

**[J- 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 31- 2012]**  
**IN THE SUPREME COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA**  
**MIDDLE DISTRICT**

AMANDA E. HOLT, ELAINE TOMLIN, LOUIS : No. 7 MM 2012  
NUDI, DIANE EDBRIL, DARIEL I. JAMIESON, :  
LORA LAVIN, JAMES YOEST, JEFFREY :  
MEYER, CHRISTOPHER H. FROMME, : Appeal from the Legislative  
TIMOTHY F. BURNETT, CHRIS HERTZOG, : Reapportionment Plan of the 2011  
GLEN ECKHART, and MARY FRANCES : Legislative Reapportionment  
BALLARD, : Commission, dated December 12, 2011

Petitioners

v.

2011 LEGISLATIVE REAPPORTIONMENT :  
COMMISSION, :

Respondent

SENATOR JAY COSTA, SENATOR : No. 1 WM 2012  
LAWRENCE M. FARNESE, JR., SENATOR :  
CHRISTINE M. TARTAGLIONE, SENATOR :  
SHIRLEY M. KITCHEN, SENATOR LEANNA : Appeal from the Legislative  
M. WASHINGTON, SENATOR MICHAEL J. : Reapportionment Plan of the 2011  
STACK, SENATOR VINCENT J. HUGHES, : Legislative Reapportionment  
SENATOR ANTHONY H. WILLIAMS, : Commission, dated December 12, 2011  
SENATOR JUDITH L. SCHWANK, :  
SENATOR JOHN T. YUDICHAK, SENATOR :  
DAYLIN LEACH, SENATOR LISA M. :  
BOSCOLA, SENATOR ANDREW E. :  
DINNIMAN, SENATOR JOHN P. BLAKE, :  
SENATOR RICHARD A. KASUNIC, :  
SENATOR JOHN N. WOZNIAK, SENATOR :  
JIM FERLO, SENATOR WAYNE D. :  
FONTANA, SENATOR JAMES R. :  
BREWSTER, and SENATOR TIMOTHY J. :  
SOLOBAY, :

Petitioners

v.

2011 LEGISLATIVE REAPPORTIONMENT  
COMMISSION,

Respondent

MAYOR CAROLYN COMITTA, COUNCIL  
PRESIDENT HOLLY BROWN, WILLIAM J.  
SCOTT, JR., HERBERT A. SCHWABE, II,  
JANE HEALD CLOSE, FLOYD ROBERT  
BIELSKI, DAVID LALEIKE, E. BRIAN  
ABBOTT, NATHANIEL SMITH, and W.  
DONALD BRACELAND,

No. 2 MM 2012

Appeal from the Legislative  
Reapportionment Plan of the 2011  
Legislative Reapportionment  
Commission, dated December 12, 2011

Petitioners

v.

2011 LEGISLATIVE REAPPORTIONMENT  
COMMISSION,

Respondent

MAYOR LEO SCODA and COUNCIL  
PERSON JENNIFER MAYO,

No. 3 MM 2012

Petitioners

Appeal from the Legislative  
Reapportionment Plan of the 2011  
Legislative Reapportionment  
Commission, dated December 12, 2011

v.

2011 LEGISLATIVE REAPPORTIONMENT  
COMMISSION,

Respondent

THOMAS SCHIFFER, ALISON BAUSMAN,  
RACHEL J. AMDUR, JOAN TARKA,  
LAWRENCE W. ABEL, MARGARET G.  
MORSHECK, LAWRENCE J. CHRZAN,  
JULIA SCHULTZ and SHIRLEY RESNICK,

No. 4 MM 2012

Appeal from the Legislative  
Reapportionment Plan of the 2011  
Legislative Reapportionment

Petitioners	:	Commission, dated December 12, 2011
	:	
v.	:	
2011 LEGISLATIVE REAPPORTIONMENT COMMISSION,	:	
Respondent	:	
SEKELA COLES, CYNTHIA JACKSON and LEE TALIAFERRO,	:	No. 5 MM 2012
	:	
Petitioners	:	Appeal from the Legislative Reapportionment Plan of the 2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission, dated December 12, 2011
	:	
v.	:	
2011 LEGISLATIVE REAPPORTIONMENT COMMISSION,	:	
Respondent	:	
PATTY KIM,	:	No. 6 MM 2012
	:	
Petitioner	:	Appeal from the Legislative Reapportionment Plan of the 2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission, dated December 12, 2011
	:	
v.	:	
2011 LEGISLATIVE REAPPORTIONMENT COMMISSION,	:	
Respondent	:	
EDWARD J. BRADLEY, JR., PATRICK MCKENNA, JR., DOROTHY GALLAGHER, RICHARD H. LOWE, and JOHN F. "JACK" BYRNE,	:	No. 8 MM 2012
	:	
Petitioners	:	Appeal from the Legislative Reapportionment Plan of the 2011 Legislative Reapportionment Commission, dated December 12, 2011
	:	





