 273:13

dad 112:12,16

data 57:15 58:14,20 65:24 66:1 70:18 71:2 107:9,12,13 176:5 177:18 189:10 192:7.9

data-entry 91:24

database 40:15 41:4,10 48:20 162:21,22 163:21,23 171:8 188:7 189:1,5 190:8 191:11 192:14 193:5 194:18 199:24 200:2,17 207:10 208:5 211:1 238:22

databases 199:21

date 30:20 39:4 49:7 52:19,20 53:4 56:20 57:16 59:11 83:2 84:19 156:17 160:12 163:9 189:19 192:1 201:15 204:2,3 205:8,23 206:7 207:8,14 212:7,9 230:3,4,7,9 250:15 257:18 258:12 262:9,11

dated 160:7,22 210:15 215:4 220:8 227:18 256:12 258:4 262:20,24

dates 159:9 219:14 234:11

daughter 257:4 260:16 273:11

day 20:18 21:12 23:13 56:4 73:18 111:20 112:22 113:3,4,20 149:8 153:20 154:21 156:16 163:17 170:12 179:24 180:11 210:12 217:15 231:12, 14 233:19,22 245:5 249:8,12 255:21 259:12 260:10,16 261:2 263:14 265:24 274:7

day's 19:10

days 32:10,13 45:4 51:19 108:20 114:17 171:3 195:5,8 205:13,18,20 210:16 211:2,3,23 212:1,14 213:2,4 231:5 235:6,8 240:7 249:9 255:19 259:1,7

deadline 212:5,14 262:5

deal 90:12,15 93:20 183:17 184:16 219:10

dealing 265:1

dealt 109:8 237:20

debate 241:9

deceased 207:12

December 106:10

decide 176:2

decided 50:2 104:13 127:10 210:22 260:1

decision 80:14,16,19 90:8 126:16, 19,21 127:1,7,9,11,15,18,20,22 128:14,16 129:12,14,19 130:2,9 131:15 132:13,24 133:9 134:10 169:4

decision-making 252:20

declaration 251:23 254:8 255:10 262:21

declarations 20:10 251:24 252:8 253:18 263:9

declare 255:11 262:15

decrease 231:2

dedicate 223:14

dedicated 232:10

defenses 18:7

defer 48:24

define 46:9

defined 55:6

definition 248:24

degree 272:3

degrees 129:21

delay 119:4 200:23

delays 170:20

deliver 252:10

delivered 108:9 197:17

demands 105:24

demonstrate 271:5,24



Index: demonstrating..distribute

demonstrating 105:22

denied 65:9 109:14 110:4

denying 64:22 111:15

department 21:2 24:18 25:1 27:6,13 28:3,6 31:13,16,18 32:10,21,23 33:12,16,22 35:15 36:23 37:3 40:19, 22 41:20,22 42:12 43:18 44:14,24 45:4,8 48:23 49:10,11,22 52:1 54:17 55:5 69:1 70:8 80:17 82:4,7,24 85:5 86:10,14 87:12,13,16 88:11 89:1,15, 17 90:3,8,14,16 91:5,10,13,19 92:8,9, 11,14,21,22 101:1 103:22 104:18 108:8,14 118:3,13 123:7 126:5,14,22, 23,24 128:7 131:18 133:5,12,15,18 134:4,16,24 135:4,10,18 136:10 137:23 142:6,19 144:18,23 149:8 150:3,22 152:16 155:2 159:20 163:24 166:21 180:19,24 186:11,22 187:14 190:13 195:23 204:3,8,17 207:22 208:3,4,13,22 209:8,21 218:7 220:3 221:11 224:13 225:9 228:22 237:4 238:2 243:19 247:9 256:11,20 257:9 258:16 269:24 270:10,13

depend 40:1

depending 38:8 68:9

deploy 51:5 108:7 278:20

deployed 41:21 98:23 108:18

deployment 42:11 45:4 46:6, 51:8 81:19 93:14,18 97:12 98:14

deploys 46:4

deposition 70:16 255:3,21

depositions 45:20

deputy 22:24 103:22 128:6 139:5 216:15 234:20

derive 186:9

describe 84:16 276:17

describes 199:9

describing 33:20 64:14 137:13 223:2

description 200:14 220:16

designed 81:13 101:12 137:22 138:4 139:8,18 146:10,22 147:15 187:22

designing 147:19

desk 40:18,22 41:18 42:7,13 44:4,19, 20 46:14,24 88:4,7 91:8 187:10,17,19 188:1,12,13 189:20 190:6,7,24 191:8, 14,21 193:8,9,15 194:14 196:1 206:21 207:16 215:3,9,12 216:9,11 217:4 218:6 231:10 232:21 233:1, 234:8 257:15 260:21 261:10

detail 72:2 85:10 97:1 166:5 167:14

detailed 98:14 138:16 142:5 143:8 145:23 152:8

details 86:14 111:1

determination 55:3 156:14 189:17 208:9 218:21 222:2,21,23

determine 31:14 35:6 36:18 41:3 54:9 60:20 72:15,18 75:11 90:9 150:5 190:14 193:4 194:20 195:12 219:7,14

determined 27:14 38:20 114:4 233:20

determining 31:8 222:19

developed 50:18

dictate 58:14

difference 62:5 190:16 230:23 243:11 272:20,21

differences 189:11 237:12 250:10

differently 194:16 268:12

difficult 248:3 260:8 277:1

difficulties 21:1 249:15 250:3

difficulty 23:6,7 74:10 76:19 113:8 270:9 276:17

digit 189:19

digits 189:20 207:7 221:10

diminish 233:2

direct 118:20 141:12 143:6 171:14 202:17 225:22

directed 26:6

ancolca 20.0

Directing 43:6

direction 164:21

directions 260:7

directly 212:2 216:13 269:4

director 43:12

directs 138:11

disability 72:20

disabled 72:10 75:1 76:17 146:7 152:21 154:2 242:15 249:14

disadvantaged 72:10 76:18 146:8 152:20 154:2

disagreements 253:20

disclosed 19:17

discontinue 114:5 118:24

discontinued 122:10

discounts 75:4

discover 46:10

discovery 208:2

discrepancy 222:19

discretion 188:6 192:2 233:4

discretionary 202:4

discuss 182:14 214:4 263:8,11

discussed 39:1 63:2 68:6 78:17 108:12 128:1,13 130:7,8 215:10 218:8

discussing 134:8

discussion 51:13,14,18 54:17,19 55:1 128:21 129:2, 132:7 133:2 134:11 164:7 220:17 221:3 251:17

discussions 26:23 54:20,22 81:3 126:16 127:5 128:3,22,24 129:8 133:11,20 134:1 135:3,16 238:14

disenfranchised 270:23,24 271:4 274:17 277:11 278:10 279:20

disenfranchisement 271:7,10,24 272:12 274:24 279:20,22,24

disjointed 186:7

dispenses 34:11

disposed 18:15

disqualifying 92:19

distinction 195:19

distinguish 87:22

distribute 25:13



Index: distributed..election

distributed 25:3,5,9

distributing 62:14

distribution 198:7

district 62:16

division 43:12 93:23 96:15 98:7

193:12 216:14

DLE 34:16 62:5,6

DLEA 34:16 62:5,7

DLEAS 62:4,13

DLES 62:13

DMV 257:24 259:5 261:4 262:12

266:13

document 70:7 78:9,13,14 82:3,12 83:4 84:2,12,22 85:4,7,15 93:13 94:9, 16,21 97:10,12 98:20 102:3,4,18 103:2 124:7 130:1 140:5 150:13,23 152:15,22 154:5 159:2,21 160:6,8,11 162:10 165:23 166:3,18 167:7,12 173:11 174:8 197:14 199:3,7,9 203:15,16,22 204:11,19 206:3 219:18

220:1,4,14,19,20,21,23 221:2 222:17 223:24 224:3,6,8,12,21,22 228:19,21 229:4,5,6 234:4 244:21 245:9,17,19,

23,24 256:12 261:19,24 262:4

documentation 29:12,14,20,21 30:1,6 89:22 135:1,11 163:15 164:23

documented 78:6

documents 79:21,24 85:9 95:6,22 102:8 116:9,10, 117:13 129:18,20 130:5 131:4 134:19 145:24 152:23 153:1 197:21 205:1 224:15 226:16 227:12 228:14 256:24 257:7,21

DOH 36:5,9,17 38:13

DOH'S 36:17

Dolan 263:1

dollars 243:19

door 107:11 190:12

DOS 21:8 24:16 25:4,13 26:1 27:19 28:10 31:4 32:17,19,22 33:1 38:17 46:21 47:2,9,14,17,20 48:16 49:6 50:18,19 52:8 55:17 57:19 65:4,5,6, 19 66:14 71:2 79:16,18,22 80:4,14 81:13 84:17 85:2,20 86:7,19 87:23,24

91:3,10 93:12,14 94:3 96:8,21 97:1,8 100:5,17 101:6,11 108:18 111:3,4,10, 16 119:15 120:11 129:22 132:12 137:3,13 138:8 139:11,12 141:11 142:3 143:5,18 148:10 156:24 157:9 163:15 187:1 210:16 217:4,19 218:4 219:24 220:13 221:10 224:9,18 225:10 227:20 230:18 243:22 256:20, 24 257:7 259:2,3,8,18 260:22 261:7, 10,14,18 262:11 267:2,18 269:24 270:12 276:5 278:17

double 90:17

doubling 69:19

doubt 74:5 75:7 102:24 148:1

dozen 20:12

draw 144:5 162:13

drawing 145:21

drill 110:17 122:3 177:5

drive 88:17 89:13 195:3 196:15 197:18,21 248:19,22,23 249:3,5

254:19 260:5,23 262:7

driven 256:4

driver 34:15 112:20 117:7 260:14

driver's 43:13 53:7 61:20 66:24 74:23 83:11 100:7 104:14,24 106:4 108:12,15 113:8 120:7 215:14 222:24 249:7

drives 211:6

driving 62:6 261:3

drop 106:10

dropoff 231:22

dropped 106:13

drops 105:7 106:15

drove 73:9 260:17

dual 145:1

due 105:15 149:11 189:10 258:1

duly 22:15 125:14 185:18

duplicate 206:2,3,11

duty 234:15

Ε

earlier 21:19 45:5 51:4 63:2, 66:9,17 70:20 77:1 78:20 79:9 86:21 95:18 106:3 108:22 109:7 123:20 127:15,18 166:1 170:5 172:21 177:11 181:18 189:8 219:9 231:4 232:15 239:7 244:23 259:10

early 20:10 42:1,10 54:23 80:20 95:14 232:6

ease 270:4

easier 50:24 106:8,19 134:23 264:11

easily 266:1

East 260:14.18

economically 113:17

educate 136:6 144:23

educating 136:5

education 136:11,17 144:10

educational 137:22

effect 50:6 104:2 106:15 119:12 163:5.6 186:12 190:3 204:9

effected 163:2

effective 104:19 149:10,12,14 174:1, 2 177:22 178:9

effectively 46:1

effectiveness 149:15

efficient 21:10

efficiently 108:17 232:5

effort 19:18 144:10 146:13 148:17,21 149:2,21 155:10 156:6 170:8,11 219:4 267:16

efforts 162:2 166:10, 247:11

elderly 72:9 76:17 146:7 152:19 155:4 249:14

elected 180:14

election 54:7 73:8 112:22 113:2 118:7 122:21 138:19,23 144:22 149:7 153:20 154:21 156:16 158:20 168:5 169:13 170:4,12 179:24 180:11 234:23 238:19 246:3,24 247:12 249:10 272:6 274:7



Index: elections..exhibits

elections 107:23 128:5 158:6,12 179:17,20,23 180:8,13,15 186:3 188:4 191:2 199:18 212:3 223:11

elector 170:15 275:16

electors 168:4,21,24 169:11 170:2,3 269:23

electronic 36:8,10,12,24 37:4,17,22 121:13

electronically 25:15 99:24 100:13, 19 101:3,20 197:19,20 199:2 218:8

eligibility 219:7

eligible 133:23 179:9,10 236:8

eliminated 83:22 84:5 85:18,19,21 86:19

else's 239:9

email 25:16,18 39:16 43:7 45:2 60:11 77:22 109:18 111:5 140:16,19 141:20 142:14 173:1 216:2,7,18,24 217:1 223:8 231:4 232:7 257:8,12,15 258:5 259:3,5,9, 261:11

emailing 43:15

emails 146:19

emphasis 146:15 153:12

employee 36:22,23 37:2 56:13 73:18

employees 63:20 98:22 99:20

104:14

enable 158:7

encompassed 152:24

encompassing 149:20 170:10

encountered 235:15

encountering 21:6

encourage 122:2 138:7,13

encourages 137:7 145:4

encouraging 140:3 144:20 145:2

end 20:18 26:6 60:13,15,21 63:6 88:2 93:5 111:19 128:10 138:11 156:14 166:21 186:23 189:5,8 198:22 212:20,21 235:16 244:2 259:15 262:21 265:24

endeavoring 18:6

ended 135:5

engaging 181:8

English 141:8 152:6

enrolled 205:9,18 206:10

enrollment 205:8,23 206:7

ensure 107:24 108:16 111:20 117:11 231:9 232:11

ensuring 229:20

entail 116:6

enter 207:18

entered 183:11 189:19 192:13

230:10

entire 57:18 68:11 91:23 94:21 146:13 152:9 198:2 203:21

entitled 57:13 63:1,8 164:18

entity 147:19

entry 189:10 192:7,9 213:20

environment 73:5 117:14

environments 116:20

epicenter 161:8

equal 19:9

equivalent 202:11,13

Eric 203:18 204:1 226:10

erred 275:7

error 91:24 222:3,5,6

errors 189:10

essentially 47:11 69:19 173:7 191:24 193:11 195:14 207:6 217:10 220:6 229:5 234:9.20 275:13

established 119:9 244:22 271:20

estimate 32:12 49:14 71:20 152:13

estimated 176:24 **ethnic** 167:2,17

ethnicity 167:23

evaluation 238:11, 239:14

even-numbered 144:7

event 114:17 246:2

events 79:14,15 155:2,3,5

eventually 200:24

evidence 19:17,20,21 21:12,23 22:2 222:9 241:3 251:5 265:17 266:23 276:16

evidencing 130:1

evolutionary 50:11 79:9

exact 72:13 129:10 169:15 191:24 192:18 206:17 214:20 241:5

exam 249:12

examination 22:19 103:15 118:20 120:2 125:18 157:6 171:14 185:4, 225:22 241:18 244:23 249:24 279:3

examined 22:16 125:15 185:19

Examiner 34:15,16

exception 149:19 183:21 206:18 208:14 218:5 220:7 221:21

exceptions 195:14 197:2,14 199:3, 208:7 209:8 210:4 215:7 218:3 219:8, 16 221:4 224:23 229:6,7,10 243:16

excerpt 226:7,15,21

exchange 77:23 105:18

excluding 53:6

exclusively 154:12 158:1

excuse 182:9 204:10 243:13

excuses 21:7

exercise 233:4

exhaust 27:21 96:1,2 233:15

exhaustion 83:21 85:18

exhibit 24:2,4,5,7,14,16 25:20,24 27:23 38:21 42:23 43:3,7 67:9,10 77:21 78:6,16 82:2,16,19 84:11 104:23 105:4 137:18,21 140:14 141:17,20 142:11,23 150:11 203:10, 11,14 208:22,23 209:19,22 213:12 215:24 216:1 219:19,23 223:18,23 226:5, 230:6 244:7,11 257:13,15 259:6,11,19 260:6,13 263:23 265:7

exhibits 19:14 23:17,18,20 136:14 182:15,16,17 183:3,8,10,16,18,20 184:4,16,17,19 263:18,21 264:9,17 265:2,12,13,19



