## **Transcript of Proceedings**

Date: July 23, 2013

Case: APPLEWHITE, et al. vs. COMMONWEALTH OF PA, et al.



Phone:302.464.0880

Fax:302.261.7396

Email:Office@Miller-Verbano.com

```
1
          IN THE COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA
 2
 3
     VIVIETTE APPLEWHITE; WILOLA
     SHINHOLSTER LEE; GROVER FREELAND;
 4
     GLORIA CUTTINO; NADINE MARSH;
                                                    TRANSCRIPT
     DOROTHY BARKSDALE; BEA BOOKLER;
 5
     JOYCE BLOCK; HENRIETTA KAY
     DICKERSON; DEVRA MIREL ("ASHER")
     SCHOR; THE LEAGUE OF WOMEN VOTERS
     OF PENNSYLVANIA; NATIONAL
 7
     ASSOCIATION FOR THE ADVANCEMENT
     OF COLORED PEOPLE, PENNSYLVANIA
     STATE CONFERENCE; HOMELESS
 8
     ADVOCACY PROJECT,
 9
                                         : C.A. No.
          Petitioners,
10
                                        : 330 M.D. 2012
               vs.
11
     THE COMMONWEALTH OF
     PENNSYLVANIA; THOMAS W. CORBETT,
12
     in his capacity as Governor;
     CAROLE AICHELE, in her capacity
13
     as Secretary of the Commonwealth,
14
          Respondents.
15
16
17
18
                       TRIAL DAY SEVEN
19
               Honorable Bernard L. McGinley
20
                   Harrisburg, Pennsylvania
                    Tuesday, July 23, 2013
21
                           9:15 a.m.
22
23
     REPORTED BY:
2.4
     Gail L. Inghram Verbano, CSR, RDR, CRR
25
```



```
APPEARANCES
 1
     On behalf of Petitioners:
 2
           ARNOLD & PORTER, LLP:
 3
                    Michael A. Rubin, Esquire
                    David P. Gersch, Esquire
                    Dana Peterson, Esquire
 4
                    R. Stanton Jones, Esquire
 5
           ADVANCEMENT PROJECT:
 6
                    Marian K. Schneider, Esquire
           PUBLIC INTEREST LAW CENTER OF PHILADELPHIA:
                    Jennifer R. Clarke, Esquire
 7
           ACLU OF PENNSYLVANIA:
 8
                    Witold Walczak, Esquire
 9
     On behalf of Respondents:
10
           PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE OF ATTORNEY GENERAL
11
                    Timothy Paul Keating Esquire
12
                    Kevin P. Schmidt, Esquire
13
           DRINKER BIDDLE & REATH, LLP
14
                    D. Alicia Hickok, Esquire
                    Todd N. Hutchison, Esquire
15
                    Ronald P. DeJesus, Esquire
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

1	CONTENTS	Page 1159 Page 1159
		DAGE
2	WITNESS:	PAGE
3	LaVERNE COLLINS	
4	By Ms. Peterson (Direct)	1160
5	By Mr. Keating (Cross)	1168
6	By Ms. Peterson (Recross)	1173
7	SUSAN CARTY	
8	By Ms. Schneider (Direct)	1175
9	By Mr. Schmidt (Cross)	1198
10	By Ms. Schneider (Direct)	1217
11	By Mr. Schmidt (Recross)	1224
12		
13		
14	EXHIBITS	
15	Petitioners' Exhibit 1430 admitted	1175
16	Petitioner's Exhibit 1750 admitted	1197
17	Petitioners' Exhibit 2100 admitted	1227
18	Petitioners' Exhibit 1427 admitted	1228
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		



```
Harrisburg, Pennsylvania
 1
 2
              Tuesday, July 23, 2012; 9:15 a.m.
 3
                 THE CLERK: All rise. Commonwealth
 4
     Court is now in session, Judge McGinley presiding.
 5
                 THE COURT: Please be seated. Are we
 6
 7
     ready to proceed? We have two appearances filed?
 8
                 MS. PETERSON: Yes, Your Honor. Good
 9
     morning. Dana Peterson of Arnold & Porter on
     behalf of the Petitioners. And Petitioners first
10
     call LaVerne Collins.
11
12
13
                 LaVerne Collins, having first been duly
     sworn according to law, was examined and testified
14
     as follows:
15
16
                 THE CLERK: Please be seated.
17
18
19
                      DIRECT EXAMINATION
20
     BY MS. PETERSON:
21
22
               Good morning.
             Q
23
             A Good morning.
24
             Q Please state your name.
25
             A LaVerne Collins.
```



Page 1161 And you are the director of the Bureau 1 0 2 of Public Transportation at PennDOT? Α Yes. And you've held that position for six 4 0 5 years? Yes. 6 Α And you've worked at PennDOT for over 0 30 years? 8 9 Α Yes. And as director, you have 10 0 responsibilities related to the public 11 12 transportation programs in Pennsylvania? 13 Α Yes. And that would include the Shared-Ride 14 Service and the Shared-Ride Program? 15 16 Α Yes. And so there's both Shared-Ride Service 17 18 and a Shared-Ride Program; is that right? 19 Α Yes. 20 So the Shared-Ride Service, that's a 21 door-to-door transportation service that's open to 22 the general public? 23 Α Yes. 24 So this service would be the actual 0



25

transportation, so the van that takes someone from

- 1 Point A to Point B?
- 2 A Yes.
- 3 Q And then the program that -- the
- 4 Shared-Ride Program offers discounts for certain
- 5 individuals who want to use the service?
- 6 A Yes.
- 7 Q So the Shared-Ride Program is a way by
- 8 which a subset of riders can get a discount for the
- 9 service?
- 10 A Yes; a discount on the fare.
- 11 Q So I want to start with the Shared-Ride
- 12 Service. So you're familiar with the Shared-Ride
- 13 Service through your position as director?
- 14 A Yes.
- 15 O And the Shared-Ride Service, that's run
- 16 locally by each local transportation provider?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q And the local transportation provider,
- 19 they give the rides and oversee the service?
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 Q So, for example, in Pittsburgh, the
- 22 Port Authority of Allegheny County, they would be
- 23 the ones who oversee the service in that area and
- 24 give the rides?
- 25 A Yes.



- 1 Q Now, each Shared-Ride provider
- 2 establishes their own hours of operation for the
- 3 Shared-Ride Service; is that right?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q And each provider establishes the days
- of the week in which they operate the service?
- 7 A Yes.
- 8 Q And some providers may not operate the
- 9 service every day of the week?
- 10 A That's true.
- 11 Q And each provider has a geographic
- 12 service area in which they provide the Shared-Ride
- 13 Service; is that also right?
- 14 A Yes.
- 15 Q And the provider may not always travel
- 16 to a location that's outside that specific
- 17 geographic area?
- 18 A That's true, yes.
- 19 O So the Shared-Ride Service, that's open
- 20 to the general public?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q So anyone in Pennsylvania can use the
- 23 Shared-Ride service?
- A As long as they're willing to pay the
- 25 fare; yes.



- 1 Q And to use the service, the individual
- 2 must make a reservation at least a day in advance?
- 3 A Yes.
- 4 O And you mentioned about the fare. So
- 5 the providers, they charge a fare to use the
- 6 service; is that right?
- 7 A Yes. There's a fare for every trip.
- 8 Q Okay. For every trip. And that fare
- 9 varies by locality?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q And that fare is typically paid by the
- 12 rider?
- 13 A Unless there's a sponsoring agency.
- 14 Q So in some instances, there may be
- 15 someone else who pays the fare for the rider?
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 O Now, the Shared-Ride service, the
- 18 drivers, the individual drivers, they're not
- 19 permitted to physically assist riders in and out of
- 20 the vehicle; is that right?
- 21 A It varies by transit system. It varies
- 22 by locale. For people who are using a wheelchair,
- 23 the driver has to deploy a lift, and there is some
- 24 assistance there, yes.
- 25 O But some counties may not permit this



- 1 assistance?
- 2 A That's possible.
- 3 O And now I want to turn to the
- 4 Shared-Ride discount program.
- 5 So PennDOT oversees the Shared-Ride
- 6 Program; is that right?
- 7 A Yes.
- 8 Q And you worked on matters related to
- 9 the Shared-Ride Program since about 1980?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q And the program offers discounts to
- 12 individuals who are 65 years and older and want to
- 13 use the Shared-Ride Service?
- 14 A Yes.
- 15 Q The individual must first register to
- 16 use the discount program; is that right?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q And to register, the individual would
- 19 fill out an application form?
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 Q And they would submit that application
- 22 form to the local provider?
- 23 A Yes.
- 24 Q And some providers allow the
- 25 individuals to mail in an application; is that



- 1 right?
- 2 A Yes; some do.
- 3 Q And others require the individual to
- 4 fill out the application in person at an office?
- 5 A Yes.
- 6 Q And that would be the provider's
- 7 office?
- 8 A Yes, unless -- in the case of
- 9 Philadelphia and Pittsburgh, there are also
- 10 legislative offices where they can fill out an
- 11 application form.
- 12 Q And now, the individual needs
- 13 proof-of-age documentation to register for the
- 14 program; is that right?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q And so after the person is registered
- 17 and if they want to use the program, they call and
- 18 schedule a ride at least one day in advance?
- 19 A Yes.
- 20 Q And there's also a separate
- 21 reduced-fare program for persons with disabilities;
- 22 is that right?
- 23 A Yes.
- 24 O And that's called the Persons with
- 25 Disabilities Transportation Program?



- 1 A The Reduced-Fare Program for Persons
- 2 with Disabilities.
- 3 Q Thank you.
- 4 And this program allows persons with
- 5 disabilities to use the Shared-Ride Service at a
- 6 discount?
- 7 A An 85 percent discount, yes.
- 8 Q And the program defines disabilities
- 9 similar to the definition in the Americans with
- 10 Disabilities Act?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 O And the individual must also first
- 13 register before they can use that program?
- 14 A Yes.
- 15 Q And they would schedule a ride in
- 16 advance?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q And to register, the individual must
- 19 provide proof of disability, such as a statement
- 20 from a healthcare provider?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q So the Shared-Ride Program and the
- 23 Persons with Disabilities Program, they both offer
- 24 a discount on the full fare of the Shared-Ride
- 25 Service?



- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q So the balance of the fare must still
- 3 be paid to the provider for every trip?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q And that balance could be paid by the
- 6 rider?
- 7 A Could be.
- 8 Q Or it could be paid by someone else, a
- 9 program or an authorized third party?
- 10 A Yes.
- MS. PETERSON: Okay. That's all I have
- 12 for you. Thank you.
- MR. KEATING: Your Honor, if I may?
- 14 THE COURT: Sure.
- 15 - -
- 16 CROSS EXAMINATION
- 17 - -
- 18 BY MR. KEATING:
- 19 Q LaVerne -- do you mind if I call you
- 20 LaVerne?
- 21 A Feel free.
- Q Okay. I just have a couple follow-up
- 23 questions to clarify things.
- 24 First of all, relative to the transit
- 25 authorities, PennDOT doesn't own the buses or any



- 1 of those things, do they?
- 2 A We do not.
- 3 O Who owns them?
- 4 A The transit provider.
- 5 Q And are there also transportation
- 6 companies too that may own them?
- 7 A Yes, there are some private companies.
- 8 Q And PennDOT actually oversees what they
- 9 do and requires them to follow specific policies
- 10 and rules; correct?
- 11 A In order to be eligible for
- 12 reimbursement under the programs that we manage,
- 13 yes.
- 14 Q And how do people find out about the
- 15 Shared-Ride Program?
- 16 A Usually it's locally. They'll -- the
- 17 transit systems have Web sites. They do their own
- 18 advertising, whatever that is.
- 19 Q And I believe you indicated that -- on
- 20 your direct, that they had geographic areas within
- 21 their own specific transit authorities for where
- they're supposed to provide service; correct?
- 23 A Yes.
- Q Are they permitted to go outside that
- 25 geographic area?



- 1 A We don't control where they go; they
- 2 make those decisions. But yes, they can.
- 3 O And the Shared-Ride Program and the
- 4 Shared-Ride Service, that was in effect prior to
- 5 voter ID law; right?
- 6 A Yes.
- 8 A 1980. The authorizing legislation was
- 9 Act 101 of 1980, and the programs actually started
- 10 in 1981.
- 11 Q Now, relative to the voter ID act, are
- 12 the transit authorities given any instructions
- 13 relative to where they should provide services if
- 14 the customer wants to go to a PennDOT in order to
- 15 get a voter ID?
- 16 A We gave instructions to all of the
- 17 transportation providers to -- not to deny any
- 18 trip. If there was a trip that was in question, to
- 19 call us before there was any denial of service.
- 20 Q And if they called you and couldn't get
- 21 ahold of you, what are they instructed to do?
- 22 A We didn't cover that contingency, but
- there's always someone in the office, so we
- 24 expected them to be able to get in touch with us.
- 25 Q And have you ever gotten a phone call



- 1 or a request from a transit authority asking for
- 2 instructions relative to a customer asking to be
- 3 provided transportation to a PennDOT location for
- 4 the purposes of getting a voter ID?
- 5 A To the best of my knowledge, no, I
- 6 haven't.
- 7 Q And if you had, what would you have
- 8 told them?
- 9 A We would have looked into the specific
- 10 circumstances of the trip, where the ID center was
- 11 located, and we would have tried to figure out a
- 12 way to get that person to that destination.
- 13 Q To what extent, if any, are you made
- 14 aware of complaints received by customers to
- 15 PennDOT concerning the services provided by the
- 16 local area transit?
- 17 A Sometimes they rise to my level.
- 18 Normally they go first to the transit system. If
- 19 the customer doesn't get satisfaction, then they'll
- 20 come to the bureau; and occasionally I receive
- 21 those calls.
- 22 Q Have you ever been made aware of any
- 23 complaints by consumers that they were denied a
- 24 ride to a PennDOT center for the purposes of
- 25 getting voter ID?



- 1 A I have not.
- 2 Q And there was some discussion during
- 3 your direct examination concerning who pays for the
- 4 ride.
- 5 Am I correct that PennDOT will not pay
- 6 for more than 85 percent of the fare?
- 7 A That's correct.
- 8 Q But the other 15 percent can be paid by
- 9 other local agencies?
- 10 A Yes, that's correct.
- 11 Q Would that include the Area Agencies on
- 12 Aging?
- 13 A Yes.
- 14 Q AAA?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q Are they a county-level type of
- 17 authority or --
- 18 A Normally county or bi-county level.
- 19 O And other than the AAA, are there other
- 20 county agencies that will provide that -- the
- 21 difference in the fare?
- 22 A Yes. There are health -- not county
- 23 necessarily, but healthcare providers are eligible
- 24 to sponsor trips, the 15 percent.
- 25 O And just to reiterate, I think you



- 1 testified on direct, do you need a photo ID in
- 2 order to get an ID to be qualified for the
- 3 Shared-Ride Service?
- A No, you do not.
- 5 MR. KEATING: Thank you.