shall remain in effect until a revised final 2011 Legislative Reapportionment Plan having the force of law is approved. PA. CONST. art. II, § 17(e).

All 2012 election dates shall remain the same, with the exception of the primary election calendar, which is adjusted as follows:

Thursday, January 26	First day to circulate nomination petitions
Thursday, February 16	Last day to file nomination petitions
Thursday, February 23	Last day to file objections to set aside nomination petitions
Monday, February 27	Last day that court may fix for hearings on objections to nomination petitions
Friday, March 2	Last day for court to finally determine objections to nomination petitions
Friday, March 2	Last day for withdrawal by candidates who filed nomination petitions

Any signatures on nomination petitions dated January 24 or January 25, 2012, shall be deemed valid as to timeliness, subject, however, to any other statutory challenge.

Jurisdiction is retained.

Mr. Justice Saylor files a dissenting statement, in which Mr. Justice Eakin and Madame Justice Orié Melvin join.

**[J- 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 31- 2012]**  
**IN THE SUPREME COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA**  
**MIDDLE DISTRICT**

AMANDA E. HOLT, ELAINE TOMLIN, LOUIS : No. 7 MM 2012  
NUDI, DIANE EDBRIL, DARIEL I. JAMIESON, :  
LORA LAVIN, JAMES YOEST, JEFFREY :  
MEYER, CHRISTOPHER H. FROMME, : Appeal from the Legislative  
TIMOTHY F. BURNETT, CHRIS HERTZOG, : Reapportionment Plan of the 2011  
GLEN ECKHART, and MARY FRANCES : Legislative Reapportionment  
BALLARD, : Commission, dated December 12, 2011

Petitioners

v.

2011 LEGISLATIVE REAPPORTIONMENT :  
COMMISSION, :

Respondent

SENATOR JAY COSTA, SENATOR : No. 1 WM 2012  
LAWRENCE M. FARNESE, JR., SENATOR :  
CHRISTINE M. TARTAGLIONE, SENATOR :  
SHIRLEY M. KITCHEN, SENATOR LEANNA : Appeal from the Legislative  
M. WASHINGTON, SENATOR MICHAEL J. : Reapportionment Plan of the 2011  
STACK, SENATOR VINCENT J. HUGHES, : Legislative Reapportionment  
SENATOR ANTHONY H. WILLIAMS, : Commission, dated December 12, 2011  
SENATOR JUDITH L. SCHWANK, :  
SENATOR JOHN T. YUDICHAK, SENATOR :  
DAYLIN LEACH, SENATOR LISA M. :  
BOSCOLA, SENATOR ANDREW E. :  
DINNIMAN, SENATOR JOHN P. BLAKE, :  
SENATOR RICHARD A. KASUNIC, :  
SENATOR JOHN N. WOZNIAK, SENATOR :  
JIM FERLO, SENATOR WAYNE D. :  
FONTANA, SENATOR JAMES R. :  
BREWSTER, and SENATOR TIMOTHY J. :  
SOLOBAY, :

Petitioners

v.

2011 LEGISLATIVE REAPPORTIONMENT :  
COMMISSION, :

Respondent :

MAYOR CAROLYN COMITTA; COUNCIL :  
PRESIDENT HOLLY BROWN; WILLIAM J. :  
SCOTT, JR.; HERBERT A. SCHWABE, II; :  
JANE HEALD CLOSE; FLOYD ROBERT :  
BIELSKI; DAVID LALEIKE; E. BRIAN :  
ABBOTT; NATHANIEL SMITH; and W. :  
DONALD BRACELAND, :

No. 2 MM 2012

Appeal from the Legislative  
Reapportionment Plan of the 2011  
Legislative Reapportionment  
Commission, dated December 12, 2011

Petitioners

v.