Index: exist..flag

exist 35:17 96:11

existed 38:17 47:19

existence 157:11

existing 271:23

exists 222:6

expanding 158:3

expect 20:10,22 148:8,15,16 201:18 209:3 218:22 223:12 225:4 228:1,7 237:5,17 239:2 252:15

expectation 63:21 117:14

experience 104:11 189:9 214:18 236:22,24 237:14 240:17 250:15,17 273:3 279:4

experienced 233:5

experiences 232:6 233:7 237:16 241:23

expert 87:15 168:11 237:22 239:11

experts 248:21

expiration 52:19,20 53:4,5

expired 53:9,10,17 55:3,8 63:3

explain 101:8 105:10 116:5 119:6 157:20 203:6 213:7

explained 99:15

explains 229:4

explanation 130:6

expressed 44:13 72:8 79:12 262:2

extended 107:22

extensive 104:16 115:11 118:4

130:22 170:10

extent 218:14 246:4 265:5 273:6

F

face 249:15 277:7 278:10

face-to-face 45:22

facial 277:2,6 278:7

facially 272:14

facilitate 74:17 76:1 115:23 252:19

facility 37:20 193:22 258:20

fact 27:22 37:12 41:7 45:6 46:3 47:1 49:3,6 50:13 55:7,16 57:24 58:5 63:18 64:6 75:15,21 77:8 87:6 95:5 105:12 107:2 108:7 110:23 112:9,18 115:7 117:22 120:17 123:1 137:12 139:21 140:23 141:5 147:18,20 149:2,12 190:15 218:19 222:10 225:11 232:23 250:13 263:4 267:16 272:21,23 273:6 274:22 275:2 276:6

factors 105:16

facts 58:14,19 70:18 71:8,9 110:18 111:8 122:4 262:15 266:23

factual 107:12

fail-safe 269:3

failed 235:22

fair 20:14 28:16 33:3 45:18 49:2 68:18 77:20 177:9 180:21,22 277:5

fairly 55:9 198:12

fall 106:9,10,12 180:8 267:18

fallback 89:21

falls 229:20

falsification 262:19

familiar 67:10 78:16 126:7 186:13 220:1 223:23 234:4 244:21

familiarize 252:7

famous 112:12,14

fashion 18:19

fast 107:8 193:15

fax 223:7 252:17

feasible 113:17

federal 143:21 144:6

fee 30:1,7

feedback 147:17

feel 85:15 250:16

fellow 204:24 205:6 212:23

felt 111:16 259:23.24

female 95:2

field 36:21 81:20 104:19,20 113:19

159:22

fielding 191:14

figure 56:23 57:3 173:18 177:20,22

figured 278:20

figures 173:20

file 210:21 212:23 219:8 252:13,22 253:1,7,9 264:15

filed 253:11

files 209:7 210:3,8 227:2

fill 28:15 38:21 40:3, 61:9,12 88:23 89:14,16 100:24 196:23 211:10,15 212:17

filled 40:6 46:19 87:11 89:13,21 187:5 228:7 259:16

filling 95:24 133:5

fills 221:5

final 83:7 85:6,10 171:3 208:8

220:14,17

finalized 25:6,8 83:5 126:6

financial 72:21

financially 72:10 76:18 146:8 152:20

154:2

find 20:9 31:14,16 32:14 33:15 35:17 47:15 76:14 80:19 110:18 122:4 174:10 188:1,8,17,22,24 189:1,4 191:9 192:3,9,18,22 193:2,5 194:17 199:20,23 201:16 208:5 218:20, 230:22 236:6 237:8 258:6 277:4, 278:17.19

finding 164:22 170:20 194:22 195:2 215:6

findings 80:24

finds 272:7 278:2

fine 34:19 60:7 191:17

finish 31:24 198:18

finished 182:8 239:19 241:13,15

firm 148:5

Five-year 236:12

flag 235:23



Index: flexible..good

flexible 18:23

flip 169:1

flow 243:15,16

fluctuate 68:9

fluent 75:24 115:23

fluid 210:11

focus 19:19 127:14 155:11 170:13

186:21 201:3

focused 20:5 266:18

focuses 154:11 270:22

focusing 134:9 216:6

folder 197:24 230:13

folks 20:20 41:15 44:18,24 52:1 55:13,16 63:4,7 64:14,19 74:2 92:9 96:12 97:16 98:12,19 110:13 116:9 126:18 134:4 138:23 140:19 186:18,

23 191:11 192:8,18

folks' 99:16

follow 45:12 112:9 194:22 195:16

199:18 226:3

follow-up 47:9 112:3 195:11

foreign 105:18

foreseeable 119:1

forestalling 279:24

forget 180:10

form 24:16,23 25:20 28:15,20 39:23 40:3,6,13 46:19 52:11 53:23 61:10,12 82:4,5,22,23 83:17 84:1 87:11 88:14, 21,23,24 89:5 94:2 95:22,24 100:23, 115:24 133:3,8 164:18 170:24 187:5, 8 195:9 196:10,16,18,21,23 198:4 221:5 222:11 223:3 228:6 256:19

259:15 261:12

formal 231:13 232:9

formalized 231:17,18

forms 27:1 64:10 88:22 89:3 95:17 115:5,8,10,15 119:13,19 161:20 172:3 173:17 195:4 261:10

forward 26:8 88:10 119:18 168:16 195:20 218:4 219:11 243:21

forwarding 259:9

found 31:19 41:10,12 80:20 100:21 111:10 189:8 199:16 201:5,8 258:7 260:11 277:6

foundation 168:12 237:21 238:8,

239:9 245:1,11,14 246:15

four-plus-hour 254:19

frail 73:10

frame 104:1,6 121:1

free 52:5,9,13 54:11 55:18 56:24 57:12,13,17,22,24 58:6,13,15 63:1,8 64:5,8,20 71:1 85:15 86:23 143:7 164:19 182:13 227:19 240:16 251:3

frequently 195:12 219:13 224:24

Friday 151:7,8 225:17

friend 73:9

front 18:1 39:21 90:24 105:4 115:11

130:5 174:11 212:20 216:1

fulfill 259:13

full 257:20 258:21

full-page 154:18 155:20

fully 161:13

function 107:3 200:4

functions 37:14

funding 143:22

funds 144:23

furnished 24:4,6

furniture 200:8

future 119:1 244:5

G

gallery 23:14

gather 73:19 124:4

gathering 20:10

gave 226:13

geared 146:14

gears 104:22

gender 39:10 85:22,23 86:8 95:1

general 30:17 34:13 41:6 72:24 80:17 93:21 113:7 130:18 153:14 154:15 245:20 268:6 275:3 276:4

278:22

generate 196:8 237:6

generated 131:5 215:8 224:17 229:1

generates 221:6

generating 159:20

gentlemen 125:6

Georgia 123:6 240:15 242:3,6,7,9,20

243:7,11 250:9,10

germane 130:24 266:11

Gersch 18:12 21:18 22:5,9,12,21 23:16,23 24:2,10,12 42:22 43:2,5 59:4, 67:7 69:9 70:2 77:19 78:11 81:24 82:15 84:9 87:19 93:5,6 102:1, 22 106:17 113:6 118:9 119:23 120:4 123:24 124:6,18 125:3,11,19 131:11, 13 132:17,20,23 137:18,19 139:15,17 140:13,15 141:17,18 142:11,13 149:23 150:10,12 151:10,14,16 157:3 168:6,10 169:14 170:24 171:11,16 181:22 182:10,18 183:24 185:1,7,15, 23 202:9 203:3,9,13 208:19 209:1,14, 18 210:1 213:11,15 215:23 219:22 223:16,21 225:19 226:20 237:21 239:4 240:22 241:9,20,21 244:10,18 245:15,16 246:20 249:18 250:22,24 251:7 263:17 264:8,20 265:6,11 276:15

get all 187:7

give 19:2,9 20:14 26:17,21 27:13,14 39:12,14,23 54:10 62:6 65:5 92:12 131:24 132:3 134:11,13 147:8 162:6 164:8 166:14 180:16 189:12

giving 27:21 108:15 131:9 135:10 156:8

glitches 45:16

global 21:4

go-ahead 92:12

go-between 60:13

goal 120:21 153:2 215:11 232:3

good 20:20 49:24 116:13 124:11



Index: good-intentioned..hours

125:20 148:6 226:1,2 238:9 267:20 268:1

good-intentioned 76:12 110:11

governor's 278:4

grab 136:14 **grand** 156:19

granddaughter 256:22 260:10

grass-roots 155:9

grassroots 170:8 181:6

gray 254:3

great 93:20 147:7 166:5

gross 173:15

grounds 168:7 169:14

group 75:20,23 86:12 117:5

groups 34:2 72:9,15,19 76:8 115:19 116:1,16 117:21,24 146:6,15 155:6

guaranteed 278:11

Guard 184:22

guess 18:13 131:10 162:9 183:21 210:18 211:8 217:22 218:17 234:16 239:1 252:13

guidance 132:15 guided 132:12

guy 206:9,15

quys 149:3

Н

hair 254:3

half 97:18 115:21 193:20 235:7

hand 24:7 42:22 43:3 82:16 137:18 139:16 140:13 141:17 142:11 195:4 203:9 208:20 209:19 223:18 233:23 244:7

handed 203:14

handful 102:8

handing 24:10

handle 70:9 71:11 97:5 106:16

182:15

handled 102:10 108:17

handles 48:23

hands 47:12 60:22 156:3,12 179:5

232:4 234:17

hang 111:24 211:7

happen 51:7 61:15 63:24 71:23 92:2 102:21 110:8 148:9 169:23 176:24 196:6 199:21 201:5,19 223:13 238:24 248:2 274:9

happened 26:10 38:14 127:4 171:6 183:7 203:6 221:20 240:6 277:15

happening 31:1 34:23 176:5

happy 21:14 60:7

hard 20:8 197:7 270:10 272:17,18

Harlow 139:5

Harmelin 146:10 147:14 165:17,18 166:5 167:13 174:17

Harrisburg 37:3,21 38:13 75:22 76:4 97:24 252:16 261:17 262:1

hash 253:19

HAVA 143:21 144:5

health 27:6 31:13,16,18 32:11,21,23 33:12,22 35:16 36:24 73:3 223:4 254:14 256:11

hear 21:15 54:3 81:5 97:6

heard 18:11 54:3 77:5,10 109:11 121:20,22 123:6 185:4 186:16 241:4, 5 262:10 270:2 276:14

hearing 23:18 30:14 66:22 99:12 136:15 150:3 183:2 199:8 241:4 266:17.18 276:9.13

heaviest 247:11

held 118:5

helped 75:8

helpful 19:16 85:15 184:1

helping 21:3

Hey 60:18,20 61:1

HICKOK 225:24 227:1,8,10 228:18 234:3 238:7,10 239:17,18,24 240:21 241:14 244:6,17,20 245:3,8 246:4,8, 11,17 249:19 250:1,19 263:22 264:2

high 49:21 167:14,15

high-level 168:1

higher 107:14

hire 148:12

hired 147:2

Hispanic 154:9 166:2

historical 107:12

historically 74:1 105:13 106:9,13

hit 145:17

hitting 175:5

hoc 231:14

hold 41:16 42:14,19,21 44:1,23 86:16 87:10 191:19 193:16 248:24

holding 267:5

home 31:15 33:11 48:6,9 180:3 196:2 258:1 260:5,23 261:13,17 262:7

homeless 47:24

homes 74:13 116:19

Honor 18:1,4,12,14 20:1,2 22:5,12 23:16 43:2 71:19 78:8 102:1,22 103:5,6 119:23 124:1,2,6 125:3, 131:11 151:10,14 157:4 169:15 171:10,11 181:22 182:2,4,7,11,18 183:24 185:2,5,15 208:19 223:17 239:4,17 240:24 241:12,14,20 244:17,20 245:3,15 246:4,8,17 249:18,19 250:22 251:1,4,7,18,19,22 252:6 253:24 263:7,17,22 264:2,8,13, 21 265:7,23 266:8,11 268:4,15 269:5 270:2 273:21 275:4,8,9,13,23 276:9, 11.15