- 6 – –
- 7 RECROSS-EXAMINATION
- 8 - -
- 9 BY MS. PETERSON:
- 10 Q Just have a few short follow-up
- 11 questions.
- 12 You testified just now about the
- 13 directive from PennDOT for the local Shared-Ride
- 14 providers to go outside their normal service area.
- 15 Are you aware of any local advertising
- 16 of that instruction to the Shared-Ride -- that the
- 17 Shared-Ride Service or Program would go beyond the
- 18 normal service area?
- 19 A I am not aware.
- 20 Q And there's nothing to that -- in that
- 21 respect on the PennDOT Web site?
- 22 A Not that I know of.
- 23 Q And are you aware of any such
- 24 advertisement on the Department of State Web site?
- A No, I am not.



- 1 MS. PETERSON: Thank you. I have
- 2 nothing further.
- 3 MR. KEATING: We have no further
- 4 redirect -- or recross, Your Honor. Can we excuse
- 5 this witness?
- 6 THE COURT: Certainly.
- 7 MR. KEATING: Thank you.
- 8 MS. PETERSON: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 9 We're now going to play a video, and I'm going to
- 10 defer to my co-counsel, Stanton Jones.
- 11 MR. JONES: Good morning, Your Honor.
- 12 I'm Stanton Jones for the Petitioners.
- We next will present the video
- 14 deposition testimony of Patricia Norton, who is a
- 15 voter and a fact witness. And we have copies for
- 16 the Court of the transcript where we've marked in
- 17 red the Petitioners' designations and in blue the
- 18 Respondents' designations, as well as a copy of a
- 19 single exhibit and the CD.
- 20 And the video is Petitioners'
- 21 Exhibit 1430A.
- 22 (Whereupon, excerpts of the video
- 23 deposition of Patricia Norton, Petitioners' Exhibit
- 24 1430A, was played in open court.)
- MR. JONES: Your Honor, we move into



- 1 evidence Petitioner's Exhibit 1430-A, which is the
- 2 video of Ms. Norton's testimony, as well as
- 3 Exhibit 1430, which was the exhibit shown to
- 4 Ms. Norton.
- 5 And just for the record, I believe
- 6 Mr. Geffen said on the transcript that the
- 7 Exhibit was 4130. The correct number is 1430.
- 8 MR. KEATING: No objection, Your Honor.
- 9 THE COURT: Very well.
- 10 MR. JONES: My colleague, Marian
- 11 Schneider, will present our next witness.
- MS. SCHNEIDER: Good morning, Your
- 13 Honor. Petitioners call Susan Carty.
- 14 - -
- 15 SUSAN CARTY, having first been duly
- 16 sworn according to law, was examined and testified
- 17 as follows:
- 18 THE CLERK: Please be seated.
- 19 - -
- 20 DIRECT EXAMINATION
- 21 - -
- 22 BY MS. SCHNEIDER:
- Q Good morning.
- 24 A Good morning.
- 25 Q Can you please introduce yourself to



- 1 the Court.
- 2 A I'm Susan Carty.
- 3 Q Where do you live?
- 4 A I live in East Goshen.
- 5 Q And are you a member of the League of
- 6 Women Voters of Pennsylvania?
- 7 A Yes.
- 8 Q What is the League of Women Voters?
- 9 A The League of Women Voters is a
- 10 93-year-old organization that has dedicated itself
- 11 to ensuring that all voters have the right to vote
- 12 unobstructed, no barriers.
- 13 The League knows well its history. We
- 14 know what women went through, struggling. We know
- 15 what men went through supporting us as well. Women
- 16 were jailed. They were beaten. They were
- 17 harassed. They lost their families. And that's a
- 18 history that we uphold today, we are committed to
- 19 today, to ensure that all voters have the right to
- 20 vote with no barriers.
- 21 Q And is the League of Women Voters a
- 22 partisan organization?
- 23 A No.
- Q And today, currently, does the League
- 25 have an educational mission?



- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q Could you describe the League's
- 3 educational mission.
- 4 A The League has an educational mission
- 5 that falls under what we call our voter services
- 6 part of the League. And our goal is to be sure
- 7 that voters understand how to vote; they understand
- 8 what they need to do to vote; what they need to be
- 9 aware of when they vote; how to go about finding
- 10 the information they need to vote.
- 11 Q And what is your position with the
- 12 League?
- 13 A I'm the president.
- 14 Q How long have you had that position?
- 15 A About six weeks.
- 16 Q How did you come to become the
- 17 president of the League? And this is -- we're
- 18 talking about the state, the Pennsylvania League of
- 19 Women Voters.
- 20 A Yes. Every two years the state has an
- 21 annual or bi-annual convention where they have a
- 22 nominating committee that takes time, about four or
- 23 five months prior to the convention, putting
- 24 together a slate of candidates that they feel would
- 25 be appropriate to fill the board positions for the



- 1 next two years.
- 2 Q So the nominating committee asked you
- 3 to be president?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q And at the -- what happened at the
- 6 convention?
- 7 A At the convention they have another
- 8 meeting with delegates that are assigned to the
- 9 convention and then other attendees from across the
- 10 state who learn more about the slate, and then they
- 11 vote for approval of the slate.
- 12 Q Now, before you became the president of
- 13 the League, what position did you hold?
- 14 A I was the president of the Chester
- 15 County League.
- 16 Q And did you have any other leadership
- 17 position in the Chester County League?
- 18 A Prior to that I was the vice president;
- 19 and prior to that I was the education committee
- 20 chair.
- 22 Chester County League?
- 23 A Yes. I'm still finishing the role of
- 24 president with them for one more year.
- 25 Q Now, you mentioned that you recently



- 1 attended this state's convention. Did the topic of
- 2 voter ID come up at the state convention?
- $\mathbf{A}$  Yes.
- 4 O And you also mentioned that other
- 5 representatives from around the state attend the
- 6 convention.
- 7 A Yes.
- 8 Q What did you learn about voter ID from
- 9 those representatives from other Leagues?
- 10 A The representatives from the other
- 11 Leagues across the state -- we serve now about
- 12 30 --
- MR. SCHMIDT: Objection; it's hearsay.
- MS. SCHNEIDER: Your Honor, this
- 15 witness is offered primarily in support of our
- 16 renewal of the motion for preliminary injunction;
- 17 and so part of the -- she's going to testify that
- 18 her impression --
- 19 THE COURT: It's admissible for what?
- MS. SCHNEIDER: What the purpose was --
- 21 we're laying the foundation for that evidence.
- 22 BY MS. SCHNEIDER:
- 23 O I'm sorry. You can continue.
- 24 Tell me, at the state convention when
- 25 the topic of voter ID came up, what did you learn



- 1 about what the local Leagues were doing about voter
- 2 ID around the state?
- 3 A The local Leagues actually individually
- 4 discussed what they did in front of the convention,
- 5 what efforts they took, what activities they went
- 6 through.
- 7 Many of the Leagues, including Chester
- 8 County League, spent many hours -- we spent
- 9 700 hours, we figured out, volunteer hours, working
- 10 on helping voters.
- 11 Many of the other Leagues did not maybe
- 12 the same amount of hours, but they held more
- 13 frequent voter registrations. They offered public
- 14 meetings, open discussion for people to understand
- 15 what this meant. They visited churches. They
- 16 visited retirement homes. They visited senior
- 17 centers. They produced newsletters for their
- 18 members and for the public.
- 19 We were on the radio multiple times.
- 20 We have articles in the newspaper clarifying that
- 21 there was a concern.
- 22 Q So I just want to turn back to what you
- 23 said about the Chester County League.
- 24 You said the Chester County League
- 25 alone spent 700 volunteer hours on voter ID.



- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q Can you describe a little bit more
- 3 about what the Chester County League, which you
- 4 were the president of, did around voter ID.
- 5 A Yes. We visited every senior center in
- 6 Chester County and spent hours staying there with
- 7 them, couple hours with each visit, helping people
- 8 recognize whether they had the correct ID, if they
- 9 did not have the correct ID, whether we are
- 10 currently registered. We showed them how to do
- 11 that on the computer. It's very easy to find out
- 12 for yourself.
- We distributed materials to as many
- 14 churches as we could reach out too. We attended
- 15 the farmers' markets. We attended fairs. We
- 16 attended activities going on in the county. We
- 17 spoke at the Coatesville Veterans Hospital, to
- 18 women.
- 19 Q So the time that you were spending
- 20 doing this outreach on voter ID meant that you
- 21 weren't spending time on other activities; is that
- 22 right?
- 23 A Right.
- Q Now let's talk about the state League.
- 25 Does the state League maintain an



- 1 office?
- 2 A Yes.
- 4 A The office is at 226 Forster Street in
- 5 Harrisburg.
- 6 O And how many staff work in that office?
- 7 A We have one full-time, one part-time.
- 8 O Who works in the state office?
- 9 A The full-time person is our executive
- 10 director. Her name is Bonita Hoke; and our
- 11 part-time person is an assistant to the director.
- 12 Her name is Rae Neubaum.
- 13 O And what are Rae Neubaum's
- 14 responsibilities?
- 15 A Rae maintains the continuity of office
- 16 procedures. She answers the phone messages. She
- 17 greets visitors. She communicates with various
- 18 state League chapters as they call and ask for
- 19 information. She maintains a database.
- 20 Q So does the League have a telephone
- 21 number for citizens to call?
- 22 A Yes.
- 23 Q And explain to me how the telephone
- 24 calls are answered. Are they answered by a live
- 25 person?



- 1 A Rae would answer the telephones when
- 2 she's in the office. When she's not in the office,
- 3 there's an answering machine.
- 4 Q And what time of year does the League
- 5 receive the most calls?
- 6 A Clearly they're very busy prior to an
- 7 election and Election Day. And then things slow
- 8 down for a while after that.
- 9 Q So how does the League keep track of
- 10 the calls that come into the state office?
- 11 A The League keeps a log. They enter the
- information from the messages or from the phones
- 13 actually into the computer.
- 14 Q And who makes that log of calls?
- 15 A Rae does.
- 16 Q And is the log created at or near the
- 17 time that the calls come in?
- 18 MR. SCHMIDT: Your Honor, I want to
- 19 object. I don't know if the witness has testified
- 20 to her foundation about this log. She just
- 21 testified that someone else at the League handles
- 22 the log, prepares the log. I don't know if she has
- 23 a foundation to testify to the content.
- 24 THE COURT: You can ask a couple more
- 25 questions.



- 1 MS. SCHNEIDER: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 2 We're just trying to lay the foundation for the
- 3 business records exception.
- 4 MR. SCHMIDT: Your Honor, as another
- 5 administrative matter, this log has never been
- 6 produced.
- 7 MS. SCHNEIDER: Yes, it has.
- 8 MR. SCHMIDT: It's the first time we're
- 9 hearing about this.
- 10 MS. SCHNEIDER: I'm sorry, Your Honor.
- 11 It has been produced in discovery. And it was
- 12 designated -- the particular -- we actually
- 13 produced logs for every month from September until
- 14 May. And I don't know what the first Bates number
- 15 is. But the Bates number of the November log is
- 16 VOTES0002208. So, yes, we did produce them in
- 17 discovery.
- 18 BY MS. SCHNEIDER:
- 19 Q Sorry. So we were talking about the
- 20 log of calls. And who makes the log of calls at
- 21 the office?
- 22 A Rae does.
- 23 Q And is the log created in the ordinary
- 24 course of the League's business?
- 25 A Yes.



- 1 Q And is creating the call log part of
- 2 Rae's normal duties?
- $\mathbf{A}$  Yes.
- 4 THE COURT: Continue.
- 5 MS. SCHNEIDER: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 6 I'd like to mark for identification Petitioner's
- 7 Exhibit 1750.
- 8 THE COURT: It will be marked as an
- 9 exhibit.
- 10 MS. SCHNEIDER: Thank you.
- 11 BY MS. PETERSON:
- 12 Q Ms. Carty, have you seen this document
- 13 before?
- 14 A Yes.
- 15 Q Do you recognize it?
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 O What is this document?
- 18 A This is the November 2012 call log for
- 19 the office phone line.
- 20 Q And can you turn to the second page of
- 21 the exhibit that I've given you.
- 22 And you mentioned that the call log was
- 23 entered into the computer, earlier. Is this a
- 24 printout of what's entered in the computer?
- 25 A Yes.



- 1 Q I just want to direct your attention to
- 2 the first row.
- 3 MS. SCHNEIDER: Before we continue,
- 4 Your Honor, I just want to mention that there were
- 5 telephone numbers and identifying information of
- 6 people that we have redacted, and that's what the
- 7 redactions are in this document.
- 8 THE COURT: Well done. And I
- 9 appreciate you enlarging it.
- 10 BY MS. SCHNEIDER:
- 11 Q If you could -- and it you need to see
- 12 it, it should be on your screen there. But if you
- 13 could look at the first row on the second page of
- 14 the exhibit and just explain what each of the
- 15 column headings on this document are and what they
- 16 signify.
- 17 A All right. As you look across the top
- 18 of the document from A to L, A is the time the call
- 19 was received. There were times when you don't see
- 20 a time there, because that would be when the phone
- 21 was actually picked up as opposed to a message
- 22 left. That's their system.
- The date the call was received. The
- 24 line into the phone, name, phone number, email,
- 25 location of the person calling. The top in there



- 1 is what -- referring to the phone call.
- 2 Business column simply was put in
- 3 there, my understanding, to refer to if the call
- 4 had something directed to the League or if the call
- 5 came from an outside -- an actual business or a
- 6 company or somebody other than a League person.
- 7 The Issue column just describes what
- 8 the call was about.
- 9 Column K also is our way of
- 10 understanding how we look at the question as to
- 11 whether it would fall under an education question
- 12 or whether it refers to the operations of the
- 13 League itself.
- 14 And then the Solution column shows the
- 15 response the call was given.
- 16 Q Now, I just want to clarify on the time
- 17 the call received.
- 18 If there is a time indicated in that
- 19 column, does that mean that was a call that was
- 20 picked up by the message machine?
- 21 A Yes.
- Q Okay. And if there's no time, it means
- 23 it was answered live?
- 24 A Yes.
- 25 Q So how did you the League use the



- 1 information in this call log?
- 2 A Well, I'm newer at this. But if you
- 3 really review call logs over a period of time,
- 4 sometimes they can indicate to you that there might
- 5 be an issue of concern that you might not be aware
- 6 of that you might need to address directly, whether
- 7 it's through your newsletters or your voter or
- 8 through communications with your chapters.
- 9 It could indicate that you also have
- 10 other concerns coming in, whether they have to do
- 11 with voting, whether they have to do with "I can't
- 12 find the polling place."
- But if you see a pattern, they can
- 14 certainly -- this could be used as a tool to help
- 15 take further action.
- 16 Q In other words, use it as a tool in
- 17 your education efforts?
- 18 A Yes.
- 19 Q Now, have you reviewed the log?
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 Q Did you -- and when I mean "you," did
- 22 the League receive calls about photo ID based on
- 23 this log?
