IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

MELINDA LAMBERSON REYNOLDS, NO. 3:09-CV-1492

Plaintiff

(Judge Munley)

V.

ELECTRONICALLY FILED

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, et al.,

Defendants

DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO DISMISS COMPLAINT

Defendants hereby move to dismiss plaintiff's complaint pursuant to Fed.R.Civ.P. 12(b) (1) and (6). In support of this motion, defendants assert the following:

- 1. The Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and it agencies are immune from suit in federal court unless the Commonwealth waives its immunity or immunity is validly abrogated by Congress. The Commonwealth has not waived its immunity for claims under the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), 42 U.S.C. §§ 12131-12134, and the ADA does not validly abrogate immunity for claims challenging state licensing decisions. Accordingly, plaintiff's ADA claim should be dismissed.
 - 2. This claim is barred by the abstention doctrine.
- 3. Defendants will submit a brief supporting this motion within the time permitted by Local Rule 7.5.

Wherefore, defendants respectfully request that this Court dismiss the complaint filed in this matter.

Respectfully submitted,

THOMAS W. CORBETT, JR. **Attorney General**

s/Michael L. Harvey By:

> MICHAEL L. HARVEY Senior Deputy Attorney General Attorney I.D. #30098

SUSAN J. FORNEY **Chief Deputy Attorney General** Chief, Litigation Section

Office of Attorney General **Litigation Section** 15th Floor, Strawberry Square Harrisburg, PA 17120

Phone: 717-783-6896 - Direct

717-772-4526

Email: mharvey@attorneygeneral.gov

Date: October 5, 2009

CERTIFICATE OF NONCONCURRENCE

I, Michael L. Harvey, Senior Deputy Attorney General, hereby certify that I sought concurrence from counsel for plaintiff in the foregoing motion and that it was denied.

s/Michael L. Harvey
MICHAEL L. HARVEY
Senior Deputy Attorney General

DATE: October 5, 2009

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

MELINDA LAMBERSON REYNOLDS,

NO. 3:09-CV-1492

Plaintiff

(Judge Munley)

 \mathbf{v}_{\bullet}

ELECTRONICALLY FILED

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, et al.,

Defendants

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Michael L. Harvey, Senior Deputy Attorney General, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, hereby certify that on October 5, 2009, I caused to be served a copy of the foregoing document via e-mail through the Middle District's electronic filing system upon the following individuals:

Lawrence D. Berger Shepherd, Finkelman, Miller & Shah, LLP 35 East State Street Media, PA 19063

Michael Churchill Public Interest Law Center of Philadelphia 125 South 9th Street Suite 700 Philadelphia, PA 19107

s/Michael L. Harvey
MICHAEL L. HARVEY
Senior Deputy Attorney General

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

MELINDA LAMBERSON REYNOLDS,

Plaintiff

NO. 3:09-CV-1492

(Judge Munley)

V.

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, et al.,

Defendants

ELECTRONICALLY FILED

ORDER

NOW, this

day of

, 2009, upon consideration of

defendants' motion to dismiss plaintiff's complaint, the motion is hereby GRANTED. Plaintiffs' complaint is dismissed.

> James M. Munley **United States District Judge**