Honor's 20:3 252:20

hope 20:2 45:17 174:15

hoping 145:4

hosted 213:20

hotline 157:18,20,24 158:3,5

hour 97:18 120:20 124:12,13,23

253:12,13 261:22

hours 57:6 96:22 97:17 107:22 108:1, 14 120:11,20 121:4,8,24 234:23



house 136:24 137:1 138:4 139:8,19 140:20 141:21 147:15 165:8,9 166:19 259:22

household 143:19 149:6 151:8 153:19

households 143:17 149:5 150:17 152:4,6 175:7, 176:17,22 178:3

huge 70:23 115:1

hundred 29:2 107:6

hundreds 58:18 71:3

hurdle 279:9

hyphenated 189:15

hypothetical 69:5 106:16

hypothetically 160:12

ı

ID 21:3,4,8 24:16,18,23 25:4,13 26:1, 15,17,19,21,23 27:9,10,13,14,18,19, 22 28:4,9,10,14 29:19 30:15 31:3,4,5 32:2,16,17,19,22 33:1,14,16 34:11 38:20 46:21 47:2,17,20 48:12,16 49:4,5,6,18 50:5,6,18,19 51:17 52:3, 7,8,11,18 53:2,3,4,7,8,9,15,18,23 54:11 55:17,18 57:13,22 58:4,15 61:17,23 62:20,24 63:3,12,14,22 64:5,8,11,17 65:1 68:24 70:10 71:21 72:16,23 73:2 76:14,22 77:8,11,12, 13, 79:16,18,22 80:4,14 82:24 85:2 86:6,7,23 91:3 93:12 94:3 96:2,4,8,22 97:1,8 99:17,21 100:6,24 101:6,12,13 104:14 105:20 108:6,19 109:12,14 110:5,14,23 111:3,4,6,10,16,22 112:16 115:9 118:14 122:16 126:5. 129:22 132:12 133:6,7 134:3,4,14,15, 17 135:4,10 137:6,13 141:11 142:3 143:18 145:6 149:8 150:6,23 152:14, 18 153:17 154:4,19 156:3,8,12 157:9, 24 158:1,7,13 159:9,19 160:20 161:19,22 162:11,16 163:15 164:3,9, 19 165:1,3 168:2,5 169:12 170:4,14 178:24 179:11,12 180:2,11 181:1 186:11 187:1 188:18,23 193:10 195:6,15 198:1 203:5 206:16 208:4 210:16 214:22 219:4,24 220:14 224:9 227:20,21 229:15 230:4,18 242:19 243:4,12,22 247:15,16 256:2,5,7,10, 16,19,20,24 257:7 260:2,10,19,22,24

261:7,14,18,23 262:6,11,12,13 263:2 267:24 272:15 273:2,8,15,19 274:22 276:17 277:8,10,20 278:9,12,17,20

idea 126:13,14 147:13 168:23 237:4 262:13

identical 140:2

identification 24:9 28:5 29:7 43:1 67:6 77:18 81:23 82:14 84:8 90:11 100:16 133:3,4 137:17 139:14 140:12 141:16 142:10 150:9 160:1,15 162:5 165:21 166:16 167:9 188:20 203:12 209:24 213:14 215:22 219:21 223:3, 20 227:7 228:17 234:2 244:9 258:10 264:23 267:3 271:9 272:11

identifications 66:24

identified 84:15 183:8,20 184:5 263:3 276:24 277:1 278:7

identify 74:10 160:6,18 162:9 166:18 167:11 205:2

identifying 202:16 242:23 243:2

identity 30:22

IDS 51:22 57:17,19,24 58:12 62:1,9, 15 64:22,23 66:3 67:15,21 68:4,14,17 71:1,2,5 75:21 76:13 105:1 108:2 112:24 115:5 116:3 118:2 120:11,12 134:18, 135:24 137:10,15 142:22 149:7 153:19 154:20 155:22 156:20, 24 159:12,16 161:8,9,14,19 162:2 163:8 164:18,22 172:10 179:4 181:14 214:2,9,12 232:4 237:5 238:18 240:16 258:8

ignore 270:16

illness 254:22

image 95:6

imagine 147:11 156:13 224:6

immediately 86:6 109:23 157:17 188:15 216:18 269:10

impact 72:9 107:7

impacted 107:17

implement 215:18

implementation 104:5,12 236:18,21

implemented 78:22 79:7 81:13 118:15,17,20 157:10,13,21 158:12

159:17

implementing 80:3

importance 99:20

important 19:19 51:21 59:12 86:21 99:16 106:20 110:23 111:20 136:6,12

imposed 29:3

impossibility 277:12

impression 200:14

improper 279:7

improve 133:22

improvement 212:18

improvements 231:7

in-depth 97:2

inactive 236:1

include 68:6 139:22 224:15 262:22

included 137:5 153:13 163:9 175:19

254:7

includes 67:3 252:1

including 20:24 57:6 149:8 153:24

incorporated 127:12

incorrect 32:17

incorrectly 189:19

increase 70:4,20,22 71:11 107:6

increased 107:20 108:16

increases 70:24

increasing 161:1

Indiana 250:12

indicating 263:1

indicative 245:21

individual 26:18 27:2,5 36:1 37:14 38:6 42:3 47:16 53:19 56:17,18 73:2, 7,9 75:19 76:11 87:14,17,18 92:6 99:21 100:20 109:8 110:20 111:3,9, 21 112:11,13 115:22 116:8 120:19 121:15,21 122:5 134:23 153:11 187:23 188:9 189:13 190:12,15 194:20,21 196:9,12,14,20 200:2 201:13,20 211:10 215:14 219:3 22:21 233:9 236:3 275:14



Index: individual's...June

individual's 206:23

individually 180:20

individuals 20:9 21:3 32:18,20 34:2 35:14 47:23,24 49:8,12 51:1,23 56:21 58:8 62:17 64:4 65:8 71:4 94:14 105:20 106:24 108:11,19 109:16 112:23 121:21 158:4 195:2 213:7 218:16 219:7,14 237:3 252:8

inform 63:12

information 23:6 37:15 40:8 56:9 57:4 65:22 66:12 81:1 91:18 109:13 111:17 115:1 136:2 137:8 138:12,17 141:14 142:5 143:9 145:23 146:1 149:5 152:8 158:6 159:11 161:21 162:1 166:4 173:6 174:22 175:1,13 176:9,14 177:19 187:7,20 192:13 202:16 207:19 221:12 222:1,13 237:2 238:15 241:7 242:23 243:2 258:18 260:15 262:17

informed 23:5 93:24 96:14

informing 195:15

infrequently 223:14

inherent 45:15 170:20

initial 24:16 50:12 66:24 67:14,15,21 69:22 82:8,22,23 106:14 187:18 208:2,14 218:21 228:6 231:4 236:20 238:16 244:19

initially 49:17 135:6,21 193:20 203:5 205:12,17 206:8 207:23 218:13 235:3 247:15

initiate 40:13

injunction 268:16,17,18,24 269:5,7

inordinate 215:7

input 81:12

inquiry 31:13

inserted 225:2

insinuating 147:23 148:2

instance 46:23 47:8 60:10 92:14 97:9 101:2 266:12

instances 41:14 44:17,19 45:23 55:14 100:11 171:6 180:10

instructed 63:20 72:24

instructions 20:3,4 95:3

insurance 223:4

intended 268:6 277:9 279:18

intending 234:22

intense 149:20 170:11

intention 183:10 276:3

intentional 247:8

intentionally 63:17

interest 191:18,22

interested 131:23 132:2,5 133:15

135:14

interesting 75:14 93:3 97:7 266:10

interface 119:7

interim 31:15 32:8

intermediate 181:7

International 254:18

Internet 60:23 61:5 256:23 257:10

interpose 130:18

interpretation 267:21 278:1,5

interpreted 180:19 268:12

interrupted 239:20

introduce 252:21 264:14

introduced 32:22 263:18

inundated 239:3

investigate 218:12

investigation 210:24 211:13

investigations 210:22 229:17

invite 213:20

inviting 19:20

involve 131:16

involved 54:20,24 55:4 62:14 116:16,18 127:24 128:22,23 183:15

234:18 248:10

involves 207:6

irrelevant 168:11

irrespective 245:23

irresponsible 211:6

issuance 50:12 82:23 91:3 119:15

230:18,21

issuances 106:14

issue 46:21 48:12 62:1,9 73:3 86:5, 23 91:16 92:12,15,17 186:24 188:16, 23 189:18 199:10 201:3 211:11 214:3,10,12 261:14 268:16, 269:17 270:5 275:8 278:4 279:8

issued 28:6 29:8 39:7 55:22,24 57:16,18,24 58:13 59:10,11 66:3,15, 18,23 67:15,20 68:4 71:1,2 86:3 105:1 126:15 127:11 156:19,24 159:12,14,16 161:8,10,14 172:9 204:23 205:13 206:1 240:15 258:19 269:6 274:2

issues 42:2 45:7,14,16 73:3 78:24 158:2 189:9 193:24 205:21 214:22,24 215:1,2 221:3 266:6

issuing 64:22 84:17 91:13 100:15 118:13 157:17 164:16 256:19

item 216:17 items 188:7

iteration 97:8

J

Janet 262:24

January 100:6 103:23

Japanese 154:13

job 62:2,8 117:6 147:2 148:6,14,15 199:17 218:11,13

John 139:1,4 158:20

Jonathan 185:1,16,18 186:1

judge 179:17,18,20,22 180:7,12,15

Judges 272:5

judgment 147:1 233:16 266:11

July 108:5 162:19 255:22

July/early 151:3

jumped 109:23

June 103:24 205:19 206:12



Index: jurisdictions..living

jurisdictions 123:5,10 236:23 237:1, 12

Justice 272:22 277:18,24 278:5

justices 272:13

Κ

keeping 108:12 163:7 164:15 191:18 233:20

key 46:9 109:3 115:8

kick 106:24 191:1

kids 68:12 106:4

kind 61:22 74:9 114:2 134:12 144:14 155:12 156:13 173:6 193:12 196:10 198:1 213:19 218:16 237:4 266:5 277:11

kinds 137:10 161:19 177:8 215:1

257:21 266:5 270:4

knew 169:22

Knorr 277:21

knowing 104:18

knowledge 64:3 117:12 118:23 150:4,7 246:12 262:17

Kurt 22:13,15,23

L

lack 150:5 218:17 224:4 258:1

Ladies 125:6 **lady** 261:22

laid 129:20

language 28:17 29:16 76:2,3

languages 115:6,10,13 154:14

large 70:9, 138:10 154:8 167:3

larger 226:15 largest 161:13

late 25:11 80:21 95:13 113:4,14 151:3

234:16

Latino 75:23 154:12 155:15 166:7

law 22:16 29:3 53:11 54:1,10 55:9,11 66:2 72:8 125:15 153:3,4, 155:7 156:17 161:19 170:6,12 181:11 185:19 242:22 243:1 271:23 272:15 274:16,24 277:7,8,9

laws 237:13 250:10

lawsuit 277:5

lawyer 55:12

lawyers 132:3 267:7

lay 238:7

layman's 34:13

lays 166:5

leading 26:11 46:7

leaf 209:6

League 116:22,24 117:16

learn 51:8 140:6 215:18,20 234:18

learned 46:6 50:14,17,23,24 79:10

217:23 256:18 257:1

learner's 67:3 68:6,8,11,20 106:5

leave 26:7 124:4 176:7 178:11 182:16 259:21

leaving 258:19

led 50:2 79:15 164:21

left 143:13 180:2 249:9

leg 134:5

legal 72:5 105:22 131:17,24 132:4

274:18

legally 53:21

legislation 134:6,17 158:12 181:9

188:5

legislative 109:19

legislator 60:5,12,17,24 109:18

111:4

legislators 109:17 112:5

Legislature 279:18

legislature's 277:13

lengthy 193:23

lesson 234:18

lessons 215:20

letter 31:17 32:20,23 65:8 73:6,8 74:19 111:5 162:18 195:14 227:15, 16,17,19 228:4 229:14 230:5,15 247:16,20 262:24 263:4,10,14

letters 138:11 162:15,23 171:18,20 172:1 227:3,11 228:9 229:6

letting 32:20

level 123:21 167:14,15 181:6,7 202:10

liberal 163:8 181:13 267:15,16 268:23 269:1 277:9 278:21 279:12

license 28:5 34:15,16 53:7 67:1 69:22 83:11 100:7 104:14 108:13,16 113:9 120:7 134:18 135:23 165:1,3 215:14 248:24 249:8 260:14

licenses 67:14,21 104:24 106:5 148:10

licensing 43:13 61:19,20 74:23 112:20 117:7 260:3,18,21

life 184:22

light 131:7 185:4

limit 59:18 144:8

limited 20:2 21:10 111:17

lines 21:6 74:22

links 48:17

list 24:4 115:11,12,13 118:4 155:22 166:23 167:24 182:22 184:1, 193:2 234:12 236:5 257:20 258:6,21

listed 19:14 41:4 105:7 166:21

273:15

listened 34:1 79:11

listening 173:24 266:4

listing 154:20

lite 148:10

litigation 131:10

live 257:4 259:17 266:12

lived 255:18

lives 273:12

living 116:19 266:16



Index: loaded..matters

loaded 197:21 204:12

locate 190:7

located 165:10

location 26:19 97:22, 106:23 107:1

120:24 249:11

locations 25:9 96:17 106:13,22 109:4 120:15 121:23 248:7,17,21

logging 143:8

logic 58:13

logical 278:14

long 32:10 38:5 42:19 53:9 121:17 124:22 193:16 211:19 212:4 228:1,8 250:13 262:3 271:8 279:18

longer 38:3,4 41:8 95:21 124:12,13,

16 163:13 164:2 268:24

longest 124:20

looked 55:19 83:16 95:22 121:3 145:7 250:11,12,14 254:5 275:24

lookups 200:7

loop 274:23

loosened 270:15

losing 183:17

lost 82:6,9 206:3

lot 19:3,14 41:8 95:19 105:18 106:3 109:7,15 110:10,12,16 147:2, 238:22 266:4,9 270:18 273:7 279:10

low 68:2

lower 24:15 83:1 84:19 220:9 273:12,

• •

lunch 124:12,16

luncheon 125:4

luxury 188:12 192:4

lying 147:24

M

machine 82:11

made 18:18,24 28:22 31:2 33:12,21 41:22 45:11 46:1 50:14,20 51:9 55:4 56:1,13,14, 70:17 76:8 79:12 80:13,