- 24 A Yeah.
- Q And approximately how many calls did



- 1 the League receive in November on photo ID?
- 2 A I believe there's about 10.
- 3 Q And can you summarize what the League
- 4 learned about photo ID from these calls.
- 5 A Yes. When you look at the phone calls
- 6 focused on photo ID, you can certainly see there's
- 7 confusion. And the confusion not only comes from a
- 8 voter who has been confused at the poll -- could be
- 9 a voter confused before they go to the poll; it
- 10 could be a reflection of confusion from a poll
- 11 worker at the poll. Could reflect inconsistent
- 12 treatment of voters at the poll.
- 0 Okay. And have we reviewed this
- 14 document together?
- 15 A Yeah.
- 16 Q And on some of the pages there's some
- 17 gray highlighting. Did we highlight the calls that
- 18 related to voter ID?
- 19 A Yes.
- 20 Q I just want to look at a few of these
- 21 examples. We won't look at all of them.
- But if you could turn to Page 6, it
- 23 says "6 out of 12" at the bottom, and look at Row
- 24 91.
- 25 A Yes.



- 1 Q Now, what issue did the caller raise in
- 2 this call?
- 3 A This caller said that at the polling
- 4 place, she was told she could not vote without ID.
- 5 Q Okay. Now, turn the page to Page 7 and
- 6 look at Row 96.
- 7 A Okay.
- 8 O What issue did the caller raise in this
- 9 call?
- 10 A This caller said when asked for ID, he
- 11 said he had it but didn't show it. Was told "most
- 12 places you don't have to show ID, but here you do."
- 13 He was not allowed to vote without showing his ID.
- 14 Is that enough?
- MR. SCHMIDT: Your Honor, I think we're
- 16 getting into double hearsay now, reading from this
- 17 document that was told to someone who is not here
- 18 to testify about information they got from a
- 19 caller.
- 20 MS. SCHNEIDER: Your Honor, as I
- 21 mentioned before, we're offering this in support of
- 22 renewing and extending the motion for preliminary
- 23 injunction and also for modifying that order,
- 24 because the soft rollout has caused confusion at
- 25 the polling place; and this is evidence of that



- 1 confusion. And we ask that the Court accept
- 2 hearsay in support of our motion for preliminary
- 3 injunction.
- 4 MR. SCHMIDT: Your Honor, we have no
- 5 opportunity to cross-examination these people.
- 6 MS. SCHNEIDER: In addition, she's also
- 7 testified or laid the foundation that the League
- 8 uses this document to enhance its education
- 9 efforts. And, therefore, it's not being offered
- 10 necessarily for the truth of the matter asserted
- 11 but to show what the League does with the calls
- 12 when they come in.
- MR. SCHMIDT: Your Honor, we would
- 14 accept that -- we would accept that representation.
- 15 But then there's no need to go through what the
- 16 callers are providing, a witness that's not here to
- 17 be cross-examined.
- 18 THE COURT: I'll accept that. Okay.
- 19 Let's just stick with the log, not get into what
- 20 the person who made the call was told. I'm
- 21 concerned about the double hearsay. I'm not
- 22 concerned about the single hearsay. I'm concerned
- 23 about the double hearsay.
- MS. SCHNEIDER: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 25 BY MS. SCHNEIDER:



- 1 Q Having reviewed this document -- well,
- 2 actually we're going to put this document aside.
- I want to direct your attention to
- 4 Election Day 2012.
- 5 What did you do on Election Day 2012?
- 6 A I volunteered at a hotline call center
- 7 at the Channel 6 ABC in Bala Cynwyd.
- 8 Q What is Channel 6? Is it a TV station?
- 9 A It's a TV station. That's the station
- 10 we use that also puts on forums for us and debates.
- 11 Q And what geographic area does Channel 6
- 12 broadcast?
- 13 A Delaware Valley, Philadelphia, Delaware
- 14 Valley, all the surrounding counties.
- 15 Q How did you come to be a volunteer at
- 16 Channel 6 on Election Day?
- 17 A I was made aware that they needed
- 18 volunteers; that Philadelphia League of Women
- 19 Voters was coordinating that with the TV station.
- 20 And then they let us all go in the suburb areas; if
- 21 you would like to help, we would appreciate your
- 22 help.
- 23 Q And the help that they needed was to do
- 24 what?
- 25 A Answering phone calls.



- 1 Q So what did you do when you went to
- 2 Channel 6 studio on Election Day?
- 3 A I answered the telephone calls for a
- 4 while, a few hours that I was there, a short time
- 5 really. And then I was asked to take a different
- 6 role in that I was, as phone calls came in and were
- 7 identified as being more problematic or more
- 8 critical issues going on on Election Day, then I
- 9 was given that information and directed to call the
- 10 correct agencies in Philadelphia to respond.
- 11 Q What kinds of problems did the callers
- 12 call into the hotline about?
- 13 MR. SCHMIDT: Objection, Your Honor.
- MS. SCHNEIDER: Your Honor, she has
- 15 personal knowledge of the calls that came in.
- 16 We're not offering it for the truth but for her
- 17 impressions that were --
- THE COURT: She's reviewed the log, and
- 19 she can tell us what her review revealed.
- 20 BY MS. SCHNEIDER:
- O Go ahead. You can answer.
- 22 A My impression was that there was a
- 23 tremendous amount of confusion, at least reflected
- 24 in the telephone calls. And I never experienced
- 25 that personally before.



- 1 O And were there calls about voter ID?
- 2 A Yes.
- 3 Q And was it your impression that there
- 4 was confusion caused by the voter ID law?
- 5 A Some, yes.
- 6 O What kinds of confusion?
- 7 A Some people, some voters were told they
- 8 could not vote without an ID. Some people were
- 9 told they couldn't even go into the polling place
- 10 without an ID.
- 11 Others didn't have --
- MR. SCHMIDT: Your Honor, again --
- 13 THE COURT: I'll give you a standing
- 14 objection all the way through.
- 15 MR. SCHMIDT: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 16 THE COURT: Let the witness testify.
- 17 MS. SCHNEIDER: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 18 BY MS. SCHNEIDER:
- 19 O You can continue.
- 20 A There were voters who felt that they
- 21 were actually intimidated at the polls and were --
- 22 didn't matter what party they were at all. It
- 23 clearly was not a reflection of political parties.
- 24 There were people who were just confused and felt
- 25 that there was confusion as to what they should and



- 1 shouldn't do.
- 2 And they were calling because -- they
- 3 also had some difficulties at the polling booths
- 4 themselves, which was a concern. Some weren't
- 5 working; there was a change in polling places.
- 7 that you switched. First, you were answering the
- 8 telephone calls --
- 9 A Yes.
- 11 agencies to direct them to urgent issues.
- During that time, were voter ID
- 13 problems among the urgent issues that you contacted
- 14 other agencies about?
- 15 A Yes. It was made clear that there were
- 16 a number of polling places where people were told
- 17 they could not vote without their ID.
- 18 Q And just to clarify, on Election Day,
- 19 you were at the Channel 6 studios outside of
- 20 Philadelphia, and this was a different call number
- 21 and telephone number than what we looked at with
- 22 Exhibit 1750; is that correct?
- 23 A Yes.
- 24 O Last area I want to talk about is, have
- 25 you had the opportunity to go to the library



```
Page 1196
 1
     recently?
 2
                 Yes.
             Α
                 What library did you visit?
             0
                 Malvern.
             Α
 5
             0
                 Is that your local library?
                 Yes.
             Α
 7
                 And is the Malvern Library part of the
 8
     Chester County Library System?
 9
             Α
                 Yes.
10
                 Why did you go there?
             0
                 I went there to see if there was
11
             Δ
12
     information on the computers that the public had
13
     access to see if there was a button or something,
     identification for photo ID information.
14
15
                 What did you do when you went to the
16
     library?
17
                 I went in and asked the gentleman at
18
     the desk if he would log me in to the computer, and
     he did. And then I noticed that there was no
19
20
     information on the screen that was the Malvern
21
     Library face page. Nothing about it.
22
                 Was that the Malvern Library home page?
             0
23
             Α
                 Yes.
24
                 And that's the screen that popped up
             0
25
     after you logged in?
```



1 Α Yes. 2 Were those -- about how many computers 0 were there that were available to the public? 3 I would say eight. 4 Α 5 0 And were there other computers for searching the catalog? 6 Α One other that was strictly for finding -- locating books in the catalogs. 8 9 And what was your impression about the computers where you logged in and the catalog 10 computers about whether those computers had 11 information about voter ID? 12 13 My impression was the computers that Α 14 were for the public to use for access to a computer 15 had no information on photo ID on their home page. 16 MS. SCHNEIDER: Thank you. I have no 17 further questions at this time. I'd like to move 18 into evidence Petitioner's Exhibit 1750. 19 Your Honor, we object. MR. SCHMIDT: 20 THE COURT: Noted. It will come in. 21 MS. SCHNEIDER: Thank you, Your Honor.



May I proceed?

22

23

24

25

Sure.

Thank you, Your Honor.

MR. SCHMIDT:

THE COURT:

	Page 1198
1	Page 1198 CROSS EXAMINATION
2	
3	BY MR. SCHMIDT:
4	Q Good morning, Ms. Carty. My name is
5	Kevin Schmidt. I represent the respondents in this
6	action. I just have a few follow-up questions.
7	Do you still have what's been marked as
8	1750, the document, in front of you?
9	A That's this one?
10	Q Yes, ma'am.
11	A Yes. Oh, yes.
12	Q Okay. And could you tell me that first
13	page there, Page 1 out of 12, what does that log
14	represent there?
15	A That log should represent a breakdown
16	of the different categories of phone calls.
17	Q Okay. And when were the phone calls
18	received?
19	A The month of November.
20	Q Okay. And does this log represent the
21	phone calls coming in from a specific area in the
22	state, or is it the entire state of Pennsylvania?
23	A It covers the whole state.
24	Q Okay. And you testified that November



25 is the busiest for these calls to be coming in to

- 1 the League of Women Voters; is that correct?
- 2 A Yes.
- 3 Q Okay. Can you look at Page 1 and
- 4 scroll down to Voter ID and tell me what the number
- 5 is there of calls.
- 6 A Yes. I saw that too. They listed it
- 7 as one.
- 8 Q One call, ma'am?
- 9 A Clearly it's not.
- 10 Q Well, we can agree that it says one
- 11 call. I know that you testified that there were 10
- 12 calls on the log; is that correct?
- 13 A Right.
- 14 Q Okay. So out of the entire
- 15 Commonwealth, the League of Women Voters in
- 16 November received 10 calls on voter ID?
- 17 A I'll clarify that: The state office
- 18 receives these phone calls. Every chapter across
- 19 the state has a phone as well, every chapter that's
- 20 in the League. So if I were in Chester County and
- 21 had a question, I wouldn't call the state. I would
- 22 called my local.
- So my sense, honestly, is the
- 24 reflection of this phone log would be more likely
- 25 people that have no understanding of the League and



- 1 they're not a part of a chapter, a local --
- Q Okay. But it's part of your mission to
- 3 educate people about the League, about voting, make
- 4 them aware of what you do; isn't that correct?
- 5 A Right.
- 6 Q And you can agree with me that your
- 7 prior testimony was that 10 calls went into this
- 8 facility; is that correct?
- 9 A It appears that way.
- 10 O That was for the entire month of
- 11 November; correct?
- 12 A Correct.
- 13 O And that's the busiest call month for
- 14 the League; is that correct?
- 15 A Right.
- 16 Q Do you know how many people voted in
- 17 the November election, 2012, ma'am?
- 18 A No.
- 19 Q Now, ma'am, you also talked about, when
- 20 you were acting as a volunteer at Channel 6, that
- 21 there were calls coming in from people who may or
- 22 may not have suffered some confusion at the polls;
- 23 is that correct?
- 24 A Correct.
- Q Okay. Did you see, on the day of the



- 1 election in November, anybody refused at a poll for
- 2 lack of an ID?
- 3 A Did I personally? I couldn't have. I
- 4 was in a phone office. But I didn't see anybody.
- 5 Q So you just overheard these calls
- 6 coming in; is that correct?
- 7 A In my ear. I listened to them.
- 8 Q So they were calling you directly?
- 9 A Yeah.
- 10 Q But you didn't see anybody refused; is
- 11 that correct?
- 12 A No.
- 13 Q You were not at the polls?
- 14 A No.
- 15 O Okay. You were at Channel 6 the entire
- 16 day?
- 17 A Correct, yeah.
- 18 O So when these calls came in -- and if
- 19 I'm understanding the mission of the League of
- 20 Women Voters correctly, you were educating them on
- 21 what was needed; correct?
- 22 A We were answering their questions about
- 23 concerns that they had or what they should do,
- 24 where they should go or were they being given
- 25 correct information.



- 1 Q So you were educating them about Act 18
- 2 and what currently was required for that election;
- 3 is that correct?
- 4 A Right, yes.
- 5 Q And were people receptive to that?
- 6 A Yes. Actually, my sense was that many
- 7 of the calls were because that was their perception
- 8 but when they went to vote and heard something
- 9 different, they were confused, going, "I didn't
- 10 think that was the case."
- 11 And then they would call, saying, "Am I
- 12 right or wrong? And should I go back?" And we
- 13 would indicate that they should go back.
- 14 Q But you clarified that confusion;
- 15 correct?
- 16 A Yeah.
- 17 Q How many calls did you take that day?
- 18 A I couldn't tell you. There were
- 19 approximately 8 or 10 phone lines, and they were
- 20 ringing all the time.
- 21 Q Why would a voter know to call
- 22 Channel 6?
- 23 A I think that was -- I didn't know that
- 24 either. That was actually on the television.
- 25 Channel 6 advertises that they have a hotline on



- 1 voting day, which I didn't know that.
- Q And the hotline advertisement said, "If
- 3 you have any problem voting at the polls, please
- 4 call in and air your complaints to Channel 6"; is
- 5 that correct?
- 6 A Yeah. Air your complaints or find out
- 7 what you should do, yes.
- 8 Q Did they ask anybody of the voting
- 9 successes that day, any of those stories?
- 10 A That -- we do get that on the hotline.
- 11 Q That's not sexy enough for Channel 6?
- 12 A Right.
- 13 Q Now, you also said you went to the
- 14 Malvern Library; is that correct?
- 15 A Yeah.
- 16 Q And when did you go there again, ma'am?
- 17 Sorry.
- 18 A It's been a few days ago. I can't tell
- 19 you what day it is today.
- 20 Q And you inspected their computers; is
- 21 that correct?
- 22 A I did.
- 23 Q And you were looking for whether or not
- 24 the computers had any information about voter ID
- 25 prominently displayed; is that correct?



- 1 A Correct.
- 2 Q And your testimony is that when you
- 3 went in there, you didn't see any; is that correct?
- 4 A Correct.
- 5 Q Now, did you go to the librarian or any
- 6 library official and explain to them that you did
- 7 not see that?
- 8 A Yes, I did.