2011 LEGISLATIVE REAPPORTIONMENT :  
COMMISSION, :

Respondent :

MAYOR LEO SCODA and COUNCIL :  
PERSON JENNIFER MAYO, :

No. 3 MM 2012

Petitioners.

Appeal from the Legislative  
Reapportionment Plan of the 2011  
Legislative Reapportionment  
Commission, dated December 12, 2011

v.

2011 LEGISLATIVE REAPPORTIONMENT :  
COMMISSION, :

Respondent :

THOMAS SCHIFFER, ALISON BAUSMAN, :  
RACHEL J. AMDUR, JOAN TARKA, :  
LAWRENCE W. ABEL, MARGARET G. :  
MORSHECK, LAWRENCE J. CHRZAN, :  
JULIA SCHULTZ and SHIRLEY RESNICK, :

No. 4 MM 2012

Appeal from the Legislative  
Reapportionment Plan of the 2011  
Legislative Reapportionment  
Commission, dated December 12, 2011

Petitioners



v.

2011 LEGISLATIVE REAPPORTIONMENT  
COMMISSION,

Respondent

SEKELA COLES, CYNTHIA JACKSON and  
LEE TALIAFERRO,

Petitioners

v.

2011 LEGISLATIVE REAPPORTIONMENT  
COMMISSION,

Respondent

PATTY KIM,

Petitioner

v.

2011 LEGISLATIVE REAPPORTIONMENT  
COMMISSION,

Respondent

EDWARD J. BRADLEY, JR., PATRICK  
MCKENNA, JR., DOROTHY GALLAGHER,  
RICHARD H. LOWE, and JOHN F. "JACK"  
BYRNE,

Petitioners

v.

No. 5 MM 2012

Appeal from the Legislative  
Reapportionment Plan of the 2011  
Legislative Reapportionment  
Commission, dated December 12, 2011

No. 6 MM 2012

Appeal from the Legislative  
Reapportionment Plan of the 2011  
Legislative Reapportionment  
Commission, dated December 12, 2011

No. 8 MM 2012

Appeal from the Legislative  
Reapportionment Plan of the 2011  
Legislative Reapportionment  
Commission, dated December 12, 2011

2011 LEGISLATIVE REAPPORTIONMENT :  
COMMISSION, :

Respondent :

DENNIS J. BAYLOR, :

Petitioner :

v. :

No. 9 MM 2012

Appeal from the Legislative  
Reapportionment Plan of the 2011  
Legislative Reapportionment  
Commission, dated December 12, 2011

2011 LEGISLATIVE REAPPORTIONMENT :  
COMMISSION, :

Respondent :

ANDREW DOMINICK ALOSI, :

Petitioner :

v. :

No. 10 MM 2012

Appeal from the Legislative  
Reapportionment Plan of the 2011  
Legislative Reapportionment  
Commission, dated December 12, 2011

2011 LEGISLATIVE REAPPORTIONMENT :  
COMMISSION, :

Respondent :

CARLOS A. ZAYAS, :

Petitioner :

v. :

No. 17 MM 2012

Appeal from the Legislative  
Reapportionment Plan of the 2011  
Legislative Reapportionment  
Commission, dated December 12, 2011

2011 LEGISLATIVE REAPPORTIONMENT :  
COMMISSION, :

Respondent :

WILLIAM C. KORTZ, MICHELLE L. VEZZANI,	:	No. 4 WM 2012
MICHAEL E. CHEREPKO, GREGORY	:	
ERSENKO, JOYCE POPOVICH, JOHN	:	
BEVEC, LISA BASHIOUM, and RICHARD	:	Appeal from the Legislative
CHRISTOPHER,	:	Reapportionment Plan of the 2011
	:	Legislative Reapportionment
Petitioners	:	Commission, dated December 12, 2011
	:	
	:	
v.	:	
	:	
2011 LEGISLATIVE REAPPORTIONMENT	:	
COMMISSION,	:	
	:	
Respondent	:	

**DISSENTING STATEMENT**

**MR. JUSTICE SAYLOR**

**FILED: January 25, 2012**

Based on the petitions, briefs, and argument, I am not persuaded that the 2011 Legislative Reapportionment Plan is contrary to law as reflected in the existing precedent. Although I am receptive to the concern that past decisions of the Court may suggest an unnecessarily stringent approach to equalization of population as between voting districts, I believe this could be addressed via prospective guidance from the Court.

Mr. Justice Eakin and Madame Justice Orié Melvin join this dissenting statement.