16 93:7 96:19 108:22 113:16 114:1 115:18 119:17 126:19 127:1,7,9,18, 23 128:14 129:11,14 130:10 131:15 146:11 156:14 163:17 180:6 181:18 189:17 192:7,14 208:8 217:24 222:6, 21,23 226:4 231:7 235:4 260:23 261:3 262:17 265:23 267:3,4 275:23 278:16

magazine 166:24

maiden 48:18

mail 61:6 153:5 211:17,19 212:2,3 223:8 262:1

mailed 151:4 230:5 236:11

mailer 151:4

mailing 143:16

mailings 151:7

maintain 114:3

maintained 227:12 228:21

maintenance 236:5,15

majority 175:18 189:7,9 191:15,16 193:21 214:2,9 244:4 247:5

make 18:24 23:13 26:9 31:13 33:10 37:12 38:11 44:18 50:5,24 63:7 75:24 87:20,22 92:7 96:18 99:17 102:2 110:13 111:21 116:10 124:8 127:11 130:2 134:23 141:11 142:2 147:6 153:13 154:3 155:6 161:18 164:24 169:3 170:2 171:4 178:22,24 179:5,7 180:24 182:19 183:13 195:18 196:17 213:3 215:19 222:2 226:20 227:9 232:13 233:16 242:13 265:6 267:22 268:24 275:8,17 277:19

makes 90:8 106:19 250:16 266:11 279:10

making 34:5 74:20 99:21 112:8,22 129:24 166:11,12 181:13 221:17,18 258:1 276:5 277:13

male 95:1

manage 123:6

management 109:5

manager 43:12 96:15

managerial 98:11

managers 62:16,17 93:23 96:16 98:8

234:9

manner 278:21

manning 62:23 234:9,10

manual 93:11 200:1

Mapquest 260:6

March 50:13 54:23 56:20 59:16,19 67:16 68:3 156:18 172:17,23 181:15 255:24 279:16

mark 42:23 151:11 264:20

marked 24:8,14 42:24 43:4 67:5,8 77:17,21 81:22 82:1,13 84:7,11 137:16,20 139:13,16 140:11,14 141:15,20 142:9 150:8,11 158:24 159:3,24 160:4,12,14 162:4 165:20, 22 166:15 167:7,8 203:12 208:22,24 209:23 213:12,13 215:21 219:19,20 223:19,23 227:6 228:16 233:24 234:1 244:7,8 264:6,22

market 148:4 149:18 173:16 177:18

marketing 148:12

markets 148:11 166:6 244:1

Marks 43:19 139:1,4 158:20 185:2, 16,18 186:1,2,5 203:14 210:2 223:22 226:1 241:22 243:18

Marsh 251:8,23 253:22 255:11 262:20,24 263:4 264:6

Marsh's 252:1

martial 148:11

mass 140:9,21, 141:23 248:3,13

massive 273:1

match 38:9 91:22 162:20 188:2,3,17 191:24 192:18 207:12,13

matches 91:2

material 265:8

materials 93:7 94:3 197:22 208:20 224:14,17 225:13 226:12

matter 30:17 45:6 47:8 50:13 55:20 75:15 97:4 105:13 107:2 108:7 117:6 120:17 126:16 207:10 247:18 268:12 269:15

matters 227:4 228:11



Index: Mazin..necessarily

Mazin 184:21

meaning 145:1 180:19

means 29:18 30:5,17 44:8 45:21 103:3 111:19 138:10 174:1 197:13

242:12

meant 32:1 267:21

measure 149:15 177:12,13 178:9,10

mechanism 89:20

media 117:6 146:10,13 149:18,20 156:6 165:7,17,18 166:5,10,11 167:14,16 174:17 175:3 243:20

Medicare 222:14,16 medium 175:16 176:15

mediums 181:10

meet 255:16

meeting 127:4 128:18 130:3,9,23

131:15 213:20 232:7

meetings 118:2,5 127:24 131:5,20 134:3

Megan 43:16 77:23 158:22 159:7

160:9

Melissa 173:2,5 174:16,17 178:3

member 131:18

members 128:4 136:8 217:5,7

memo 94:11 159:7 174:18,23 178:4

mention 120:5 137:3,10,13,14 139:10 141:11 142:3 143:5,18 150:22 155:12 175:4.6 235:22

mentioned 76:21 78:20 94:16 114:11 120:5 129:6 135:16 146:6 170:5 219:9 242:2,3

mentions 164:16 167:19

mere 147:18,20 149:12

Merion 273:12,14 message 168:2,16 met 75:11 125:22

method 33:8,10 267:1 277:13 278:10

methods 223:9 metric 156:7,12 metrics 145:7,9,12,14,16 146:5,8

microwave 176:3

microwaving 176:12

mid 118:21

middle 189:14 239:20

Mike 136:14

miles 248:19 254:17 257:24 260:4

million 45:21 136:16 143:10,16,21 144:1,3,9 146:17 149:5 150:17 152:4 167:1 175:7 176:16,21,24 177:3,6,7 178:2 272:24

mind 54:16 130:20 183:18 241:24

minimize 123:12 Miniscule 222:4 minor 93:17 97:3 minorities 153:12

minority 146:12 155:4 247:3

minute 30:13 31:4,24 40:10 84:2 271:6

minutes 20:24 35:20 38:3,7 41:5,14, 17 42:16 44:2 107:4 120:22 121:2 185:7 193:17 194:1 232:21 233:14 251:10 260:5,17 261:3,6 262:8

mispronouncing 174:16

missed 279:16

missing 83:15 242:14

mistake 56:1,13 58:16 63:17

mistakes 112:8

misunderstanding 56:12 58:16

misunderstandings 61:15

mix 21:1

mobile 113:10,12,13 114:6,13 115:2

122:7,9 123:7,10 167:2

model 134:16

modifications 133:11

modified 134:22

modify 81:2 **moind** 182:1

moment 23:5 80:1 165:5 176:6 207:2 214:18 223:17 232:12 267:7

Monday 73:18 112:21 225:18 231:19 260:15

Mondays 260:13,22

money 114:2 143:11,19 144:5 147:9

month 59:9 67:1,18 68:3,9,10,15,17, 23 69:19 105:10,14 120:23 122:21 162:19 211:8

months 53:10 63:3 68:2, 74:19 105:1,7 106:11 118:5 240:4 279:13

months' 53:17

morning 25:12 55:19 59:1 66:20 83:11 93:17,22,23 94:7 95:12,14 96:15,17,23 98:22 99:2 112:18 126:4 183:8 186:12,17 217:3 224:10,19 225:12 252:2,4,5,21

Motion 239:12

motor 89:4 99:23 123:7 221:13

move 26:13 27:12 31:3 39:24 136:13 207:20 239:5 240:22 255:7 263:17 271:14.15.18

moved 205:22

moving 52:2 119:18 191:19,22 206:11 219:10

multimedia 153:8 170:11 181:7

multiple 60:13 207:12

mutilated 82:7,10

Myers 22:13,15,23 24:13 27:7 33:20 53:13 56:22 57:8 58:21 67:11 76:16 82:17 102:3 103:18 124:20 186:17

Ν

Nadine 251:8,23 255:11 262:20

names 219:13

narrow 191:23 215:8 232:24 254:3

nature 29:1 51:24 74:14,16 77:14

79:24 97:19 106:6

Nazareth 252:15 271:14,16

necessarily 56:1



Index: needed..opportunity

needed 26:19 29:14 40:8 68:24 74:23 93:20 104:7 133:24 256:5,24 261:11, 15 262:4

needing 238:18 **negate** 122:22

neighbor 249:5

neighborhood 68:14

nervous 250:16

net 86:3 196:11 212:19

networks 178:1 **newly** 171:4

newspaper 109:10,17 122:1 154:11, 17,18 155:15,20 166:24

newspapers 154:13,14 155:16 167:2

night 24:21,23 25:4,12 26:4,11,15 38:18 47:3,6,20 50:1,3,22 79:15,17 83:5,10 85:21 93:16 94:6 95:12,13 102:8 117:23 126:6 181:16 186:12 195:22 224:10,18

no-excuse 242:10

non-tv 137:2

nondriver 256:7

nondriver's 28:5 67:1 134:18 135:23 165:1.3

nonetheless 92:12

nonvalid 236:2

normal 18:19 101:4 215:17

north 171:24

note 113:1 262:22

noted 87:1 106:3 109:7

notes 254:6.12

notice 236:11,12 255:6

noticed 205:16

notification 33:13 153:5

notified 216:22 217:2 256:11

notify 181:10 261:17

notion 27:17,19

Notwithstanding 245:22

November 54:6 118:21 122:11 123:3 149:16 150:6 240:7 256:3,17 262:14

number 39:6,8,14 41:23 48:10,14,17 49:15,21,23 57:12,23 58:12,17,19,22 66:5,7 69:14 70:23 71:11,20 72:15 75:18 81:3 87:2,3 91:1,14,21 96:22 105:1,7,15 107:6 134:19 138:15 141:13 142:5 143:7 152:13,17,19,20 156:3,21 157:22,23 158:1 163:11 172:17 187:20 188:19 195:17 204:14 206:24 207:2,4,8,21 208:16 210:10 214:20 216:3 221:2,3,11,19 222:10, 15,24 227:22,24 230:4,23 232:1 235:2,9 237:5 240:14,18 257:19 258:13,14 273:16,18 274:3

number's 210:11

numbers 24:6 65:21 68:5 70:9 107:13 121:4 153:23,24 159:4,15 162:16 213:6 228:11 231:2 237:18 240:13 248:20 273:1,21

numerous 258:1

nursing 74:13 116:19

nutshell 190:18

0

oath 55:2

object 18:13 239:4

objection 59:4,5 72:6 78:8 130:13,18 131:8 168:6 169:2,14 170:24 237:21 240:22,23 241:6,11 245:13 246:10, 16,18 263:24 265:1,11

objections 130:21 184:3 245:1 253:6,7,8,10 263:20

objectives 167:16

obstacle 277:4

obtain 28:4 29:7,13 30:1 102:18 122:16 133:4 134:24 169:12 195:6,15 256:9 260:22

obtained 222:16

obtaining 214:2,9,12,22

obvious 20:15

occasion 74:6

occasioned 200:23

occasions 74:6 76:7 235:21

occur 19:5 225:16 244:4

occurred 42:9 76:7 99:1 151:7 201:9, 11 202:7 221:20 240:18 244:16

occurring 111:1 244:4 247:6

occurs 202:11

October 53:17 54:12 105:9,10 120:23 170:19,23 171:2 212:5 240:6

offer 196:9 227:8 228:15

offered 116:1 117:19 181:14 196:18 239:11 263:20 265:19 278:5

offering 116:22 181:15 239:10

offers 115:1 116:17 129:22

office 35:13,14 36:22 80:17 104:21 108:20,24 109:4,19 111:13 134:5 138:19,23,24 161:12,13,15,23 162:17,24 193:12 200:8 237:2 238:15 252:14,15 258:17 260:12,20

official 158:6 277:16

oldest 210:13

one-on-one 129:14,16

one-stop 89:10

ongoing 183:5

online 166:23 167:24 221:14

open 57:7 108:14 112:21 113:4 249:8,12 260:21,22

opened 260:12

opening 266:1

operating 74:2

operational 51:4

Operationally 99:20

operations 117:18

operators 74:20

opinion 71:6,7,24 72:7,11 104:17 107:9,10 146:7 239:10 268:3,5 269:7, 9 272:21 275:23 276:21,22 278:2

opportunity 19:9 20:16 21:20



Index: opposed..people

112:23 170:3 195:9 212:16 221:22 266:2

opposed 101:3 105:23

opposing 19:23 20:12 253:2,5

options 214:4 215:10

orally 129:19

order 30:8 32:9 41:5 52:18 56:22 66:24 67:20 70:4,11 72:22 76:23 77:8 122:16 159:22 168:20 170:2,14 178:1 185:13 188:22 226:19 227:9 256:7 267:2 271:9,19 275:8