- 9 Q And did you ask them to now prominently
- 10 display that as their partnership with the
- 11 Department of State?
- 12 A That's very good. Actually, what I did
- 13 learn was that the county system, our county
- 14 system, Chester County system, does have a symbol
- 15 on it. But we were -- it was communicated to me
- 16 that all of the county systems across the state
- 17 were advised to do that.
- 18 And it was also indicated to me -- but
- 19 they all don't have it. I did look at them. I
- 20 didn't look at all of them. But even though it's
- 21 on the county Web site, we have nine libraries. So
- 22 if you go into each individual library, it's not
- 23 there. And when you go into their library
- 24 computer, it doesn't show you the county home page
- 25 when you open up the -- the individual library.



- 1 Q So this was a branch of Chester County
- 2 on the Malvern branch?
- 3 A Right.
- 4 Q Okay. Did they say that they would,
- 5 after you spoke with them, put the ID button back
- 6 on the computers?
- 7 A No. I did not direct them to do that.
- 8 O You didn't?
- 9 A No.
- 10 Q Is that consistent with the League of
- 11 Women Voters' mission?
- 12 A No. I can't direct them what to do. I
- 13 asked him if he understood, did he know why they
- 14 weren't there.
- 15 And he said, "No, but I guarantee
- 16 they're not there." So I said that was most
- 17 interesting.
- 18 That was it. I had no idea that I
- 19 could go in there and say, "You have to do this."
- Q Did you ask him to put it up?
- 21 A No, I did not.
- 22 Q Now, ma'am, you testified earlier about
- 23 the League of Women Voters' education mission.
- 24 A Yeah.
- 25 O And does that education mission,



- 1 helping people understand how to vote, providing
- 2 voter services, does that include educating people
- 3 on Act 18, the voter ID law?
- 4 A Yes, it would.
- 5 Q Now, what faculties has the League of
- 6 Women Voters set up since Act 18 was enacted?
- 7 A We did not, as far as I'm aware of,
- 8 particularly at the county level, set up anything
- 9 new and different, because Act 18 falls under our
- 10 mission of voter services. So over time, if
- 11 anything comes up that has to do with voting, it
- 12 would fall under our voter services area.
- 13 Q So you haven't had to make any changes
- 14 in your mission or in your faculty since Act 18 was
- 15 enacted?
- 16 A I don't know what you mean by faculty.
- 17 Q I guess you haven't changed your
- 18 ordinary course of business prior to Act 18, post
- 19 Act 18. Do you understand that question, ma'am?
- 20 A I got that part. Yes.
- 21 Our mission has not changed. But
- 22 definitely, I think the word "faculty" has
- 23 certainly changed in that it has consumed much more
- 24 time and effort and more extensive outreach than we
- 25 normally do on a given day.



- 1 Q Ma'am, back in July 2012, some of your
- 2 colleagues testified about some outreach efforts
- 3 that the League was making. And two of them in
- 4 particular, Madeline Rawley and Janice Horn -- are
- 5 you familiar with them?
- 6 A Vaguely, yes. Not well, though.
- 7 Q Well, they both testified that, in
- 8 advance of the hearings in July, that they did some
- 9 investigation into PennDOT driver's licensing
- 10 centers. Are you familiar with that?
- 11 A Vaguely.
- 12 O And you also testified that it was a
- 13 coordinated effort requested by some organizations
- 14 like the voter coalition. Are you familiar with
- 15 that?
- 16 A I'm familiar with that.
- 17 Q And basically what they did was they
- 18 went into PennDOT driver's licensing centers and
- 19 looked around to see what information was there.
- 20 And they testified under oath that they did that so
- 21 that they could be prepared to bring elderly people
- 22 who needed to obtain ID in there, and they just
- 23 wanted to be prepared to do that.
- Are you aware of that, ma'am?
- 25 A I am aware of that, what you're saying



- 1 about them. But that was not particularly
- 2 something that every League across the state even
- 3 had the ability to do.
- 4 Q Okay. Are you aware of what divisions
- 5 of the League across the state have taken elderly
- 6 voters to PennDOT to obtain ID?
- 7 A No, I'm not aware of which ones
- 8 specifically.
- 9 Q Are you aware that that's occurred at
- 10 all?
- 11 A I'm aware that that was discussed. I'm
- 12 aware that my impression was that there's a
- 13 hesitancy to physically take somebody that is a
- 14 stranger in a car and the liabilities for that.
- 15 Q Has there been any directive from the
- 16 League -- you being president or members of the
- 17 board -- not to do that?
- 18 A I am more aware of that at the local
- 19 level, saying not to do that. I'm aware that at
- 20 the state level there was a conversation, but I
- 21 wouldn't say it was a directive.
- Q Could you explain that more? Was there
- 23 information put out there dissuading people from
- 24 assisting elderly voters to get ID?
- 25 A I heard -- well, not assisting voters.



- 1 We were assisting voters in a variety of ways.
- 2 There was concern about liability if you drove
- 3 someone in your car. At our local level we had a
- 4 lot of conversations with that -- the whole bus
- 5 service. I can't think of the name of the bus
- 6 service. But they wouldn't do it for free.
- 7 And then there was a conversation about
- 8 doing it for a lower price. And then they just
- 9 said, We can't do it. Our funds have been cut for
- 10 this year for the City, so we can't afford to do
- 11 it. That really was the biggest attempt to try to
- 12 help people that I'm aware of.
- Q And when you say "our funds," who were
- 14 you speaking of?
- 15 A Pardon me?
- 16 Q Who were you speaking of when you say
- 17 "our funds"? What group are you talking about?
- 18 A Oh, am I talking about the local
- 19 Chester County League as opposed to the state
- 20 League?
- 21 Q You said "our." I'm just trying to
- 22 clarify who you were referring to.
- 23 A That's my problem, because I have two
- 24 positions. That would have been more the Chester
- 25 County, local level.



- 1 Q So if I heard you correctly, you're the
- 2 president of the League; but you're also still
- 3 involved at the Chester County level?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q You're very busy, I guess?
- 6 A Yes.
- 7 Q Now, do you assist people in similar
- 8 fashion to register to vote? Does the League do
- 9 that?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q And how do you do that? Can you
- 12 explain that to me.
- 13 A Yes. I can explain to you how we
- 14 assisted with all of our 700 volunteer hours in
- 15 that we -- we were asked or called and asked to
- 16 come to certain senior centers, all the county
- 17 senior centers, some of the assisted living
- 18 centers.
- 19 And we would go and talk to people as a
- 20 group and explain to them what they needed to have.
- 21 And then we would kind of break up and just sit
- 22 with them individually and help them identify if
- 23 they have the right ID; were they voter-registered
- 24 currently, because they were in different locations
- 25 maybe from a year ago, because they were older.



- 2 Q Yes.
- 3 And did that include both getting
- 4 people to register to vote or to educate them about
- 5 voter ID? I was speaking specifically about
- 6 getting people to register to vote.
- 7 A Well, particularly, the focus was on
- 8 voter ID, because most -- it's very common for the
- 9 elderly to use an expired driver's license. And
- 10 they were so happy to show it to you that they had
- 11 it and were very disturbed when they learned that
- 12 it wasn't acceptable.
- So sometimes there were family members
- 14 there that we would communicate with to help them.
- 15 Sometimes they needed to re-register because they
- 16 were at a different address. And some of them had
- 17 to do an absentee ballot because they were just not
- 18 well enough to go. So it was kind of a mixed bag.
- 19 Q Now, at the beginning of your answer
- 20 you said the League was asked to do this.
- Who asked them?
- 22 A Oh, some of the -- the senior center --
- 23 the county senior centers actually contacted our
- 24 county commissioners and asked if they would help.
- 25 And the commissioners referred the call to us and



- 1 said, "You're the ones to help."
- 2 Q So the League itself didn't reach out
- 3 directly to these care facilities; they were asked
- 4 by somebody in local government; is that correct?
- 5 A No. I'm sorry.
- 6 MS. SCHNEIDER: Excuse me, Your Honor.
- 7 I object to Mr. Schmidt's characterization of the
- 8 facility as a care facility. This was a county --
- 9 I think that the witness has not testified that
- 10 these were care facilities as that term of art is
- 11 used in this case.
- 12 THE COURT: I think the question -- the
- 13 answer involved county senior centers; is that
- 14 correct?
- 15 THE WITNESS: Yes. That was -- that's
- 16 exactly right. And we were contacted -- we were
- 17 contacted by the senior center director for the
- 18 county.
- 19 BY MR. SCHMIDT:
- Q Okay, ma'am. And does this type of
- 21 contact happen in the normal course of League of
- 22 Women Voters' operations?
- 23 A Not as frequent as it was. We had a
- 24 lot more contact, actually -- requests for us to
- 25 come help -- than I was used to.



- 1 Q And people looked to the League because
- 2 that's part of your mission, is to educate voters
- 3 about voter ID and voter registration. And that's
- 4 what you do in the normal course of your
- 5 operations; is that correct?
- 6 A Yeah.
- 7 THE COURT: The Department of State,
- 8 have they ever contacted the League that you know
- 9 of?
- 10 THE WITNESS: That would be -- at the
- 11 state level? I don't know that it's within the
- 12 state.
- 13 BY MR. SCHMIDT:
- 14 Q Just a few more things, Ms. Carty. The
- 15 League of Women Voters, is this a membership-driven
- 16 organization?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q And you also received donations; is
- 19 that correct?
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 Q Do you receive any other funding
- 22 sources?
- 23 A Other funding sources comes from
- 24 membership, comes from donations, and comes from
- 25 grant programs that we organize for outreach,



- 1 education.
- 2 Q So you receive grants. Are they both
- 3 state and federal grants?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q So you receive a grant from the
- 6 Commonwealth of Pennsylvania in some form or
- 7 fashion?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q And are there any restrictions placed
- 10 upon you in the use of this funding?
- 11 A Well, you're asking somebody who really
- 12 knew here. I'm just really learning about that.
- 13 So I could not give you a really honest answer. I
- 14 would be quessing.
- 15 Q Is it fair to say that the League can
- 16 use its funding as it deems appropriate and where
- it deems appropriate; is that correct?
- 18 A I wouldn't say that. For grant money?
- 19 Q Any funding source that you have, the
- 20 League can choose to use it as it wants to;
- 21 correct?
- 22 A No.
- 23 Q Can you explain that to me.
- 24 A Well, if I understand your question
- 25 correctly, if you receive funds, if you receive



- 1 funds that are focused in a grant direction,
- 2 there's usually a grant guide as to how that is to
- 3 be done. And your grantee has already complied
- 4 with their --
- 5 Q Understood. Let's separate the grant
- 6 money from the membership and the donation money.
- 7 The membership and donation funds, are
- 8 there any restrictions on the League to use those
- 9 funds?
- 10 A Yeah. Membership funds go into the
- 11 education fund. And, therefore, those funds, once
- 12 we have what we're allowed to keep -- because they
- 13 get, the state and the national levels sort of
- 14 divide it up -- they are directed for education
- 15 fund, which has its own guidelines on it being a
- 16 nonpartisan education outreach.
- 17 O And would voter education fall into
- 18 that group?
- 19 A Yes.
- 20 Q Ma'am, I notice on your Web site that
- 21 there's a voter ID subcommittee. What is that?
- 22 A When the voter ID bill became apparent
- 23 to us to be a concern and confusion, we felt that
- 24 we needed more focus, more people working in the
- 25 voter services committee.



- 1 And every chapter is basically subject
- 2 to how many members you have and how active they
- 3 are. And in my particular situation at the county
- 4 level, our voter services committee was small and
- 5 older, elderly -- more elderly than me. And so we
- 6 felt we needed people who could act a little more
- 7 quickly and use technology a little better.
- 8 Q And, ma'am, you also have a newsletter
- 9 that goes out monthly; is that correct?
- 10 A Correct -- are you talking about the
- 11 state?
- 12 O That's my next question. Are there
- 13 multiple versions of it? Is there one newsletter?
- 14 A Yes. The state has a quarterly, what
- 15 they call "Voter," which I have had no part in yet,
- 16 but I will. And then each chapter has a monthly
- 17 newsletter.
- 18 O Okay. And within the newsletters, both
- 19 the quarterly newsletter and the monthly
- 20 newsletter, is there a section dedicated to
- 21 voter ID education?
- 22 A A section? At the county level, no.
- 23 At the state level over the past year, I've seen a
- 24 couple articles about it, yes.
- 25 O And are the articles educational



- 1 articles or opinionated articles?
- 2 A That could be your opinion. They're
- 3 meant to be educational certainly. I would guess
- 4 you can certainly look at that and say there's
- 5 opinion in there.
- 7 mission to make statements in opposition to Act 18?
- 8 A Would it be contrary for someone to not
- 9 be in opposition? Is that --
- 10 Q No. Would it go against the League's
- 11 mission to make statements in opposition to Act 18?
- 12 A Yes.
- MR. SCHMIDT: Your Honor, I have
- 14 nothing further.
- 15 THE COURT: Thank you, Counselor.
- MS. SCHNEIDER: Your Honor, I have a
- 17 few additional questions, if I may. Thank you.
- 18 - -
- 19 REDIRECT EXAMINATION
- 20 - -
- 21 BY MS. SCHNEIDER:
- 22 Q Mrs. Carty, you testified about the
- 23 hotlines, and I wanted to talk to you a little bit
- 24 about other voter hotlines.
- 25 Are you aware of the 1-866-OUR-VOTE



- 1 hotline?
- 2 A Yes.
- 3 Q Is that a hotline that the League
- 4 publicizes for voters to call?
- 5 A Yes.
- 6 Q And so in addition to the state hotline
- 7 that you mentioned and that the local Leagues each
- 8 have their own telephone number, there's an
- 9 additional hotline that voters call; is that
- 10 correct?
- 11 A Yeah.
- 12 O So the call log is a small subset of
- 13 callers that might be using various hotlines around
- 14 the state?
- 15 A Clearly, that -- yes, that was my first
- 16 impression when I looked at it. I thought, Oh,
- 17 what is this? How is it possible, in a sense?
- 18 But then I thought, Well, wait a
- 19 minute; you've got 32 Leagues. And if I know about
- 20 a League, I would call my own.
- 21 Q Okay. I just want to direct your
- 22 attention to the first page of Exhibit 1750, and
- 23 that is the list of how the calls are categorized.
- 24 And about -- towards the top, do you see it's about
- 25 a third of the way down on the first page it says



- 1 "Election Day Issues" as a topic.
- 2 Do you see that?
- 3 A Yes.
- 4 Q And then I just want you to turn to
- 5 some of the gray-highlighted calls on voter ID.
- 6 MR. SCHMIDT: Your Honor, I'll just
- 7 restate my objection to the double hearsay.
- MS. SCHNEIDER: Your Honor, he asked
- 9 whether those calls were categorized as voter ID,
- 10 and I wanted to point out that those calls were
- 11 categorized under the topic "Election Day Issues."
- 12 THE COURT: We'll let the witness
- 13 answer that, if she could.