ordinary 159:21 228:22

organization 37:10 65:15 198:7

oriented 254:6

original 93:14 94:9,22 183:11 204:8 210:16 230:7

originally 108:18 144:4 206:6,9,10

out-of-home 167:23 outlets 175:3 177:8

outreach 74:9,12 98:21 109:8 113:7 115:4 116:1

outstanding 250:6

overcome 279:9

overflow 23:8 193:12

overnight 114:17 overrule 241:1,2

overruled 169:2.17 239:13 246:18

oversight 108:20

overtime 96:22 234:23

overview 168:1

overwhelmed 275:20

 ${\bf overwhelming} \ \ 189:7 \ 194:2 \ 240:17,$

Ρ

18

owed 58:15 60:3 64:5

P-107 223:19 **p.m.** 125:4,5

Pa 140:4 175:17

packet 237:2 262:23

pages 85:10 94:19,22 142:23 143:3 174:19 251:9 254:8

paid 59:20 60:17,18, 147:19

paper 29:6 88:23 89:13 100:23,24 101:2,18 202:2

papers 260:19

paperwork 31:12 73:11,12,19,20 74:15 88:11 89:20,24 92:13 118:10 197:5 205:4

paragraph 27:23 43:24 83:16,19,22 258:23

parents 106:6

park 114:18

parole 205:3

part 37:19 49:14 51:21 54:4 56:8,12 58:17 63:21 67:4 72:7,11 75:12 76:11 91:9 100:15 101:17 113:3 127:16,18 129:13 138:7 145:12 190:5,20,23 197:2 224:22 226:6,11 233:3 237:10 240:12 244:18 245:19 247:9

participate 238:11 274:19

participated 51:13 129:8 238:13

participation 229:1

parties 55:4

partly 191:12,13 231:3 238:20

parts 94:23

party 51:14 54:19 133:1

passed 66:2 156:18 268:7 279:14

past 26:23 50:10 56:5 107:14 121:16 151:8 193:22 254:18

path 236:14

pattern 240:8

pause 23:4

pay 30:7 52:4 55:7 112:6

paying 148:7 payment 30:1

pdf 252:18

pen 148:10

penalties 28:22 29:3 262:18

Penndot 23:1 26:16,17,21,23 27:10, 14,18,22 28:7,11,14 29:8,13,19 30:7, 14 31:3,4,5,12 32:2,4,16 33:14 34:11 35:2,10 36:4,16,22 37:2,20 38:12,20 41:15 43:10 44:18 45:21 46:20 49:5 51:22 52:8 53:2,6,8,13,15 54:18 55:6, 17 58:4,17 64:24 65:2,18,20 66:3,23 70:15 74:6,8,11,18 76:19 79:3 80:6, 10 81:17 86:6 87:23 88:2 90:4,12,23 93:11 96:2,4 99:3 101:13 103:19 104:2, 109:13 112:6,7 113:11 115:4, 18 116:1,21 118:2 120:12 126:17 133:5 135:23 156:20 157:16 161:2,7 162:16,22 163:10,18 164:16 172:9 186:18,24 187:1,6,7,10,20 188:17,23 190:6 193:16 194:23 195:6 196:1,7, 19 197:1,7 198:23 199:3,9 204:3 205:1 206:20 207:22 215:14 218:6 227:23 228:5 232:18 233:7,11 247:23,24 248:11,17,22 249:10,12,16 250:3 256:4,7,10 258:15,17,19 260:11,14,20 261:6,13,15 262:10 267:1,17,19,23,24 277:20

Penndot's 44:9 81:6 106:16 187:14 224:5 238:21

Penndots 248:7,20

Pennsylvania 20:4 27:5 28:3,6 31:7, 9 35:4 36:19 118:16,18 144:3 149:18 170:17 242:7 250:18 255:16,18 256:1 271:8 272:14

Pennsylvania-born 33:23

Pennsylvanians 146:17

people 20:5,6,7 21:3,6,7 26:16 37:8 40:22 41:9,11,23 42:21 43:15 44:10, 13,23 45:9 51:15 57:5,12,20,21 61:22 62:2,10,15,22 63:6,20 64:22 65:15 68:22,23 69:2,21 70:10 71:20 72:15 73:2 74:8,10,14,21,23 75:4,7,20 76:12 77:6 87:4 96:3,7 97:15 98:4 106:24 107:6,24 108:23 109:3,9 110:11,16 113:7,21 116:10 121:2,23 129:6 134:11,13 138:14,21 139:3 140:4 141:12 143:6,7 144:24 145:2,5 146:21 147:6,8 149:4,7,12,14 152:13, 17 153:12,24 154:1,4 156:3 161:17, 18 170:9 176:7,11,24 177:13,19,23 178:10 179:7 181:1 191:8,19 193:7,



10,16 194:13 195:12,13 197:23 198:3 199:1,2,4,5 200:4,5 202:24 212:8,10 216:3 218:8 219:12 225:9 227:4 228:10 232:1,14 235:2,11 238:18 243:15 250:6 266:16,17 270:9 273:1, 3,7,16,18 274:3, 275:12,19 276:6 277:10 279:17

people's 179:5

percent 29:2 37:13 70:4 105:8 107:6 120:24 161:9,14 214:3,10,11,15,21

perception 110:20

perfect 45:21 56:14 176:2

perform 200:4

period 26:7 113:23 127:16,19 134:9 160:10,22 176:17 177:7 279:18

periodic 193:24periods 120:6permit 271:9

permits 67:4 68:6,8,11,20 106:5

permitted 21:22

person 28:8,18,19 34:8,10 39:24 40:9 41:2 47:12 48:1,4 56:23 63:3 64:15,18 73:9,11 76:17,18 80:3,8,9 81:16 88:10 89:7,21 90:10 110:7 111:6 126:24 175:10 198:6,13,14,15, 21,22 200:15,19 201:4 213:1 218:19 219:5 232:18 236:7 242:19 249:15 251:10 271:9

personal 71:7 246:12

personally 53:13 155:3 202:16

personnel 98:3

persons 128:18 177:20 207:22 209:7 210:4 276:16

perspective 21:5 253:22

pertain 79:21

petitioner 251:9,23 253:22,23

255:10,20

Petitioners 125:12 183:19 185:15

petitioners' 24:8 42:24 67:5 77:17 81:22 82:13 84:7 137:16 139:13 140:11 141:15 142:9 150:8 184:6

203:11 209:23 213:13 215:21 219:20 223:19 244:8 263:21 264:22 265:10

Philadelphia 76:4 105:16 106:1 107:19,22 108:13 113:2 117:1 120:7, 14 121:22 161:7,11 165:18 167:4 204:23

phone 36:6 37:21,23,24 39:14 88:4 91:7 138:15,18 141:13 142:5 146:19 149:3 157:24 158:4 193:24 195:16 213:6,7 217:12 231:10,15 232:10

phones 138:22 234:10

photo 27:9 28:5 67:15,21 69:22 87:9 90:1,2 100:15 104:24 115:5 116:3 133:6,7 134:18 135:24 145:6 165:1 168:5 170:4 172:10 180:2 196:7 242:19 243:4 256:2,5 272:15 273:2,8, 15,19 277:7

photos 94:14 **phrase** 52:23

physically 211:16

PIBH 94:12,13

pick 41:18 121:15 164:3 263:2

picked 42:2,17

picture 73:14 77:12 88:23 90:4,5 91:17 92:13 101:11,14 228:2,3 247:18,21,23

pieces 222:1

Pittsburgh 106:2 165:10 167:4 254:18

place 33:5 50:15,19 61:15 74:11 91:8 93:21 130:3 131:20 156:1,10 179:21 180:4,12,13 212:19 215:5 242:15 248:2 250:4

plainly 266:9 267:3

plan 112:19 152:16 153:22 154:3 156:1 273:19

planned 118:6 planning 20:21 plans 118:23

play 104:13 202:4 238:22

pleasure 252:21

plenty 37:8 57:3

PO 219:1

point 25:5 35:21 36:20 47:11 48:12 59:24 62:18 64:6 75:21 80:3 87:17 89:23 90:3,6,12 97:7 101:20 109:12 111:23 133:10 148:3 175:15 182:13 187:9,13,15,16,18 196:2 198:6 200:21 201:24 211:1 212:13,24 214:13 215:6 233:17 241:10 250:8 263:7 265:21 266:6 269:10 270:18 273:6 274:5 275:1

pointed 276:3

points 45:11 198:1 226:3 249:20

policies 159:17

policy 132:5,7,11 134:5 237:2 238:15

polling 145:12,14 179:21 180:3,12,13 242:14

polls 154:21

popcorn 176:3, 177:12 274:13

popped 134:7 population 154:15

populations 154:23 155:4 156:5 178:2

portion 210:23

position 49:12 81:18 179:3 270:1

positive 201:21 228:5

possess 258:9 **possess** 29:12

possibility 27:21 88:18 222:6 279:23,24

possibly 73:4 74:17

post 162:17,24 222:22

postcard 150:17,20 151:23 152:4 153:17 165:15

postcards 155:22 167:1

posted 224:15

postmarked 212:4

posture 18:22

potential 63:16



potentially 57:21 92:1

pre-hava 235:16

preceding 186:8

precinct 180:1,14,15

precisely 107:21

precision 214:20

predict 18:3

prediction 237:24 238:23 239:6

275:22,24 276:11

predictions 237:7,10 238:17 239:8

275:22

predominantly 246:23

preface 55:23

prefer 34:20 103:9

preference 103:6

prefers 185:5

premarked 24:3

prepared 85:4 220:20 240:24

prescreening 116:2,6,17,23 117:20

prescribed 53:11

presence 105:23 161:17

present 18:7 227:22 257:2,17,22

271:20

presented 45:3 187:6 204:2 222:12

preserve 255:3

press 134:5 157:16

presume 211:24

presumption 200:12,15,18,22

pretend 267:7

pretty 29:21 30:4 57:23 98:18 128:9

201:18 223:8 240:12

previous 70:17 94:12 160:8

previously 65:8 241:7

primarily 105:15 116:18 119:12,19

200:5 215:2

primary 86:2 119:11

principal 62:2

principally 216:6

print 61:2 136:20 167:21

printed 222:15

printout 260:6,13

prior 169:12 170:4

probation 205:3

probing 110:24

problem 48:15 112:14 113:7 192:12 218:5 255:4 266:14 274:4 277:3,6,8

278:7.8

problems 20:5,6, 192:8,10 230:23

procedure 31:8,11,20,24 32:3 34:6 65:4 79:2,5 253:16 255:6 267:18,19

268:22 270:12.13

procedures 26:8 74:2 78:22 95:17

126:5,10,14,20 127:8 225:10 250:4

267:18 270:11

proceed 239:16 251:11

proceedings 210:23

process 20:9 26:20 27:4 28:13 34:4 35:20 37:1,4,12,19 38:2,16 40:5,14 45:15 47:19 49:9 50:2,11,16,23 51:7

59:22,24 62:18 67:4 74:17 78:21 79:2,10 80:14 84:15,16 85:2 86:5,20

87:6,8,15 88:9,17 91:9,23 92:20,22 93:24 96:10 98:6 99:23 100:8,15

101:10,17 105:21 115:23 116:12

118:10,15,19,24 119:4,5,10,12

127:11 128:23,24 129:9,21 130:6,11

131:21 133:22 134:23 135:7,9,21 158:8 161:22 163:9,16 187:9 189:21

190:2,6,10 194:16 195:9 196:24 199:23 207:6 212:16,18 214:5 215:3,

5,13,17 218:3,12 219:6,16,24 220:7,

14,16,17 221:7 224:20,23 225:5,13

228:7 230:24 231:1,5,8,11,13,14,16,

24 232:9,22 236:19, 252:20 261:16 274:19

process-wise 37:9

processed 73:12 89:2

processes 47:23 50:15 101:14

proclivity 229:11

produce 87:9 92:16

produced 203:16

product 32:24 45:5 55:3,8 82:9 86:3,

4,22 98:15 108:10 114:14 122:20

147:4,6 233:19,21

products 104:2,5,9,12 106:15 114:24

professional 104:17

professionals 147:1 149:20 218:17

program 41:21 46:4 51:5 74:19,20

75:2 76:21,24 77:2,7,15 79:13 80:4

81:3,4,13 86:19 93:12,15,16 97:8

100:6,17 101:21 157:9 158:15 186:11

195:19,20,21 198:10 217:19,23

224:18 236:5 249:4

programmatic 199:24 207:18

programmatically 219:10

programs 75:8 104:1,5,9,12 175:6

progress 166:22 229:18 231:7

project 198:2

projecting 23:6,8

projects 166:20

promise 108:9

prompt 38:13

proof 201:21 228:5 257:21 258:2,22

261:9

proofs 47:21 48:4,6 84:3 85:19 134:20 135:6,21 163:12,13 256:6

257:3,17 258:6,11

proper 161:20

proportion 235:5

proposal 85:2,3 219:24 220:13,15

244:19

proposals 245:20

proposed 23:17

proposition 272:7

protections 276:8

proud 148:16 155:9

prove 272:1,10 274:1

proven 269:18

provide 102:18 158:5 164:22 188:17



Index: provided..recall

196:8 242:23 243:1,4 258:11

provided 65:22 102:7 104:4 146:1 166:4, 187:20 195:17 201:13 224:4 229:14

providing 163:12

provisional 113:3 179:13,14,16 180:5,12,16

PS 262:18

public 136:5,6,8 158:5

publicity 170:7

purchasing 165:19

purge 273:10

purged 235:17 273:13

purposes 26:20 28:4 52:12 63:23 111:11 116:2 137:6 161:11,14 163:15 164:4 258:10

pursue 219:16

push 244:4

pushing 69:23,24

put 19:16 21:11 41:16 42:13,21 44:1, 23 49:17 50:15,19 59:18 73:13 78:3, 19 93:14 95:2,4 98:10 139:6 156:9 163:22,23 214:16 226:18 237:2 238:15 247:11 253:21 277:24