- MS. SCHNEIDER: Okay.
- 15 BY MS. SCHNEIDER:
- 16 Q For example, can you turn to Page 7 of
- 17 this document and look at Row 96.
- 18 A Yes.
- 19 Q And that was one of the examples we had
- 20 looked at before. But do you see Column H where it
- 21 says the topic?
- 22 A Yes.
- 23 Q And what topic was that characterized
- 24 as?
- 25 A Election Day issues.



- 1 Q So based on your review of the call
- 2 log, were some of the voter ID calls categorized as
- 3 Election Day issues?
- 4 MR. SCHMIDT: Objection, Your Honor.
- 5 MS. SCHNEIDER: Your Honor, he opened
- 6 this up on his cross.
- 7 MR. SCHMIDT: It's a leading question,
- 8 Your Honor.
- 9 THE COURT: It's been admitted in the
- 10 log. You can look at the log. Do you have an
- 11 answer to that?
- 12 THE WITNESS: Yes. The answer would be
- 13 yes.
- 14 BY MS. SCHNEIDER:
- 15 Q Thank you. I just want to go back to
- 16 the questioning that you had about the library
- 17 system.
- 18 Is it your understanding that when you
- 19 log on to the Chester County Library System at
- 20 home, there is information about voter ID; is that
- 21 right?
- 22 A Yes.
- 23 Q But was it -- is it your testimony that
- 24 when you actually went to one of the branches of
- 25 the library, there was no information about voter



- 1 ID?
- 2 A Yes.
- 3 Q And so do you -- did the League have
- 4 any discussion with the Chester County Library
- 5 System about voter ID?
- 6 A Currently?
- 7 Q No, not currently, but putting the
- 8 information about voter ID on their system
- 9 computer.
- 10 A No.
- 11 Q No?
- 12 A Not a specific conversation about
- 13 having the ID button be on the individual computers
- 14 in the individual libraries; is that --
- 15 O What was your discussion with Chester
- 16 County Library System?
- 17 A Way back, the director of the Chester
- 18 County Library System actually is a League member.
- 19 So we had to communicate with them, particularly
- 20 more on -- we did it on Smart Voter issues, to get
- 21 a button for Smart Voter.
- 22 But I do not remember any conversation
- 23 with the library at all about voter ID, except our
- 24 voter services committee chair communicated to us
- 25 that she communicated with them, which is -- people



- 1 down the road.
- 2 Q Can you explain what Smart Voter is.
- 3 A Smart Voter is the new format for the
- 4 voter's quide that used to be a paper document you
- 5 got once in an election in the newspaper. And
- 6 because of the cost of the newspaper version, only
- 7 one day, we had no choice but to take it out of
- 8 there and go to the computer system.
- 9 Smart Voter is online all the time. So
- 10 all during an election period, if I have an
- interest in what's happening, I can go to Smart
- 12 Voter any day and see who is running and what
- 13 candidates have responded to questions with their
- 14 information on there.
- 15 O So Smart Voter is an electronic version
- of the League's voter's guide?
- 17 A Correct.
- 18 O Does it come from the national league?
- 19 A It comes from actually a state league,
- 20 yes.
- 21 Q Finally I just want to go back -- you
- 22 talked about discussing getting voters to the
- 23 driver's license center by a bus. Were you talking
- 24 about the Rover bus?
- 25 A That was it; right.



- 1 Q What is the Rover bus?
- 2 A Rover is a transportation system that's
- 3 available to elderly, but it does cost -- it's not
- 4 expensive. And it helps people get where they need
- 5 to get at times. But apparently when the voter ID
- 6 situation came up, we, the League, contacted Rover
- 7 to see if they would help voters get to PennDOT.
- 8 And they couldn't because they didn't
- 9 know how long they would be at PennDOT or -- so
- 10 they literally said they couldn't afford to add
- 11 that into their services.
- 12 Q And it also wasn't free; is that
- 13 correct?
- 14 A It was what?
- 15 0 It was not free?
- 16 A No, it was not free.
- 17 Q And were they asking the League to pay
- 18 for the cost for getting voters there?
- 19 A No.
- 20 O And the Rover bus is limited to Chester
- 21 County; is that right?
- 22 A Correct.
- MS. SCHNEIDER: That's all I have, Your
- 24 Honor.
- MR. SCHMIDT: Just very briefly, Your



Page 1224 1 Honor. 2 RECROSS-EXAMINATION 4 5 BY MR. SCHMIDT: Ms. Carty, could you take a look again 6 0 at Petitioner's Exhibit 1750. And you were asked 7 about Field H, which is Election Day issues. 8 9 Are the content of those issues limited to voter ID? Are there more than voter ID 10 discussed on calls identified as Election Day 11 issues? 12 13 There's other Election Day issues that Α 14 are other topics. 15 Okay. And you also testified that 16 there's 32 Leagues. Is this the only call log 17 kept? 18 Oh, no. This is just -- this is just Α 19 the state. Every League has a phone number. All Leagues are not consistent or the same based upon 20 21 their membership and who's willing to have the call 22 line in their house basically. 23 The bigger Leagues that have more 24 membership would have a much better call line, more 25 effective call line. Some Leagues are very, very



- 1 small and they're kind of isolated.
- 2 Q Are the other Leagues, do they document
- 3 calls similar to what the state does, like this
- 4 chart?
- 5 A My understanding would be they should.
- 6 I have not spoken to everyone yet to ask them how
- 7 they do it or if it is different than the state.
- 8 Q Have you, as president, seen call logs
- 9 come in from any of the other 32 League chapters?
- 10 A No. Have I personally seen them? No.
- 11 Q So you can't testify whether or not
- 12 they actually exist or if it's more of a policy; is
- 13 that correct?
- 14 A (Nods head.)
- MR. SCHMIDT: That's all I have,
- 16 Your Honor. Thank you.
- 17 MS. SCHNEIDER: Your Honor, I have
- 18 nothing further.
- 19 THE COURT: Thank you, Mrs. Carty.
- THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- 21 THE COURT: It's 11:00. Take five
- 22 minutes and come back.
- THE CLERK: The Court is in recess.
- 24 (Recess taken.)
- THE CLERK: Court is in session.



- 1 THE COURT: Stay seated, please.
- 2 Thank you, Counsel. I'm informed that
- 3 we have two videos, maybe 25 minutes apiece,
- 4 50 minutes in total. That will wind up the morning
- 5 session.
- 6 MR. JONES: Great. Thank you, Your
- 7 Honor.
- 8 The first video we'll play is the video
- 9 deposition of Nadine Marsh. Ms. Marsh is a voter
- 10 and also a former Petitioner in this case. And
- 11 I've already given to Respondents' counsel, the
- 12 court reporter and the bailiff for Your Honor a
- 13 copy of the CD and the written transcript as well
- 14 as the exhibits.
- 15 THE COURT: We have this. Thank you,
- 16 Counsel.
- 17 (Whereupon excerpts of the video
- 18 deposition of Nadine Marsh, Petitioners' Exhibit
- 19 2100, was played in open court.)
- MR. JONES: Your Honor, we'd like to
- 21 move into evidence Petitioners' Exhibit 2100, which
- is a video of Mrs. Marsh's deposition, as well as
- 23 Petitioners' Exhibit 2100-A through 2100-G, which
- 24 were the exhibits to the deposition.
- MR. HUTCHISON: Your Honor, the only



- 1 objection we would have is to Exhibit 6, which is
- 2 not an official PennDOT document and is partially
- 3 inconsistent with the stipulation between the
- 4 parties last summer regarding the center hours.
- 5 MR. JONES: Your Honor, I believe
- 6 Mrs. Marsh explained what the document is: it's a
- 7 printout from the Web site DMV.org. She
- 8 authenticated the document.
- 9 MR. HUTCHISON: It doesn't address the
- 10 objection. That's not a PennDOT document.
- 11 THE COURT: It will be admitted.
- MR. JONES: Your Honor, we have one
- 13 more video to play, the deposition of Catherine
- 14 Howell. I understand it's about 28 minutes, which
- 15 would run us a couple minutes past noon.
- 16 THE COURT: That would be fine.
- 17 MR. JONES: The CD which is being
- 18 handed up is Petitioners' Exhibit 1427.
- 19 THE COURT: What was Mrs. Marsh's
- 20 exhibit? 2100?
- 21 MR. JONES: Correct; and the exhibits
- 22 to her exhibit were 2100-A through 2100-G.
- THE COURT: And what are you going to
- 24 do with Ms. Howell? What's her deposition?
- MR. JONES: The video of the deposition



- 1 is Petitioners' Exhibit 1427; and there are no
- 2 exhibits to the deposition.
- 3 THE COURT: Okay.
- 4 (Whereupon excerpts of the video
- 5 deposition of Catherine Howell, Petitioners'
- 6 Exhibit 1427, was played in open court.)
- 7 MR. JONES: Your Honor we move into
- 8 evidence Petitioners' Exhibit 1427, which is the
- 9 video of Mrs. Howell's deposition.
- 10 MR. SCHMIDT: No objection.
- 11 THE COURT: It will be admitted.
- MR. RUBIN: Your Honor, that's all we
- 13 have for today. Tomorrow morning we'll have some
- 14 brief written submissions, which won't take very
- 15 long. The one outstanding item is that I
- 16 understand that the Respondents were supposed to
- 17 provide a list of who their witnesses will be and
- 18 when they'll be testifying, for the Court and for
- 19 the Petitioners.
- MR. HUTCHISON: Your Honor, we do have
- 21 a proposed schedule that we can distribute to the
- 22 Court and to Petitioners.
- 23 THE COURT: Are there any plans for
- 24 Counsel to meet this afternoon?
- MR. RUBIN: Your Honor, we received



- 1 shortly before midnight a list of who the 144 were
- 2 for the first time. We've sent that to our
- 3 colleagues at BLDS. Our plan was to touch base
- 4 with them and then get in contact with Respondents
- 5 as appropriate to figure out how we can move that
- 6 forward, as the Court has asked.
- 7 MS. HICKOK: Your Honor, they have
- 8 also asked for information from PennDOT. I've been
- 9 in touch with PennDOT to find out how to produce
- 10 that information. It will necessitate taking one
- 11 of the exhibits that's been admitted so far and
- 12 placing that exhibit under seal. But if we can
- 13 work that out, we will find a way to produce that
- data in a way that conforms to PennDOT's legal
- 15 obligations.
- 16 THE COURT: Okay. Now, I see your
- 17 Proposed Witness Schedule for Monday the 29th. I
- 18 am on another panel at 1 o'clock on Monday the
- 19 29th, so can we move that to Tuesday the 30th?
- 20 Because my afternoon panel will only be a couple
- 21 hours.
- MS. HICKOK: That's fine, Your Honor.
- MR. RUBIN: Just to clarify, there will
- 24 be no Court on that day?
- 25 THE COURT: Yeah. I have to do some --



- 1 I'm on another panel. So we'll have to schedule
- 2 these witnesses for Tuesday and thereafter.
- MS. HICKOK: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 4 MR. KEATING: Your Honor, one thing.
- 5 Other than the written submissions you
- 6 plan to submit tomorrow, are you planning on any
- 7 other witnesses in your case in chief?
- MR. RUBIN: Your Honor, by agreement,
- 9 Kurt Myers will be testifying in their case but
- 10 also as part of our case in chief. We also --
- 11 given where we stand on the data -- and we haven't
- 12 gotten it -- we'd like to keep open our case in
- 13 chief or get an agreement that we can present
- 14 evidence on that in a rebuttal case.
- 15 And we can do it either way. But we
- 16 don't have any more live witnesses in our case in
- 17 chief other than relating to that issue; and then
- 18 also Mr. Myers.
- MR. KEATING: We would not object,
- 20 first of all, to Mr. Myers. That's not
- 21 problematic. Yes, you can cross-examine him beyond
- 22 the scope of direct.
- But what I'm sort of searching for is,
- 24 I believe there's going to come a point in time
- 25 where we're going to ask for a Rule 230.1 motion in



- 1 this case, and I'm just trying to figure out when
- 2 that was going to be presented.
- 3 THE COURT: If you know.
- 4 MR. KEATING: Compulsory nonsuit.
- 5 MR. RUBIN: Right. Subject to the 144
- 6 data, to the extent that's relevant to responding
- 7 to that -- we don't think it necessarily is -- but
- 8 we would want to have that information, have a
- 9 chance to potentially take discovery, potentially
- 10 reach an agreement, potentially present to the
- 11 witness concerning that.
- 12 MR. KEATING: And we don't anticipate
- 13 that that information, one way or the other, is
- 14 going to be determinative in any way relative to
- 15 the rule we're going to be asking for.
- 16 THE COURT: Okay. Well, we can
- 17 coordinate that as best we can as we move along.
- 18 Okay?
- 19 MR. KEATING: Thank you, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: So we'll recess until 9:30
- 21 tomorrow. Okay?
- MS. HICKOK: Thank you, Your Honor.
- THE CLERK: Court is in recess.
- 24 (Proceedings adjourned: 12:12 p.m.)





1	CERTIFICATE OF SHORTHAND REPORTER	Page	1232
2			
3	I, Gail Inghram Verbano, Registered		
4	Diplomate Reporter, Certified Realtime Reporter,		
5	Certified Shorthand Reporter (CA), and Notary		
6	Public, the officer before whom the foregoing		
7	proceedings were taken, do hereby certify that the		
8	foregoing transcript is a true and correct record		
9	of the proceedings; that said proceedings were		
10	taken by me stenographically and thereafter reduced		
11	to typewriting under my supervision; and that I am		
12	neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by		
13	any of the parties to this case and have no		
14	interest, financial or otherwise, in its outcome.		