Putnam 18:8 21:20 130:12,17 132:16 157:8 159:2,5 160:2,17 162:6,8 165:5,6,22,24 166:14,17 167:6,10 168:7,18 169:5,7,9,17,24 171:9 182:4,7 184:18 265:22

puts 105:24

putting 55:15 147:24 156:11 252:9 276:16

Q

qualifications 255:16

qualified 49:5 190:15 200:19 222:22

qualify 58:10 64:6,8 243:2

quantify 75:16

quarter 99:2 124:23

question 21:18 24:22 26:9 37:7

40:24 46:3 49:1 51:11 52:6 58:1 71:10 72:5 73:22 75:14 78:4,5,9 80:2, 13 85:14,17,22,24 86:16 90:22 92:18, 20 96:6 100:2 102:15 103:4 107:18 108:21 110:11,12 111:15 112:1,3 121:11 123:15 126:12 130:15,16 131:7,12,19 149:22 152:12 153:10,21 168:19 169:8,15, 176:19 177:12 178:5,7,20 180:18 181:21 188:22 198:18 202:8 210:9,19 239:23 245:6 247:14,17 257:19 259:4 272:2,16,23 274:15

questioning 130:22 132:18 186:6 240:24 241:12

questions 26:5,10 83:13 87:24 90:20 98:17,21 99:22 102:2,9,23 103:7 104:23 108:24 110:17,24 112:16 113:6 118:9 119:3,21 122:7 123:24 124:2 152:11 155:8 157:3 164:5 168:22,23 182:2 186:8,21 189:24 190:19 224:24 225:19 236:17,18 240:19 241:23 243:15,16 261:8 266:5 274:10

queue 232:10

queuing 121:12

quick 38:8 78:7 249:19

quickly 46:1 173:6 232:4,22 252:23, 24

quote 258:21 259:14,15 261:16

quote/unquote 113:22

R

R-1 159:3 184:17

R-10 233:24

R-2 160:4

R-3 160:13,18,24 172:4

R-4 162:6

R-5 174:7,11

R-6 166:14

R-7 165:22 166:3 172:24 174:3

R-8 227:8

R-9 228:15

radio 136:20 139:7,18,22 140:1 143:15 153:5 154:7,9 165:11 166:2,7, 23 167:22,23 173:16 243:21 246:22 247:2

raise 97:6 209:16 244:24

raised 26:24 30:18 239:15 256:5 272:16,22

raised-seal 34:8 35:3

ramping 247:6

ran 99:3

range 66:11

rate 222:4,5

rates 146:2

reach 98:16 146:12,17 147:7,8 150:1 153:2 168:21,24 169:11 175:17 176:21 211:1

reached 175:10

reaching 146:6 147:16 149:21 155:5 174:2,6 175:2

reacted 34:4

read 20:14 54:10 71:23 72:2 78:7 98:20 122:1 184:4 214:10 251:8,23 253:2 268:3,4 269:7,9,11

reading 19:17 64:10 67:17 112:15 172:8 175:9,16 214:1 217:2 276:3,20,

ready 144:14 198:13,15,21 199:4,5 203:20

real 78:7 110:18 111:8

reality 51:8 133:19

realize 63:18

realized 90:17

reason 21:11 44:23 47:18 50:3,17 79:6 92:8,10 102:20 107:21 206:17 207:14 254:13, 264:14 266:15 269:20 271:5 272:8,9,10

reasonable 102:12,14 117:15 121:4

reasons 50:9 88:14 191:8 239:6 273:9

recall 51:20 54:23 67:1 72:11,12 78:14 94:12 98:5.9 102:24 122:7



Index: receipt..report

124:4 172:14 194:2,10,12 235:7,19 240:1,2,3,10,12 242:24 243:16,24 247:19 248:20 250:13 253:24

receipt 198:7 261:19

receive 31:17 40:13 45:21 47:17 55:18 157:24 158:15 161:24 195:13 196:19,22 198:16 205:24 211:21 217:3 219:4 262:2

received 41:13 66:1 102:5 143:24 149:5 153:7 166:9 170:6 184:8,10,11, 12,13,14 187:16 195:8 208:11, 210:20 241:3 259:2,13,21 263:4,11, 14 264:3,4,5,24 265:14,16

receives 153:4 186:23

receiving 48:16 197:6 198:22 199:2

recent 50:21 65:24 97:12 167:13 200:24 201:22

recently 75:18 125:24 200:16 201:23

recess 125:1,4 185:9,11,12

recited 176:15

recognize 228:19 263:23

recollect 193:19

recollection 65:7,10 81:7 135:20 238:4

recollections 30:14

recommendations 146:11

reconvene 125:1

record 18:1,24 19:2 30:20 31:9,14, 17,19 32:4,11, 33:15,24 35:6,17 36:3, 19 37:1 79:3 130:12 151:17 183:12 188:2 198:20 202:1,2 204:13 221:9 236:6 239:8 251:17 256:13 264:9,10, 12 276:10 278:16

records 35:16 36:18 38:9 41:12 55:19 58:3 235:21 236:1,2

RECROSS 249:24

RECROSS-EXAMINATION 249:22

rectified 217:14

Red 136:24 137:1 138:4 139:8,19 140:20 141:21 147:15 165:8.9 166:19

REDIRECT 120:2 241:18

reduce 34:5 232:1

reexamination 119:24 171:12

refer 87:16 91:10 242:11

reference 79:1 93:7 100:5,17 114:13 142:4 161:1 162:17 180:6 192:7

referenced 120:6 138:1 172:20

referencing 175:22

referring 97:21 129:10

refers 178:3

reflect 151:17,18

reflected 27:22

reflecting 129:18

reflects 78:1

refresh 30:13

refresher 225:16

 $\pmb{\text{refund}} \ \ 55:24\ 56:19,22\ 58:9,11\ 59:2,$

21,23 60:3,8

refunded 56:20

refunds 55:21 57:11 58:3,22 59:10,

13

refuse 196:22

refused 261:14

region 105:17 106:1 120:14

regional 62:16 93:23 96:16 98:7

register 88:19,20 89:6,9 100:8 196:14 200:20 212:5 213:1,9 221:23

271:12 274:21

registered 44:21 47:1,16 87:7,14,18 89:8 90:10 100:21,22 151:9 162:19 163:20 164:2,12,17,24 165:3 168:4 170:3,15,21 171:4 173:24 174:2,6 175:2,5,19 180:1 187:23 190:15 194:21 195:13,24 196:13,14 200:3,15 201:13,21 204:4 205:11,12 206:6,8, 10 211:12 212:15 218:20 219:15 221:23 222:20,22 235:14 236:4,9 255:15 269:16,19,23 270:6 274:1 275:16

registering 195:3

registration 46:15,18 47:15 86:24 87:11 88:14,16 89:4,13,18 90:2

163:19 170:16,18 171:2,8 188:2 192:9 195:3,11 196:10,15,18,21,23 197:3,11 198:4,23 199:17 200:24 201:22 202:1,2 204:22 205:2,7 206:2, 207:24 211:3,6,7,10,15,17 212:14,17 213:5,10 218:24 219:5 235:12,13,17 258:16 270:2,4,16 273:7,11 274:20

registrations 99:23 100:12,18

regular 162:1,3 166:9

reiterate 71:17

rejected 21:8 65:1,3 162:2 203:5

208:3,8 235:3 247:15

rejections 208:3

related 119:13 207:21 238:19,20,21

relating 262:19

relationship 183:5

release 124:8 157:16

relevance 130:20

rely 168:15

remand 266:15

remarks 21:19

remedied 45:18

remember 72:13 83:16 122:2 133:10

134:8 179:1 196:13

reminded 153:16

reminding 145:2

reminds 145:5

removed 86:11

Rendell 114:7

renew 240:22

renewed 53:19

repeat 52:6

rephrase 100:1 130:16 169:7

replaced 225:3

replacement 82:6,9

reply 259:2

report 159:9,14 172:3,21 173:18,23

216:12,13



reported 44:14 128:7,24 129:11

reporter 183:4,5,6,14

reports 44:1,2,8,9 112:7 158:15,18, 19 166:11 172:13 216:14,15

represent 210:13

representation 102:11 209:13 226:20

representative 34:18 35:2,5,11,12, 18 36:5,16,21 37:20 39:22,23 40:12, 18 41:2 42:6 46:20 48:3 53:14 62:3, 20 88:3 91:1 92:11 111:16 163:11 187:9,21 188:18 194:24 196:1 210:6

representative's 111:13

representatives 34:14 38:11 41:16 42:14 56:7 62:21 95:16 97:21 99:8

represented 18:6 222:11 262:23

reputations 147:24

request 86:10 102:2,13,14 131:16 132:9 206:3 265:20

requesting 28:3 258:8

requests 130:13

require 19:6 48:8 134:19 163:13 164:2, 195:10 219:12

required 29:13 77:16 94:24 95:21 96:1 187:8

requirement 48:2 83:21 84:2 85:18 86:2,9 122:16 170:14 181:6 267:15, 16 278:8

requirements 26:22 85:20 86:18 136:7,9 161:19 164:8 259:14 278:22

requires 55:11 135:23 136:10 164:21 277:7

requiring 109:21 255:5

requisite 275:2

research 47:15 60:19 109:16 177:19 178:8,12,17 215:8 229:7 233:18 238:1,4,16,21 239:9 257:1

researched 60:6 256:23

reserve 103:1 **reside** 193:3

residence 134:21 135:6,22 163:12, 14 256:7 257:17,21 258:11 259:15 261:12

residency 84:3 85:19 257:3 258:7,22 261:10

resident 271:19

resolution 233:22

resolve 49:19 188:16 208:14 209:9, 21 229:7 230:14 253:9 273:23 274:1

resolved 91:7 170:22 194:1 208:21 210:5,14 212:24 226:14,22 227:4, 228:12 230:2

resolves 102:15

resort 26:2 27:20

respect 21:19 96:8 133:14 136:7 140:3 149:11 164:6 202:18 246:22 268:10 277:2

respond 20:16 102:13 259:3 276:20

Respondent 184:15

Respondents 18:5 159:3 203:17

respondents' 159:24 160:14 162:4 165:20 166:15 167:8 227:6 228:16 234:1 255:5 265:2,3,4,12,13,15

responds 217:9

response 55:23 91:12 163:4 168:17 259:8,10,13,18,21 267:4

responsibilities 56:3 62:8

responsibility 56:6,8 57:2 63:10 65:16 77:3 80:11 81:19,21 117:10 183:16 184:22

responsive 108:2,3

restate 169:20 229:19

restrict 73:3

result 48:15 92:19 207:11 236:5,15

retrospective 239:13

return 207:11 262:4

returned 162:16,23 171:18 172:1

reveal 132:8

review 82:20 84:13 116:9 203:21 238:19 239:9

reviewed 116:9 130:11 224:22 231:3 232:7 237:1,3,4 238:13,16 241:24

revised 220:8

rides 75:6

right-hand 24:15 83:1 84:20

rises 74:6

risk 114:21 115:1 123:14,22 148:1

rite 203:2

Riverfront 35:13 36:22

road 231:6 279:14

robocalls 136:20 153:6

robust 269:3

Rochester 260:4,12,14,18 261:4

role 81:18 104:11 233:2 238:23

roll 215:17

rolled 157:14,15 198:11 217:18,23

243:22

rolls 195:11 235:18 271:16 273:7,9,

14,17

Ronald 174:9

room 96:21 127:22 128:2,12,15,21 129:4,7

roughly 162:22 214:23 230:20 279:13

round 98:12

rounds 22:4

roundup 19:10

Royer 125:12,14,21,22 126:13 131:14 140:16 141:19 147:4 151:17 152:11 156:17 157:9 161:24 168:3 178:5 180:20 181:12

rule 22:7 268:2

rules 267:1

ruling 73:24

Ruman 174:9

run 52:20 53:5 186:20

running 107:13 119:10 137:23 142:19 149:17 246:3,13,23 247:2



Index: runs..shift

runs 138:24

rural 114:19

rush 180:3

Rutz 173:2,5 174:16,17 175:15 178:3

Rutz' 176:10

S

safekeeping 190:14

safety 26:3 86:2 196:10 212:19

sample 142:22 172:4

samples 144:17

sat 96:24 97:17 99:15

satisfied 135:20

satisfy 136:8

Saturday 75:20 189:13 190:1 193:23

248:8

Saturdays 194:11,14

save 87:24

Saylor 277:18,24 278:6

scanned 252:23

scanning 197:2

scenario 91:22

schedule 95:15 234:7.8

scheduling 255:4

school 68:12 106:7

scope 244:23 245:2,4,13 246:14

Scott 37:9 45:7 65:12,16 80:11 81:17

99:4,5

screen 23:7,12 138:10 153:18 254:1

screens 101:15

seal 27:1

sealed 256:5

seamless 82:11

seamlessness 236:19

search 187:21,22 188:7 189:16 199:24 200:2 201:17 211:1 215:3

218:14 233:15 238:19

searched 260:11

searching 191:10 193:2 202:10

235:24

seat 35:23

seated 125:8 185:14

second-to-the-last 140:5

seconds 207:10

secretary 23:1 43:16 77:24 103:22 127:2 128:8,11,20 129:7,15 130:4,9

131:17,22 132:4 158:23 159:8

182:21,23

section 154:7 175:15 262:18 267:14

269:21

sectors 154:1

secure 30:15 197:20

security 26:24 30:21 39:6,8 48:10, 13,17 90:22 91:1,14,21 114:9,12,23

116:14 122:23 123:1,11,18 134:20 163:11 187:19 204:14 206:24 207:2, 4,7,9 221:11,14,19 222:4,7,8,10,15,

24 256:6 257:19 258:13

seek 18:16 131:8

seeking 70:10

sees 101:15

send 60:8,24 61:3 65:2 87:12 89:1,15 90:3 91:18,23 92:6,13 113:19 164:1 196:21 212:7,9,12,24 218:6 233:17

252:18

sending 140:20

senior 62:22 146:13 167:18

seniors 153:12

sense 40:5 61:14 114:1 192:13 203:23 243:11 265:23 274:17 279:10

sentence 28:2 29:9

sentences 95:9

separate 18:14 101:12

separately 18:6 112:19

separation 62:4,7

September 31:21 32:1 33:9,20 34:7,

24 54:5 59:10,11,14,15 65:22 66:2 67:16 105:6,8,11 145:18 151:6 156:19, 160:23 162:7,12,15 172:9 173:2 210:17,18 220:8 227:18 240:5, 6 244:13 260:1,16 261:2 262:9,20

series 118:9 168:22

served 121:8,18

service 34:14,17 35:2,5,10,12,18 36:5,16,21 37:20 38:11 39:21,22,24 40:12,17 41:2,15 42:5,14 44:10,18,24 46:20 48:3 53:14 56:7 61:21,22 62:3, 19 69:12 89:9 90:24 95:16 97:21 99:8 106:24 107:8 120:22 163:10 187:21 188:18

serviced 121:1,2,24

services 115:18

serving 191:21

session 125:7 185:14 252:12

sessions 97:18

set 55:16 117:1 144:14 159:4 191:23 219:1,2 228:14 232:24 245:14 262:15

267:17

sets 152:17

setting 181:24

settled 271:8

Seventy 135:14

several-page 203:15

severe 248:17

Sewickley 256:1

Shannon 125:12,14,21 180:20

share 20:17 22:7

shared 56:5,7 57:1 63:10 197:18

230:13 252:2

Shared-ride 74:18,20,22 76:21,24

77:7 249:4

she'd 273:15

she'll 151:18

Shenk 37:10 43:7 65:12 81:17 99:4,5

Shenk's 80:11

shift 136:1



shifting 122:6 178:19 200:7 213:11

shock 146:24

shop 37:9

shopping 89:10

short 131:12 185:3 219:11 255:5

short-term 277:3

shorter 116:12 213:16

shortly 171:8

show 67:8 76:22 77:8,13,20,22 82:1 84:10,11 107:10 139:15 141:3,6 142:18 145:3,4,6 150:10 152:4 159:2 160:4,13 165:22 173:8 176:1 195:5 213:12 219:18 230:7 244:6 247:23 257:5 271:19 273:21 278:9

showed 76:6 82:11 140:1 155:14,17 209:2 232:6 262:23

showing 100:22 104:24 137:20 141:19 145:9 155:13 176:23 223:22

shown 24:13 105:9 172:3,24 176:15, 18 177:7 211:4 243:21,22

shows 156:7 178:1 179:24 200:16

sick 259:20

side 24:5,6 132:5 168:21 169:1 184:15 254:1 265:3,4 272:23

sign 28:19 30:11 51:15 52:10 53:22 55:2 56:18 60:7 61:2 63:19 64:1,9,19 149:13 279:17

signal 42:7

signals 44:3 193:18

signature 205:14

signed 205:16 272:5

significance 130:19

significant 71:11 75:3 87:5 95:9 107:7,15 274:3

signing 54:2 59:16 230:9

similar 101:14 133:8 141:23 143:24 155:18 160:8,11 193:4 202:17 224:6, 12 237:14,15 242:22 243:1 245:18

simple 50:4 51:15 133:8 134:12,13 135:8 164:7

simpler 27:7 58:1

simply 18:17 35:21 56:2 59:13 63:14, 17 77:13 95:20 107:3,10 133:5 135:21 149:2 211:11 247:18 269:10

Simpson 21:14

single 153:4,18 181:4 198:6 207:12 242:2

sir 22:22 133:14 149:11 229:24

sit 73:12 96:21 103:7 191:19

site 113:22 115:16 137:8 138:16 141:13 142:4 145:17,22 152:8,9 257:16 260:11,13

sites 146:2

sitting 176:7 177:13

situation 40:1 46:2 52:16 56:15 60:16 63:2 64:7 78:1,6,17,18 111:2 115:22 122:19 199:16 202:6 223:2 274:13

situations 63:11,15 75:18

size 75:9,11 151:15 153:23

slight 70:20,22 189:10 237:11

slightly 156:21 171:22 188:9 202:14

slow 68:3

slower 106:11

small 273:20,22

smaller 150:20,21

smidgen 75:12

Smith 256:22 257:5

snapshot 129:23

Social 30:21 39:6,7 48:9,13,17 90:21 91:1,14,21 116:14 134:20 163:11 187:19 204:14 206:24 207:1,4,7,9 221:11,14,19 222:4,7,8,10,15,23 256:6 257:18 258:13

soft 197:4

softer 279:21

solve 112:14

solved 279:8

someone's 78:1 79:3 199:16,17

someplace 138:14

sort 18:22 19:9 21:4 69:22 119:7 193:3 202:22 215:16 243:15 255:7 277:1

sound 49:20 109:24 208:6,16 210:9

sounds 19:12,13 49:21 66:5,16 102:12 265:3

space 155:21 192:20

Spanish 75:24 115:8,23 137:24 139:20,22 140:2 141:8 151:22 152:3, 6,10

speak 246:7

speaking 106:10 138:15 151:18 152:6 155:4

special 158:22 159:8 160:9 192:21

specific 42:20 55:9 59:11 80:8 86:13 120:18 121:10 146:15 166:1 187:22 218:24 219:1,2 234:11 235:19 242:3

specifically 38:5 42:19 54:16,21,24 61:12 73:23 75:16 77:2 80:10,23 85:8 99:19 120:18 137:5 139:12 143:18 146:11 164:16 167:17 175:4

specifics 61:11 98:9 121:3 250:14

speed 270:3

spend 19:3 144:6,9 232:16

spending 114:2 173:21 232:16,17 233:13

spent 96:22 143:11 173:8,9,15 243:19 261:22 266:4

spike 237:18 240:10,11

spirit 132:13 163:7 164:15

spoke 57:2 189:12

spot 137:9 138:2 212:18

spots 137:12,21 139:24 140:1 143:15 165:11 167:20 243:21

spreadsheet 229:8,23

spring 202:23 203:2

SSN 187:24 188:2

staff 72:24 73:8,10,16 93:17,19 94:4, 5 96:18,23 97:7 110:2,7 111:5 117:22,23 128:5 129:4 159:16 188:5



Index: staffing..support

200:6 217:2,5,7 219:12 225:14,15,18 232:10 233:4,5,12,13

staffing 41:23 159:13

stage 37:2

stages 42:1,10

stand 103:7,9 246:6 252:9 267:4

standard 74:2 98:18 221:7

standing 36:2 39:21 195:24 199:11

standpoint 37:15 40:3 41:11 48:23 49:9 50:12 51:4 64:1 74:13 75:5 76:2 80:7 91:16 93:18 95:1 104:20 106:22 107:15 113:18 114:23 117:20 118:1 119:8

stands 123:15

start 23:17,23 50:2 52:23 78:12 119:5

183:17 268:2 279:1

started 24:18 80:22 126:16 151:4,5

157:16 185:5 244:13 246:1

starting 33:5 172:17

starts 203:17

state 21:3 22:22 24:18 25:1 27:13 28:3 33:16 38:5 40:19,22 41:20,22 42:12 43:18 44:15,24 45:5 48:23 49:11,22 52:1 54:18 55:5 62:12 80:17 82:5,7,24 85:5 86:10,14 87:12,13,16 88:11 89:1,15,17 90:4,8,15,16 91:5, 10,13,19 92:8,9,11,14,21,22 101:1 108:8 117:24 118:3,13 119:8 120:16 124:5 125:20 126:5,14,23 127:1 128:7 133:5,13,16,18 134:17,24 135:4, 136:10 137:23 142:6, 143:19 144:18 149:6,8 150:3,23 151:9 152:16 153:4,7,19 154:17 155:2 159:20 161:13 163:24 166:21 170:6,9 180:20, 185:24 186:11,22 190:14 195:23 204:3,8,17 207:23 208:3,4,13, 22 209:8,21 218:7 220:3 221:12 224:13 225:9 242:2,3,10 243:20 247:9 250:11 256:20 257:9 258:16 269:24

State's 45:8 126:22 187:15

stated 26:19 34:3 77:1 95:18 106:21 258:5

200.0

statement 68:18 70:22 121:5 172:13 259:17 261:13

statements 122:5

states 105:23 174:5 237:1,13,17 238:12 240:4,9,17 241:23 250:14 273:4 275:21

statewide 161:10 163:21

static 165:13 240:12

stating 52:10 **station** 173:8,16

stations 154:9,10 166:7 167:22

173:21 174:1

status 46:15,18 72:21 207:24 258:16

statute 268:7 269:22 270:7,17 278:1,

5,11

stay 103:8 205:23

staying 113:4

stays 35:21

step 124:3 182:12 251:3

steps 87:13 112:17 115:5 200:19

236:21

Steve 182:20

stick 177:23

Sticking 194:15

sticks 240:14

stifling 251:21

stipulate 132:16 149:24 168:12

263:5,14

stipulation 263:11

STNGRCPP 173:11

stolen 82:7,9

stop 28:7 29:15 34:9 188:21,24

story 122:4

straightened 92:5

straightforward 29:22 30:5 96:12

streamline 215:10

streamlined 79:2 231:9.24

streamlining 214:5

street 117:9 121:8,11,22 161:12,15, 17 188:7

stressed 56:4

stretch 69:6,10,11,14

strike 239:5,12 240:23

students 105:19 167:18

stuff 98:18 147:10

subject 55:20 102:9 124:4 136:3 153:8 163:1 170:7,10 262:18 267:5

submit 20:11.13 251:24 252:1

submitted 245:19 272:18

submitting 19:12

substantial 68:24

substantive 213:24

succeed 148:18,19,23 221:16,18

succeeding 148:20 149:1

success 273:22

successful 156:8.11

succinct 213:17 229:21

suggest 96:9, 266:20 271:1

suggested 135:5,13 255:1,6

suggestion 255:2

suggestions 132:15

suggests 107:13

summarizing 167:14

summary 19:15 166:19 173:7

summer 133:11 162:18

summertime 106:4

Sunday 255:9

super 138:9

superfluous 192:19

superimposed 138:10

supervisor 216:10 234:14 261:8

supervisors 96:16 98:8

supervisory 98:3

supply 39:2

support 70:19 71:3 132:15



suppose 248:13

supposed 26:16 27:20 40:12 41:3 52:4,5,9,13 91:7 95:16 201:5 239:7 267:24 270:5 273:14

supposedly 75:21

Supreme 19:2 20:4 73:23 125:24 126:15 127:10,19 132:13,24 133:9 134:10 146:6 163:4,7 164:21 181:13 239:15 266:7,18,21 267:5,9,12 268:3, 4,11,13 269:7,9,13,14,16,20 270:13, 15,20 271:2 272:12 275:4 276:2,21, 24 277:6 278:2,14 279:2,6,10

surprising 146:21

survey 177:21

suspect 38:6 65:14 109:9

sustain 245:13 sustained 264:1

Suzanne 256:22 257:6,8 258:5 259:1,3,7,9,12,20 261:10

Sweeney 43:16 77:23 158:22 159:7 160:9.21

switch 118:8 136:4

Switching 104:22

sworn 125:15 185:19

synopsized 220:6

system 36:8,10,12 50:4 53:15 90:11 91:15 100:23 101:5,8 114:3 121:12 171:5,7 190:9 193:24 196:5,7 201:1, 4,7 204:8 211:4 221:15 224:10 235:14 268:22 269:3,4

systematic 199:24 systems 114:15

Т

tab 202:15

table 117:2,17

tabling 155:5

tacked 189:14 220:18

tailor 268:23

takes 38:6 171:2 211:23 260:5

269:24

taking 41:7,14 42:12 112:18 117:11 247:20 248:13,14 262:12

talk 34:23 98:16,22 102:19 115:3,24 126:3 207:1 279:23

talked 110:1,2 111:9 112:4 115:20 119:14 127:6 131:21 133:17 199:8 235:11 238:5 239:6

talking 47:5 63:2 68:13 69:14,20 78:2 80:22 88:6 89:4 97:14 117:21,24 133:12 152:23 154:24 156:9 167:17 175:21 177:9 209:15 218:3 233:11

tap 181:10

target 154:23 156:6 167:17

targeted 154:8 178:2

targeting 153:11 156:6 167:22

task 218:19 234:20

taxpayers 114:1

team 109:5 147:16

technical 34:14

technically 18:4 207:6

technician 206:20 227:23 233:7,11

technological 119:8

technology 101:9 119:16 121:13

telephone 60:12 233:6

television 137:5 139:24 143:15 149:4 153:5 166:23 167:19,20 175:22,24 177:1,24 243:20 244:12

television/cable 175:14

telling 31:18 95:20 163:10

tells 147:6 173:23 174:3 175:1 176:5

temp 200:6

temporal 26:7

temporary 194:1 225:14

tension 277:2

term 218:18 219:11 224:4

terms 18:2 34:13 145:12 180:23 186:18 195:21 214:20 237:5 267:12

270:17 277:2

terrific 147:10

test 62:6 117:12

testified 22:16 45:5,19 50:10 55:15 64:21 108:5 125:15 128:17 129:3 136:16 166:1 185:19 253:24 255:21 275:12

testify 21:5 55:11 237:23 255:14

testifying 58:2,7 76:16,20

testimony 28:24 56:5 67:2 70:24 77:2 78:21 94:12 109:11 126:4,9 136:2 164:11 165:7 179:1,6,19 186:10,16 237:22 241:24 254:6 255:4 266:9 270:2 272:17 274:10

text 214:1

theory 41:1 279:12

thing 27:9 28:8,10,18 29:5,6 46:13 48:8 71:16 79:1 83:15,24 94:6 96:17 110:15 146:3 190:11 258:7 266:21 267:20 274:18 275:14

things 19:13 21:8 30:24 39:1 40:11 41:23 46:6 72:3 74:14,16 78:20,22 79:24 92:1,19 96:5 100:9 105:20 106:6 109:10 114:19 135:5 136:19 202:15 217:23 232:8 236:19 238:22 270:5 273:24 274:2 278:18

thinking 212:22

thought 51:3,6 254:10 260:19 265:23

thoughts 22:7

thousand 156:24 172:20 240:15

thousands 71:4

threads 231:4

Thursday 18:2 19:5 20:7,22 21:13 22:2 107:23 113:2 225:17 252:4,5,9, 21 253:9 263:8 276:17

ticket 121:17

Tier 187:17,18 188:5,16 189:20,22 190:24 191:2,11,14 192:3,8,18,22 194:14,18 201:17 215:3,12 231:8,11, 13,16 232:9,16,21 233:8,10 234:8

tight 270:14

time 18:17,24 19:4,8 20:3 21:10 33:22 35:21 45:17 62:18,23 65:3 71:17 78:23 87:17 99:8,14 102:2,10,