15			
16	1		
17	Sail Ingham Verban		
18	Gail Inghram Verbano, RDR, CRR, CSR		
19	CA-CSR No. 8635		
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			



		Index. Iarea			
	<b>65</b> 1165:12	address 1188:6 1211:16			
1		administrative 1184:5			
<b>1</b> 1198:13 1199:3	7	admissible 1179:19			
<b>1-866-OUR-VOTE</b> 1217:25	<b>7</b> 1190:5 1219:16	admitted 1220:9			
<b>10</b> 1189:2 1199:11,16 1200:7 1202:19	<b>700</b> 1180:9,25 1210:14	<b>advance</b> 1164:2 1166:18 1167:16 1207:8			
<b>101</b> 1170:9	8	advertisement 1173:24 1203:2			
<b>11:00</b> 1225:21		advertises 1202:25			
<b>12</b> 1189:23 1198:13	<b>8</b> 1202:19	advertising 1169:18 1173:15			
<b>1430</b> 1175:3,7	<b>85</b> 1167:7 1172:6	advised 1204:17			
<b>1430-A</b> 1175:1		<b>afford</b> 1223:10			
<b>1430A</b> 1174:21,24	anord 1223:10  agencies 1172:9,11,20 1193:				
<b>15</b> 1172:8,24	<b>91</b> 1189:24	1195:11,14			
<b>1750</b> 1185:7 1195:22 1197:18 1198:8 1218:22 1224:7	<b>93-year-old</b> 1176:10	<b>agency</b> 1164:13			
<b>18</b> 1202:1 1206:3,6,9,14,18,19	<b>96</b> 1190:6 1219:17	<b>Aging</b> 1172:12			
1217:7,11	<b>9:15</b> 1160:2	<b>agree</b> 1199:10 1200:6			
<b>1980</b> 1165:9 1170:8,9		ahead 1193:21			
<b>1981</b> 1170:7,10	A	ahold 1170:21			
	<b>a.m.</b> 1160:2	<b>air</b> 1203:4,6			
2	<b>AAA</b> 1172:14,19	Allegheny 1162:22			
<b>2012</b> 1160:2 1185:18 1192:4,5	<b>ABC</b> 1192:7	allowed 1190:13 1215:12			
1200:17 1207:1	ability 1208:3	Americans 1167:9			
<b>226</b> 1182:4	absentee 1211:17	amount 1180:12 1193:23			
<b>23</b> 1160:2	accept 1191:1,14,18	<b>annual</b> 1177:21			
3	acceptable 1211:12	<b>answering</b> 1183:3 1192:25 1195:7 1201:22			
20 44040 447040	access 1196:13 1197:14	<b>answers</b> 1182:16			
<b>30</b> 1161:8 1179:12	<b>act</b> 1167:10 1170:9,11 1202:1 1206:3, 6,9,14,18,19 1216:6 1217:7,11	apparent 1215:22			
<b>32</b> 1218:19 1224:16 1225:9	acting 1200:20	apparently 1223:5			
4	action 1188:15 1198:6	appearances 1160:7			
	active 1216:2	appears 1200:9			
<b>4130</b> 1175:7	activities 1180:5 1181:16,21	application 1165:19,21,25 1166:4,11			
6	actual 1161:24 1187:5	approval 1178:11			
	add 1223:10	approximately 1188:25 1202:19			
<b>6</b> 1189:22,23 1192:7,8,11,16 1193:2 1195:19 1200:20 1201:15 1202:22,25	addition 1218:6	area 1162:23 1163:12,17 1169:25			
1203:4,11	additional 1217:17 1218:9	1171:16 1172:11 1173:14,18 1192:11 1195:24 1198:21 1206:12			

#### Index: areas..Channel

areas 1192:20

**Arnold** 1160:9

**art** 1212:10

articles 1180:20 1216:24,25 1217:1

asserted 1191:10 assigned 1178:8

assist 1164:19 1210:7

assistance 1164:24 1165:1

**assistant** 1182:11 **assisted** 1210:14,17

assisting 1208:24,25 1209:1

attempt 1209:11 attend 1179:5

attended 1179:1 1181:14,15,16

attendees 1178:9

attention 1186:1 1192:3 1218:22

**authorities** 1168:25 1169:21

1170:12

authority 1162:22 1171:1 1172:17

authorized 1168:9 authorizing 1170:8

**aware** 1171:14,22 1173:15,19,23 1177:9 1188:5 1192:17 1200:4 1206:7 1207:24,25 1208:4,7,9,11,12,

18,19 1209:12 1217:25

В

**back** 1180:22 1202:12,13 1205:5 1207:1 1220:15 1221:17 1222:21

1225:22

**bag** 1211:18

**Bala** 1192:7

**balance** 1168:2,5

**ballot** 1211:17

barriers 1176:12,20

based 1188:22 1220:1 1224:20

**basically** 1207:17 1216:1 1224:22

**Bates** 1184:14,15

**beaten** 1176:16

beginning 1211:19

behalf 1160:10

**bi-annual** 1177:21

**bi-county** 1172:18

bigger 1224:23

biggest 1209:11

**bill** 1215:22

bit 1181:2 1217:23

**blue** 1174:17

board 1177:25 1208:17

**Bonita** 1182:10

**books** 1197:8

**booths** 1195:3

**bottom** 1189:23

branch 1205:1,2

**branches** 1220:24

break 1210:21

breakdown 1198:15

**briefly** 1223:25

bring 1207:21

broadcast 1192:12

bureau 1161:1 1171:20

**bus** 1209:4,5 1222:23,24 1223:1,20

**buses** 1168:25

busiest 1198:25 1200:13

**business** 1184:3,24 1187:2,5

1206:18

busy 1183:6 1210:5

**button** 1196:13 1205:5 1221:13,21

C

**call** 1160:11 1166:17 1170:19,25 1175:13 1177:5 1182:18,21 1185:1, 18,22 1186:18,23 1187:1,3,4,8,15,17,

19 1188:1,3 1190:2,9 1191:20 1192:6 1193:9,12 1195:20 1199:8,11,21 1200:13 1202:11,21 1203:4 1211:25 1216:15 1218:4,9,12,20 1220:1 1224:16,21,24,25 1225:8

**called** 1166:24 1170:20 1199:22 1210:15

caller 1190:1,3,8,10,19

callers 1191:16 1193:11 1218:13

calling 1186:25 1195:2 1201:8

**calls** 1171:21 1182:24 1183:5,10,14, 17 1184:20 1188:22,25 1189:4,5,17 1191:11 1192:25 1193:3,6,15,24 1194:1 1195:8 1198:16,17,21,25 1199:5,12,16,18 1200:7,21 1201:5,18 1202:7,17 1218:23 1219:5,9,10 1220:2 1224:11 1225:3

candidates 1177:24 1222:13

car 1208:14 1209:3

care 1212:3,8,10

**Carty** 1175:13,15 1176:2 1185:12 1198:4 1213:14 1217:22 1224:6

1225:19

case 1166:8 1202:10 1212:11

catalog 1197:6,10

catalogs 1197:8 categories 1198:16

categorized 1218:23 1219:9,11

caused 1190:24 1194:4

**CD** 1174:19

1220:2

**center** 1171:10,24 1181:5 1192:6 1211:22 1212:17 1222:23

**centers** 1180:17 1207:10,18 1210:16,17,18 1211:23 1212:13

chair 1178:20 1221:24

**change** 1195:5

changed 1206:17,21,23

**Channel** 1192:7,8,11,16 1193:2 1195:19 1200:20 1201:15 1202:22,25 1203:4,11



## Index: chapter..customers

**chapter** 1199:18,19 1216:1,16

chapters 1182:18 1188:8 1225:9

characterization 1212:7

characterized 1219:23

**charge** 1164:5 **chart** 1225:4

**Chester** 1178:14,17,22 1180:7,23,24 1181:3,6 1196:8 1199:20 1204:14 1205:1 1209:19,24 1210:3 1220:19

1221:4,15,17 1223:20

**choice** 1222:7 **choose** 1214:20

churches 1180:15 1181:14

circumstances 1171:10

**citizens** 1182:21

**City** 1209:10

clarified 1202:14

**clarify** 1168:23 1187:16 1195:18

1199:17 1209:22

clarifying 1180:20

**clear** 1195:15

**CLERK** 1160:4,17 1175:18 1225:23,

25

**co-counsel** 1174:10

coalition 1207:14

Coatesville 1181:17

colleague 1175:10

colleagues 1207:2

Collins 1160:11,13,25

column 1186:15 1187:2,7,9,14,19

1219:20

commissioners 1211:24,25

committed 1176:18

**committee** 1177:22 1178:2,19 1215:25 1216:4 1221:24

**common** 1211:8

Commonwealth 1160:4 1199:15

1214:6

communicate 1211:14 1221:19

communicated 1204:15 1221:24,25

communicates 1182:17

communications 1188:8

**companies** 1169:6,7

**company** 1187:6

complaints 1171:14,23 1203:4,6

complied 1215:3

**computer** 1181:11 1183:13 1185:23, 24 1196:18 1197:14 1204:24 1221:9

1222:8

**computers** 1196:12 1197:2,5,10,11, 13 1203:20,24 1205:6 1221:13

**concern** 1180:21 1188:5 1195:4

1209:2 1215:23

concerned 1191:21,22

concerns 1188:10 1201:23

confused 1189:8,9 1194:24 1202:9

confusion 1189:7,10 1190:24 1191:1

1193:23 1194:4,6,25 1200:22

1202:14 1215:23

consistent 1205:10 1224:20

**consumed** 1206:23

consumers 1171:23

contact 1212:21,24

contacted 1195:13 1211:23 1212:16,

17 1213:8 1223:6

contacting 1195:10

content 1183:23 1224:9

contingency 1170:22

continue 1179:23 1185:4 1186:3

1194:19

continuity 1182:15

contrary 1217:6,8

**control** 1170:1

convention 1177:21,23 1178:6,7,9

1179:1,2,6,24 1180:4

conversation 1208:20 1209:7

1221:12,22

conversations 1209:4

coordinated 1207:13

coordinating 1192:19

copies 1174:15

copy 1174:18

**correct** 1169:10,22 1172:5,7,10 1175:7 1181:8,9 1193:10 1195:22 1199:1,12 1200:4,8,11,12,14,23,24 1201:6,11,17,21,25 1202:3,15 1203:5,14,21,25 1204:1,3, 1212:4,14 1213:5,19 1214:17,21 1216:9,

correctly 1201:20 1210:1 1214:25

1218:10 1222:17 1223:13,22 1225:13

cost 1222:6 1223:3,18

Counselor 1217:15

counties 1164:25 1192:14

**county** 1162:22 1172:18,20,22 1178:15,17,22 1180:8,23,24 1181:3, 6,16 1196:8 1199:20 1204:13,14,16, 21,24 1205:1 1206:8 1209:19,25 1210:3,16 1211:23,24 1212:8,13,18 1216:3,22 1220:19 1221:4,16,18 1223:21

county-level 1172:16

couple 1168:22 1181:7 1216:24

**court** 1160:5,6 1168:14 1174:6,16,24 1175:9 1176:1 1179:19 1183:24 1185:4, 1186:8 1191:1, 1193:18 1194:13,16 1197:20,24 1212:12 1213:7 1217:15 1219:12 1220:9 1225:19,21,23,25

**cover** 1170:22

covers 1198:23

created 1183:16 1184:23

creating 1185:1

**critical** 1193:8

cross 1168:16 1198:1 1220:6

cross-examination 1191:5

cross-examined 1191:17

customer 1170:14 1171:2.19

customers 1171:14



cut 1209:9

Cynwyd 1192:7

D

**Dana** 1160:9

database 1182:19

date 1186:23

**day** 1163:9 1164:2 1166:18 1183:7 1192:4,5,16 1193:2,8 1195:18 1200:25 1201:16 1202:17 1203:1,9, 19 1206:25 1219:1,11,25 1220:3 1222:7,12 1224:8,11,13

days 1163:5 1203:18

debates 1192:10

decisions 1170:2

dedicated 1176:10 1216:20

deems 1214:16,17

defer 1174:10

**defines** 1167:8

definition 1167:9

**Delaware** 1192:13

delegates 1178:8

denial 1170:19

denied 1171:23

deny 1170:17

**Department** 1173:24 1204:11

1213:7

deploy 1164:23

deposition 1174:14,23

describe 1181:2

describes 1187:7

designated 1184:12

designations 1174:17,18

desk 1196:18

destination 1171:12

difference 1172:21

difficulties 1195:3

**direct** 1160:19 1169:20 1172:3 1173:1 1175:20 1186:1 1192:3 1195:11 1205:7,12 1218:21

directed 1187:4 1193:9 1215:14

direction 1215:1

**directive** 1173:13 1208:15,21 **directly** 1188:6 1201:8 1212:3

**director** 1161:1,10 1162:13 1182:10, 11 1221:17

disabilities 1166:21,25 1167:2,5,8,

disability 1167:19

discount 1162:8,10 1165:4,16

1167:6,7,24

10,23

discounts 1162:4 1165:11

discovery 1184:11,17

discussed 1180:4 1224:11

discussing 1222:22

discussion 1172:2 1180:14 1221:4,

15

display 1204:10

displayed 1203:25

dissuading 1208:23

distributed 1181:13

disturbed 1211:11

divide 1215:14

divisions 1208:4

**document** 1185:12,17 1186:7,15,18 1189:14 1190:17 1191:8 1192:1,2

1198:8 1219:17 1222:4 1225:2

documentation 1166:13

donation 1215:6,7

donations 1213:18,24

door-to-door 1161:21

double 1190:16 1191:21,23 1219:7

driver 1164:23

driver's 1207:9,18 1211:9 1222:23

drivers 1164:18

drove 1209:2

duly 1160:13 1175:15

duties 1185:2

Ε

ear 1201:7

earlier 1185:23 1195:6 1205:22

**East** 1176:4

easy 1181:11

educate 1200:3 1211:4 1213:2

educating 1201:20 1202:1 1206:2

**education** 1178:19 1187:11 1188:17 1191:8 1205:23,25 1214:1 1215:11,

14,16,17 1216:21

**educational** 1176:25 1177:3,4

1216:25 1217:3

effect 1170:4

effective 1224:25

effort 1206:24 1207:13

efforts 1180:5 1188:17 1191:9

1207:2

elderly 1207:21 1208:5,24 1211:9

1216:5 1223:3

**election** 1183:7 1192:4,5,16 1193:2,8

1195:18 1200:17 1201:1 1202:2 1219:1,11,25 1220:3 1222:5,10

1224:8,11,13

electronic 1222:15

eligible 1169:11 1172:23

email 1186:24

enacted 1206:6,15

**enhance** 1191:8

enlarging 1186:9

**ensure** 1176:19

**ensuring** 1176:11

enter 1183:11