23 104:1,6 106:8 107:1 113:12,23 121:1,17,18 124:1,11 127:16,19 129:23 143:15,16 144:18 157:4 158:9 176:2,23 185:6 191:13 192:4,5 193:23 194:9 203:16 211:20 214:13, 18 215:6 217:12 223:15 225:20 232:16,17,20 233:14 238:5 240:19 246:24 248:9 250:4 254:11,23,24 260:1 263:9,12 266:4 271:21 272:6 273:10 275:18 276:12,19 278:16 279:1,3,18

timeline 34:5 245:20.21

times 56:11 57:6 107:17,20 110:16 120:18,19 134:7 145:17 158:7 231:21 234:11

title 34:10,15

today 19:4,8,9 20:19,20 21:21 22:1 53:12,20 54:5,6,8,11 79:6 102:21 109:2 118:16,17 127:20 184:24 194:19 225:7 251:6 265:19 266:4,9 270:21.22 272:18 274:10 275:13

toining 182:1

told 36:2 48:5 144:16 153:18 161:7 234:20 253:6 260:21 261:10,15 268:17 275:6

toll 143:7

tomorrow 20:8 204:9 252:2,7,12 279:1

tomorrow's 253:15

tonight 117:24 253:6

tools 191:10 192:5 193:1

top 27:24 69:17 83:16 173:12

topic 52:2 71:18 118:8 136:4 207:21

232:8

topics 122:6 136:1 178:19 213:11

total 58:12,22 67:21 71:1 122:4

172:19,21,22

touch 124:7 253:18

town 242:16 271:13

Township 273:12

track 159:22 183:17 217:5 229:12,17

tracked 229:8

tracking 229:5,10

tracks 244:15

traditional 223:9 276:19

traffic 145:22 193:13

train 95:19 96:13 97:7 104:13 224:8

trained 35:15 61:24 62:8 95:16 96:8 98:3 104:8 200:7 225:18 233:4.5

training 79:24 93:7,9,11,13,15 94:9, 23 96:9,21 97:10,11,18 98:2,11,19,21 104:4,20 108:21 224:3,5,14,17,21 225:3,8,11,12,13,16 226:12 265:8

transaction 40:4 59:14

transactions 113:20 114:3

transcribed 277:17

transcript 254:8 255:22 277:16

transfer 205:22 217:11

transferred 188:4,15 233:9

transferring 231:15

transformed 157:23

transit 140:9.21. 141:24 248:3.13

translate 115:5

translated 115:9,14

translation 115:15,18

transmit 100:12

transmitted 99:24

transmitting 100:18

transportation 28:6 108:9 165:14

167:1 270:11,13

transposed 189:20

travel 254:16 255:5

treat 266:1

treated 221:21

tremendous 40:7

trial 45:20 55:21 68:7 70:17 94:13

254:8 255:22 256:14

trials 183:14

trip 164:3 250:5 260:8 261:3

trips 258:1 259:5 262:12

trouble 229:9

true 53:2 169:18 218:23 243:18 249:13 262:16 275:24 276:8

trust 147:1

truth 28:23 273:4

Tuesday 19:18 215:4 261:2

turn 33:19 38:16 59:3 79:14 221:1

turned 47:19 49:5,18 87:4 190:13 232:1,14

Turner 182:20,24

turning 73:7

turnout 144:20

turns 277:11

TV 136:20,23 137:9,12,21 165:11 167:23 175:20 177:4 243:24 244:2, 12,16 246:1

tweaks 85:11

tweet 112:12

Twitter 112:10.15

type 81:19 109:13 192:23 239:13

types 21:7 116:20 258:22

typical 137:21 139:18,21

typically 39:20 148:9 159:15

typo 192:14

U

U.S. 105:24 255:17

ultimately 19:3 126:23 127:2 129:11 169:3 174:18 175:10 222:18 226:22

unable 21:2 28:4,11 29:7 46:15 188:1 192:3 194:17 199:10 204:4 206:21 256:9 259:21 260:22 272:8

unconstitutional 272:14

undeliverable 162:23

underage 175:11

understand 44:8 59:12 61:17 69:13 72:2 85:6 87:21 88:1 92:7 99:6,



106:20 110:3 127:15 129:2 130:19,22 131:3,19 155:7 164:10 169:5 176:18, 19 178:7 179:6 182:20 187:4,8 191:7 197:1 209:20 234:19 241:12 245:24 261:7 278:15

understanding 36:14,15 53:3 144:21 163:2 208:1,11

understands 266:8

understood 26:12 37:18 66:23 69:7 74:21 131:6,11 253:16

undertook 236:20

underutilized 122:12

undisputed 279:5

unique 145:19 202:5

unit 113:12,13 114:5,6,13,22 115:2 122:7,9,23

United 105:23

units 113:10 123:7,10

universities 105:18

university 154:17

unlike 183:14

unmanageable 240:11

unredacted 204:17

unresolved 226:14 227:13

unsworn 28:24 262:19

unusual 18:22 252:18

up-to-date 93:24

update 94:5,8,10,17,19 159:7 160:20

162:12,14 167:13

updated 79:23 93:15 94:23 97:11 98:20 102:4 119:20 159:16 224:23

225:1,12

updates 158:21

uploaded 230:12

UPS 196:20 197:8,10

useable 64:11

utility 257:17 258:12

utilize 82:5 121:12

utilizing 175:16 utmost 110:13

٧

vague 257:23 258:24

vaguely 134:8

valid 52:18 53:3 205:13,18,20 206:12

236:1,13

validate 258:15

validating 27:4

varying 129:21

vast 175:18

Vehicle 221:13

Vehicles 123:7

vendor 165:10,19

vendors 155:3

verification 27:1 35:24 45:1 48:24 49:10 91:9 92:20 95:21 187:24 188:19 221:14,17,19 222:24 223:1

259:14 261:12

verified 36:3 45:10 88:15 190:23

203:18 204:1 229:14

verifies 221:12

verify 32:21,24 35:16 37:1 38:9 44:20 46:15,24 79:3 87:7 88:8 90:23 91:14, 21 164:11 186:24 187:23 190:24 195:23 201:24 206:21 207:3,24 209:3 212:15 213:8 218:19 233:8 235:13

verifying 86:24 95:7 121:9 261:19

version 83:7,9 135:22 137:24 139:20 140:2 150:16 151:22 152:3,10 220:5,

versions 141:8

video 253:24 255:1 277:16

videotape 255:21

Vietnamese 154:12

view 19:3, 187:15 202:14,17 275:7

viewers 145:20 146:2 177:7

violating 54:1

violation 29:4

virtually 147:11

visit 74:15 140:7

visits 32:8

volume 106:12,14 107:2 108:16

217:13

volunteer 195:5

vote 26:15 50:5 51:17 54:4,5,6,7 61:17 71:21 72:16,23 88:20 89:6 100:8 112:24 122:16 133:8 134:14,15 137:6 140:4 141:3 144:15 145:2,3,4, 5, 150:6 154:4 163:20 164:9,24 165:3 178:24 179:5,7,9,11,12,14,16,23 180:5,11,16 181:1 187:24 190:16 195:3 201:14 205:11 206:8 211:12 212:5 221:23,24 222:20,23 236:8,13, 14 242:7,12,16,20 243:5,12 255:15 256:3,8,15 262:12,14 271:6,9,21 272:4,8,9 273:2,14,19 276:7 277:8

vote-by-mail 242:9

voted 273:16

voter 26:14 27:8,22 28:19 31:5,12,14, 15,17 32:15 33:10,23 34:7,22 35:1,2 36:18 38:20 39:1,18,20 40:14 41:4 47:1,18 48:9,16,17 50:4 52:7,17 53:12,23 57:17 60:10,15,16,18,21 61:4,16 62:14 63:12,14 64:15,24 85:2 87:7,11 88:8,16 89:4,13 90:12,15,23 92:15 99:23 100:12 104:14 115:9 118:14 133:3,23 134:3,4 136:11 143:19 144:10,20 149:6 151:9 153:4 154:19 157:24 158:1,7,13 159:9,19 160:20 161:8,18 162:11,21 163:9,14, 19 164:3,12 168:2 170:11,21 171:7 175:11 179:9,24 180:16 187:1,6 188:2,18 189:1,4 190:7,23 191:9 193:10 194:17 195:3,11,23,24 196:2, 8,9,15,18,20,23 197:3,11 198:1 199:10 200:7 201:22 202:1 204:4,15, 22 205:2,7 206:2,16,23 207:24 211:5, 7,10,17 212:14,17 218:23 219:5,24 220:14 221:4, 223:5,7,11 230:4 235:12,17,20 236:9,11 242:7 248:16 256:20 258:15,17,18,19 261:23 262:6 274:9,15

voter's 30:20 46:15,17

voters 21:1 44:21 49:4,18 51:15 58:3 106:17 115:19 116:22 117:1,17



122:16 134:23 137:7 138:11 146:12, 13,14 147:16 149:21 150:1,5 153:2, 11 154:20 161:22 162:1,15,20 163:22,23 164:1, 167:17,18 168:4 171:5 173:24 174:3,6 175:2,5,19 180:14 181:8,10 193:3 258:8

votespa 138:15,18 145:17

votespa.com 138:12 141:13 143:7 152:9

votespa.com. 140:7

voting 26:19 27:9 28:4 52:8,11,18 53:3,18 55:17 61:23 62:20,24 63:23 64:11,17,18 66:3 96:5 99:17 111:11 116:3 133:4,7 137:6 153:15,18 161:11,14 163:15 164:4 181:5 255:17 258:10

vulnerable 72:9 154:1

W

wait 42:16 54:6,11 107:17,20 111:24 120:19 121:8, 193:23 200:11 261:21

waited 41:17

waiting 42:18 200:16 261:5

waits 120:10

WALCZAK 20:1,17 93:2 251:19,22 252:5,13,17 253:3,5,14,23 254:7,15 255:8 264:13,17

walk 28:16 88:19 107:11 163:18 203:4

walks 190:12

wanted 26:15 27:8 28:9 40:2 75:24 111:3,10 134:22 153:13 219:17 260:9 265:6 266:2,6 268:1,9

Washington 273:12

watch 176:24 177:23 178:10

watching 175:24 176:1,8,17,22 177:8.14.20

watered-down 135:22

wave 106:17 151:7

waves 151:5

ways 50:24 60:5,13 133:21 159:18

168:1 234:18

web 57:4 61:1 115:16 137:7 138:16 141:13 142:4 145:22 146:2 152:8,9 153:6 165:12 257:16 260:11,13

Webinar 97:16 98:7

WECK 165:12

weeds 207:6

week 51:12,19 66:5,8,16 75:18 80:21 109:18 115:21 138:22 158:1, 163:4 171:5 193:20 194:12 198:13,22 215:4 230:15,20 231:8 235:10 244:13 249:8,9,13

weekend 259:24

weekly 158:21 159:9,15

weeks 156:16 157:12 167:5 193:21 194:4,8 196:16 244:3 247:7 254:23 259:22

well-prepared 57:6

wheeled 73:13

wheels 167:4

wildly 250:17

window 34:9,11 62:23 113:3

withdrawn 27:18 31:2 52:17 90:22 93:10 145:8 173:9 176:20 189:23 194:16 199:14 200:12 210:20 216:16

witnesses 20:22 124:14,22 186:9

Wolpert 216:3,8

woman 73:7 254:2

Women 116:22,24 117:16

wondered 241:10

wonderful 73:6

wonders 196:15

word 170:8 181:5 220:18 226:24 229:16 241:5 270:22

words 54:22 70:19 72:13 89:7 169:16 279:21

work 19:10 23:14 45:6,8 64:13 71:20 72:14,18 73:16,21 78:23 87:8 92:4 111:21 117:2,18,19 146:23 147:21 150:5 152:13 195:19,20 200:24 205:17 218:4 219:6 223:10 234:16 248:6,9 260:17 275:1 277:13,14

worked 25:7 45:13,16 50:18 123:13, 16,19 144:2 195:21 261:6 274:24

worker 180:13

working 49:10 73:17 96:16 108:5 144:17 146:20 234:23 261:22

works 43:10 53:8 86:20 104:19 179:20 180:13

worksheet 206:18

world 147:5

worry 35:5 269:17

wrestling 148:11

writes 101:20

writing 24:15 43:23

written 101:23 152:15,16 153:22

206:20 264:11

wrong 43:3 82:12 90:18 128:20 242:24 243:3

wrote 111:4

Υ

yawn 93:3 251:21

yawning 92:24 93:1

year 24:19 45:22 55:8 100:7 153:9 211:20

years 103:18,20,21 104:18 105:2 110:9 144:5,6,7 236:4,13 240:16 272:11 273:16

yeoman's 73:16

yesterday 25:7,8,21 26:6 84:23 118:11 131:2 163:3 220:11 255:9 262:24

York 181:24

young 153:12