## Index: entered..happened

entered 1185:23,24

entire 1198:22 1199:14 1200:10

1201:15

establishes 1163:2,5

evidence 1175:1 1179:21 1190:25

1197:18

**examination** 1160:19 1168:16 1172:3 1175:20 1198:1 1217:19

examined 1160:14 1175:16

examples 1189:21 1219:19

**exception** 1184:3 **excerpts** 1174:22

**excuse** 1174:4 1212:6

executive 1182:9

**exhibit** 1174:19,21,23 1175:1,3, 1185:7,9,21 1186:14 1195:22

1197:18 1218:22 1224:7

exist 1225:12

expected 1170:24

expensive 1223:4

experienced 1193:24

**expired** 1211:9

**explain** 1182:23 1186:14 1204:6 1208:22 1210:12,13,20 1214:23

1222:2

extending 1190:22

extensive 1206:24

**extent** 1171:13

F

face 1196:21

facilities 1212:3,10

facility 1212:8

fact 1174:15

faculties 1206:5

faculty 1206:14,16,22

fair 1214:15

fairs 1181:15

fall 1187:11 1206:12 1215:17

falls 1177:5 1206:9

familiar 1162:12 1207:5,10,14,16

families 1176:17 family 1211:13

**fare** 1162:10 1163:25 1164:4,5,7,8, 11,15 1167:24 1168:2 1172:6,21

**farmers'** 1181:15

fashion 1210:8 1214:7

**federal** 1214:3

feel 1168:21 1177:24

felt 1194:20.24 1215:23 1216:6

**Field** 1224:8

**figure** 1171:11

figured 1180:9

filed 1160:7

fill 1165:19 1166:4,10 1177:25

**Finally** 1222:21

find 1169:14 1181:11 1188:12 1203:6

**finding** 1177:9 1197:8

finishing 1178:23

focus 1211:7 1215:24

focused 1189:6 1215:1

**follow** 1169:9

follow-up 1168:22 1173:10 1198:6

form 1165:19,22 1166:11 1214:6

format 1222:3

**Forster** 1182:4

forums 1192:10

foundation 1179:21 1183:20,23

1184:2 1191:7

free 1168:21 1209:6 1223:12,15,16

frequent 1180:13 1212:23

front 1180:4 1198:8

full 1167:24

full-time 1182:7,9

**fund** 1215:11,15

funding 1213:21,23 1214:10,16,19

**funds** 1209:9,13,17 1214:25 1215:1,

7,9,10,11

G

gave 1170:16

Geffen 1175:6

general 1161:22 1163:20

gentleman 1196:17

**geographic** 1163:11,17 1169:20,25

1192:11

give 1162:19,24 1214:13

**goal** 1177:6

**good** 1160:8,22,23 1174:11 1175:12,

23,24 1198:4 1204:12

**Goshen** 1176:4

government 1212:4

**grant** 1213:25 1214:5,18 1215:1,2,5

**grantee** 1215:3

grants 1214:2,3

gray 1189:17

gray-highlighted 1219:5

greets 1182:17

group 1209:17 1210:20 1215:18

guarantee 1205:15

guess 1206:17 1210:5 1217:3

**guessing** 1214:14

guide 1215:2 1222:4,16

guidelines 1215:15

Н

**handles** 1183:21

happen 1212:21

happened 1178:5



# Index: happening..law

happening 1222:11

happy 1211:10

**harassed** 1176:17

Harrisburg 1160:1 1182:5

head 1225:14

headings 1186:15

health 1172:22

healthcare 1167:20 1172:23

heard 1202:8 1208:25 1210:1

**hearing** 1184:9

hearings 1207:8

hearsay 1179:13 1190:16 1191:2,21,

22,23 1219:7

held 1161:4 1180:12

helping 1180:10 1181:7 1206:1

helps 1223:4

hesitancy 1208:13

highlight 1189:17

highlighting 1189:17

**history** 1176:13,18

Hoke 1182:10

**hold** 1178:13

home 1196:22 1197:15 1204:24

1220:20

homes 1180:16

honest 1214:13

honestly 1199:23

Honor 1160:8 1168:13 1174:4,8,11, 25 1175:8,13 1179:14 1183:18 1184:1,4,10 1185:5 1186:4 1190:15, 20 1191:4,13,24 1193:13,14 1194:12, 15,17 1197:19,21,22 1212:6 1217:13, 16 1219:6,8 1220:4,5,8 1223:24

1224:1 1225:16,17

Horn 1207:4

**Hospital** 1181:17

hotline 1192:6 1193:12 1202:25

1203:2,10 1218:1,3,6,9

hotlines 1217:23,24 1218:13

**hours** 1163:2 1180:8,9,12,25 1181:6,

7 1193:4 1210:14

house 1224:22

ı

ID 1170:5,11,15 1171:4,10,25 1173:1, 1179:2,8,25 1180:2,25 1181:4,8,9,20 1188:22 1189:1,4,6,18 1190:4,10,12, 13 1194:1,4,8,10 1195:12,17 1196:14 1197:12,15 1199:4,16 1201:2 1203:24 1205:5 1206:3 1207:22 1208:6,24 1210:23 1211:5,8 1213:3 1215:21,22 1216:21 1219:5,9 1220:2,

20 1221:1,5,8,13,23 1223:5 1224:10

idea 1205:18

identification 1185:6 1196:14

identified 1193:7 1224:11

**identify** 1210:22

identifying 1186:5

impression 1179:18 1193:22 1194:3

1197:9,13 1208:12 1218:16

impressions 1193:17

include 1161:14 1172:11 1206:2

1211:3

including 1180:7

inconsistent 1189:11

**individual** 1164:1,18 1165:15,18 1166:3, 1167:12,18 1204:22,25

1221:13,14

individually 1180:3 1210:22

individuals 1162:5 1165:12,25

information 1177:10 1182:19 1183:12 1186:5 1188:1 1190:18 1193:9 1196:12,14,20 1197:12,15 1201:25 1203:24 1207:19 1208:23

1220:20,25 1221:8 1222:14

**injunction** 1179:16 1190:23 1191:3

inspected 1203:20

instances 1164:14

instructed 1170:21

instruction 1173:16

**instructions** 1170:12,16 1171:2

**interest** 1222:11

interesting 1205:17

intimidated 1194:21

introduce 1175:25

investigation 1207:9

involved 1210:3 1212:13

isolated 1225:1

issue 1187:7 1188:5 1190:1,8

**issues** 1193:8 1195:11,13 1219:1,11, 25 1220:3 1221:20 1224:8,9,12,13

J

jailed 1176:16

Janice 1207:4

**Jones** 1174:10,11,12,25 1175:10

Judge 1160:5

July 1160:2 1207:1,8

K

**KEATING** 1168:13,18 1173:5 1174:3,

7 1175:8

**Kevin** 1198:5

kind 1210:21 1211:18 1225:1

kinds 1193:11 1194:6

**knew** 1214:12

**knowledge** 1171:5 1193:15

L

lack 1201:2

laid 1191:7

**Laverne** 1160:11,13,25 1168:19,20

law 1160:14 1170:5 1175:16 1194:4

1206:3



# Index: lay..mission

lay 1184:2

laying 1179:21

leadership 1178:16

leading 1220:7

league 1176:5,8,9,13,21,24 1177:4,6, 12,17,18 1178:13,15,17,22 1180:8, 23,24 1181:3,24,25 1182:18,20 1183:4,9,11,21 1187:4,6,13,25 1188:22 1189:1,3 1191:7,11 1192:18 1199:1,15,20,25 1200:3,14 1201:19 1205:10,23 1206:5 1207:3 1208:2,5, 16 1209:19,20 1210:2,8 1211:20 1212:2,21 1213:1,8, 1214:15,20 1215:8 1218:3,20 1221:3, 1222:18,19 1223:6,17 1224:19 1225:9

**League's** 1177:2 1184:24 1217:6,10 1222:16

**Leagues** 1179:9,11 1180:1,3,7,11 1218:7,19 1224:16,20,23,25 1225:2

learn 1178:10 1179:8,25 1204:13

learned 1189:4 1211:11

learning 1214:12

left 1186:22

legislation 1170:8

legislative 1166:10

**level** 1171:17 1172:18 1206:8 1208:19,20 1209:3,25 1210:3 1213:11 1216:4,22,23

levels 1215:13

liabilities 1208:14

liability 1209:2

librarian 1204:5

libraries 1204:21 1221:14

**library** 1195:25 1196:3,5,7,8,16,21, 22 1203:14 1204:6,22,23,25 1220:16,

19,25 1221:4,16,18,23

license 1211:9 1222:23

licensing 1207:9,18

lift 1164:23

limited 1223:20 1224:9

lines 1202:19

list 1218:23

listed 1199:6

listened 1201:7

**literally** 1223:10

live 1176:3.4 1182:24 1187:23

living 1210:17

**local** 1162:16,18 1165:22 1171:16 1172:9 1173:13,15 1180:1,3 1196:5 1199:22 1200:1 1208:18 1209:3,18, 25 1212:4 1218:7

locale 1164:22

locality 1164:9

locally 1169:16

located 1171:11 1182:3

locating 1197:8

location 1163:16 1171:3 1186:25

**locations** 1210:24

**log** 1183:11,14,16,20,22 1184:5,15, 20,23 1185:1,18,22 1188:1,19,23 1191:19 1196:18 1198:13,15,20 1199:12,24 1218:12 1220:2,10,19 1224:16

logged 1196:25 1197:10

logs 1184:13 1188:3 1225:8

long 1163:24 1177:14 1223:9

**looked** 1171:9 1195:21 1207:19 1213:1 1218:16 1219:20

**lost** 1176:17

lot 1209:4 1212:24

lower 1209:8

М

machine 1183:3 1187:20

made 1171:13,22 1191:20 1192:17

1195:15

Madeline 1207:4

mail 1165:25

**maintain** 1181:25

maintains 1182:15,19

make 1170:2 1200:3 1206:13 1217:7,

11

makes 1183:14 1184:20

**making** 1207:3

Malvern 1196:4,7,20,22 1203:14

1205:2

manage 1169:12

Marian 1175:10

mark 1185:6

marked 1174:16 1185:8 1198:7

markets 1181:15

materials 1181:13

matter 1184:5 1191:10 1194:22

**matters** 1165:8

Mcginley 1160:5

means 1187:22

meant 1180:15 1181:20 1217:3

meeting 1178:8

**meetings** 1180:14

member 1176:5 1221:18

members 1180:18 1208:16 1211:13

1216:2

membership 1213:24 1215:6,7,10

1224:21,24

membership-driven 1213:15

men 1176:15

mention 1186:4

**mentioned** 1164:4 1178:25 1179:4 1185:22 1190:21 1195:6 1218:7

message 1186:21 1187:20

messages 1182:16 1183:12

mind 1168:19

minute 1218:19

minutes 1225:22

mission 1176:25 1177:3,4 1200:2



1201:19 1205:11,23,25 1206:10,14, 21 1213:2 1217:7,11

mixed 1211:18

modifying 1190:23

money 1214:18 1215:6

month 1184:13 1198:19 1200:10,13

monthly 1216:9,16,19

months 1177:23

morning 1160:9,22,23 1174:11

1175:12,23,24 1198:4

motion 1179:16 1190:22 1191:2

**move** 1174:25 1197:17 **multiple** 1180:19 1216:13

Ν

national 1215:13 1222:18

necessarily 1172:23 1191:10

**needed** 1192:17,23 1201:21 1207:22 1210:20 1211:15 1215:24 1216:6

Neubaum 1182:12 Neubaum's 1182:13

newer 1188:2

newsletter 1216:8,13,17,19,20

newsletters 1180:17 1188:7 1216:18

newspaper 1180:20 1222:5,6

nods 1225:14

nominating 1177:22 1178:2

nonpartisan 1215:16

normal 1173:14,18 1185:2 1212:21

1213:4

Norton 1174:14,23 1175:4

Norton's 1175:2 Noted 1197:20

**notice** 1215:20

noticed 1196:19

**November** 1184:15 1185:18 1189:1 1198:19,24 1199:16 1200:11,17

1201:1

**number** 1175:7 1182:21 1184:14,15 1186:24 1195:16,20,21 1199:4

1218:8 1224:19

**numbers** 1186:5

0

oath 1207:20

object 1197:19 1212:7

objection 1175:8 1193:13 1194:14

1219:7 1220:4

obtain 1207:22 1208:6

occasionally 1171:20

**occurred** 1208:9

offer 1167:23

offered 1179:15 1180:13 1191:9

offering 1190:21 1193:16

offers 1162:4 1165:11

office 1166:4,7 1170:23 1182:1,3,4,6,

8,15 1183:2,10 1184:21 1185:19

1199:17 1201:4

offices 1166:10

official 1204:6

older 1165:12 1210:25 1216:5

online 1222:9

open 1161:21 1163:19 1174:24

1180:14 1204:25

**opened** 1220:5

**operate** 1163:6,8

operation 1163:2

operations 1187:12 1212:22 1213:5

**opinion** 1217:2,5

opinionated 1217:1

opportunity 1191:5 1195:25

opposed 1186:21 1209:19

opposition 1217:7,9,11

order 1169:11 1170:14 1173:2

1190:23

ordinary 1184:23 1206:18

organization 1176:10,22 1213:16

organizations 1207:13

**organize** 1213:25

outreach 1181:20 1206:24 1207:2

1213:25 1215:16

overheard 1201:5

oversee 1162:19,23

oversees 1165:5 1169:8

owns 1169:3

Ρ

pages 1189:16

paid 1164:11 1168:3,5, 1172:8

paper 1222:4

**Pardon** 1209:15

part 1177:6 1179:17 1185:1 1196:7

1200:1,2 1206:20 1213:2 1216:15

part-time 1182:7,11

parties 1194:23

partisan 1176:22

partnership 1204:10

party 1168:9 1194:22

past 1216:23

Patricia 1174:14,23

pattern 1188:13

pay 1163:24 1172:5 1223:17

pays 1164:15 1172:3

**Penndot** 1161:2,7 1165:5 1168:25 1169:8 1170:14 1171:3,15,24 1172:5 1173:13,21 1207:9,18 1208:6 1223:7,

9

**Pennsylvania** 1160:1 1161:12 1163:22 1176:6 1177:18 1198:22

1214:6

**people** 1164:22 1180:14 1181:7 1186:6 1191:5 1194:7,8,24 1195:16



## Index: percent..Rae

1199:25 1200:3,16,21 1202:5 1206:1, 2 1207:21 1208:23 1209:12 1210:7, 19 1211:4,6 1213:1 1215:24 1216:6 1221:25 1223:4

percent 1167:7 1172:6,8,24

perception 1202:7

period 1188:3 1222:10

permit 1164:25

permitted 1164:19 1169:24

**person** 1166:4,16 1171:12 1182:9, 11, 1186:25 1187:6 1191:20

**personal** 1193:15

personally 1193:25 1201:3 1225:10

persons 1166:21,24 1167:1,4,23

**Peterson** 1160:8,9,21 1168:11 1173:9 1174:1,8 1185:11

**Petitioner's** 1175:1 1185:6 1197:18 1224:7

**Petitioners** 1160:10 1174:12 1175:13

Petitioners' 1174:17,20,23

**Philadelphia** 1166:9 1192:13,18 1193:10 1195:20

**phone** 1170:25 1182:16 1185:19 1186:20,24 1187:1 1189:5 1192:25 1193:6 1198:16,17,21 1199:18,19,24 1201:4 1224:19

phones 1183:12

**photo** 1173:1 1188:22 1189:1,4,6 1196:14 1197:15

physically 1164:19 1208:13

picked 1186:21 1187:20

Pittsburgh 1162:21 1166:9

place 1188:12 1190:4,25 1194:9

places 1190:12 1195:5,16

**play** 1174:9

played 1174:24

point 1162:1 1219:10

**policies** 1169:9

policy 1225:12

political 1194:23

poll 1189:8,9,10,11,12 1201:1

**polling** 1188:12 1190:3,25 1194:9 1195:3,5,16

**polls** 1194:21 1200:22 1201:13 1203:3

popped 1196:24

Port 1162:22

Porter 1160:9

**position** 1161:4 1162:13 1177:11,14

1178:13,17

positions 1177:25 1209:24

post 1206:18

preliminary 1179:16 1190:22 1191:2

prepared 1207:21,23

prepares 1183:22

present 1174:13 1175:11

**president** 1177:13,17 1178:3,12,14, 18,24 1181:4 1208:16 1210:2 1225:8

presiding 1160:5

price 1209:8

primarily 1179:15

**printout** 1185:24

**prior** 1170:4 1177:23 1178:18,19 1183:6 1200:7 1206:18

**private** 1169:7

problem 1203:3 1209:23

problematic 1193:7

problems 1193:11 1195:13

procedures 1182:16

proceed 1160:7 1197:23

**produce** 1184:16

produced 1180:17 1184:6,11,13

**program** 1161:15,18 1162:3,4,7 1165:4,6,9,11,16 1166:14,17,21,25 1167:1,4,8,13,22,23 1168:9 1169:15 1170:3 1173:17 programs 1169:12 1170:9 1213:25

prominently 1203:25 1204:9

proof 1167:19

proof-of-age 1166:13

**provide** 1163:12 1167:19 1169:22

1170:13 1172:20

**provided** 1171:3,15

**provider** 1162:16,18 1163:1,5,11,15 1165:22 1167:20 1168:3 1169:4

provider's 1166:6

**providers** 1163:8 1164:5 1165:24 1170:17 1172:23 1173:14

providing 1191:16 1206:1

**public** 1161:2,11,22 1163:20 1180:13,18 1196:12 1197:3,14

publicizes 1218:4 purpose 1179:20

purposes 1171:4,24

put 1192:2 1205:5,20 1208:23

**puts** 1192:10

putting 1177:23 1221:7

Q

qualified 1173:2

quarterly 1216:14,19

**question** 1170:18 1187:10,11 1199:21 1206:19 1212:12 1214:24 1216:12 1220:7

questioning 1220:16

**questions** 1168:23 1173:11 1183:25 1197:17 1198:6 1201:22 1217:17 1222:13

quickly 1216:7

R

radio 1180:19

Rae 1182:12,13,15 1183:1,15

1184:22



#### Index: Rae's..sense

Rae's 1185:2 raise 1190:1,8

**Rawley** 1207:4

re-register 1211:15

reach 1181:14 1212:2

**reading** 1190:16

ready 1160:7

**receive** 1171:20 1183:5 1188:22 1189:1 1213:21 1214:2,5,25

**received** 1171:14 1186:19,23 1187:17 1198:18 1199:16 1213:18

receives 1199:18

recently 1178:25 1196:1

receptive 1202:5 recess 1225:23.24

recognize 1181:8 1185:15

record 1175:5 records 1184:3 recross 1174:4

**RECROSS-EXAMINATION** 1173:7

1224:3

red 1174:17

redacted 1186:6

redactions 1186:7

redirect 1174:4 1217:19

reduced-fare 1166:21 1167:1

refer 1187:3

**referred** 1211:25

referring 1187:1 1209:22

reflect 1189:11
reflected 1193:23

reflection 1189:10 1194:23 1199:24

refused 1201:1,10

register 1165:15,18 1167:13,18

1210:8 1211:4,6

registered 1166:16 1181:10

registration 1213:3 registrations 1180:13 reimbursement 1169:12

reiterate 1172:25

related 1161:11 1165:8 1189:18

relative 1168:24 1170:11,13 1171:2

remember 1221:22 renewal 1179:16 renewing 1190:22

represent 1198:5,14,15,20 representation 1191:14 representatives 1179:5,9,10

request 1171:1 requested 1207:13 requests 1212:24

require 1166:3 required 1202:2 requires 1169:9

reservation 1164:2

respond 1193:10 responded 1222:13 respondents 1198:5

Respondents' 1174:18

**response** 1187:15

responsibilities 1161:11 1182:14

restate 1219:7

restrictions 1214:9 1215:8

retirement 1180:16 revealed 1193:19

review 1188:3 1193:19 1220:1

reviewed 1188:19 1189:13 1192:1

1193:18

ride 1166:18 1167:15 1171:24 1172:4

rider 1164:12,15 1168:6

riders 1162:8 1164:19

rides 1162:19,24

ringing 1202:20

rise 1160:4 1171:17

road 1222:1

**role** 1178:21,23 1193:6

rollout 1190:24

Rover 1222:24 1223:1,2,6,20

**row** 1186:2,13 1189:23 1190:6 1219:17

rules 1169:10 run 1162:15

running 1222:12

S

satisfaction 1171:19

schedule 1166:18 1167:15

**Schmidt** 1179:13 1183:18 1184:4,8 1190:15 1191:4, 1193:13 1194:12,15 1197:19,22 1198:3,5 1212:19 1217:13 1219:6 1220:4,7 1223:25 1224:5 1225:15

**Schmidt's** 1212:7

**Schneider** 1175:11,12,22 1179:14, 20,22 1184:1,7,10,18 1185:5,10 1186:3,10 1190:20 1191:6,24,25 1193:14,20 1194:17,18 1197:16,21 1212:6 1217:16,21 1219:8,14,15 1220:5,14 1223:23 1225:17

screen 1186:12 1196:20,24

scroll 1199:4

searching 1197:6

seated 1160:6,17 1175:18

section 1216:20,22

senior 1180:16 1181:5 1210:16,17

1211:22,23 1212:13,17

sense 1199:23 1202:6 1218:17



**separate** 1166:20 1215:5

September 1184:13

serve 1179:11

**service** 1161:15,17,20,21,24 1162:5, 9,12,13,15,19,23 1163:3,6,9,12,13, 19,23 1164:1,6,17 1165:13 1167:5,25 1169:22 1170:4,19 1173:3,14,17,18

1209:5,6

**services** 1170:13 1171:15 1177:5 1206:2,10,12 1215:25 1216:4

1221:24 1223:11

session 1160:5 1225:25

**set** 1206:6,8 **sexy** 1203:11

**Shared-ride** 1161:14,15,17,18,20 1162:4,7,11,12,15 1163:1,3,12,19,23 1164:17 1165:4,5,9,13 1167:5,22,24 1169:15 1170:3,4 1173:3,13,16,17

short 1173:10 1193:4

**show** 1190:11,12 1191:11 1204:24 1211:10

1211.10

**showed** 1181:10

**showing** 1190:13

**shown** 1175:3

shows 1187:14

**signify** 1186:16

similar 1167:9 1210:7 1225:3

**simply** 1187:2

single 1174:19 1191:22

sit 1210:21

site 1173:21,24 1204:21 1215:20

sites 1169:17

**situation** 1216:3 1223:6

slate 1177:24 1178:10,11

slow 1183:7

**small** 1216:4 1218:12 1225:1

**Smart** 1221:20,21 1222:2,3,9,11,15

soft 1190:24

**Solution** 1187:14

**sort** 1215:13

source 1214:19

sources 1213:22,23

speaking 1209:14,16 1211:5

specific 1163:16 1169:9,21 1171:9

1198:21 1221:12

specifically 1208:8 1211:5

**spending** 1181:19,21

spent 1180:8,25 1181:6

spoke 1181:17 1205:5

spoken 1225:6

**sponsor** 1172:24

sponsoring 1164:13

staff 1182:6

**standing** 1194:13

**Stanton** 1174:10,12

**start** 1162:11

started 1170:7,9

**state** 1173:24 1177:18,20 1178:10 1179:2,5,11,24 1180:2 1181:24,25 1182:8,18 1183:10 1198:22,23 1199:17,19,21 1204:11,16 1208:2,5, 20 1209:19 1213:7,11,12 1214:3 1215:13 1216:11,14,23 1218:6,14

1224:19 1225:3,7

**state's** 1179:1

statement 1167:19

**statements** 1217:7,11

station 1192:8,9,19

**staying** 1181:6

stick 1191:19

**stories** 1203:9

**stranger** 1208:14

**Street** 1182:4

**strictly** 1197:7

struggling 1176:14

**studio** 1193:2

studios 1195:19

subcommittee 1215:21

**subject** 1216:1

**submit** 1165:21

subset 1162:8 1218:12

**suburb** 1192:20

successes 1203:9

**suffered** 1200:22

summarize 1189:3

**support** 1179:15 1190:21 1191:2

supporting 1176:15

**supposed** 1169:22

surrounding 1192:14

Susan 1175:13,15 1176:2

switched 1195:7

sworn 1160:14 1175:16

**symbol** 1204:14

**system** 1164:21 1171:18 1186:22 1196:8 1204:13,14 1220:17,19 1221:5,8,16,18 1222:8 1223:2

systems 1169:17 1204:16

Т

takes 1161:25 1177:22

talk 1195:24 1210:19 1217:23

talked 1200:19 1222:22

talking 1177:18 1184:19 1209:17,18

1216:10 1222:23

technology 1216:7

**telephone** 1182:20,23 1186:5 1193:3,24 1195:8,21 1218:8

telephones 1183:1

television 1202:24

term 1212:10

**testified** 1160:14 1173:1,12 1175:16 1183:19,21 1191:7 1198:24 1199:11



# Index: testify..working

1205:22 1207:2,7,12,20 1212:9 1217:22 1224:15

**testify** 1179:17 1183:23 1190:18 1194:16 1225:11

**testimony** 1174:14 1175:2 1200:7 1204:2 1220:23

**things** 1168:23 1169:1 1183:7 1213:14

thought 1218:16,18

**time** 1177:22 1181:19,21 1183:4,17 1184:8 1186:18,20 1187:16,18,22 1188:3 1193:4 1195:12 1197:17 1202:20 1206:10,24 1222:9

times 1186:19 1223:5

today 1176:18,19,24 1203:19

**told** 1171:8 1190:4,11,17 1191:20 1194:7,9 1195:16

tool 1188:14,16

top 1186:17,25 1218:24

topic 1179:1,25 1219:1,11,21,23

topics 1224:14 touch 1170:24 track 1183:9

transcript 1174:16 1175:6

**transit** 1164:21 1168:24 1169:4,17, 21 1170:12 1171:1,16,18

**transportation** 1161:2,12,21,25 1162:16,18 1166:25 1169:5 1170:17 1171:3 1223:2

travel 1163:15

**treatment** 1189:12

tremendous 1193:23

**trip** 1164:7,8 1168:3 1170:18 1171:10

**trips** 1172:24 **true** 1163:10,18

truth 1191:10 1193:16

**Tuesday** 1160:2

**turn** 1165:3 1180:22 1185:20 1189:22 1190:5 1219:4,16

turning 1195:6

**TV** 1192:8,9,19

type 1172:16 1212:20

typically 1164:11

U

**understand** 1177:7 1180:14 1206:1, 19 1214:24

**understanding** 1187:3,10 1199:25 1201:19 1220:18 1225:5

understood 1205:13 1215:5

unobstructed 1176:12

uphold 1176:18 urgent 1195:11,13

٧

Vaguely 1207:6,11

Valley 1192:13,14

van 1161:25

varies 1164:9,21

variety 1209:1

**vehicle** 1164:20

version 1222:6,15

versions 1216:13

**Veterans** 1181:17

vice 1178:18

video 1174:9,13,20,22 1175:2

visit 1181:7 1196:3

visited 1180:15,16 1181:5

visitors 1182:17

volunteer 1180:9,25 1192:15

1200:20 1210:14

volunteered 1192:6

volunteers 1192:18

**vote** 1176:11,20 1177:7,8,9,10 1178:11 1190:4,13 1194:8 1195:17 1202:8 1206:1 1210:8 1211:4,6

voted 1200:16

voter 1170:5,11,15 1171:4,25 1174:15 1177:5 1179:2,8,25 1180:1, 13,25 1181:4,20 1188:7 1189:8,9,18 1194:1,4 1197:12 1199:4,16 1202:21 1203:24 1206:2,3,10,12 1207:14 1211:5,8 1213:3 1215:17,21,22,25 1216:4,15,21 1217:24 1219:5,9 1220:2,20,25 1221:5,8,20,21,23,24 1222:2,3,9,12,15 1223:5 1224:10

voter's 1222:4.16

voter-registered 1210:23

voters 1176:6,8,9,11,19,21 1177:7,19 1180:10 1189:12 1192:19 1194:7,20 1199:1,15 1201:20 1208:6,24,25 1209:1 1213:2,15 1218:4,9 1222:22 1223:7,18

Voters' 1205:11,23 1212:22

VOTES0002208 1184:16

**voting** 1188:11 1200:3 1203:1,3,8 1206:11

W

**wait** 1218:18

wanted 1217:23 1219:10

ways 1209:1

**Web** 1169:17 1173:21,24 1204:21 1215:20

week 1163:6,9

weeks 1177:15

wheelchair 1164:22

**women** 1176:6,8,9,14,15,21 1177:19 1192:18 1199:1,15 1201:20 1205:11, 23 1206:6 1212:22 1213:15

**word** 1206:22

words 1188:16

work 1182:6

worked 1161:7 1165:8

worker 1189:11

working 1180:9 1195:5 1215:24



		Index:	worksyears
works 1182:8			
wrong 1202:12			
Υ	_		
<u> </u>	_		
<b>year</b> 1178:24 1183:4 1209:10 1210:25 1216:23			
<b>years</b> 1161:5,8 1165:12 1177:20 1178:1			

